



# MEMORANDUM

PLANNING DIVISION  
DEPARTMENT of COMMUNITY and NEIGHBORHOODS

**To:** Salt Lake City Historic Landmark Commission  
**From:** Katia Pace, 801 535-6354, [katia.pace@slcgov.com](mailto:katia.pace@slcgov.com)  
**Date:** September 1, 2022  
**Re:** PLNHLC2022-00665 – Minor Alterations for an addition and chimney removal @  
130 U Street

A staff report for petition (PLNHLC2022-00665) for a minor alteration at a property located at 130 U St. was originally published on the city’s website and made available to the public on August 25, 2022. In this report it was recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approved a proposed addition to the structure but to deny the removal of a chimney located on the rear side of the home. After further review of the analysis of the Historic Overlay Standards and staff’s recommendation, staff found that the request for the removal of the chimney did not present substantial reason for denial. Staff updated the analysis of the Historic Overlay Standards and changed the recommendation to reflect the analysis. The purpose of this memo is to present the updated analysis for the removal of the chimney and the addition, and provide an updated recommendation based upon the analysis.

### Changes to Attachment E: Analysis of Historic Overlay Standards

The following table is to replace the Attachment E: Analysis of Historic Overlay Standards in the staff report and it should be used to review this project.

#### 21A.34.020 – Historic Preservation Overlay District

G. Standards For Certificate Of Appropriateness For Alteration Of A Landmark Site Or Contributing Structure Including New Construction Of An Accessory Structure: In considering an application for a certificate of appropriateness for alteration of a landmark site or contributing structure, the Historic Landmark Commission, or the Planning Director, for administrative decisions, shall find that the project substantially complies with all of the following general standards that pertain to the application and that the decision is in the best interest of the City.

Standard	Finding	Analysis
1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be used for a purpose that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.	<b>Complies</b>	The subject property is a residential property. The proposed addition will not change the residential land use, the proposal is to do an addition within an existing rear porch.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.	<b>Does not comply</b>	<b>Chimney</b> The proposed addition includes the removal of an existing chimney on the rear. Original roof form and features should be preserved including historic chimneys. However, this

	<b>Complies</b>	<p>chimney is not readily visible from the street and will have minimal impact on the visual character of this house from the public right of way.</p> <p><b>Addition</b> The proposed addition is located to the rear where it will have a minimal impact on the visual character of the historic structure from the public right of way.</p>
3. All sites, structures and objects shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create a false sense of history or architecture are not allowed.	<p><b>Not Applicable</b></p> <p><b>Complies</b></p>	<p><b>Chimney</b> The removal of the chimney does not create a false sense of history.</p> <p><b>Addition</b> The proposed addition will be clad in Alaskan yellow cedar, a different material to differentiate from the original brick structure.</p>
4. Alterations or additions that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.	<b>Not Applicable</b>	The proposed addition will not remove any historic features which have gained significance in their own right.
5. Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.	<p><b>Does not comply</b></p> <p><b>Complies</b></p>	<p><b>Chimney</b> The proposed addition includes the removal of an existing chimney on the rear. Original roof form and features should be preserved including historic chimneys. However, this chimney is not readily visible from the street and will have minimal impact on the visual character of this house from the public right of way.</p> <p><b>Addition</b> The proposal is to replace a rear window with a shorter wood clad window with the same profile and depth to the façade of the building. The outline of the original brick window opening will be retained. This window is on the south façade</p>

		at the rear of the property and is not visible from the street. The replacement of the rear window is allowed on the rear and when located outside of the public view.
6. Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced wherever feasible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other structures or objects.	<b>Not applicable</b>	No deteriorated architectural features are being repaired or replaced.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.	<b>Not Applicable</b>	The applicant has not proposed any chemical or physical treatments to clean the surface of the primary structure.
8. Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant cultural, historical, architectural or archaeological material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment.	<b>Complies</b>  <b>Complies</b>	<b>Chimney</b> The request to remove the chimney is to give room to the addition. Staff finds that this chimney is a character defining feature but that due to its location it's not considered to be significant. There are two remaining chimneys that are visible from the street that will be preserved.  <b>Addition</b> The proposed addition will be compatible with the size, scale and material of the property.
9. Additions or alterations to structures and objects shall be done in such a manner that if such alterations or additions were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired. The new work shall be	<b>Not Applicable</b>	<b>Chimney</b> The removal of the chimney will not result in the essential form of the home to be impaired.

<p>differentiated from the old and shall be compatible in massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.</p>	<p><b>Complies</b></p>	<p><b>Addition</b>  The proposed addition is an infill of an existing porch. It's unlikely that the addition will be removed, but it will be constructed in such a way that if it were removed, the integrity of the structure would not be adversely affected.</p>
<p>10. Certain building materials are prohibited including the following:  A. Aluminum, asbestos, or vinyl cladding when applied directly to an original or historic material.</p>	<p><b>Complies</b></p>	<p>The applicant is not proposing any of the prohibited materials applied directly to any historic materials.</p>
<p>11. Any new sign and any change in the appearance of any existing sign located on a landmark site or within the H Historic Preservation Overlay District, which is visible from any public way or open space shall be consistent with the historic character of the landmark site or H Historic Preservation Overlay District and shall comply with the standards outlined in chapter 21A.46 of this title.</p>	<p><b>Not Applicable</b></p>	<p>The applicant is not proposing the installation or modification of any signage with this request.</p>

**Updated Recommendation**

The following recommendation was rewritten to reflect the analysis of the project:

Based on the information in this staff report, Planning Staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness (CoA) for the proposed addition and for the proposed removal of the chimney.