

SALT LAKE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
This meeting was held electronically pursuant to the
Salt Lake City Emergency Proclamation
Wednesday, December 9, 2020

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Planning Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:30:12 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Planning Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Planning Commission meeting were: Chairperson, Brenda Scheer; Vice Chairperson, Amy Barry; Commissioners Maurine Bachman, Adrienne Bell, Jon Lee, Matt Lyon, Sara Urquhart, and Crystal Young-Otterstrom. Commissioners Carolynn Hoskins and Andres Paredes were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director; Molly Robinson, Planning Manager; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Lex Traughber, Senior Planner; Mayara Lima, Principal Planner; Amy Thompson, Senior Planner; David Gellner, Principal Planner; Aaron Barlow, Principal Planner; and Marlene Rankins, Administrative Secretary.

Chairperson Brenda Scheer, read the Salt Lake City Emergency Proclamation.

Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director, provided the public with instructions on how to participate during the public hearing.

APPROVAL OF THE NOVEMBER 18, 2020 & DECEMBER 2, 2020, MEETING MINUTES. [5:34:43 PM](#)
MOTION [5:35:18 PM](#)

Commissioner Urquhart moved to approve the November 18, 2020 and the December 2, 2020 meeting minutes.

Commissioner Young-Otterstrom seconded the motion. Commissioners Urquhart, Young-Otterstrom, Lyon, Barry, Bachman, and Bell voted “Aye”. Commissioner Lee abstained from voting. The motion passed.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR [5:36:24 PM](#)

Chairperson Scheer stated she had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Barry stated she had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR [5:36:32 PM](#)

Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director, stated she had nothing to report.

[5:36:56 PM](#)

Bishop Place (formerly The Quince) Planned Development & Subdivision at approximately 432 North 300 West - Paul Garbett, representing Garbett Homes, has submitted applications for Planned Development and Preliminary Subdivision for a single-family attached residential development of 24 dwelling units, in a configuration of six separate buildings, located at approximately 432 N. 300 West (Bishop Place – a private street). Currently, the properties associated with the proposed development are occupied by abandoned structures that have been approved for demolition. The subject property is zoned SR-3 (Special Development Pattern Residential District) and is located within Council District 3 represented by Chris Wharton (Staff contact: Lex Traughber at (385) 226-9056 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com)

- a. **Planned Development** – This project request requires Planned Development approval for new residential construction without public street frontage and the averaging of overall lot sizes to meet the minimum lot size required by zone **Case number PLNSUB2019-01159**
- b. **Subdivision** – The applicant is requesting approval for preliminary subdivision to create 24 lots for residential development **Case number PLNSUB2019-01160**

Lex Traughber, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the request as outlined in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification of the request

Paul Garbett, applicant, provided a presentation with further details.

PUBLIC HEARING [5:55:17 PM](#)

Chairperson Scheer opened the Public Hearing;

Zachary Dussault – Stated his support of the request.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Scheer closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [5:57:18 PM](#)

Commissioner Young-Otterstrom stated, based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for Planned Development have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Planning Commission approve the request for Planned Development located at approximately 432 N. 300 West (Bishop Place).

Commissioner Lyon seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Barry, Bell, Lee, Lyon, Urquhart, and Young-Otterstrom voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

MOTION [5:58:46 PM](#)

Commissioner Young-Otterstrom stated, based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for Subdivision have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Planning Commission approve the request for Subdivision located at approximately 432 N. 300 West (Bishop Place).

Commissioner Bell seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Barry, Bell, Lee, Lyon, Urquhart, and Young-Otterstrom voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

[6:00:01 PM](#)

Alta Depot Planned Development & Design Review at approximately 565 West 100 South - Studio PBA, representing the property owner, WP West Acquisitions, LLC, is requesting Planned Development and Design Review approval for a 288-unit multi-family residential complex consisting of four stories of residential construction wrapped around a five-story parking structure located at approximately 565 W. 100 South. Planned Development approval is required for all new construction in the G-MU zoning district. The applicant is also requesting a modification to exterior building materials through the Design Review process. The subject property is zoned G-MU (Gateway Mixed Use District) and is located within Council District 4 represented by Ana Valdemoros (Staff contact: Lex Traughber at (385) 226-9056 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com)

- a. **Planned Development** – Planned Development approval is required for all new construction in the G-MU zoning district **Case number PLNPCM2020-00221**
- b. **Design Review** – The applicant is also requesting a modification to exterior building materials through the Design Review process **Case number PLNPCM2020-00220**

Lex Traugher, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the request with the conditions listed in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification on whether public art is a requirement in the GM-U zone

Robert Miiller, applicant, provided a presentation with further design details.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on location of the metal material
- Mid-block walkway and whether it will be open to the public
- Clarification on number of units, parking spaces, and bicycle storage

PUBLIC HEARING [6:23:06 PM](#)

Chairperson Scheer opened the Public Hearing;

Zachary Dussault – Stated he likes the mid-block walkway but dislikes the rest of the proposal.

Michaela Fife – Raised concerns with the gated mid-block walkway.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Scheer closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant further discussed the following:

- Clarification on whether the closed gates are temporary plans
- Public accessibility
- Whether there is a public easement
- Clarification on who owns the alley way
- Whether fire accesses are required to remain open
- Whether the North to South mid-block walkway will be open to the public
- Whether the commission can require that the access to the mid-block walkway remain accessible to the public
- Clarification on conditions of approval

MOTION [6:43:51 PM](#)

Commissioner Bell stated, based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for Planned Development have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Planning Commission approve the request for Planned Development for new multi-family residential construction in the G-MU zoning district located at approximately 565 West 100 South, subject to three conditions as noted in the staff report dated 12/9/2020. With the following modification:

1. **That condition #2 reads a public easement will be recorded on the property with a new East/West mid-block walkway.**

Commissioner Bachman seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Barry, Bell, Lee, Lyon, Urquhart, and Young-Otterstrom voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

[6:45:42 PM](#)

Chrome Works at approximately 269 W Brooklyn Avenue - SMH Builders, representing the property owner, is requesting approval to build a 234-unit multi-family building at the above-listed address. Currently the land is used for outdoor storage and it is zoned CG (General Commercial). The subject property is located within Council District 5, represented by Darin Mano (Staff contact: Mayara Lima at (385) 377-7570 or mayara.lima@slcgov.com)

- a. **Design Review** - Request to increase the allowable building height from 60 feet to 79.5 feet
Case number PLNPCM2020-00610
- b. **Planned Development** - Request to allow canopy and balcony encroachments into the required front yard
Case number PLNPCM2020-00843

Mayara Lima, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the request with the conditions listed in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification on the location of the mesh screens

George Hauser, applicant, provided a presentation with further design details.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Whether there is any internal bicycle parking

PUBLIC HEARING [7:08:10 PM](#)

Chairperson Scheer opened the Public Hearing;

Amy Hawkins, Community Council – Stated her support of the request.

Michael Fife – Raised concerns with parking.

Zachary Dussault – Stated his support of the request.

Terrell Bodily – Stated his support of the request.

Paul Johnson, Chairperson of the Central 9th Community Council – Stated his support of the request. He also raised concerns with the pedestrian access.

Matt Haydon – Stated his opposition of the request.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Scheer closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Whether there are any future land use projects for this area
- Whether the commission can initiate a master plan incorporating similar developments, so that as different pieces get developed the commission has a vision as well

MOTION [7:31:51 PM](#)

Commissioner Young-Otterstrom stated, based on the findings and analysis in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Planning Commission approve the request for Design Review and Planned Development for a new multi-family building at 269 W Brooklyn Avenue as proposed in PLNPCM2020-00610 and PLNPCM2020-00843, with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Commissioner Barry seconded the motion. Commissioners Young-Otterstrom, Urquhart, Lyon, Lee, Bell, Barry, and Bachman voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

[7:34:14 PM](#)

Design Review Modifications at approximately 255 South State Street - 255 S State Street is a mixed-use project that consists of two buildings, a north tower and a south tower, with a midblock pedestrian walkway that runs through the center of the towers providing pedestrian connections from State Street to Floral Street as well as to the Cramer House, a Salt Lake City Local Historic Landmark Site that will be restored and incorporated into the overall project. Buildings located between corner properties can have a permitted height of 100 feet in the D-1 zone. Buildings taller than 100 feet may be authorized through the Design Review process. The proposal received Design Review approval from the Planning Commission for an additional 60 feet of building height on January 22, 2020. The proposed height of the north tower is 160 feet. Since that time, the applicant has been working through the process to receive their building permits and some changes have been made to the building in terms of materials and the design of the south building facade. In accordance with section 21A.59.080, these types of modifications to the approved Design Review plans require approval from the Planning Commission. The property is zoned D-1 (Downtown Central Business District) and is located within Council District 4, represented by Ana Valdemoros. (Staff contact: Amy Thompson at (801) 535-7281 or amy.thompson@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNPCM2019-00926**

Amy Thompson, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the proposed modifications.

Michael Militello, applicant, provided a presentation with further details.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on access into the parking garage
- Vehicle access
- Clarification that the restorations of Cramer house is not impacted by the requested changes

PUBLIC HEARING [7:48:46 PM](#)

Chairperson Scheer opened the Public Hearing;

Zachary Dussault – Raised concerns with vehicle access affecting the pedestrian walkway.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Scheer closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [7:51:42 PM](#)

Commissioner Bell stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff memo, information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Planning Commission approve the modifications to the Design Review approval, petition PLNPCM2019-00926, at approximately 255 S State Street.

Commissioner Urquhart seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Barry, Bell, Lee, Lyon, Urquhart, and Young-Otterstrom voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

The Commission took a short break.

[7:53:37 PM](#)

Book Cliffs Lodge Condition(s) Modification to Design Review Approval at approximately 1149 S. West Temple - The Book Cliffs Lodge is a proposed 54-unit mixed income apartment building approximately 45-feet in height located in the CC – Corridor Commercial Zoning District at 1149 S. West Temple. Buildings in the CC district are limited to 30-feet in height, but an additional 15-feet of height could be approved through the Conditional Building and Site Design Review (CBSDR) process. The proposal received CBSDR approval from the Salt Lake City Planning Commission on December 6, 2017 with conditions. Since that time, the applicant has been working through the process to receive their building permits and modifications have been made to the building in terms of materials and design of the west building facade. The proposed changes include changes to the design of each façade of the building, different building materials than what were approved by the Planning Commission, and other minor changes to design elements. The Design Review process limits the ability of the Planning Director to approve modifications and the proposed changes are outside of the authority granted in Chapter 21A.59 of the zoning ordinance. The original approval included a condition that the west façade be updated to be more similar to the east façade of the building. This review will also consider if the proposed changes satisfy that condition of approval. The subject property is located within Council District 5, represented by Darin Mano (Staff contact: David J. Gellner at (385) 226-3860 or david.gellner@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNPCM2017-00708**

David Gellner, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the modifications as proposed.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Whether there is a size requirement for entrances

Jeff Lonardo, applicant, provided further design details.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on where the art panels that were taken away are why that decision was made

PUBLIC HEARING [8:08:36 PM](#)

Chairperson Scheer opened the Public Hearing;

Amy Hawkins, Community Council – Stated she received emails from the community opposing the request raising concerns with parking.

Matt Haydon – Stated his opposition of the request. He also raised concerns with the amount of parking.

Zachary Dussault – Stated his support of the request. He also stated he’s concerned the building is oriented towards the parking lot. Recognizes that redesign is a compromise.

Terrell Bodily – Stated his support of the request.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Scheer closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant further discussed the follow:

- Clarification if additional parking would alleviate public concerns and whether the commission has purview on changes
- Whether the apartments will be listed as affordable or market rate
- Clarification on parking reduction and who enforces the reduction and how units remaining affordable is monitored and enforced

MOTION [8:28:28 PM](#)

Commissioner Bell stated, based on the findings and analysis in the staff report, testimony, and discussion at the public hearing, I move that the Planning Commission approve the requested modifications to the previously approved design for the Book Cliffs Apartments located at approximately 1159 S. West Temple, Conditional Building and Site Design Review petition PLNPCM2017-00708 as proposed.

Commissioner Bachman seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Barry, Bell, Lee, Lyon, and Urquhart voted “Aye”. Commissioner Young-Otterstrom voted “Nay”. The motion passed 6-1.

[8:31:44 PM](#)

Nunez ADU at approximately 2721 East 2100 South - Andrea Palmer, representing the property owner and Modal Living, is requesting conditional use approval for a 14.5-foot tall, 352-square-foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU) that will be situated in the rear, northeast corner of the property located at 2721 East 2100 South. The property is zoned FR-3/12,000, Foothills Residential District, where ADUs must be processed as a conditional use, and is located within Council District #6, represented by Dan Dugan (Staff contact: Aaron Barlow (385) 386-2764 or aaron.barlow@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNPCM2019-01053**

Commissioner Bell recused herself due to possible conflict of interest.

Aaron Barlow, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the request with the conditions listed in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification on proposed parking space and accessibility
- Whether there is a plan pathway leading from Scenic Drive to the ADU

Andrea Palmer, applicant, was available for questions.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on the access to the ADU
- Distance from the ADU to Scenic Drive
- Distance between the existing property and the ADU

PUBLIC HEARING [8:45:08 PM](#)

Chairperson Scheer opened the Public Hearing;

Ray Levy – Stated their opposition of the request.

David Platt – Raised concerns on how access will be created to the ADU.

Zachary Dussault – Stated his support of the request.

J.A. Chytraus – Provided an email comment raising concerns with the access to the ADU from Scenic Drive.

Elinda - Stated she's not against ADU's but is concerned about the possible unstable hill and parking issues on Scenic Drive.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Scheer closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission mad the following comments:

- I'm generally in favor of ADU's and what they bring to our community but I'm struggling with this one
- I don't know that it would make sense to require parking on Scenic Drive with the length of the property
- I don't think having a longer walk-way to get to the unit is a problem
- Discussion was made regarding possible conditions to the motion

MOTION [9:12:01 PM](#)

Commissioner Lyon stated, based on the information listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve the request for Conditional Use for an accessory dwelling unit (ADU) at 2721 East 2100 South, as presented in petition PLNPCM2019-01053, with the conditions listed in the staff report and adding condition:

- 1. That foot paths/traffic is not added between the ADU and Scenic Drive.**

Commissioner Barry seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Barry, Lee, Lyon, and Urquhart voted "Aye". Commissioner Young-Otterstrom voted "Nay". The motion passed 5-1.

[9:13:30 PM](#)

OPMA Training – The Commission received Open and Public Meetings Act training.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- How to promote a better design in the City

The meeting adjourned at [9:36:32 PM](#)