## SALT LAKE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING This meeting was held electronically pursuant to Salt Lake City Emergency Proclamation No. 2 of 2020 (2)(b) Wednesday, May 13, 2020

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Planning Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at 5:40:34 PM. Audio recordings of the Planning Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Planning Commission meeting were: Chairperson Adrienne Bell, Vice Chairperson Brenda Scheer; Commissioners Maurine Bachman, Amy Barry, Jon Lee, Matt Lyon, Andres Paredes, Sara Urquhart and Crystal Young-Otterstrom. Commissioner Carolynn Hoskins was excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Nick Norris, Planning Division Director; Molly Robinson, Planning Manager; John Anderson, Planning Manager; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Linda Mitchell, Principal Planner; Mayara Lima, Principal Planner; David Gellner, Principal Planner; Eric Daems, Senior Planner; Casey Stewart, Senior Planner; Nannette Larsen, Principal Planner; and Marlene Rankins, Administrative Secretary.

Molly Robinson, Planning Manager, provided participation options and instructions to the public.

# APPROVAL OF THE APRIL 22, 2020, MEETING MINUTES. 5:44:11 PM

MOTION <u>5:44:25 PM</u>

Commissioner Lyon moved to approve the April 22, 2020, meeting minutes.

Commissioner Lee seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Barry, Lee, Lyon, Paredes, Scheer, Urquhart, and Young-Otterstrom voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

## REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR 5:45:19 PM

Chairperson Bell stated she had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Scheer stated she had nothing to report.

## **REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR** <u>5:45:30 PM</u>

Molly Robinson, Planning Manager, stated she had nothing to report.

## <u>5:45:57 PM</u>

<u>Conditional Use ADU at approximately 1020 S Lincoln Street</u> - Andrea Palmer, property owner representative, is requesting Conditional Use approval for a detached 425 square feet accessory dwelling unit (ADU) on a property located at approximately 1020 S Lincoln Street. The property is zoned R-1/5,000 Single Family Residential and is located within Council District 5, represented by Darin Mano. (Staff Contact: Linda Mitchell at (801) 535-7751 or linda.mitchell@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNPCM2019-01079** 

Linda Mitchell, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the Conditional Use with the conditions listed in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

• Clarification on owner occupancy

- Whether basement was being used as an air bnb
- Condition of alley
- Clarification on easement photos

Andrea Palmer and Ian Kaplan, Modal Living, were available for questions.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Whether there is conformation that the property is owner occupied
- Clarification on whether the basement is currently being rented

## PUBLIC HEARING 6:00:57 PM

Chairperson Bell opened the Public Hearing;

Darryl High, Community Council – Provided an email stating opposition of the request.

Zachary Dussault – Stated his support in the request.

Amie R – Asked; How and when are the percentages sent for filling up the yards with structures and how broadly does that apply for neighborhoods?

Sharen Hauri – Provided an email stating her support of the project.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Bell closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission and Staff further discussed the following:

• Clarification on lot coverage and what percentage will be covered

## MOTION <u>6:17:24 PM</u>

Commissioner Lyon stated, I move to table this item. I'd like staff to look into the rental unit on the property to see if it is a separate dwelling unit.

Commissioner Urquhart seconded the motion. Commissioners Young-Otterstrom, Urquhart, Scheer, Paredes, Lyon, Lee, Barry, and Bachman voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

## <u>6:18:45 PM</u>

<u>Conditional Use ADU at approximately 1371 South 500 East</u> - Alexis Suggs, property owner representative, is requesting Conditional Use approval for a detached 650 square foot accessory dwelling unit (ADU) on a property located at approximately 1371 South 500 East. The property is zoned R-1/5,000 Single Family Residential and is located within Council District 5, represented by Darin Mano. (Staff Contact: Linda Mitchell at (801) 535-7751 or linda.mitchell@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNPCM2019-01147** 

Linda Mitchell, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the Conditional Use request with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Alexis Suggs, applicant, was available for questions.

## PUBLIC HEARING 6:23:42 PM

Chairperson Bell opened the Public Hearing;

Zachary Dussault – Stated his support of the request.

Amie R – Asked through the Webex Q&A: Whether ADU's permitted as hobby shops.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Bell closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission and Staff further discussed the following:

#### MOTION <u>6:32:39 PM</u>

Commissioner Bachman stated, based on the findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and input received during the public hearing, I move that the Planning Commission approve the Conditional Use request (PLNPCM2019-01147) as proposed, subject to complying with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Commissioner Scheer seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Barry, Lee, Lyon, Paredes, Scheer, Urquhart, and Young-Otterstrom voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

#### <u>6:33:52 PM</u>

<u>Conditional Use ADU at approximately 613 S Emery Street</u> - Andrea Palmer, representing the property owner, is requesting Conditional Use approval for a detached Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) at approximately 613 S Emery Street. The applicant is proposing a one-bedroom structure with a building footprint of approximately 432 square feet. The structure will be approximately 11 feet 8 inches in height and located in the rear of the lot. The property is zoned R-1/5000 Single-Family Residential and is located within Council District 2, represented by Andrew Johnston. (Staff Contact: Mayara Lima at (801) 535-7118 or mayara.lima@slcgov.com) Case number PLNPCM2020-00107

Mayara Lima, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the request with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Ian Kaplan, applicant, was available for questions.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

• Clarification on what would constitute a denial of a land use application

#### PUBLIC HEARING 6:48:08 PM

Chairperson Bell opened the Public Hearing;

Zachary Dussault – Stated his support of the request.

Michael Nemelka- Provided an email comment stating his opposition because of the increase in on-street parking.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Bell closed the Public Hearing.

#### **MOTION** <u>6:55:08 PM</u>

Commissioner Scheer stated, based on the information listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve the request for Conditional Use for an ADU at 613 S Emery, as presented in petition PLNPCM2020-00107, with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Commissioner Bachman seconded the motion. Commissioners Young-Otterstrom, Urquhart, Scheer, Paredes, Lyon, Lee, Barry, and Bachman voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

#### <u>6:56:32 PM</u>

**Zephyr Lofts Design Review at approximately 360 West 200 South** - Micah Peters, property owner, is requesting Design Review approval for a 138-unit apartment building on a 0.73-acre lot located at approximately 360 W 200 S in the D-4 – Downtown Secondary Central Business District. The building is proposed to be eighty-five feet tall. Buildings in excess of seventy-five feet tall in the D-4 district are allowed through the Design Review process with Planning Commission approval. The subject property is located within Council District 4, represented by Ana Valdemoros. (Staff Contact: David J. Gellner at (801) 535-6107 or david.gellner@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNPCM2020-00067** 

David Gellner, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the request with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Micah Peters and Julia Oderda, applicants, provided a presentation with further detailed information.

The Commission, Applicant and Staff discussed the following:

- Walkway height and width
- Clarification on how the walkway will be identified visually
- Materials and paving used for the walkway
- Access driveway and pedestrian use
- Pedestrian walkway and how to make it feel safe & inviting
- Landscaping near pedestrian walkway and along frontage
- Street frontage design & ADA ramp
- Design of the retail space on street level
- Building wrapping continuing into courtyards
- Warehouse National Historic District
- Exterior materials, color and integrity

#### PUBLIC HEARING 7:37:29 PM

Chairperson Bell opened the Public Hearing;

Zachary Dussault – Stated his support of the request.

Tucker Samuelsen – Stated his support of the request.

John Benson – Provided an email comment stating his opposition of the request.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Bell closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission and Staff further discussed the following:

- Clarification on the applicants request of additional height
- Character of the building
- Clarification on standards on height
- Colors and materials being proposed to be used
- Clarification on the commission purview over the project

#### MOTION <u>8:04:11 PM</u>

Commissioner Urquhart stated, based on the findings and analysis in the staff report, testimony, and discussion at the public hearing, I move that the Planning Commission approve the proposed Design Review application for additional building height, file PLNPCM2020-00067 for the Zephyr Lofts Apartments located at approximately 360 W 200 S. This recommendation is based on the conditions of approval listed in the staff report. Final details regarding these conditions of approval are delegated to planning staff.

Commissioner Lyon seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Barry, Lee, Lyon, Paredes, and Urquhart voted "Aye". Commissioners Scheer and Young-Otterstrom voted "Nay". The motion passed 6-2.

<u>8:06:09 PM</u> The commission took a small break.

### <u>8:11:07 PM</u>

<u>Crossing at 9th Design Review at approximately 880, 876, & 866 West 200 South and 181, 175, 151, 153, & 141 South 900 West</u> – Gary Knapp, with JZW Architects, representing the property owner, is requesting approval of modifications to the design standards to construct a new mixed-use development at 880, 876, & 866 West 200 South and 181, 175, 151, 153, & 141 South 900 West. The standards proposed to be modified include the maximum length of a street-facing facade (360' where 200' would be required) and the maximum spacing between operable building entrances (50' where 40' would be required). The project site is located in the TSA-UN-T (Transit Station Area Urban Neighborhood- Transitional) zoning district and is located within Council District 2, represented by Andrew Johnston (Staff Contact: Eric Daems at (801) 535-7236 or eric.daems@slcgov.com) Case number PLNPCM2020-00015

Eric Daems, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the request with the conditions listed in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

Clarification on the mixed use

Gary Knapp, applicant, and Joe Johnson, property owner, provided a presentation with further design details.

#### PUBLIC HEARING 8:40:02 PM

Chairperson Bell opened the Public Hearing;

Michael Fife – Raised concern with the length of the proposal and stated his opposition.

Zachary Dussault – Stated his support of the request.

Tyler Cole – Questioned whether there would be additional traffic impacts and anticipated parking impacts.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Bell closed the Public Hearing.

The applicant addressed the public's questions.

### MOTION <u>8:55:48 PM</u>

Commissioner Lyon stated, based on the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Planning Commission deny PLNPCM2020-00015 Design Review for the Crossing at 9th mixed-use development because the evidence presented demonstrates proposal does not comply with standards:

- 1. D Large building masses shall be divided into heights and sizes that relate to human scale;
- 2. E Facades faces exceed the length of the building, don't include sufficient massing changes and material changes to break up that plane.

Commissioner Barry seconded the motion. Commissioners Young-Otterstrom, Urquhart, Scheer, Paredes, Lyon, Lee, Barry, and Bachman voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

## <u>8:57:44 PM</u>

<u>Granary on 9 Planned Development at approximately 110 West 900 South</u> – Alec Harwin of Sojourn Development SLC. LLC, is requesting Planned Development approval petition for a proposed mixed-use development at approximately 110 West 900 South. The proposal includes two separate principal buildings with a total of 19 residential units and two commercial units. The buildings will be approximately 40 feet tall. The reason for planned development review is for vehicles backing into the adjacent alley and for vehicle parking occupying more than 25 percent of the front facade length. The site is located within Council District 4, represented by Ana Valdemoros (Staff contact: Casey Stewart at (801) 535-6260 or casey.stewart@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNSUB2019-01033** 

Casey Stewart, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the request as proposed.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification on whether the units are townhouses
- Main entrance location

Gonzolo Calquin, applicant, provided further design details.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on garage locations for the residential units
- Architectural treatment
- Pedestrian engagement

#### PUBLIC HEARING 9:20:31 PM

Chairperson Bell opened the Public Hearing;

Paul Johnson, Community Council – Has no problems with cars backing into the alley and they appreciate the creative use of the alley.

Zachary Dussault – Stated his support of the request and the use of the alley.

Mike Fife – Stated his support of the request.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Bell closed the Public Hearing.

Alec Harwin, property owner, stated he supports any recommendations regarding window treatments.

## MOTION <u>9:27:55 PM</u>

Commissioner Scheer stated, based on the findings listed in the staff report and the testimony and plans presented, I move that the Planning Commission approve the Granary on 9 Planned Development petition PLNSUB2019-01033 subject to the following conditions:

1. The façade of the residential building on West Temple - the ground floor be redesigned to have more of a residential look than a commercial look and to give staff the ability to approve that change

Commissioner Bachman seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Barry, Lee, Lyon, Paredes, Scheer, Urquhart, and Young-Otterstrom voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

### <u>9:30:30 PM</u>

**Master Plan and Zoning Map Amendment at approximately 2903 South Highland Drive** - Pierre Langue with Axis Architects, representing the property owner Highland Row LLC, is requesting to amend the Sugarhouse Master Plan and the zoning map for a property located at approximately 2903 South Highland Drive. The proposal would rezone the eastern portion of the property (approximately the eastern 55') from R-1-7000 (Single-Family Residential) to CB (Community Business) and amend the Sugar House Future Land Use Map from Low Density Residential to Mixed Use – Low Intensity. The proposed master plan amendment to Mixed Use – Low Intensity and rezone to CB is intended to accommodate a future development on the entire property located at 2903 South Highland Drive. The site is located within Council District 7, represented by Amy Fowler. (Staff Contact: Nannette Larsen at (801) 535-7645 or nannette.larsen@slcgov.com) Case numbers PLNPCM2020-00054 and PLNPCM2020-00053

Nannette Larsen, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission forward a positive recommendation to the City Council.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

• Clarification on setback

Pierre Langue, applicant, provided further information and address public comments that were previously received.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Rear-yard setback
- CB setback requirement clarification

#### PUBLIC HEARING 9:49:34 PM

Chairperson Bell opened the Public Hearing;

Judi Short, Land Use Chair for Sugar House Community Council – Stated she researched this parcel and as far as she can tell it's never been developed, so it's not like we are losing a house. She also suggested to the petitioner to make the buffer wider.

Steve Davis – Raised concern with additional traffic and safety of his children. He also raised concern with parking.

Zachary Dussault – Stated his support of the request.

Christine Frank - Raised concern with traffic and height difference.

Rachel Louchnor – Raised concern with added traffic, height and green space.

Bruce Robertson - Provided an email comment stating his opposition of the request.

Khristopher Shampeny – Provided an email comment stating his opposition of the request and his concern regarding traffic.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Bell closed the Public Hearing.

### MOTION <u>10:06:44 PM</u>

Commissioner Lyon stated, based on the information in the staff report I move that the Planning Commission recommend that the City Council approved the proposed master plan amendment, as presented in petition PLNPCM2020-00053. Additionally, I move that the Planning Commission recommend that the City Council approve the proposed zoning map amendment, as presented in PLNPCM2020-00054.

Commissioner Urquhart seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Barry, Lee, Lyon, Paredes, Scheer, Urquhart, and Young-Otterstrom voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

The following is a list of Q&A's that were received during the meeting:

Q&A Session for Planning Commission Meeting - May 13, 2020

Session number: 961164179 Date: Wednesday, May 13, 2020 Starting time: 5:02 PM

-Darryl High (darrylhigh@gmail.com) - 5:56 PM Q: Molly I'm online Darryl Priority: N/A-

-Darryl High (darrylhigh@gmail.com) - 5:56 PM Q: Molly - Darryl High Priority: N/A--Nick Norris - 5:57 PM A: Daryl, do you want to make comments?

-Darryl High (darrylhigh@gmail.com) - 5:57 PM Q: I'm not able to unmute Priority: N/A--Nick Norris - 5:57 PM A: Molly will unmute you--Nick Norris - 6:01 PM A: we have tried to unmute you, but cant hear or tell if you are speaking. Have you tested your microphone? Darryl High (darrylhigh@gmail.com) - 6:01 PM

Q: We are not against ADU's – and have supported all others within our boundaries They need to abide by their stated purpose They should not create negative impacts on immediate neighbors, or on the adjacent street, or set precedents

Priority: N/A-

-Nick Norris - 6:02 PM A: We read your submitted comments into the record, anything else to add?

Amie R (amierosenberg@yahoo.com) - 6:03 PM

Q: How and when were the percentages set for filling up yards with structures? Priority:  $\ensuremath{\mathsf{N}}\xspace{\mathsf{A}}\xspace{\mathsf{A}}$ 

-Nick Norris - 6:05 PM

A: The total lot coverage requirements have been in the zoniing ordinance for about 15 years. The ADU requirements for size were adopted in 2018.-

Amie R (amierosenberg@yahoo.com) - 6:04 PM Q: I am a next door neighbor Priority: N/A--John Anderson - 6:04 PM A: Amie would you like to speak

Amie R (amierosenberg@yahoo.com) - 6:09 PM Q: Why is alley included as part of yard coverage? Priority: N/A--Nick Norris - 6:12 PM A: The zoning ordinance defines lot area as "LOT AREA: The total area within the property lines

of the lot plus one-half (1/2) the right of way area of an adjacent public alley."

Jason Leiser (jasonsleiser@gmail.com) - 6:19 PM Q: I just lost audio Priority: N/A--Marlene Rankins - 6:21 PM A: Jason - try to log out and log back in --Brenda Scheer - 6:21 PM A: Can you hear us?

Amie R (amierosenberg@yahoo.com) - 6:23 PM Q: Are ADUs permitted as hobby shops? Priority: N/A Zachary Dussault (zacharytdussault@gmail.com) - 6:37 PM Q: Great question! Priority: N/A

Zachary Dussault (zacharytdussault@gmail.com) - 7:16 PM Q: echo coming from julia's mic Priority: N/A

Zachary Dussault (zacharytdussault@gmail.com) - 7:24 PM Q: YES Priority: N/A

Zachary Dussault (zacharytdussault@gmail.com) - 7:25 PM Q: Bad echo coming from juilias mic Priority: N/A

PAUL JOHNSON (pjslc@yahoo.com) - 7:32 PM Q: Hello Molly. This is Paul Johnson, chair of the Central 9th Community Council. I'm unable to stay on any longer. Is it okay if I provide you a comment on agenda item 6? Priority: N/A--Molly Robinson - 7:34 PM

A: Yes, please submit your comment to planning.comments@slcgov.com-

PAUL JOHNSON (pjslc@yahoo.com) - 7:35 PM Q: Thank you! Priority: N/A

Christine Franke (franke38@comcast.net) - 9:51 PM Q: It used to be a restaurant. The beefeater I suggest you do more research Priority: N/A

Steve Davis (sadavis1978@hotmail.com) - 9:55 PM Q: tha Priority: N/A

Steve Davis (sadavis1978@hotmail.com) - 9:56 PM Q: this street is too wide for that traffic flow nonsense Priority: N/A

Zachary Dussault (zacharytdussault@gmail.com) - 10:00 PM

Q: @previous commeter, drivers will drive at a speed they feel the road supports, regardless of spped limit. A narrower street provides trafic calming and make drivers hesitate. Hevily utilized on street parking also slows traffic and protects the sidewalk Priority: N/A

Zachary Dussault (zacharytdussault@gmail.com) - 10:09 PM Q: we made it! goodnight everyone Priority: N/A

The meeting adjourned at <u>10:11:07 PM</u>