

**Minutes Meeting
Citizens' Compensation Advisory Committee
August 25, 2016**

Members Present: Cori Petersen
John Mathews
Kerma Jones
Dale Cox
Frances Hume

Members Excused: Connie Spyropoulos-Linardakis

Staff Present: David Salazar, City Compensation Administrator
Rachel Lovato, Committee Support/Coordinator
Jodi Langford, City Benefits Administrator
Julio Garcia, Human Resources Director

Guests: Michael Millard (SLC Police Association)

A recording of these proceedings is on file and available by request from the SLC- HR Department.

Meeting Open & Welcome: Vice-Chair Cori Petersen opened the meeting and established that a quorum of members were present; Frances Hume and (initially) Connie Linardakis participated in the meeting via telephone conference.

Review and adopt March 14, 2016 meeting minutes: A motion to approve the minutes of the committee meeting held on 3/14/2016 was made by John Mathews and seconded by Frances Hume. The vote to approve the minutes was unanimous by all members present.

Committee Staff Support: David Salazar introduced Rachel Lovato, a human resources consultant, as a new staff support to the committee, following retirement of Nancy Torres earlier in the year. Rachel provided the committee with a brief professional background, including her experience with various city departments.

2016 CCAC Annual Report: Frances Hume shared an overview of her presentation to the city council on the committee's 2016 annual report, including: an introduction of the concept of total compensation; committee focus on overall compensation measures (benchmarking) and objectives to attract, motivate, and retain employees; low employee turnover; etc.. Frances, also, noted that FirstWest was asked to join the presentation to comment on the special study conducted to compare wages of the city's public safety employees to those from similar U.S. cities. In response to questions posed by council members about the time allowed to complete the study, FirstWest's Dave Jackson assured the them that compared to other projects his firm had more than enough time to complete their study and deliver a quality product.

Cori Petersen reported on her discussion during a small group meeting with two council members, Erin Mendenhall and Lisa Adams. Discussion included an overview of the annual report, as well as questions and requests for the committee's advice about potential action and incentives the city might offer to encourage employees (particularly, those in public safety) to live in Salt Lake City. A review of gender pay equity was also noted as an area of council members' interest.

Relative to a question raised about the city council's intent on the frequency of future special (wage) studies for public safety positions compared to other U.S. cities, Julio Garcia added that council members clarified that every three to five years would be an appropriate timeline for conducting future studies.

FY17 City Compensation & Benefits Report: David Salazar reported on actions taken by city leaders in response to committee recommendations included in the 2016 annual report. Specific actions included: funding appropriated for employees in benchmark jobs shown to be lagging market significantly; and, a 1.25% general pay increase for all regular, full-time employees.

Julio reported on various benefit enhancements approved by the city, including: acupuncture; increase in the number of visits for patients with autism; extension of medical coverage to provide transgender hormone therapy and mental health counseling; and, bariatric surgery. David, also, noted approval given for continuation of the city's front-loaded contribution to employee health savings accounts. Later, Jodi commented on the city's low overall premium increase, 6%, and costs associated with this year's benefits enhancements.

WorldatWork 2016-17 Salary Budget Survey: Results of WorldatWork's 2016-17 salary budget forecast predicts a flat 3.0% overall salary budget increase across all industries, employee groups, and geographic areas, including merit and promotional pay increases. General (or cost of living) increases are estimated to be 1.6% to 2.0%.

Review, Planning & Discussion of 2016-17 activities: Committee members discussed city council requests for committee consideration and advice on potential issues and initiatives, including: housing subsidies (low interest loans) for employees and gender pay equity.

HOUSING SUBSIDIES - David pointed to city leaders' underlying desire to minimize the negative effects on air quality, carbon emissions, and increased mileage on city vehicles. Jodi suggested researching past efforts by the city, as well as current (or recent efforts) of other local public employers, including Ogden City, West Valley City, and the state of Utah, which offer similar programs for police officers. Actions suggested by the committee included; gathering information about programs from local cities, SHRM, and IPMA; conducting public safety employee focus groups; *etc.*

GENDER PAY EQUITY: A report highlighting results and analysis of city gender pay conducted in November 2015 was distributed to committee members. David outlined the methodology and analysis used to compare female to male rates of pay for incumbents in a select mix of professional, office/clerical, protective services, and service/ maintenance jobs; special effort was made to highlight the comparison of gender pay in jobs which are known to be either male- or female-dominated job assignments. Among the few lower female-to-male pay ratios *GIS Specialist* (94.8%) and *Airport Police Officer II* (91.2%) were noted as being above the 75% national gender pay ratio cited in recent news reports.

In response to questions raised about the cause of gender pay differences, David stated that in all cases of incumbents in union-covered jobs pay is strictly dictated on incumbent years in their respective job title. Furthermore, terms of the union contract specify exact pay rates based upon time in position and without consideration of personal differences such as job performance or gender. Pay differences among appointed employees were noted as being more difficult to assess or measure due to the fact that virtually all executive-level jobs are single incumbent positions; pay among this class of employees is, instead, market-driven.

David suggested the committee may wish to consider a more recent analysis on gender pay equity to be highlighted and addressed in the next annual report.

Especially because of the formalized and specific pay structures in place for union employees (who account for approximately two-thirds of the city's total workforce), David noted there is much less of a concern for pay disparity due to the contract agreements the city has in place with its unions. Dale Cox noted his pride in the fact that the union pay structures are "gender and race blind." Despite being "gender blind," Frances Hume suggested that union pay structures may also be "performance blind." When asked about the city's planned approach to performance management, Julio Garcia stated that he anticipates focusing on performance management with input from union representatives within the next year. Committee members discussed the merits and challenges associated with various employer pay-for-performance programs, including the tendency of employers to replace traditional models with newer "feedback-based" models.

As an action item, David was asked to provide the committee with a more recent gender equity pay analysis to consider for all jobs with more than a single incumbent, including both union and non-represented employees.

MEDIAN PAY DATA: David notified committee members about efforts underway to work with TechNet to begin collecting median pay data for comparative purposes in the coming year.

Thanks & Recognition: John Mathews was recognized by members of the committee and thanked for his service to Salt Lake City with a small memento.

Call for new committee member nominees: Committee members discussed the names, backgrounds, experience, and qualifications of various human resource professionals interested and willing to fill vacancies left following the departure of out-going member, John Mathews (mayoral appointee), and former member, Jennifer Seelig (a city council appointee, whose unfinished term ends August 31, 2018). Nominees presented include: Michael Colledge (BYU); Mike Tanner (O.C. Tanner); Ginny Sorenson (Swire Coca-Cola); Marlene Sloan (Mercer); Karen Okabe (retired); Jill Carter (Questar).

Next Meeting Date: Next meeting date was set to occur on November 2, 2016, beginning at 4:00 pm.

This meeting was adjourned at approximately 5:15 PM.

These minutes were approved in a Committee meeting held on 1/17/2017.