MEMORANDUM
PLANNING DIVISION
DEPARTMENT of COMMUNITY and NEIGHBORHOODS

To: Salt Lake City Planning Commission

From: Kelsey Lindquist, Planning Manager

Date: October 25, 2023

Re: Hardware Village II Design Review Time Extension

ACTION REQUIRED: Vote on granting a one-year time extension for Design Review approval at 152 N 500 W

RECOMMENDATION: Grant a one-year time extension for Design Review approval at 152 N 500 W.

BACKGROUND/DISCUSSION:
The Design Review for Hardware Village II (PLNPCM2022-00586) received approval from the Planning Commission on October 26, 2022. The Design Review approval consisted of the following:

1. Increase to building setbacks along Hardware Avenue and North Temple.
2. Reduction to the ground floor use on 490 West and North Temple.
3. Reduction of the required durable building materials on the ground floor on 490 West and North Temple.
4. Reduction of the amount of glass for North Temple.
5. Reduction for the required building entrances for 490 West and North Temple.
6. Building length exceeds maximum of 200’ along Hardware Avenue, North Temple and 490 West.

The Planning Commission imposed two conditions on the approval. The conditions consisted of the following:

1. The applicant shall submit a lighting plan that meets Design Standard K, approval of this plan shall be delegated to Staff.
2. The façade of the southwest corner is modified so that it looks like one solid building.

Design Review approvals expire in one year “unless a building permit has been issued or complete building plans have been submitted to the division of building services and licensing.” The applicant has not submitted complete building plans to the Building Services Division and has not obtained any building permits for work on the development at this time. As such, they requested an extension to maintain the original approval for an additional year.
The Planning Commission may grant extensions for Design Review approvals for up to one additional year. An extension would push the expiration of the Design Review to October 26, 2024. If the extension is approved, the applicant will need to obtain a building permit or submit complete building plans to Building Services before that date or request another extension.

**ATTACHMENTS:**

A. Time Extension Request Letter

B. Original Record of Decision Letter

C. Original Staff Report
May 1st, 2023

Salt Lake City Corp
Attn: Ken Andersen, Building Official
451 South State Street
Salt Lake City, Ut 84111

RE:   PLNPCM2022-00586, Approval Nov. 2022 - REQUEST FOR ENTITLEMENTS EXTENSION
      Zoning District:  TSA-UC-C
      Master Plan:   Capitol Hill & Downtown

Dear Mr. Andersen:

Thank you for your consideration of a Salt Lake City approval extension for project
#PLNPCM2022-00586, Salt Lake Hardware II. As you are aware, the financing environment in the
United States has dramatically changed over the last year. The dramatic increase in interest rates
coupled with the increase of required investment equity for construction finance has placed
many new development projects on hold. KBS is an active stakeholder in Salt Lake City with
ownership of the Hardware Office building, the Hardware Village II project as mentioned earlier
and the 222 Main office tower in the heart of downtown Salt Lake City. We will remain active
investors and stakeholders in Salt Lake City and the State of Utah as our firm is appreciative of
the business friendly, fiscally responsible government approach, and strengths of overall real
estate investments opportunities.

We are excited to proceed with Hardware Village II but will require some additional time to wait
for the lending environment to improve prior to commencing on the completion of the project.
Your understanding and willingness to extend our approval to November 2024 will be very well
received from our Investment Committee and Board. Thank you for your continued assistance
and understanding.

Respectfully,

[Signature]

Tim Helgeson,
Senior Vice President
KBS Capital Advisors, as authorized agent for KBS III 155 North 400 West, LLC

CC:   Mark Isaac, Owners Representative, Pinyon8 Consulting
      Tim Stanley, Development Lead, Cherry Tree

KBS Capital Advisors
800 Newport Center Drive, Suite 700, Newport Beach, CA 92660 | Tel 949.417.6500 | Fax 949.417.6501
November 1, 2022

Dwell Design Studio
ATTN: Evan Haslam
360 West 300 South Ste. 102
Salt Lake City, Utah 84101

RE: Record of Decision for Petition PLNSUB2022-00586 Hardware Village II
Design Review

Dear Evan:

On October 26, 2022, the Salt Lake City Planning Commission granted Design Review approval for the property located at approximately 152 N 500 W.

This Record of Decision is provided to you indicating the date action was taken, the decision of the Planning Commission including any approval conditions, the one-year time limit on the approval, the limitations on modifications to the plans, and the 10-day appeal period.

Project Description
The Planning Commission reviewed and approved the following project:

Design Review for a Mixed-Use Development at approximately at approximately 152 N 500 W-- Evan Haslam with Dwell Design Studio, representing the property owner, has submitted a Design Review application to develop the property at the above-stated address. The proposed development will consist of an 8-story mixed use building, including 344 residential units, a parking garage, and commercial space. In addition to the TSA score of 113, which requires Design Review approval by the Planning Commission, the applicant is also seeking to modify design standards for ground floor use, buildings materials and glass, building entrance, street facing façade length, and building setbacks. The property is located in the TSA-UC-C (TSA Urban Center Station Core Area) District, within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Liz Hart at 801-535-8861 or elizabeth.hart@slcgov.com)

Conditions of Approval
The following conditions were applied to the approval of the proposal:

1. The applicant shall submit a lighting plan that meets Design Standard K, approval of this plan shall be delegated to staff.

2. The façade of the southwest corner is modified so that it looks like one solid building.

Review Process Standards and Findings of Fact
The Planning Commission made specific findings related to the standards of review for Design Reviews as stated in Chapter 21A.59 of the City Code. The decision was also based on the purpose of the zoning ordinance, the purpose of the zoning district where the project is located, the information contained in the staff report, the project details provided by you, testimony from the public, and the discussion of the Planning Commission. Copies of this information will be made available online here: https://www.slc.gov/planning/planning-commission-agendas-minutes/.
**Modifications to the Approved Plans**
To obtain a building permit, all plans must be consistent with the plans reviewed and approved by the Planning Commission. The plan approved by the Planning Commission constitutes the site design in relation to building placement and design, landscaping, mobility and circulation elements, and any elements that were approved as zoning modifications through the Planned Development process. Modifications to the plan requires an application to the Planning Division and the Planning Director can only approve narrowly defined minor modifications as listed in 21A.55.100B of the Zoning Ordinance. Any modification not listed as a minor modification requires approval by the Planning Commission.

**Time Limit on Approval**
No Design Review approval shall be valid for a period longer than **one year** from the date of approval unless a building permit is issued or complete building plans and building permit applications have been submitted to the Division of Building Services and Licensing. An extension of one year may be granted by the Planning Commission. Extension requests must be submitted in writing prior to the expiration of the planned development approval.

**10-Day Appeal Process**
There is a 10-day appeal period in which any affected party can appeal the Planning Commission’s decision. This appeal period is required in the City’s Zoning Ordinance and allows time for any affected party to protest the decision, if they so choose. The appeal would be heard by the Appeals Hearing Officer. Any appeal, including the filing fee, must be submitted by the close of business on Monday, November 7, 2022.

The summary of action for the Planning Commission meeting is located on the Planning Division’s website at: [https://www.slcgov.com/planning/public-meetings/planning-commission-agendas-minutes/](https://www.slcgov.com/planning/public-meetings/planning-commission-agendas-minutes/).

If you have any questions, please contact me at 801-535-8861 or Elizabeth.hart@slcgov.com

Sincerely,

Liz Hart
Principal Planner

cc: File Numbers PLNSUB2022-00586
Design Review

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 152 N 500 W
PARCEL ID: 08-36-276-056-0000
MASTER PLAN: Capitol Hill
ZONING DISTRICT: TSA-UC-C (Transit Station Area – Urban Center – Core)

REQUEST:
Evan Haslam with Dwell Design Studio, representing the property owner, is seeking Design Review approval to develop the property located at 152 N 500 W. The proposed development will consist of an 8-story building with 344 residential units, parking garage, and commercial space. The subject property is located in the TSA Urban Center Core Area District (TSA-UC-C). The development is required to go through the Design Review process because the proposal did not obtain enough TSA points to allow for an administrative approval. Projects must receive at least 125 points to be administratively approved and the Hardware Village II proposal received 113 points. The applicant is also requesting multiple design standard modifications:

- Building setbacks require 50% of the building façade be within 5 feet of the property line along Hardware Avenue and North Temple. The applicant is proposing a modification to increase the building setbacks along Hardware Avenue to be between approximately 7 feet and 11 feet and along North Temple to be between approximately 8 feet and 16 feet.
- The applicant is requesting that the required ground floor use be reduced from 80% to 10% on 490 West and to 8% on North Temple.
- The applicant is requesting to reducing the amount of durable ground floor building materials from 90% materials to 69% on 490 West and 58% on North Temple.
- The applicant is requesting to reduce the amount of glass required for North Temple from 60% to 42%.
- The applicant is requesting that the amount of building entrances required for 490 West be five and zero for North Temple.
- The applicant is requesting that the building length be allowed to exceed the maximum of 200 feet by 124 feet along Hardware Avenue and North Temple, and 111 feet along 490 West.

RECOMMENDATION:
Based on the information and findings listed in the staff report, it is the Planning Staff's opinion that the request generally meets the applicable standards of approval and therefore recommends the Planning Commission approve the request with the following conditions:
1) The applicant shall submit a lighting plan that meets Design Standard K, approval of this plan shall be delegated to staff.

**ATTACHMENTS**

A. Vicinity Map  
B. Plan Set  
C. Property and Vicinity Photos  
D. TSA Zoning Standards and TSA Development Score Letter  
E. Design Review Standards  
F. Public Process & Comments  
G. Department Review Comments

**PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

**Background and Site Context**

![Hardware District Map](image)

The Hardware Village II project site is part of a larger block development known as the Hardware District. The Hardware District includes the Hardware Office building located on the corner of 400 West and North Temple, and two apartment buildings to the north of the project site. The two apartment buildings went through the TSA application process in 2015-2016. The subject property proposed for development is currently a parking lot for the office building to the east.

**Project Location**

The project site is unique because of the North Temple viaduct/overpass which abuts the property on the south. The North Temple viaduct/overpass starts at the intersection of 400 West and ends at the intersection of 600 W. The elevation and plane of North Temple that interacts with the project site is over 10-20 feet above grade of the subject property. There is no accessible point to North Temple from this project via the south façade. Access to North Temple is from the east at 400 West or to the west at the Frontrunner Station elevator/stairs that lead to the TRAX station on top of the viaduct/overpass. North Temple has two sidewalks at two different vertical planes, one at grade at the bottom of the

**Quick Facts**

- **Height:** ~80 feet  
- **Number of Residential Units:** 344 units  
- **Uses:** Residential with underground parking garage, and commercial space  
- **Exterior Materials:** Brick, metal siding and cement paneling  
- **Parking:** 797 stalls  
- **Open Space:** 25% of project area: ~39,653 SF
abutment and one on the viaduct/overpass. The viaduct/overpass and the area underneath are owned by the city.

**TSA Application Review**

Initially the applicant submitted a TSA Development Score Review (PLNTSD2022-00534) for new construction as the project is located in the TSA-UC-C zoning district. During the review of the TSA Development Score Review Planning Staff found that the proposal did not obtain sufficient points to constitute an administrative approval by Planning Staff. Planning Staff also identified that the project did not meet several required design standards. In response the applicant submitted an application for Design Review to request modifications of certain design standards. Due to the expanse of requested design modifications the application requires a decision by the Planning Commission to modify the required design standards.

**Planning Commission Work Session**

The Planning Commission previously the review the proposed Design Review application during a work session on September 14, 2022. It was during this work session that the Planning Commission heard the applicant’s perspective of the location of the site. During the work session meeting the unique location of the site was considered as well as the design modifications requested by the applicant. While all of the requested modifications were discussed, the Planning Commission recommended that the applicant address the south facing façade along North Temple to provide more visual interest and interaction to the pedestrian realm. The North Temple façade is discussed further in this Staff Report.

**Project Description**

The proposed development consists of an 8-story mixed use building that includes a parking garage, commercial space, and residential units. The building has 3 street facing facades, Hardware Avenue to the north, 490 West, and North Temple to the south. An alleyway is proposed on the east for purposes of access to building utilities and the parking garage. The building provides commercial space on the ground floor at the corner of 490 West and North Temple. 490 West also includes a bicycle storage area and shop. The ground level of Hardware Avenue will include residential units and an entry lobby. The basement level and first 3 levels of the building will mainly consist of a parking garage. The proposed parking garage includes spaces for the residential units and for the office building located to the east of the project site. Levels 4-8 of the building will be residential units; the entire building will have a total of 344 residential units consisting of studios and 1-2 bedrooms.

**REQUESTED MODIFICATIONS AND DESIGN REVIEW PROCESS**

The design standards the applicant is requesting to be modified from the underlying zoning district (TSA-UC-C) in order to develop the site include:

- Increased building setbacks for Hardware Avenue and North Temple:
  - Hardware Ave. setbacks range between 7-11 feet
  - North Temple setbacks range between 8-16 feet.
- Reduction of ground floor use
  - 490 West reduced from 80% to 10%
  - North Temple reduced from 80% to 8%
- Reduction of durable ground floor materials
- 490 West reduced from 90% to 69%
- North Temple reduced from 90% to 58%
- Reduction of required glass:
  - North Temple reduced from 60% to 42%
- Reduction of building entrances:
  - 490 West reduced from seven to five
  - North Temple reduced from eight to zero
- Increased building length:
  - Hardware Avenue building length proposed at 324 feet
  - North Temple building length proposed at 324 feet
  - 490 West building length proposed at 311 feet

In making a decision for the Design Review the Planning Commission should consider whether the proposal meets the standards in Section 21A.59.050 of the zoning code. The standards of review may be found in this Staff Report as Attachment E.

**KEY CONSIDERATIONS**

The key considerations listed below were identified through the analysis of the project:

1. Compliance with Adopted Plans and the Underlying Zoning District
2. Requested Design Standard Modifications

### Consideration 1: Compliance with Adopted Plans

**Plan Salt Lake (2015)**

The City has an adopted citywide master plan that includes policies related to providing additional housing options. The plan includes policies related to growth and housing in Salt Lake City. Applicable initiatives from the plan are below.

**Growth:**
- *Locate new development in areas with existing infrastructure and amenities, such as transit and transportation corridors.*
- *Promote infill and redevelopment of underutilized land.*
- *Accommodate and promote an increase in the City’s population.*

**Housing:**
- *Direct new growth toward areas with existing infrastructure and services that have the potential to be people-oriented.*
- *Increase the number of medium density housing types and options.*
- *Enable moderate density increases within existing neighborhoods where appropriate.*
- *Promote high density residential in areas served by transit.*

**Transportation & Mobility**
- *Having public transit stop within ¼ mile of all residents*
- *Encourage transit-oriented development*

The project site is an existing parking lot that is located next to the North Temple/Guadeloupe Frontrunner and TRAX stations. The proposed development includes 344 residential units, which adds density and growth to the underutilized site. It also provides future residents direct access to transit. Also, the TSA district encourages areas next to transit to have higher density development that incorporates a mix of uses that enhances the area. The proposed development accomplishes this with the mix of commercial space on the ground level and residential units.
Capitol Hill Master Plan
The project site is located in the Capitol Hill Master Plan area. One goal of the Capitol Hill Master Plan is to guide development in the community is to, “encourage appropriate housing opportunities in the community in appropriate locations through renovation of existing structures and compatible infill development and redevelopment.” The Hardware Village meets this goal as it increases housing stock in the area by providing over 300 additional residential units and also is redeveloping the existing parking lot into the proposed mixed-use building.

North Temple Boulevard Plan
Part of the vision for the Viaduct Transfer Station Area Plan is that “future development will continue to create a vibrant, active, safe and well connected urban center...”. There are several policies identified on how to guide future infrastructure improvements and land use decisions to make this vision a reality, the proposed connectivity and placemaking associated with this project achieve this goal. The area plan specifically calls out East-West Pedestrian connections other than the North Temple Viaduct. Creating a connection from the FrontRunner Station Platform along the north side of the Viaduct to 400 West is a critical need. This means providing a safe, comfortable, and interesting environment for walking, cycling and other similar modes of travel.

The North Temple façade incorporates metal paneling that is designed to create an interesting environment and the enhanced landscape along the building creates a more pleasing and comfortable space for the pedestrian.

Underlying TSA Zoning District Compliance
A Design Review requires, per Section 21A.59.050, that any approved design review meet the intent of the underlying zoning district. The subject property is located in the TSA-UC-C (Transit Station Area Urban Center Core) zoning district. The TSA district purpose, Section 21A.26.078, of the zoning code:

The purpose of the TSA Transit Station Area District is to provide an environment for efficient and attractive transit and pedestrian oriented commercial, residential and mixed use development around transit stations. Redevelopment, infill development and increased development on underutilized parcels should include uses that allow them to function as park of a walkable, mixed use district. Existing uses that are complementary to the district, and economically and physically viable, should be integrated into the form and function of a compact, mixed use pedestrian oriented neighborhood.

The Urban Center station area in the TSA zoning district includes the following purpose in Section 21A.26.078:

An urban center station contains the highest relative intensity level and mix of uses. The type of station area is meant to support Downtown Salt Lake and not compete with it in terms of building scale and use.

Finally, the Core substation area purpose is to:
...provide areas for comparatively intense land development with a mix of land uses incorporating the principles of sustainable, transit-oriented development and to enhance the area closest to a transit station as a lively, people oriented place. The core area may mix ground floor retail, office, commercial and residential space in order to activate the public realm.

The proposed development meets the intent and goals of the underlying TSA-UC-C zoning district in that it creates a mixed-use development on a site which supports transit and pedestrian oriented development by providing additional residential housing units located near the North Temple Frontrunner and TRAX stations. By providing additional housing in these locations, it supports transit ridership while increasing the number of pedestrians along the street frontages.

The proposed design of the ground floor level of the building provides multiple elements that activate the public realm. On the corner of 490 West and North Temple the design includes a commercial space that activates this corner with large transparent windows and the outdoor seating. The design for the North Temple façade has metal screening in the middle section, covering the parking garage. The design of this metal screening pops out from the façade and adds some color, which adds a visual element to this space making it more appealing to the pedestrian that will use this corridor to connect to the transit station. Further the building facades are articulated with durable building materials to which encourages pedestrian interest.

While technically the proposed development does not meet multiple required design standards in the TSA zoning district, the proposed development meets the intent of the underlying zoning district in that it provides spaces for pedestrians and creates interest along the entire façade length.

**Consideration 2: Requested Design Standard Modifications**

The applicant is requesting six design standard modifications: reduction in ground floor use, reductions in building materials, glass, and building entrances, and increases in street facing façade length, and building setbacks.

**1. Increase in the minimum front yard setback (Table 21A.26.078.E.3.b)**

TSA-UC-C district requires 50% of the building façade to be within 5 feet of the property line along Hardware Avenue, 490 West, and North Temple. This requirement allows for a maximum of 15 feet if plazas, courtyards or outdoor dining are proposed within the setback.

The applicant is proposing the following setbacks:

Hardware Ave: ranging from ~7 feet to ~11 feet, 0% of the building is within 5 feet of the property line, a small plaza is proposed on the east corner.

North Temple: ranging from ~8 feet to ~16 feet, 0% of the building is within 5 feet of the property line and no plazas, courtyards or outdoor dining is proposed at the ground level.

Hardware Avenue is a private street and is designed to have on-street parallel parking, which will increase the right-of-way larger. The proposed street design increased setbacks, but the design also provides an attractive streetscape with the proposed street trees, plantings against the building and plaza area.
The existing at grade sidewalk along the North Temple viaduct/overpass abuts the property line of the subject property and the wall of the viaduct/overpass. Having the proposed building pushed back further from the property line creates a wider corridor and allows the area to be more comfortable pedestrians and future tenants.

2. Reduction of the Ground Floor Use (Table 21A.37.060.B)

The purpose of this design standard is to promote a walkable environment that emphasizes comfort and safety to the pedestrian. The intent is also to activate the street by requiring ground floor uses next to the sidewalk. This standard can be achieved by active uses and/or visual interest on the ground floor of a building. The project is required to have 80% of the ground floor level to be a use other than parking, such uses must extend at least 25 feet into the building.

The applicant is requesting that this requirement be modified for 490 West and North Temple.

490 West consists of a residential unit on the north corner, utility rooms, entrance to the parking garage, a bicycle storage and shop area, and commercial space on the south corner.

The commercial space on the southern corner, 490 West and North Temple, consists of 883 SF, is ~10% of the ground floor of 490 West. The primary entrance for the commercial space is fronting 490 West. The commercial space will extend 25 feet into the building.

The North Temple ground floor consists of a commercial space on the west corner, as discussed above, utility rooms and the parking garage. The corner commercial space is approximately 7% of the North Temple ground floor. The remaining portion of this ground floor is parking.

The proposal includes minimal ground floor use; however, the architectural design of the ground floor and the landscaping does create an active and visually interesting public right-of-way. The variety of building materials, window placement, and façade changes provides a visually pleasing environment to the pedestrian to interact with the building. The addition of the commercial space which includes outdoor seating and the enhanced landscaped area along the building, does make the space more comfortable and usable for the pedestrian, which increases the eyes on the street along this corridor. The application of these elements satisfies this standard.

3. Decrease in Ground Floor Building Material (Table 21A.37.060.B)

The TSA-UC-C zoning district requires 90% ground floor buildings be durable materials, such as stone, brick, masonry, texture or patterned concrete, and fiber cement board. Other proposed materials may be approved by the Planning Director or through the Design Review process. The purpose of this standard is to facilitate pedestrian interest and interaction.
The 490 West Elevation includes 69% of brick and concrete paneling, and 31% is metal paneling. The metal paneling is not considered to be a durable material, and is primarily driving this durable material reduction on this elevation. There is a significant percentage of glass on this elevation, which breaks up the ground floor material application. The glazing creates a vertical emphasis and facilitates interaction with the pedestrian on the street level.

The North Temple elevation includes 58% durable materials, primarily consisting of brick and concrete paneling. The corners are wrapped with durable material and glazing. The parking garage is a significant portion of the North Temple elevation. The applicant is proposing to clad the garage with metal screening. Metal screening is not considered to be a durable material, which is primarily driving this durable material reduction on this elevation. In order to address concerns with the visibility of the parking garage, the applicant has increased the visual interest of the metal screening by creating a unique design. The design element incorporates a varied undulation of the metal. The combination of the durable building materials and the metal panel design elements creates more visual interest.

4. Reduction in Ground Floor Glass (Table 21A.37.060.B)

The ground floor of a building facing a public street is required to have 60% glass between 3 and 8 feet above grade. The intent of this standard is to facilitate pedestrian interest, increase safety, as well as maximize transparency of ground floor facades. The applicant is requesting to reduce the required 60% to approximately 43% ground floor glass for the North Temple elevation. The request is directly related to the location of the parking structure, which is primarily visible on this elevation. With that said the applicant is applying glass on the corners of the building. To address the reduction of the ground floor glass, the applicant has introduced movement along the metal screening of the parking garage.

5. Reduction in the Building Entrances (Table 21A.37.060.B)

Operable building entrances are required every 40 feet on street facing building facades. The purpose of this standard is to engage the public sphere and orient the building to the adjacent street. 490 West has five entrances proposed and one parking garage entrance, the required amount is seven building entrances. The ground floor proposes multiple different uses, a residential unit, two utility rooms, parking garage, bicycle storage and shop, and commercial space. The parking garage entrance is in the
the bicycle shop space, which only has one entrance from the exterior. This is to create a more secure area for the storage of bicycles. The other uses provide an exterior entrance into the spaces. The proposed building entrances are appropriate for the proposed design of the ground floor level.

Due to the orientation of the building and the location of the parking garage the applicant is proposing zero operable building entrances along North Temple. This is a reduction of eight building entrances on this elevation. Upon review, staff expressed concern about the reduction of building entrances on this elevation. The applicant addressed these concerns by wrapping the windows on the corners, increasing the outdoor seating and creating a larger corridor for pedestrians. Staff believes that these additional elements could increase the comfort of the future pedestrians who utilize this space. The North Temple corridor is heavily trafficked by pedestrians making their way to the Frontrunner station and these design elements help make this corridor feel safer.

6. Increase in Maximum Length of a Building Facade (Table 21A.37.060.B)

The maximum allowed length of a street facing façade in the TSA-UC-C zoning district is 200’. The intent of this standard is to mitigate excessive building lengths that have an impact on the pedestrian realm. The building is proposed to have a total length of approximately 324’ on the north and south facades, which face Hardware Ave and North Temple, and will have approximately 311’ along 490 West and the alleyway on the east side. In order to comply with the modification of exceeding the 200’ limit, the proposed design of the building does include vertical and horizontal breaks, material changes, and massing changes on the facades. 490 West and North Temple have large step backs on the middle portion of the upper levels of the façades, these step backs allow for the placement of the rooftop courtyards. The ground level on North Temple provides architectural design elements that helps break up the building façade.

Staff Discussion:

While the applicant is asking for design standard modifications, the proposal meets the purpose of the Core Area within the Transit Station Area District, which is to provide areas for comparatively intense land development with a mix of land uses incorporating the principles of sustainable, transit oriented development and to enhance the area closest to a transit station as a lively, people oriented place.

The design of the proposed building is modern and consists of multiple material changes, vertical and horizontal breaks, balconies, recessed portions of the facades, and roof top amenity areas. The metal paneling on the south façade provides a unique feature to the building. The proposed design of the landscaping and plaza areas create an open and inviting space for pedestrians. Overall, the design of the building is oriented toward the street, provides visual interest to the pedestrian, is compatible with the established buildings in the surround area, and will add character to the Hardware District.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff is recommending approval of the Design Review. The proposal meets the purpose of the TSA zoning district, and the requested modifications result in a product that achieves the land use regulations for a property that has a unique circumstance. The proposal also reflects the housing and development goals in the Capitol Hill Master Plan, North Temple Boulevard Plan and Plan Salt Lake. The master plans support infill development that is in scale with the existing
and desired development pattern and provides different housing types that support the desire for a walkable, more transit-oriented neighborhood.

**NEXT STEPS**

**Approval of the Requests**
If the design review is approved, the applicant may proceed with the project after meeting all standards and conditions required by all City Departments and the Planning Commission to obtain all necessary building permits. A final plat application will need to be submitted and recorded with Salt Lake County.

**Denial of the Requests**
If the design review is denied, the applicant cannot proceed with the project and will be required to meet the design standards of the underlying zoning ordinance in order to develop the property.
ATTACHMENT A: Vicinity Map
ATTACHMENT B: Plan Set
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CONTENT</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PROJECT NARRATIVE</td>
<td>03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONTEXT AND CHARACTER</td>
<td>04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DISTRICT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SITE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZONING</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROJECT DESIGN</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCEPT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FORM, SCALE, AND HEIGHT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MATERIALS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROJECT DATA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROGRAM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PLANS AND SECTIONS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RENDERINGS</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SITE DESIGN</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEMO PLAN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R.O.W. LANDSCAPE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UTILITIES</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PARK AND MID-BLOCK DESIGN</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DESIGN REVIEW STANDARDS</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PROJECT NARRATIVE

In coordination and cooperation with Salt Lake City’s urban apartment community, that has been coined as the “Hardware District”, KBS proposes a new multi-family development on the current surface parking lot at 152 North 500 West, adjacent to the Hardware Office Building. Fronting Hardware Avenue and also facing the FrontRunner North Temple Bridge/Guadalupe station, the project is poised to contribute to the city’s ever-evolving built environment and the fast developing transit oriented development in the area.

Utah’s Transit Authority’s (UTA) TRAX system connects downtown activity, history, and commerce to the airport and regional destinations throughout the valley. The North Temple Bridge/Guadalupe station is one of many key stops in that system. This contributes to an area of comparatively intense land development with a mix of land uses incorporating the principles of sustainable, transit oriented development, as dictated by the Transit Station Area District and the Core Area.

The project design capitalizes on an already unique and vibrant existing character and architecture. From the Hardware Office Building to the Hardware Apartments, the District is an efficient and attractive transit and pedestrian oriented commercial, residential and mixed use developed area.

The Type IIIA construction will house 344 rental apartments, as well as several building amenities for resident use, including a pool courtyard, inner courtyard, WeWork space, fitness/yoga, dog run/spa, sky lounge and ground-floor retail space and bike shop/storage. The five stories of residential units will sit on a type IA, four story parking podium. The parking structure is intended to park the residential portion as well as the existing parking required for the Hardware Office Building, at a total of 797 stalls.

Redevelopment of the existing surface parking lot aims to significantly contribute to the evolution of Hardware District and Salt Lake City’s downtown experience with 21st century design and construction.
Nodes

1. Utah State Capital Building
2. Pioneer Park
3. Downtown Harmon
4. Temple Square
5. Gallivan Center
6. Utah Museum of Contemporary Art
7. Salt Palace Convention Center
8. Eccles Theater
9. City Creek Center
CONTEXT AND CHARACTER: DISTRICT
Nodes

1. Clark Planetarium
2. Vivint Arena (Jazz)
3. The Union Event Center
4. The Gateway
5. The Complex
6. The Radisson Hotel
CONTEXT AND CHARACTER: SITE

1. CLARK PLANETARIUM
2. VIVINT ARENA (JAZZ)
3. THE UNION EVENT CENTER
4. THE GATEWAY
5. THE COMPLEX
6. THE RADISSON HOTEL
MOBILITY DIAGRAM

CONTEXT AND CHARACTER: SITE

12

August 3, 2022

HARDWARE VILLAGE II

October 25, 2023

PLNPCM2022-00586

© dwell design studio, llc - ALL RIGHTS RESERVED
CONTEXT AND CHARACTER: SITE

VIEW OF HARDWARE AVENUE FROM 400 WEST

VIEW OF SITE FROM 490 WEST

VIEW OF SITE FROM SOUTHWEST CORNER

VIEW OF HARDWARE OFFICE FROM NORTH TEMPLE AND 400 WEST
ZONING NARRATIVE

The purpose of the Transit Station Area District (TSA), where the subject property (152 North 500 West) is located, is to provide an environment for efficient and attractive transit and pedestrian oriented commercial, residential and mixed use development around transit stations. Redevelopment, infill development and increased development on underutilized parcels should include uses that allow them to function as part of a walkable, Mixed Use District.

The Core Area provides areas for comparatively intense land development with a mix of land uses incorporating the principles of sustainable, transit oriented development and to enhance the area closest to a transit station as a lively, people oriented place. The core area may mix ground floor retail, office, commercial and residential space in order to activate the public realm.

Further, the Urban Center Station (UC) contains the highest relative intensity level and mix of uses. This type of station area is meant to support Downtown Salt Lake and not compete with it in terms of building scale and use.

The Downtown Plan designates Salt Lake City’s downtown as the premier location for sustainable urban living, commerce, and cultural activity with a variety of housing options to meet the diverse needs of the region, to improve downtown livability, and to attract and retain skilled workers.
ZONING NARRATIVE CON'D

The design of Hardware Village II meets all applicable zoning-specific design standards except the setback requirements; maximum length of street facing facades; ground floor use; ground floor building materials and ground floor glass requirements facing North Temple; and building entrances along 490 West.

Detail and design reasoning for the requested exceptions:

Zoning Setback Requirements

The zoning ordinance specifies Hardware Avenue (private road), 490 West (dedicated public right-of-way) and North Temple (public right-of-way) as Front Yards. This project proposes that North Temple be specified as a Side or Rear Yard.

The setbacks required, per table 21A.26.078.E.3b, state that North Temple must have 50% of the building’s “street facing facade” built to the minimum 5 foot setback.

Many of the requested modifications to zoning requirements are along North Temple and are based on the unique conditions that exist there. The North Temple viaduct/overpass starts at its intersection with 400 West. Due to the change in elevation and plane of the street, by the time it interacts with the project site it is over 10 to 20 feet above ground level adjacent to the proposed building (see diagram on page 16). There is no accessible point to North Temple from this project via the south facade. Access begins at the East side of the adjacent property, or along the West side of our project then up an elevator/stair.

In the view of the applicant, this is no longer a street facing facade at the ground floor. You are facing the side of the viaduct/overpass, thus negating the intended street level connection intended for Front Yard setbacks. This same logic applies to other requested modifications, as will be explained in the following sections.

In addition to North Temple, Hardware Avenue creates another unique condition that prohibits 50% of the frontage to be within 5 feet. The project is proposing the same parallel parking, back of curb and sidewalk conditions that exist on the opposite side of the road in Hardware Phase I. The current location of the property line does not allow for parallel parking, back of curb and building frontage to be within the requested 5 feet (see civil site plan on page 48). It is requested that the maximum 15 feet be allowed for the entire facade, which the project is within as illustrated in the diagram on this page.
Per 21A.26.078.E.2 (item 3), it is requested that the existing right-of-way sidewalk running along the North Temple viaduct/overpass meet a 10 foot width.

The existing sidewalk runs between the existing hardware building and the abutment walls for the North Temple bridge. The sidewalk cannot be widened because of its position between the existing office building and the viaduct. Once the sidewalk is past the hardware building, it remains elevated on a ramp that transitions the sidewalk down to grade as it goes west. Widening the sidewalk would require reconstruction of the ramp.

The North Temple property line is at the back of the existing walk. Widening the sidewalk would be a right-of-way take by the City for this project.

North Temple also has two sidewalks at two different vertical planes – one at grade at the bottom of the abutment (in plane with the project) and one on the viaduct/overpass. North Temple technically already has over 10 feet of sidewalk, but it’s split between two grade planes because of the bridge.

**Ground Floor Use, Material and Glass Requirements**

The ground floor use requirements along North Temple require the project to accommodate an allowed commercial, institutional, or public use as well as percentages of building materials and glass.

As noted on the previous page, the applicant deems that these requirements are not applicable to a frontage that is not street facing, but rather faces a viaduct/overpass, and does not create the environment intended by the ordinance.

Even the installation of half tree grates is an attempt to “meet code” while serving no purpose for the intent of the code.
Building Entry Doors

Per 21A.37.050.D, a building entrance is required every 40’ along street facing facades.

This requirement is met along Hardware Avenue. However, the applicant requests that this requirement be reduced to the amount of entrances (4) currently proposed along 490 West, and not applicable to the North Temple (not a street facing facade).

The existing Hardware office building has some electrical gear that will be housed between that existing building and the proposed project. With so much electrical gear on this project’s East elevation, many of its back-of-house spaces were pushed to the West side of the building. Spaces such as trash and recycling, new tenant loading, parking entrances all require overhead access removing wall space available for building entrances.

The current language of the existing Hardware Village along 490 West is that doors do not meet this requirement. Doors are located at exist stairs only and there is even a fake door placed mid-block.

Similar to Hardware Village I, Hardware Village II needs a location for parking garage entrance and back-of-house access, due to only having two street facing facades to accomplish this.

The area between the existing office building and the proposed project is being dedicated to infrastructure for the office building and the new project, not allowing these uses to be located there. This was in an attempt to meet ground floor use requirements as much as possible, while still allowing garage and back-of-house access (see provided floor plans).
Maximum Building Length

Per 21A.37.050.F, the maximum building length is limited to 200 feet.

The applicant proposes a modification to the maximum length allowed along street facing facades from 200 feet to 328 feet. Per the general massing concept and the vertical/horizontal breaks as shown on this sheet, the project demonstrates a different and unique multiple building usage for each facade while also incorporating the existing architectural design language along the North side of the site (See image for reference).
DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT

Early concept design began with an investigation of building proportions of the site’s immediate context, as well as the neighboring Hardware Apartments and the Hardware Office Building. Adjacency to the Hardware Office Building to the East and the Hardware Apartments to the north provide massing, material and siting cues.

The design team wanted to capitalize on the existing pedestrian connectivity and walkability of the district, as well as the connection to public transit. In addition to the site’s context, views, and streetscape, parking conditions for the existing office and new residential portion informed the footprint. These considerations informed the following design objectives:

1) Establish a building massing hierarchy for a streetscape and pedestrian experience that clearly defined residential lobby and retail spaces.

2) Define that massing with materials and fenestration to reflect contextual cues.

3) Strategically locate amenity zones (mass vs. void) to take advantage of view corridors.
   - Podium-level amenity to visually connect and activate the streetscape, further emphasizing the pedestrian-scale of the urban realm.
   - Roof lounge amenity at a structurally desired-location—top story of the building—to create an aesthetic and experiential moment in the building.

4) Maximize balcony locations and views.

Collectively the project objectives aim to address the site at both the transit station area district level and pedestrian level, as well as define the resident experience and an engaged public experience.
SUN STUDY: SUMMER SOLSTICE

June 21st
9:00 AM

June 21st
12:00 PM

June 21st
3:00 PM

June 21st
6:00 PM

PROJECT DESIGN: FORM, SCALE, AND HEIGHT

HARDWARE VILLAGE II
SUN STUDY: WINTER SOLSTICE

December 21st
9:00 AM

December 21st
12:00 PM

December 21st
3:00 PM

December 21st
6:00 PM

SUN HAS SET BY 6:00 PM

PROJECT DESIGN: FORM, SCALE, AND HEIGHT
GROUND FLOOR GLAZING

The zoning ground floor glass calculation requires a minimum of 60%, as measured three feet (3') and eight feet (8') above grade (per 21A.37.050).

Ground floor glazing facing Hardware Avenue equals 60%.

Ground floor glazing facing 490 West equals 66%.

Refer to diagram below. The dark purple band denotes the transparency area used in the calculation, between 3 ft and 8 ft above ground level.

Signage to be placed outside of this band to meet transparency requirement.

PERCENTAGE OF GLAZING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FACADE</th>
<th>GROUND FLOOR TRANSPARENCY</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NORTH</td>
<td>MINIMUM 0%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WEST</td>
<td>MINIMUM 0%</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EXTERIOR FINISH LEGEND

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DEC</th>
<th>MATERIAL DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>MATERIAL REFERENCE</th>
<th>COLOR INFORMATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1015</td>
<td>METAL FRAME - COLOR 3</td>
<td>TBS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1016</td>
<td>METAL FRAME - COLOR 4</td>
<td>TBS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1017</td>
<td>METAL FRAME - COLOR 5</td>
<td>TBS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1018</td>
<td>METAL FRAME - COLOR 6</td>
<td>TBS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1019</td>
<td>METAL FRAME - COLOR 7</td>
<td>TBS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOUTH ELEVATION

PROJECT DESIGN: MATERIALS

PERCENTAGE OF MATERIALS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PERCENTAGE</th>
<th>MATERIAL REFERENCE</th>
<th>MATERIAL NAME</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
<td>TBS</td>
<td>METAL FRAME</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
<td>TBS</td>
<td>METAL FRAME</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
<td>TBS</td>
<td>METAL FRAME</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
<td>TBS</td>
<td>METAL FRAME</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10%</td>
<td>TBS</td>
<td>METAL FRAME</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MAX BLANK WALL LENGTH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BLANK WALL LENGTH</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>200</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>400</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOUTH ELEVATION
## Exterior Finish Legend

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>General Description</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th>Color Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>METAL PANEL - COLOR 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METAL PANEL - COLOR 2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METAL PANEL - COLOR 3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRICK</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STONE</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Project Design: Materials

#### Hardware Village II

**PERCENTAGE OF MATERIALS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Material</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Brick</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stone</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metal</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Glass</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wood</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Max Blank Wall Length**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Blank Wall Length</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BRICK</td>
<td>7 ft 6 in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STONE</td>
<td>8 ft 0 in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METAL</td>
<td>9 ft 0 in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GLASS</td>
<td>3 ft 6 in</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Truss Bearing**

- Level 8: F.F.E. = 4323 - 8 1/4" T.O.S. = 4281 - 0"
- Level 7: F.F.E. = 4315 - 3 9/16" T.O.S. = 4269 - 0"
- Level 6: F.F.E. = 4302 - 4 1/2" T.O.S. = 4269 - 0"
- Level 5: F.F.E. = 4291 - 6 5/8" T.O.S. = 4269 - 0"
- Level 4: F.F.E. = 4281 - 0" T.O.S. = 4269 - 0"
- Level 3: F.F.E. = 4269 - 0" T.O.S. = 4269 - 0"
- Level 2: F.F.E. = 4269 - 0" T.O.S. = 4269 - 0"

**KBS**

© dwell design studio, llc - ALL RIGHTS RESERVED
Durable materials include stone, brick, masonry, textured or patterned concrete, and fiber cement board.

21A.37.050.B.1 requires the project to have 90% durable materials at the ground level. The proposed project can meet this percentage if a metal garage screening material can be approved as a durable material.
PROJECT DATA

RETAIL: 883 SF (ground floor)

RESIDENTIAL UNIT MIX:

Studio - 59 Units / 17%
1-Bed - 175 Units / 51%
2-Bed - 110 Units / 32%
Total - 344 Units / 100%
Average unit size = 826 SF

PARKING DECK:

4 Levels (3 Levels + 1 Basement)
Office Parking:
450 spaces provided
Residential Parking:
.5 space per dwelling unit required = 172 spaces minimum
344 spaces provided at 1 per unit
Retail Parking:
3 spaces per 1000 SF = 3 spaces provided

Standard Spaces - 344 spaces for Residents, 3 spaces for Retail & 450 spaces reserved for Hardware Building
ADA Spaces: 9 spaces (including 1 Van space)
EV Spaces: 21 spaces (1 EV space required per 38 spaces provided)

Total - 797 Spaces
**PROGRAM**

The project’s program primarily consists of apartments and accessory spaces (i.e. leasing/mail, pool area, dog run/spa and sky lounge), but also includes 909 square feet of coffee shop/retail space at the ground floor fronting Hardware Avenue and 490 West. The total number of units is 343. The building facade is a combination of glazed storefront, brick veneer, fiber cement paneling and lap siding and metal panel. The construction is Type IIIA above the Type IA parking podium.

The proposed parking structure’s footprint is approximately 317 feet by 269 feet, with one level below grade, one level half below and half above grade and two levels above grade, with capacity for 803 vehicles.

**Level 1 and 2 (double height):**
24 ft height space encompasses the residential lobby, leasing office, six (6) townhomes, four (4) studios, two (2) 1-bed residential unit and retail space. Two prominent points of entry along Hardware Avenue and plaza space between the project and Hardware Office Building, provide a grand first-impression of the building. 490 West includes access to the retail space and bike shop/storage.

Parking deck with back-of-house.

**Level 3:**
Parking deck with one (1) 1-bed residential unit, four (4) studio units and mezzanine level of leasing.

**Level 4:**
Forty-nine (60) studio, 1-bed and 2-bed residential units. Fitness and clubroom off of western facing courtyard, WeWork off of inner courtyard, and Dog Run/Spa off of south facing courtyard.

**Levels 5-7:**
Sixty-seven (67) studio, 1-bed and 2-bed residential units.

**Level 8:**
Sixty-six (66) studio, 1-bed and 2-bed residential units. Sky lounge facing southwest, providing unobstructed views of the Salt Lake Valley.
BASEMENT LEVEL

STORM DETENTION VAULT

BASEMENT PARKING

INTAKE AIR WELL

AIR WELL

304' - 2"
BUILDING SECTION A-A
BUILDING SECTION B-B

HARDWARE VILLAGE II

PROJECT DESIGN: SECTIONS
RENDERING: SOUTHWEST CORNER
SITE/COURTYARD DESIGN
HARDWARE VILLAGE II

MATCH LINE: SEE SHEET C4.2

LEGEND

GENERAL NOTES

SITE DESIGN: UTILITIES
**SLC Design Review Standard - B**

Development shall be primarily oriented to the sidewalk, not an interior courtyard or parking lot.

1. Primary entrances shall face the public sidewalk (secondary entrances can face a parking lot).

2. Building(s) shall be sited close to the public sidewalk, following and responding to the desired development patterns of the neighborhood.

3. Parking shall be located within, behind, or to the side of buildings.

**Compliance of Standard - B**

1-2. The main entry of the proposed project, referred to here as Hardware Village II, is oriented towards Hardware Avenue, and the connected plaza to Hardware Office Building, on the northeast side of the site. Similar to the development pattern along Hardware Avenue, the project’s pedestrian-focused entry facade along Hardware Avenue provides two prominent points of access to the residential lobby, and access to the parking deck for office users that is beyond the connecting plaza. Both Hardware Apartments and Office Building’s main entrances front off of Hardware Avenue.

3. Office parking entry, as mentioned, is located off the East side of the site beyond the connecting plaza. Residential parking access is located off 490 West, separating the retail space on the northwest corner of the site and the bike shop/storage that is accessed near the Front-runner transit station platform and the Southwest end of the site.

**SLC Design Review Standard - C**

Building facades shall include detailing and glass in sufficient quantities to facilitate pedestrian interest and interaction.

1. Locate active ground floor uses at or near the public sidewalk.

2. Maximize transparency of ground floor facades.

3. Use or reinterpret traditional storefront elements like sign bands, clerestory glazing, articulation, and architectural detail at window transitions.

4. Locate outdoor dining patios, courtyards, plazas, habitable landscaped yards, and open spaces so that they have a direct visual connection to the street and outdoor spaces.

**Compliance of Standard - C**

1. Active ground-floor uses at / near the public sidewalk include retail frontage, main residential lobby, bike shop/storage and residential town-home units.

2. Glazing at the ground floor is two-story in appearance. The glazing also wraps the corner of the residential lobby extending the transparency for pedestrians walking along the plaza connection and also and the Southwest corner of 490 West near the transit station.

3. The retail and residential lobby facades are delineated with clerestory glazing broken up by brick banding that speaks to both the existing office building and apartments.

4. The plaza between the existing office building will create a direct visual connection to Hardware Avenue and the entrance lobby, including Hardware Apartments across the street. The retail space on the northwest corner will create habitable landscape and open space that invites pedestrian activity.
SLC Design Review Standard - D

Large building masses shall be divided into heights and sizes that relate to human scale.

1. Relate building scale and massing to the size and scale of existing and anticipated buildings, such as alignments with established cornice heights, building massing, step-backs, and vertical emphasis.

2. Modulate the design of a larger building using a series of vertical or horizontal emphases to equate with the scale (heights and widths) of the buildings in the context and reduce the visual width or height.

3. Include secondary elements such as balconies, porches, vertical bays, belt courses, fenestration, and window reveals.

4. Reflect the scale and solid-to-void ratio of windows and doors of the established character of the neighborhood or that which is desired in the master plan.

Compliance of Standard - D

1. The first two stories of the Hardware Avenue facade is scaled to create a horizontal continuation of the existing Hardware Apartments and maintain the pedestrian scale. Vertical emphasis is created with rhythmic brick banding that delineates between material, use and window changes. Massing below the horizontal line created at the podium level is stepped back a maximum of 2 feet. This creates visual interest at the pedestrian level.

Above the horizontal line of the podium, the residential units are massed in three areas, each corner and in the middle. The corners are emphasized with lighter material banding and warm-toned, inset balconies. The middle massing is composed of darker materials with rhythmic balconies and pop-outs.

The facade along 490 West has similarly massed corners, broken in the middle by the West facing pool courtyard. This is an active amenity that overlooks the West side of the valley and is highly visible from the North Temple Viaduct and the heavy rail.

2. The project as divided in height by the horizontal break at the podium level. The two to three stories below this line creates a pedestrian and street-scape-friendly experience, while the five stories above the line are massed at corners and the middle, breaking up the mass in width.

3. Each massing, as described above, includes balconies (inset, semi-recessed and extended), vertical bays, belt courses and window reveals as secondary elements to those masses.

4. The scale and ratio of doors at the ground level relate to the typical street frontage along Hardware Avenue (storefront scale and rhythm of transparency and entry).
SLC Design Review Standard - E

Building facades that exceed a combined contiguous building length of two hundred feet (200’) shall include:

1. Changes in vertical plane (breaks in facade);
2. Material changes; and
3. Massing changes.

Compliance of Standard - E

The lot frontage for the proposed building is approximately 250 feet in length along Hardware Avenue and 312 feet along 490 West.

1-3. Vertical breaks in both the Hardware Avenue and 490 West facades occur over the retail space at the third level, matching the facade break in the adjacent Hardware Apartments, and at a recessed area over the town-home units, providing another break and relief in the front facade experienced at the pedestrian level. Materials and massing likewise change at the corners of the retail space and the residential lobby, to further delineate the change in building program.

SLC Design Review Standard - F

If provided, privately-owned public spaces shall include at least three (3) of the six (6) following elements:

1. Sitting space of at least one sitting space for each two hundred fifty (250) square feet shall be included in the plaza. Seating shall be a minimum of sixteen inches (16”) in height and thirty inches (30”) in width. Ledge benches shall have a minimum depth of thirty inches (30”);
2. A mixture of areas that provide seasonal shade;
3. Trees in proportion to the space at a minimum of one tree per eight hundred (800) square feet, at least two inch (2”) caliper when planted;
4. Water features or public art;
5. Outdoor dining areas; and
6. Other amenities not listed above that provide a public benefit.

Compliance of Standard - F

No privately-owned public spaces have been provided.
SLC Design Review Standard - G

Building height shall be modified to relate to human scale and minimize negative impacts. In downtown and in the CSHBD Sugar House Business District, building height shall contribute to a distinctive city skyline.

1. Human scale:
   a. Utilize setbacks to design a building that relate to the height and scale of adjacent and nearby buildings, or where identified, goals for future scale defined in adopted master plans.
   b. For buildings more than three stories or buildings with vertical mixed use, compose the design of a building with distinct base, middle, and top sections to reduce the sense of apparent height.

2. Negative impacts:
   a. Modulate taller buildings vertically and horizontally so that it steps up or to its neighbors.
   b. Minimize shadow impacts of building height on the public realm and semi-public spaces by varying building massing. Demonstrate impact from shadows due to building height for the portions of the building that are subject to the request for additional height.
   c. Modify tall buildings to minimize wind impacts on public and private spaces, such as the inclusion of a wind break above the first level of the building.

3. Cornices and rooflines:
   a. Shape and define rooflines to be cohesive with the building’s overall form and composition.
   b. Include roof forms that complement the rooflines of surrounding buildings.
   c. Green roof and roof deck: Include a green roof and/or accessible roof deck to support a more visually compelling roof landscape and reduce solar gain, air pollution, and the amount of water entering the stormwater system.

Compliance of Standard - G

1. The two stories below the podium are stepped back a maximum 2 feet to create scale similar to adjacent and nearby buildings. The podium break creates a distinct base that divides the residential units above from below and reduces the sense of apparent height.

2. The project is massed with three distinctive courtyards above the podium level, creating minimal shadow impacts and wind breaks. Two of the three decks are located at the perimeter of the building footprint and provide breaks at the west and south facades.

3. Rooflines and parapet heights complement the existing rooflines of the existing buildings. Parapet heights are varied based on the massing breaks. A roof lounge has been provided on the southeast corner of the project that provides an unobstructed view of the Salt Lake Valley. Courtyards located above the podium are landscaped and provide reduced solar gain, pollution and added storm water volume.
SLC Design Review Standard - H

Parking and on-site circulation shall be provided with an emphasis on making safe pedestrian connections to the sidewalk, transit facilities, or mid-block walkway.

Compliance of Standard - H

Parking is located behind the ground floor uses located along Hardware Avenue and 490 West. Entrances to the parking deck will be from the east and west sides of the site. The east entrance will facilitate office users for the existing Hardware Office Building. The west entrance will be residences of the project. Pedestrian access/connection is provided to the North Temple Bridge/Guadalupe transit station.

SLC Design Review Standard - I

Waste and recycling containers, mechanical equipment, storage areas, and loading docks shall be fully screened from public view and shall incorporate building materials and detailing compatible with the building being served. Service uses shall be set back from the front line of the building or located within the structure.

Compliance of Standard - I

Service-use areas are not visible to the public, are located within the structure and are screened from public view. Site electrical/mechanical equipment is screened and location on the south end of the area between the existing Hardware Office Building and the project, with vehicular/maintenance access. Residential loading and trash/recycling pick-up are located behind overhead, decorative doors located along 490 West.

SLC Design Review Standards - J

Signage shall emphasize the pedestrian / mass transit orientation.

1. Define specific spaces for signage that are integral to building design, such as commercial sign bands framed by a material change, columns for blade signs, or other clearly articulated band on the face of the building.

2. Coordinate signage locations with appropriate lighting, awnings, and other projections.

3. Coordinate sign location with landscaping to avoid conflicts

Compliance of Standard - J

SLC Design Review Standard noted by the design team. Signage to be reviewed by deferred submittal.
2. Hardscape (paving material) shall be utilized to differentiate privately-owned public spaces from public spaces. Hardscape for public sidewalks shall follow applicable design standards. Permitted materials for privately-owned public spaces shall meet the following standards:
   a. Use materials that are durable (withstand wear, pressure, damage), require a minimum of maintenance, and are easily repairable or replaceable should damage or defacement occur.
   b. Where practical, as in lower-traffic areas, use materials that allow rainwater to infiltrate into the ground and recharge the water table.
   c. Limit contribution to urban heat island effect by limiting use of dark materials and incorporating materials with a high Solar-Reflective Index (SRI).
   d. Utilize materials and designs that have an identifiable relationship to the character of the site, the neighborhood, or Salt Lake City.
   e. Use materials (like textured ground surfaces) and features (like ramps and seating at key resting points) to support access and comfort for people of all abilities.
   f. Asphalt shall be limited to vehicle drive aisles.

Compliance of Standard - K

SLC Design Review Standard noted by the design team. The hardscape and landscape design of the exterior amenities and circulation to comply with the City’s lighting requirements. Discussions with the Planning Director emphasized lighting along the south property line between the project and the North Temple Viaduct and will be addressed by the Design Team.

SLC Design Review Standard - L

1. Street tree requirements have been addressed, see landscape drawings.

Compliance of Standard - L

1. One street tree chosen from the street tree list consistent with the city’s urban forestry guidelines and with the approval of the city’s urban forester shall be placed for each thirty feet (30’) of property frontage on a street. Existing street trees removed as the result of a development project shall be replaced by the developer with trees approved by the city’s urban forester.

2. Hardscape in privately-owned public spaces to comply with the design review standard requirements. Hardscape paving in the plaza between the existing Hardware Office Building and the project will utilize different paving materials.
Durable materials include stone, brick, masonry, textured or patterned concrete, and fiber cement board.

21A.37.050.B.1 requires a project to have 90% durable materials at the ground level. The proposed project can meet this percentage if a metal garage screening material can be approved as a durable material.
### EXTERIOR FINISH LEGEND

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Material Description</th>
<th>Finish or Color Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0220</td>
<td>1/4&quot; SHEET METAL</td>
<td>200 SMOOTH-GI, 205 GALV.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0221</td>
<td>1/4&quot; SHEET METAL COLOR</td>
<td>200 SMOOTH-GI, 205 GALV.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0222</td>
<td>1/8&quot; METAL PANEL</td>
<td>200 SMOOTH-GI, 205 GALV.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0223</td>
<td>1/8&quot; METAL PANEL COLOR</td>
<td>200 SMOOTH-GI, 205 GALV.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0224</td>
<td>1/4&quot; METAL PANEL</td>
<td>200 SMOOTH-GI, 205 GALV.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0225</td>
<td>1/4&quot; METAL PANEL COLOR</td>
<td>200 SMOOTH-GI, 205 GALV.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### PERCENTAGE OF MATERIALS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Material</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BRICK</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCRETE FULL-FACE</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCRETE PARTIAL-FACE</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCRETE PANEL</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCRETE PANEL FINISH</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCRETE PANEL BASE</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCRETE PANEL BASE FINISH</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### MAX BLANK WALL LENGTH

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Material</th>
<th>Length</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BRICK</td>
<td>20 ft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCRETE PANEL</td>
<td>15 ft</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCRETE PANEL FINISH</td>
<td>10 ft</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**EAST ELEVATION**

**PROJECT DESIGN: MATERIALS**

**HARDWARE VILLAGE II**

---

© dwell design studio, llc - ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

August 3, 2022
ATTACHMENT C: Property and Vicinity Photos

NORTH

SOUTH
ATTACHMENT D: TSA Zoning Standards

TSA Transit Station Area District – 21A.26.078

**Purpose Statement:** The purpose of the TSA Transit Station Area District is to provide an environment for efficient and attractive transit and pedestrian oriented commercial, residential and mixed use development around transit stations. Redevelopment, infill development and increased development on underutilized parcels should include uses that allow them to function as part of a walkable, Mixed Use District. Existing uses that are complementary to the district, and economically and physically viable, should be integrated into the form and function of a compact, mixed use pedestrian oriented neighborhood. Each transit station is categorized into a station type. These typologies are used to establish appropriate zoning regulations for similar station areas. Each station area will typically have two (2) subsections: the core area and the transition area. Due to the nature of the area around specific stations, the restrictions of Overlay Zoning Districts, and the neighborhood vision, not all station areas are required to have a core area and a transition area.

**Core Area:** The purpose of the core area is to provide areas for comparatively intense land development with a mix of land uses incorporating the principles of sustainable, transit-oriented development and to enhance the area closest to a transit station as a lively, people oriented place. The core area may mix ground floor retail, office, commercial and residential space in order to activate the public realm.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Zoning Ordinance Standards for TSA-UC-C zone (21A.26.078)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Standard</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum Building Height</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maximum Building Height</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Front/Corner Side Yard Setback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum Lot Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum Lot Width</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open Space Area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Site Circulation and Connectivity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
safe and efficient options for all modes of travel. Circulation networks, whether public or private, require adequate street, pedestrian and bicycle connections to provide access to development. The internal circulation network shall be easily recognizable, formalized and interconnected.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Safe and Efficient Options</th>
<th>The street facing facades. These building entrances will be easily spotted and accessible to pedestrians and residents. Pedestrian access to the building will be highlighted by awnings.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>All parking lots shall comply with the standards in section 21A.44.020, &quot;General Off Street Parking Regulations&quot;</th>
<th>Measurements and location of parking access and stalls meets the standards of Sections 21A.44.020. Refer to Salt Lake City’s Transportation review comments.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parking is prohibited between the street-facing building line and any front or corner side property line. This shall include any drive aisle that is not perpendicular to the front or corner side property line.</th>
<th>No parking is proposed between the front facades of the building and the property lines.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Any new development shall provide a midblock walkway if a midblock walkway on the subject property has been identified in a master plan that has been adopted by the City.</th>
<th>The Capitol Hill Master Plan does not identify a midblock walkway on the subject property.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### Maximum Parking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Residential: 1 space per dwelling unit</th>
<th>1 space per unit residential unit is provided. 344 spaces provided for residential use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nonresidential: 3 spaces for every 1000 usable square feet</td>
<td>883 SF of commercial space. Office building is 210,938 usable square feet. ~633 stalls allowed. 453 stalls provided for commercial use. Total Stalls: 797 Maximum Allowed: 977</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Ground Mounted Utility Boxes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>May be located in the rear and side yards and shall be located a minimum of one foot from a side or rear property line. May be placed in a required landscaped yard if screened by a wall, fence or hedge of at least equal height.</th>
<th>Ground mounted utility boxed are proposed to be within the landscaped yard on the east side of the building. Will comply at building permits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

### TSA Design Development Review

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Use of Exterior Insulation and Finishing System (EIFS) or traditional stucco is not allowed as a building material on the ground floor of street facing building facades. Use of EIFS</th>
<th>EIFS is not proposed for the building.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Complies

Complies

Complies

Does not comply

Complies
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>and stucco is allowed for up to ten percent (10%) of the upper level street facing facades.</th>
<th>In yards greater than ten feet (10’) in depth, one shade tree shall be planted for every thirty feet (30’) of street frontage.</th>
<th>On the north and south side of the building, along the property line one tree per 30’ of street frontage will be provided.</th>
<th>Complies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>At least fifty percent (50%) of the front or corner side yards shall be covered in live plant material.</td>
<td>Where sitting areas aren’t located the front and corner side yards will be covered in live plan material.</td>
<td>Complies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Entry Feature Requirements:</strong> All required building entries shall include at least one of the following features:</td>
<td>Each building entrance will have an awning.</td>
<td>Complies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(1) An awning or canopy over the entrance that extends a minimum of five feet (5’) from the street facing building facade;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) A recessed entrance that is recessed at least five feet (5’) from the street facing facade;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) A covered porch that is at least five feet (5’) in depth and at least forty (40) square feet in size; or</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) A stoop that is at least two feet (2’) above sidewalk level and that includes an awning or canopy that extends at least three feet (3’) from the street facing building facade.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Parking</strong></td>
<td><strong>Walking Through Parking Lots:</strong> Parking lots with more than fifteen (15) spaces shall provide a pedestrian walkway through the parking lot to the primary building entrance or a sidewalk providing access to a primary building entrance. One (1) walkway must be provided for every three (3) drive aisles. Walkways shall be curb separated from the parking areas and a minimum of five feet (5’) wide. Vehicles shall not overhang the walkway. Parking lot landscaping requirements in chapter 21A.48 of this title</td>
<td>The development does not propose an open parking lot. A parking garage is proposed on the ground floor and basement of the building.</td>
<td>Complies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
shall be included on the side of the walkway. Where the walkway crosses a drive aisle, a crosswalk that is clearly identified by a change in color, material, or similar technique shall be used.
October 18, 2022

Dwell Design Studios
Attn: Evan Haslam
360 W 300 S, Suite. 102
Salt Lake City, Utah 84101

RE: Transit Station Area Development Score Review for Petition #PLNTSD2022-00534 at 152 N 500 W – Hardware Village II

This letter is notification of the development score review as determined by Planning Department staff. Pursuant to chapter 21A.10 of the Salt Lake City Zoning Ordinance, notice of application was sent out on July 18, 2022. The noticing period ended on August 1, 2022.

After completing a review of the revised plans, submitted on October 3, 2022, staff has given this project a score of **113 points** out of the submitted 128 (see attached scoring sheet for more information). This means that a public hearing and Planning Commission approval is required prior to the project being authorized to go through the standard building permit process. The project must receive approval for the following:

1. It must receive design review approval from the Planning Commission
2. Any significant changes made to the approved plans, elevations or site plan must be approved by the Planning Department

The following points were not given by staff:

17. Eyes on the Street and Public Spaces, 15 points

   Staff has determined that the North Temple façade does not meet this standard on the ground level because there are no proposed operable openings, balconies, verandas or similar features on the ground level. The majority of the façade is the exterior of the parking garage which does not provide any visibility to the public space.

As the applicant, you have the option to appeal this development score review to the Appeals Hearing Officer. If you chose to appeal, a public hearing will be required per the requirements of the Salt Lake City Zoning Ordinance.

A full zoning review will be completed as part of the Design Review to verify that the drawings submitted comply with the applicable zoning requirements. Additionally, the plans approved by the Planning Commission will be compared with the plans submitted for your building permit, and you will be notified if there are any discrepancies between the two sets.

If you have any further questions about the Planning Department process, please contact me at 801-535-6681 or by e-mail at: Elizabeth.hart@slc.gov.com.

Sincerely,

Liz Hart
Principal Planner
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORY</th>
<th>GUIDELINE SECTION</th>
<th>ITEM DESCRIPTION</th>
<th>VALUE</th>
<th>APPLICANT REVIEW</th>
<th>STAFF REVIEW</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Land Use</td>
<td>1.A. Intensity and Density of Use (Applicable to Core Area Only.)</td>
<td>A project that meets at least one of the following requirements:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>More than 50 dwelling units per acre; Buildings that are up to 80% of the allowable building height; or Buildings with a Floor to Lot Area ratio of 3 or more.</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>More than 30 dwelling units per acre; Buildings that are up to 70% of the allowable building height; or Buildings with a floor to lot area ratio of 2 or more.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>More than 20 dwelling units per acre; Buildings that are at least 60% of the allowable building height; or Buildings with a floor to lot area ratio of 1 or more.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.B. Intensity and Density of Use (Applicable to Transition Area only.)</td>
<td>A project that meets at least one of the following requirements:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>More than 25 dwelling units per acre; Buildings that are up to 80% of the allowable building height; or Buildings with a Floor to Lot Area ratio of 2 or more.</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>More than 20 dwelling units per acre; Buildings that are up to 70% of the allowable building height; or Buildings with a floor to lot area ratio of 1.5 or more.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Use</td>
<td>2. Integrated Mixed of Uses:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>If the ground floor of a building is designed for retail, restaurant, or other use other than residential on the ground floor. The guideline applies to street facing habitable space only and not the entire ground floor area. The following points shall be added to the development score:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>100% of the gross floor area on the ground floor is dedicated to a use different than what is on the floors above.</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At least 75% of the gross floor area on the ground floor is dedicated to a use different than what is on the floors above.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>At least 50% of the gross floor area on the ground floor is dedicated to a use different than what is on the floors above.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A project that includes at least two uses that are different than existing uses on adjacent properties.</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>More than 15 dwelling units per acre; Buildings that are at least 60% of the allowable building height; or Buildings with a floor to lot area ratio of 1 or more.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.A. Mixed Income Housing</td>
<td>A project that includes affordable housing available to those with 60% or less of the median household income of the City for sale or lease shall have the following number of points added to the development score:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>33% or more of the total dwelling units.</td>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20% or more of the total dwelling units.</td>
<td>30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10% or more of the total dwelling units.</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.B. Mixed Income Housing</td>
<td>An affordable housing project that is located in an area identified in the “Opportunity Index” map (as used in the latest available Utah Housing Corporation Allocation Plan) or its successor as determined by the Planning Director, with a rating of at least 3 or greater shall receive the following points:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Areas rated 5 or greater</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Area rated 3 or greater</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Accessible Dwelling Units</td>
<td>A project which includes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>33% or more of the total dwelling units.</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15% or more of the total dwelling units</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building and Site Design</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>--</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>dwellings units designed as ADA accessible:</strong></td>
<td>10% or more of the total dwelling units.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. Community Serving Uses</strong></td>
<td>Projects that include the following area of community serving uses:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Refer to Guidelines for qualifying uses.)</td>
<td>A minimum of 1500 square feet.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A minimum of 1000 square feet</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A minimum of 500 Square feet</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6. Redevelopment of Surface Parking Lots</strong></td>
<td>A project that includes the redevelopment of an existing surface parking lot to an active use or structured parking:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>50% or more of the existing surface parking lot is covered by new buildings.</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>35% or more of the existing surface parking lot is covered by new buildings.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25% or more of the existing surface parking lot is covered by new buildings.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>7. Redevelopment of Nonconforming Use or Noncomplying Building</strong></td>
<td>A project that includes redevelopment of a site containing a nonconforming use or non-complying building:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A new building that meets the standards of the TSA zoning district and replaces a building that does not meet the standards.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A project that includes replacing a nonconforming use with a use that is allowed in the TSA zoning district.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8. Removal of Billboards</strong></td>
<td>A project that includes redevelopment of a site containing a billboard:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>An existing billboard is legally removed by the developer as part of a redevelopment project.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>9. Sustainable Site and Open Space Design</strong></td>
<td>A project that incorporates adopted sustainable policies of the City:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>(Points may be obtained from both items.)</em></td>
<td>The project utilizes a roof design, such as a landscaped roof, that is intended to reduce energy use, storm drainage runoff or other similar sustainable policy of the City.</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The project utilizes landscape designs and materials that conserves energy, reduces the urban heat island, conserves water, retains or reuses storm drainage or other similar sustainable policy of the City. Documentation must be provided to indicate how the project will incorporate this guideline.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 10. Green Building
The following points will be awarded based on the level of LEED certification:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Platinum</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gold</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silver</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 11. Energy Efficiency
Projects that incorporate energy efficiency into the design of the project shall have the following points added to the development score:

*(For guidelines 1 through 4, points may only be obtained from one item. Points from guidelines 1 through 4 may be combined with points from guideline 5.)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Guideline</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The project is certified as having 100% of its energy needs served by renewable power either from on or off-site sources. If development relies on off-site power, documentation must be provided showing at least 20 year commitment to power source</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The project is certified as having 50% its energy needs served by renewable power either from on or off-site sources. If development relies on off-site power, documentation must be provided showing at least 20 year commitment to power source</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Solar array: 5 points for every 500 square feet of solar panels. Maximum 20 points.</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Geothermal heating and cooling systems</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The project is designed with passive, energy efficient features that include awnings or solar shades over all windows, or other similar passive energy saving features.</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 12. 360 Degree Architecture
A project that incorporates architecture features on building facades that are not adjacent to a street:
*(See Guideline for required elements.)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Architectural detailing is wrapped around all four sides. See guideline document for specific detailing requirements.</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architectural detailing is wrapped around both side facades of a building, but not on the rear façade. See guideline document for specific detailing requirements.</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 13. Historic Preservation
Projects that preserve, rehabilitate, restore, reuse a historic property or new construction that contributes to the character of a historic property or district:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location and Criteria</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local Register: New construction, major alterations and additions that are approved by the Historic Landmark Commission that include reuse of the site.</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National Register: State Historic Preservation Office review and approval of exterior alterations to buildings not locally designated, but on the national register and seeking federal tax credits</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building and Site Design</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Projects that are adjacent to a local or national designated property that are compatible with the historic property through building mass and bulk, setbacks and design features as determined by the Planning Director</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Register: Projects that receive administrative approval in accordance with Zoning Ordinance Section 21A.34.020. Projects that add historically significant sites to the Salt Lake City Register of Cultural Resources if they qualify as defined in Zoning Ordinance Section 21A.34.</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>14. Building Materials</strong></td>
<td>Projects that incorporate high quality, durable and low maintenance building materials:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least 80% of the street facing façades above the ground floor are clad in durable, high quality materials, as listed above, excluding glazing, doors, and trim</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At least 70% of the street facing facades above the ground floor are clad in high quality, durable materials as listed above, excluding glazing, doors, and trim</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>15. Corner Buildings</strong></td>
<td>Buildings located on the corners of intersecting streets that address both streets:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When located on the corner of two intersecting streets, the primary entrance of the building addresses the corner by including a hinged, rounded, beveled, open bay, mitered orientation or similar entrance feature.</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>16. Rooftop Design and Use</strong></td>
<td>A project that incorporates a rooftop use:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A rooftop of a building is used as a common space for the building occupants.</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A roof includes at least one of the following design features: Two or more sloping planes visible from a public street; An arched or barrel vaulted design; A distinguishable cornice or parapet; Overhangs that are a minimum of 12 inches in depth to create a shadow line.</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17. Eyes on the Street and Public Spaces</td>
<td>Buildings that are designed to have windows, doors, balconies or other similar features facing public streets and open spaces: Operable openings, balconies, verandas or other similar features on all levels of the building that face a public space and allow visibility into the public space. Balconies need to have a minimum depth of 5 feet and include at least 30 square feet of space</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18. Lighting</td>
<td>A project that includes a lighting plan that accomplishes at least one of the following: Casts light from store fronts onto the sidewalk; Highlights unique architectural features of a building; or Highlights artwork or unique landscape features.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19. Signs</td>
<td>Signs that meet the intent of this guideline shall have the following points added to the development score: A sign that is mounted perpendicular to the primary building façade and oriented to the pedestrian (projecting business storefront sign). An awning or canopy sign that is integrated into the design of the building. A monument sign that is integrated into the site and compatible with the building architecture.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20. Public Spaces and Plazas</td>
<td>Projects that include active, outdoor spaces, that are accessible to the public and adjacent to a public right of way: A project includes a minimum of 15% of the total lot area. A project includes a minimum of 10% of the total lot area. A project includes a minimum of 5% of the total lot area. A public space, regardless of size, that is located near a transit station and includes seating, art, protection from the elements or other feature intended to activate the space or make it comfortable (must be within 330 feet of transit station).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21. Streetscape Amenities</td>
<td>A project that includes street furniture, pedestrian amenities, public art or other similar features intended to improve the streetscape: At least 4 street furnishings At least 3 street furnishings At least 2 street furnishings</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 22. Public Artwork
Projects that include public art in a location where it is readily visible from a public space:

- 2 points per art piece, up to a maximum of 6 points

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 23. Connections and Walkways
Projects that include connections and walkways from buildings, parking lots and private open space to public spaces:

- Projects that include a minimum six foot wide ADA accessible walkway through a parking lot that is separated from vehicle drive aisles.
- Projects that include a minimum six foot wide ADA accessible sidewalk from private property to public open spaces.

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 24. Bicycle Amenities
A project that includes bicycle parking amenities in addition to what is already required in the zoning ordinance:

- The project includes lockers, changing rooms for cyclists and showers.
- The project includes any bicycle amenity identified in the Bicycle Amenity section of the Transit Station Area Development Guidelines.
- The project incorporates art into the design of the bicycle amenity.

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 25.A. Access to Transit:
A project located within close proximity to a transit station shall have the following number of points added to the development score:

- The project is located within 300 feet, measured along the most direct, legal walking path.
- The project is located within 750 feet, measured along the most direct, legal walking path.
- The project is located within 1500 feet, measured along the most direct legal walking path.

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 25.B. Access to Transit:
A development that provides transit passes to residents as follows:

- A multi-family residential development that provides transit passes to residents through the City’s transit pass program for a minimum period of three years from the development’s initial occupancy. Passes shall be available for free to residents at request. At least one pass shall be available per unit. Verification from Transportation division of minimum 3 year participation is required.

### 26. Public Walkways Interior to the Block
A development that includes public walkways through the interior of blocks:

- The project includes a narrow street or alley through the project that accommodates people walking, biking and driving.

- The project includes a walkway accessible to the public that is a minimum of 10 feet wide that connects through the property to a public space, such as park, trail or street or similar area and allows for the walkway to be continued on adjacent properties.

### 27. Parking Structure Design
Parking structures that incorporate the following:

- 100% of the parking structure is wrapped with high quality, durable materials or habitable space with a depth of at least 25’ on all street facing facades.

- 75% of the parking structure is wrapped in high quality, durable materials or habitable space with a depth of at least 25’ on all street facing facades.

- For below grade parking structures, there is no visible evidence of the parking garage other than the parking entrance. The ground floor uses must have entrances at grade, without the use of ramps, to qualify.

### 28. Alternative Vehicle Parking
Projects that include dedicated parking stalls for alternative fuel vehicles, scooters, mopeds or motorcycles:

- Parking for alternative fuel vehicles, scooters, mopeds, motorcycles, or other similar vehicle is provided at a rate equal to 7% of the total number of spaces provided for automobiles.

- A project includes dedicated parking stalls/equipment for a car sharing program.
### Points may be obtained from multiple items.

A project includes a charging station for electric vehicles:
- **Level 1 Station**: 2 pts per stall, max. 6
- **Level 2 Station**: 3 pts per stall, max. 9
- **Level 3 Station**: 4 pts per stall, max. 12

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>29. Parking Ratios</th>
<th>Projects that provide parking in the ratios indicated:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Residential developments with a parking ratio less than 1 stall per unit:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Residential development with a parking ratio less than 1.25 stall per unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Non-residential developments with a parking ratio less than 2 stalls per 1,000 gross square feet</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>30. Neighborhood Input</th>
<th>Projects that have been presented to the associated community council and have notified residents and property owners within 300 feet via mail about when and where the community council presentation will be held</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Projects that have been presented at an open house for the proposal on the development site and have notified residents and property owners within 300 feet via mail about when and where the open house will be held</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Community Engagement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approval Process</th>
<th>Applicant Total</th>
<th>Staff Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Planning Commission Review Required</td>
<td>124 points or less</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrative (Staff) Approval</td>
<td>125 points or more</td>
<td>128 113</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ATTACHMENT E: Design Review Standards

**21A.59.050: Standards for Design Review**: In addition to standards provided in other sections of this title for specific types of approval, the following standards shall be applied to all applications for design review:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard</th>
<th>Rationale</th>
<th>Finding</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A. Any new development shall comply with the intent of the purpose statement of the zoning district and specific design regulations found within the zoning district in which the project is located as well as the City’s adopted &quot;urban design element&quot; and adopted master plan policies and design guidelines governing the specific area of the proposed development.</strong></td>
<td>As reviewed previously in this Staff Report, the proposed Hardware Village II Design Review modifications meets the intent and purpose of the TSA-UC-C zoning district, as well as the Plan Salt Lake, Capitol Hill Master Plan, and the North Temple Boulevard Area Plan. For additional information and specific policy statements, refer to page four. The proposed project also meets the intent of the urban design element of the City. The Salt Lake City “urban design element” document states that high density residential house and commercial uses are appropriately located west of the central downtown area. Hardware Village II will support this objective in that it creates needed housing west of the downtown area.</td>
<td>Complies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **B. Development shall be primarily oriented to the sidewalk, not an interior courtyard or parking lot.**  
1. Primary entrances shall face the public sidewalk (secondary entrances can face a parking lot).  
2. Building(s) shall be sited close to the public sidewalk, following and responding to the desired development patterns of the neighborhood.  
3. Parking shall be located within, behind, or to the side of buildings. | While the Hardware Village II development will include rooftop community spaces and courtyards, the ground floor street facing façade's designs are oriented toward the public sidewalks. Building entrances for patrons and residents of the building will all face the street and are accessible from the sidewalk. The sidewalk abuts the building façade on Hardware Ave, 490 West and North Temple. The parking garage will be located within the building. | Complies |
| **C. Building facades shall include detailing and glass in sufficient quantities to facilitate pedestrian interest and interaction.**  
1. Locate active ground floor uses at or near the public sidewalk.  
2. Maximize transparency of | The ground floor glazing along Hardware Ave and 490 West does meet the Design Standard for glass coverage, by providing over 60% of glazing on the facades. The upper floors of the building meet the glass requirements in the Design Standards Section 21A.37.060 of Salt Lake City Zoning Code. | Complies |
ground floor facades.
3. Use or reinterpret traditional storefront elements like sign bands, clerestory glazing, articulation, and architectural detail at window transitions.
4. Locate outdoor dining patios, courtyards, plazas, habitable landscaped yards, and open spaces so that they have a direct visual connection to the street and outdoor spaces.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>D. Large building masses shall be divided into heights and sizes that relate to human scale.</th>
<th>The ground floor along North Temple does not meet the Design Standards for glass coverage, this is required at 60% of the ground floor street facing façade length. However, the placement and size of windows are sufficient to activate the public right-of-way along North Temple. While the amount of fenestration doesn’t meet the standard, the addition of the commercial space on the corner and the architectural detailing of the metal paneling along the parking garage allows for a greater degree of interaction and interest from the public right-of-way. Additional connection to pedestrians at the corner of 490 West and North Temple is provided through outdoor seating areas. A more enhanced landscape plan is proposed for North Temple area and will highlight these locations and enhance a sense of openness to this space.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Relate building scale and massing to the size and scale of existing and anticipated buildings, such as alignments with established cornice heights, building massing, step-backs and vertical emphasis.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Modulate the design of a larger building using a series of vertical or horizontal emphases to equate with the scale (heights and widths) of the buildings in the context and reduce the visual width or height.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Include secondary elements such as balconies, porches, vertical bays, belt courses, fenestration and window reveals.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Reflect the scale and solid-to-void ratio of windows and doors of the established character of the neighborhood or that which is desired in the master plan.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>E. Building facades that exceed a combined contiguous building length of two hundred feet (200’) shall include:</th>
<th>Complies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Changes in vertical plane (breaks in façade);</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Material changes; and</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

|  | Complies | October 25, 2023 | PLNPCM2022-00586 | 110 |
3. Massing changes.

| F. If provided, privately owned public spaces shall include at least three (3) of the six (6) following elements: |
|---|---|
| 1. Sitting space of at least one sitting space for each two hundred fifty (250) square feet shall be included in the plaza. Seating shall be a minimum of sixteen inches (16") in height and thirty inches (30") in width. Ledge benches shall have a minimum depth of thirty inches (30"); |
| The proposed structure will be built to and within 5' of the public right-of-way. This subsection of the chapter does not apply |
| 2. A mixture of areas that provide seasonal shade; |
| 3. Trees in proportion to the space at a minimum of one tree per eight hundred (800) square feet, at least two inch (2") caliper when planted; |
| 4. Water features or public art; |
| 5. Outdoor dining areas; and |
| 6. Other amenities not listed above that provide a public benefit. |

| G. Building height shall be modified to relate to human scale and minimize negative impacts. In downtown and in the CSHBD Sugar House Business District, building height shall contribute to a distinctive city skyline. |
|---|---|
| 1. Human scale: |
| a. Utilize stepbacks to design a building that relate to the height and scale of adjacent and nearby buildings, or where identified, goals for future scale defined in adopted master plans. |
| b. For buildings more than three stories or buildings with vertical mixed use, compose the design of a building with distinct base, middle and top sections to reduce the sense of apparent height. |
| 2. Negative impacts: |
| a. Modulate taller buildings vertically and horizontally so that it steps up or down to its neighbors. |
| The proposed building meets the minimum and maximum requirements for building height in the TSA district. |
| The ground level is stepped back to create a scale similar to surrounding buildings. The podium break creates a distinct base that divides the residential units above from below and reduces the sense of apparent height. |
| The project is massed with three distinctive courtyards above the podium level, creating minimal shadow impacts and wind breaks. Two of the three rooftop decks are located at the perimeter of the building footprint and provide breaks at the west and south facades. |
| Rooftlines and parapet heights complement the existing rooftlines of the existing buildings. Heights are varied based on the massing breaks. A roof lounge has been provided on the southeast corner of the project that provides an unobstructed view of the Salt Lake Valley. Courtyards located above the podium are landscaped and provide reduced solar gain, pollution and added storm water volume. |

Complies
b. Minimize shadow impacts of building height on the public realm and semi-public spaces by varying building massing. Demonstrate impact from shadows due to building height for the portions of the building that are subject to the request for additional height.

c. Modify tall buildings to minimize wind impacts on public and private spaces, such as the inclusion of a wind break above the first level of the building.

3. Cornices and rooflines:
   a. Shape and define rooflines to be cohesive with the building’s overall form and composition.
   b. Include roof forms that complement the rooflines of surrounding buildings.
   c. Green roof and roof deck:
      Include a green roof and/or accessible roof deck to support a more visually compelling roof landscape and reduce solar gain, air pollution, and the amount of water entering the stormwater system.

**H. Parking and on-site circulation shall be provided with an emphasis on making safe pedestrian connections to the sidewalk, transit facilities, or midblock walkway.**

Parking will be located within the building and should not negatively impact pedestrians and cyclists in the public right-of-way. The majority of the building entrances into the parking garage will be geared toward the pedestrian. A single ingress and egress access for vehicles using the parking garage will be provided along the 490 West frontage. An additional access point to the garage is provided on the alleyway. The width and location of this access is appropriate to the site and development.

**I. Waste and recycling containers, mechanical equipment, storage areas, and loading docks shall be fully screened from public view and shall incorporate building materials and detailing compatible with the building being served. Service uses shall be set back from the front line of building or located within**

The proposed development does not include exterior loading docks. All waste and recycling containers will within the building.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>the structure.</th>
<th>J. Signage shall emphasize the pedestrian/mass transit orientation.</th>
<th>Signage was not included in the design of the building. A sign permit will need to be submitted and meet these standards.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Define specific spaces for signage that are integral to building design, such as commercial sign bands framed by a material change, columns for blade signs, or other clearly articulated band on the face of the building.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Does not comply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Coordinate signage locations with appropriate lighting, awnings, and other projections.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Coordinate sign location with landscaping to avoid conflicts.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K. Lighting shall support pedestrian comfort and safety, neighborhood image, and dark sky goals.</td>
<td>A lighting plan was not submitted. The landscape design does show lighting within the trees. Lighting along the south facade, North Temple, will be required. Staff has concerns about creating an unsafe space for pedestrians that use this path after dark. Staff recommends the Planning Commission apply a condition that the applicant work with staff on an acceptable lighting plan.</td>
<td>Complies with Recommended Conditional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Provide street lights as indicated in the Salt Lake City Lighting Master Plan.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Outdoor lighting should be designed for low-level illumination and to minimize glare and light trespass onto adjacent properties and uplighting directly to the sky.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Coordinate lighting with architecture, signage, and pedestrian circulation to accentuate significant building features, improve sign legibility, and support pedestrian comfort and safety.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L. Streetscape improvements shall be provided as follows:</td>
<td>Presently the subject site is a surface parking lot; there are few trees on the site. The proposal includes a sufficient number of trees to meet the landscaping standards in the TSA zoning district with 1 tree provided for every 30’ of property frontage on a street.</td>
<td>Complies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. One street tree chosen from the street tree list consistent with the city’s urban forestry guidelines and with the approval of the city’s urban forester shall be placed for each thirty feet (30’) of property frontage on a street. Existing street trees removed as the result of a development project shall be replaced by the developer with trees approved by the city’s urban forester.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Hardscape (paving material) shall be utilized to differentiate privately owned</td>
<td>Differing paving patterns will be used to define different open spaces and to provide outdoor seating. The narrative states that different paving material will be used but is not shown on the plans. The materials proposed as hardscape and as part of the building veneer are considered durable and should withstand Salt Lake City’s climate.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
public spaces from public spaces. Hardscape for public sidewalks shall follow applicable design standards. Permitted materials for privately-owned public spaces shall meet the following standards:

a. Use materials that are durable (withstand wear, pressure, damage), require a minimum of maintenance, and are easily repairable or replaceable should damage or defacement occur.

b. Where practical, as in lower-traffic areas, use materials that allow rainwater to infiltrate into the ground and recharge the water table.

c. Limit contribution to urban heat island effect by limiting use of dark materials and incorporating materials with a high Solar-Reflective Index (SRI).

d. Utilize materials and designs that have an identifiable relationship to the character of the site, the neighborhood, or Salt Lake City.

e. Use materials (like textured ground surfaces) and features (like ramps and seating at key resting points) to support access and comfort for people of all abilities.

f. Asphalt shall be limited to vehicle drive aisles.

The building materials and design are compatible to the area and will further the character of the neighborhood and the connections with the Frontrunner and TRAX stations.
ATTACHMENT F: Public Process & Comments

Public Notice, Meetings, Comments

The following is a list of public meetings that have been held, and other public input opportunities, related to the proposed project since the applications were submitted:

- **August 26, 2022** – The Capitol Hill, Downtown, and Fairpark Community Council was sent the 45 day required notice for recognized community organizations. The comment period ended on October 10, 2022.
- **August 30, 2022** - Property owners and residents within 300 feet of the development were provided early notification of the proposal.
- **September - October 2022** – The project was posted to the Online Open House webpage.

Notice of the public hearing for the proposal included:

- **October 12, 2022**
  - Public hearing notice sign posted on the property
- **October 12, 2022**
  - Public hearing notice mailed
  - Public notice posted on City and State websites and Planning Division list serve

Public Comment:

No public comment was received.
This proposal was reviewed by the following departments. Any requirement identified by a City Department is required to be complied with.

**Building:** Comments provided by Todd Christopher

No Comments

**Engineering:** Comments provided by Scott Weiler on

Please design the public improvements in 490 West/500 West per APWA Standards.
Prior to performing work in the public way, a Permit to Work in the Public Way must be obtained.
Please work directly with Rocky Mountain Power as soon as electrical load can be projected.
Notice: Direct Assigned Facilities (transformers, metering equipment, and some system equipment) are not allowed in the public right-of-way. Know your space, plan for your utility service, and work with Rocky Mountain Power. Developer will be required to make needed adjustment(s) to site plan in order to accommodate direct assigned facilities on private property.

Direct Assigned Facilities means facilities or portions of facilities that are constructed for the sole use/benefit of a particular customer requesting service from Rocky Mountain Power.

**Fire:** Comments provided by Douglas Bateman on 3/22/22

*Approved fire apparatus access roads shall be provided for every facility, building or portion of a building hereafter constructed or moved into; and shall extend to within 150 feet of all portions of the facility and all portions of the exterior walls of the first story of the building as measured by an approved route around the exterior of the building or facility. Due to interior court yard an AMM will be necessary to provide additional fire protection measures

*Fire apparatus access roads shall have an unobstructed width of not less than 20 feet for buildings 30-feet an less, exclusive of shoulders, except for approved security gates in accordance with Section 503.6, and an unobstructed vertical clearance of not less than 13 feet 6 inches. Buildings greater than 30 feet shall have a road width of not less than 26 feet. Fire apparatus access roads with fire hydrants on them shall be 26-feet in width; at a minimum of 20-feet to each side of the hydrant in the direction or road travel.

*Fire apparatus access roads shall be designed and maintained to support the imposed loads of fire apparatus (80,000 pounds) and shall be surfaced to provide all-weather driving capabilities.

*The required turning radius of a fire apparatus access road shall be the following: Inside radius is 20 feet, outside is 45-feet

*Buildings or portions of buildings constructed or moved into or within the jurisdiction is more than 400 feet from a hydrant on a fire apparatus access road, as measured by an approved route around the exterior of the facility or building, on-site fire hydrants and mains shall be provided where required by the fire code official. Additional fire hydrants may be necessary dependent on total square footage and required fire flows in accordance with IFC appendix B and C

*Fire department connections shall be located on the street address side of buildings, fully visible and recognizable from the street, and have a fire hydrant within 100-feet on the same side of the street.
*Where a fire hydrant is located on a fire apparatus access road, the minimum road width shall be 26 feet, exclusive of shoulders.
*Aerial fire apparatus access roads shall be provided where the highest roof surface exceeds 30 feet measured from grade plane. For purposes of this section, the highest roof surface shall be determined by measurement to the eave of a pitched roof, the intersection of the roof to the exterior wall, or the top of parapet walls, whichever is greater. Some exceptions have been added by SLC; those can be obtained from this office.
*Aerial fire apparatus access roads shall have a minimum unobstructed width of 26 feet, exclusive of shoulders. Aerial access routes shall be located not less than 15 feet and not greater than 30 feet from the building and shall be positioned parallel to one entire side of the building.
*Overhead utility and power lines shall not be located over the aerial fire apparatus access road or between the aerial fire apparatus road and the building.

**Sustainability:**

No comments provided.

**Transportation:** Comments provided by Kevin Young

- The street system gets confusing in this area between 490 W and 500 W. South of North Temple, 500 W is on the east side of the railroad tracks. North of North Temple, 500 W is on the west side of the railroad tracks and 490 W is on the east side of the railroad tracks. The address should refer to 490 W, not 500 W, in the location of this development.

The applicant needs to provide, as applicable to project, updated parking calculations indicating the following:
• Each type of use and associated parking ratio per 21A.44.030
• Minimum number of ADA parking spaces required (21A.44.020.D)
• Minimum number of passenger vehicle parking spaces required (21A.44.030.G)
• Maximum number of passenger vehicles parking spaces required (21A.44.030.H)
• Minimum number of electric vehicle parking spaces required (21A.44.050.B.2)
• Minimum number of bicycle parking spaces required (21A.44.050.B.3)
• Minimum number of loading berths required (21A.44.080)
• Any modifications to parking requirements (21A.44.040)
• Number of parking spaces provided (include both existing and proposed quantities)

The applicant needs to provide, as applicable to project, the following details:
• ADA parking stall dimensions, signage, pavement markings, and ramps.
• Parking stall and aisle width dimensions
• Signage and/or pavement markings for electric vehicle parking spaces indicating exclusive availability for electric vehicles (see 21A.44.050.B.2).
• Bike rack installation (See SLC Transportation Standard Detail, F1.f2, “Bicycle Parking” @ http://www.slcdocs.com/transportation/design/pdf/F1.f2.pdf.

**Police:** Comments provided by

I have two primary concerns, both concerning the North Temple side. First, I can’t remember how high the walls are on the North Temple viaduct. I am assuming they are already high/thick enough for vehicles involved in a traffic accident traveling westbound on North Temple to keep from falling off the
viaduct onto the pedestrian walkway on the other side. If that is accurate, then my concern is alleviated. Second, I agree with your assessment that pedestrian use on the North Temple side needs to be considered. Having a dark, closed space with little visibility, access, or lighting will create a space that will be highly conducive to criminal activity. To keep that space safe, the north temple sidewalk portion must be as visible, interactive, and light as possible.

Public Utilities: Comments provided by Kristeen Beitel

The following comments are provided for information only and do not provide official project review or approval. Comments are provided to assist in design and development by providing guidance for project requirements.

- Public Utility permit, connection, survey, and inspection fees will apply.
- All utility design and construction must comply with APWA Standards and SLCPU Standard Practices.
- All utilities must meet horizontal and vertical clearance requirements. Water and sewer lines require 10 ft minimum horizontal separation and 18” minimum vertical separation. Sewer must maintain 5 ft minimum horizontal separation and 12” vertical separation from any non-water utilities. Water must maintain 3 ft minimum horizontal separation and 12” vertical separation from any non-sewer utilities.
- Public street lights will be required on 490 West. Contact SLCPU Street Light Program Manager, Dave Pearson (801-483-6738), for additional information regarding street lights.
- Utilities cannot cross property lines without appropriate easements and agreements between property owners.
- Site utility, grading, erosion control, and plumbing plans will be required for building permit review. Submit supporting documents and calculations along with the plans.
- As shown in the Design Review package, a new public water main will be required to provide water service to this project. A plan and profile and Engineer’s cost estimate must be submitted for review. The property owner is required to bond for the amount of the approved cost estimate.
- One culinary water meter and fire lines, as required, are permitted per parcel. Because the parcel is larger than 0.5 acres, a separate irrigation meter may also be permitted. Each service must have a separate tap to the main.
- Water meters 4” or larger require a justification letter prior to approval. Applicant will be required to provide a memo with calculations to justify the sizing of the proposed water meter. Calculations must prove that it is necessary beyond what can be provided with a 3” water meter for average daily flows. If approved, the water meter will require additional monthly fees. Applicant will also need to provide the estimated average daily flow in GPD to calculate the required fees.
- Any food and beverage processing, preparation, and service requires grease removal prior to discharge to the public sewer system. Treatment must be provided such that the discharge limit of 500 mg/L of FOG (fats, oils, and grease) is achieved. Applicant will be required to provide a treatment device and plan for treatment and sampling that meets this discharge limit and all applicable standards set forth in the Utah plumbing code and SLCPU Standards. Treatment device shall be located as to be readily accessible for cleaning and inspection. The treatment device must be sized by a licensed design professional. For an exterior, below grade device, a 4 foot diameter sampling manhole, per APWA 411, must be located downstream of the interceptor and upstream of any other connections. For alternative treatment methods, a sampling point must be provided immediately downstream of the device and upstream of any other connections. Plumbing plans must show two separate waste streams - one for grease and one for sewer.
• Covered parking area drains are required to be treated to remove solids and oils prior to discharge to the sanitary sewer. These drains cannot be discharged to the storm drain. Use a sand/oil separator or similar device. A 4ft diameter sampling manhole must be located downstream of the device and upstream of any other connections.

• As shown in the Design Review package, a new sewer main will be required at the property owner’s expense to serve this development. The new sewer main must run the entire frontage of the property. A plan and profile and Engineer’s cost estimate must be submitted for review. The property owner is required to bond for the amount of the approved cost estimate.

• Site stormwater must be collected on site and routed to the public storm drain system. Stormwater cannot discharge across property lines or public sidewalks.

• Stormwater treatment is required prior to discharge to the public storm drain. Utilize stormwater Best Management Practices (BMP’s) to remove solids and oils. Green Infrastructure should be used whenever possible. Green Infrastructure and LID treatment of stormwater is a design requirement and required by the Salt Lake City UPDES permit for Municipal Separate Storm Sewer System (MS4). This permit was updated with this requirement in June 2021. The applicant will need to provide options for stormwater treatment and retention for the 80th percentile storm. If additional property is not available, there are other options such as green roof or other BMP’s. Lack of room or cost is generally not an exception for this requirement. If green infrastructure is not used, then applicant must provide documentation of what green infrastructure measures were considered and why these were not deemed feasible. Please verify that plans include appropriate treatment measures. Please visit the following websites for guidance with Low Impact Development: https://deq.utah.gov/water-quality/low-impact-development?form=MY01SV&OCID=MY01SV and https://documents.deq.utah.gov/water-quality/stormwater/updes/DWQ-2019-000161.pdf?form=MY01SV&OCID=MY01SV.

• Stormwater detention is required for this project. The allowable release rate is 0.2 cfs per acre. Detention must be sized using the 100-year 3-hour design storm using the farmer Fletcher rainfall distribution. Provide a complete Technical Drainage Study including all calculations, figures, model output, certification, summary and discussion.

• Projects larger than one acre require that a Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan (SWPPP) is submitted for review.

Urban Forestry:

No comments provided