

Motion Sheet for PLNPCM2021-00822 and 2021-00835 – Pacific Yard – Planned Development & Design Review

Motion to approve the Planned Development:

Based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for Planned Development have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Planning Commission approve the request for Planned Development for new mixed-use construction in the CG zoning district at approximately 43 W 700 South, 720 S 400 West, and 704 S 400 West with the following conditions:

1. Final approval of the details for public art, development and site lighting (including the mid-block walkway), street lighting, streetscape details, street furniture, midblock walkway paving, sidewalk paving and landscaping to be delegated to Planning Staff to ensure compliance with the standards for Design Review as well as the Downtown Community Plan.
2. Applicant to mitigate the building mass and improve the relationship of building height to human scale through provision of an awning of 4' in depth, subject to an encroachment agreement approved by all required City divisions and departments.
3. Final approval a tree form with a spreading canopy in the park strip, that will also meet the needs of the Urban Forestry Division and relevant utility companies to be delegated to Planning Staff.
4. A public easement will be recorded on the property for the midblock walkway. A sign will be posted on the midblock walkway stating it is open to the public.
5. A complete lot consolidation application for the three existing parcels shall be submitted and approved.

Motion to approve the Design Review:

Based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for Design Review have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Planning Commission approve the request for Design Review for additional height for new mixed-use construction in the CG zoning district at approximately 43 W 700 South, 720 S 400 West, and 704 S 400 West with the following conditions:

1. Final approval of the details for public art, development and site lighting (including the mid-block walkway), street lighting, streetscape details, street furniture, midblock walkway paving, sidewalk paving and landscaping to be delegated to Planning Staff to ensure compliance with the standards for Design Review as well as the Downtown Community Plan.
2. Applicant to mitigate the building mass and improve the relationship of building height to human scale through provision of an awning of 4' in depth, subject to an encroachment agreement approved by all required City divisions and departments.
3. Final approval a tree form with a spreading canopy in the park strip, that will also meet the needs of the Urban Forestry Division and relevant utility companies to be delegated to Planning Staff.
4. A public easement will be recorded on the property for the midblock walkway. A sign will be posted on the midblock walkway stating it is open to the public.
5. A complete lot consolidation application for the three existing parcels shall be submitted and approved.

Motion to deny the Planned Development:

Based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for Planned Development have not been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Planning Commission deny the request for Planned Development at approximately 43 W 700 South, 720 S 400 West, and 704 S 400 West. Specifically, the Commission finds that the proposed project does not comply with Standards (Commissioner then states findings based on the Standards (following) to support the motion):

21A.55.050: STANDARDS FOR PLANNED DEVELOPMENTS:

The Planning Commission may approve, approve with conditions, or deny a planned development based upon written findings of fact according to each of the following standards. It is the responsibility of the applicant to provide written and graphic evidence demonstrating compliance with the following standards:

- A. **Planned Development Objectives:** The planned development shall meet the purpose statement for a planned development (section [21A.55.010](#) of this chapter) and will achieve at least one of the objectives stated in said section. To determine if a planned development objective has been achieved, the applicant shall demonstrate that at least one of the strategies associated with the objective are included in the proposed planned development. The applicant shall also demonstrate why modifications to the zoning regulations are necessary to meet the purpose statement for a planned development. The Planning Commission should consider the relationship between the proposed modifications to the zoning regulations and the purpose of a planned development, and determine if the project will result in a more enhanced product than would be achievable through strict application of the land use regulations.
- B. **Master Plan Compatibility:** The proposed planned development is generally consistent with adopted policies set forth in the Citywide, community, and/or small area Master Plan that is applicable to the site where the planned development will be located.
- C. **Design And Compatibility:** The proposed planned development is compatible with the area the planned development will be located and is designed to achieve a more enhanced product than would be achievable through strict application of land use regulations. In determining design and compatibility, the Planning Commission should consider:
 1. Whether the scale, mass, and intensity of the proposed planned development is compatible with the neighborhood where the planned development will be located and/or the policies stated in an applicable Master Plan related to building and site design;
 2. Whether the building orientation and building materials in the proposed planned development are compatible with the neighborhood where the planned development will be located and/or the policies stated in an applicable Master Plan related to building and site design;
 3. Whether building setbacks along the perimeter of the development:
 - a. Maintain the visual character of the neighborhood or the character described in the applicable Master Plan.
 - b. Provide sufficient space for private amenities.
 - c. Provide sufficient open space buffering between the proposed development and neighboring properties to minimize impacts related to privacy and noise.
 - d. Provide adequate sight lines to streets, driveways and sidewalks.
 - e. Provide sufficient space for maintenance.
 4. Whether building facades offer ground floor transparency, access, and architectural detailing to facilitate pedestrian interest and interaction;
 5. Whether lighting is designed for safety and visual interest while minimizing impacts on surrounding property;
 6. Whether dumpsters, loading docks and/or service areas are appropriately screened; and
 7. Whether parking areas are appropriately buffered from adjacent uses.
- D. **Landscaping:** The proposed planned development preserves, maintains or provides native landscaping where appropriate. In determining the landscaping for the proposed planned development, the Planning Commission should consider:
 1. Whether mature native trees located along the periphery of the property and along the street are preserved and maintained;
 2. Whether existing landscaping that provides additional buffering to the abutting properties is maintained and preserved;
 3. Whether proposed landscaping is designed to lessen potential impacts created by the proposed planned development; and
 4. Whether proposed landscaping is appropriate for the scale of the development.
- E. **Mobility:** The proposed planned development supports Citywide transportation goals and promotes safe and efficient circulation within the site and surrounding neighborhood. In determining mobility, the Planning Commission should consider:

1. Whether drive access to local streets will negatively impact the safety, purpose and character of the street;
 2. Whether the site design considers safe circulation for a range of transportation options including:
 - a. Safe and accommodating pedestrian environment and pedestrian oriented design;
 - b. Bicycle facilities and connections where appropriate, and orientation to transit where available; and
 - c. Minimizing conflicts between different transportation modes;
 3. Whether the site design of the proposed development promotes or enables access to adjacent uses and amenities;
 4. Whether the proposed design provides adequate emergency vehicle access; and
 5. Whether loading access and service areas are adequate for the site and minimize impacts to the surrounding area and public rights-of-way.
- F. Existing Site Features: The proposed planned development preserves natural and built features that significantly contribute to the character of the neighborhood and/or environment.
- G. Utilities: Existing and/or planned utilities will adequately serve the development and not have a detrimental effect on the surrounding area. (Ord. 8-18, 2018)

Motion to deny the Design Review:

Based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for Design Review have not been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Planning Commission deny the request for Design Review for additional height at approximately 43 W 700 South, 720 S 400 West, and 704 S 400 West. Specifically, the Commission finds that the proposed project does not comply with Standards (Commissioner then states findings based on the Standards (following) to support the motion):

21A.59.050: STANDARDS FOR DESIGN REVIEW:

The standards in this section apply to all applications for design review as follows:

For applications seeking modification of base zoning design standards, applicants shall demonstrate how the applicant's proposal complies with the standards for design review that are directly applicable to the design standard(s) that is proposed to be modified.

For applications that are required to go through the design review process for purposes other than a modification to a base zoning standard, the applicant shall demonstrate how the proposed project complies with each standard for design review. If an application complies with a standard in the base zoning district or with an applicable requirement in [chapter 21A.37](#) of this title and that standard is directly related to a standard found in this section, the Planning Commission shall find that application complies with the specific standard for design review found in this section. An applicant may propose an alternative to a standard for design review provided the proposal is consistent with the intent of the standard for design review.

A. Any new development shall comply with the intent of the purpose statement of the zoning district and specific design regulations found within the zoning district in which the project is located as well as the City's adopted "urban design element" and adopted master plan policies and design guidelines governing the specific area of the proposed development.

- B. Development shall be primarily oriented to the sidewalk, not an interior courtyard or parking lot.
1. Primary entrances shall face the public sidewalk (secondary entrances can face a parking lot).
 2. Building(s) shall be sited close to the public sidewalk, following and responding to the desired development patterns of the neighborhood.
 3. Parking shall be located within, behind, or to the side of buildings.

C. Building facades shall include detailing and glass in sufficient quantities to facilitate pedestrian interest and interaction.

1. Locate active ground floor uses at or near the public sidewalk.
 2. Maximize transparency of ground floor facades.
 3. Use or reinterpret traditional storefront elements like sign bands, clerestory glazing, articulation, and architectural detail at window transitions.
 4. Locate outdoor dining patios, courtyards, plazas, habitable landscaped yards, and open spaces so that they have a direct visual connection to the street and outdoor spaces.
- D. Large building masses shall be divided into heights and sizes that relate to human scale.
1. Relate building scale and massing to the size and scale of existing and anticipated buildings, such as alignments with established cornice heights, building massing, step-backs and vertical emphasis.
 2. Modulate the design of a larger building using a series of vertical or horizontal emphases to equate with the scale (heights and widths) of the buildings in the context and reduce the visual width or height.
 3. Include secondary elements such as balconies, porches, vertical bays, belt courses, fenestration and window reveals.
 4. Reflect the scale and solid-to-void ratio of windows and doors of the established character of the neighborhood or that which is desired in the master plan.
- E. Building facades that exceed a combined contiguous building length of two hundred feet (200') shall include:
1. Changes in vertical plane (breaks in facade);
 2. Material changes; and
 3. Massing changes.
- F. If provided, privately-owned public spaces shall include at least three (3) of the six (6) following elements:
1. Sitting space of at least one sitting space for each two hundred fifty (250) square feet shall be included in the plaza. Seating shall be a minimum of sixteen inches (16") in height and thirty inches (30") in width. Ledge benches shall have a minimum depth of thirty inches (30");
 2. A mixture of areas that provide seasonal shade;
 3. Trees in proportion to the space at a minimum of one tree per eight hundred (800) square feet, at least two inch (2") caliper when planted;
 4. Water features or public art;
 5. Outdoor dining areas; and
 6. Other amenities not listed above that provide a public benefit.
- G. Building height shall be modified to relate to human scale and minimize negative impacts. In downtown and in the CSHBD Sugar House Business District, building height shall contribute to a distinctive City skyline.
1. Human scale:
 - a. Utilize stepbacks to design a building that relate to the height and scale of adjacent and nearby buildings, or where identified, goals for future scale defined in adopted master plans.
 - b. For buildings more than three (3) stories or buildings with vertical mixed use, compose the design of a building with distinct base, middle and top sections to reduce the sense of apparent height.
 2. Negative impacts:
 - a. Modulate taller buildings vertically and horizontally so that it steps up or down to its neighbors.
 - b. Minimize shadow impacts of building height on the public realm and semi-public spaces by varying building massing. Demonstrate impact from shadows due to building height for the portions of the building that are subject to the request for additional height.
 - c. Modify tall buildings to minimize wind impacts on public and private spaces, such as the inclusion of a wind break above the first level of the building.
 3. Cornices and rooflines:
 - a. Cohesiveness: Shape and define rooflines to be cohesive with the building's overall form and composition.
 - b. Complement Surrounding Buildings: Include roof forms that complement the rooflines of surrounding buildings.

- c. Green Roof And Roof Deck: Include a green roof and/or accessible roof deck to support a more visually compelling roof landscape and reduce solar gain, air pollution, and the amount of water entering the stormwater system.
- H. Parking and on site circulation shall be provided with an emphasis on making safe pedestrian connections to the sidewalk, transit facilities, or midblock walkway.
- I. Waste and recycling containers, mechanical equipment, storage areas, and loading docks shall be fully screened from public view and shall incorporate building materials and detailing compatible with the building being served. Service uses shall be set back from the front line of building or located within the structure. (See subsection 21A.37.050K of this title.)
- J. Signage shall emphasize the pedestrian/mass transit orientation.
- 1. Define specific spaces for signage that are integral to building design, such as commercial sign bands framed by a material change, columns for blade signs, or other clearly articulated band on the face of the building.
 - 2. Coordinate signage locations with appropriate lighting, awnings, and other projections.
 - 3. Coordinate sign location with landscaping to avoid conflicts.
- K. Lighting shall support pedestrian comfort and safety, neighborhood image, and dark sky goals.
- 1. Provide street lights as indicated in the Salt Lake City Lighting Master Plan.
 - 2. Outdoor lighting should be designed for low-level illumination and to minimize glare and light trespass onto adjacent properties and uplighting directly to the sky.
 - 3. Coordinate lighting with architecture, signage, and pedestrian circulation to accentuate significant building features, improve sign legibility, and support pedestrian comfort and safety.
- L. Streetscape improvements shall be provided as follows:
- 1. One street tree chosen from the street tree list consistent with the City's urban forestry guidelines and with the approval of the City's Urban Forester shall be placed for each thirty feet (30') of property frontage on a street. Existing street trees removed as the result of a development project shall be replaced by the developer with trees approved by the City's Urban Forester.
 - 2. Hardscape (paving material) shall be utilized to differentiate privately-owned public spaces from public spaces. Hardscape for public sidewalks shall follow applicable design standards. Permitted materials for privately-owned public spaces shall meet the following standards:
 - a. Use materials that are durable (withstand wear, pressure, damage), require a minimum of maintenance, and are easily repairable or replaceable should damage or defacement occur.
 - b. Where practical, as in lower-traffic areas, use materials that allow rainwater to infiltrate into the ground and recharge the water table.
 - c. Limit contribution to urban heat island effect by limiting use of dark materials and incorporating materials with a high Solar- Reflective Index (SRI).
 - d. Utilize materials and designs that have an identifiable relationship to the character of the site, the neighborhood, or Salt Lake City.
 - e. Use materials (like textured ground surfaces) and features (like ramps and seating at key resting points) to support access and comfort for people of all abilities.
 - f. Asphalt shall be limited to vehicle drive aisles. (Ord. 14-19, 2019)