# SALT LAKE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING City & County Building 451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah Wednesday, November 14, 2018

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Planning Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at <u>5:33:45 PM</u>. Audio recordings of the Planning Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Planning Commission meeting were: Chairperson Maurine Bachman, Vice Chairperson Sara Urquhart; Commissioners Amy Barry, Adrienne Bell, Weston Clark, Carolynn Hoskins, Andres Paredes and Clark Ruttinger. Commissioners Brenda Scheer and Matt Lyon were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were Wayne Mills, Planning Manager; Molly Robinson, Planning Manager; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Tracy Tran, Senior Planner; Lauren Parisi, Principal Planner; Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner and Marlene Rankins, Administrative Secretary.

# Field Trip

A field trip was held prior to the work session. Planning Commissioners present were: Maurine Bachman, Weston Clark, Carolynn Hoskins and Sara Urquhart. Staff members in attendance was Wayne Mills.

- <u>239 N East Capitol Street</u> Staff summarized request.
- 529 West 500 North Staff summarized the project.

# APPROVAL OF THE OCTOBER 24, 2018, MEETING MINUTES 5:34:09 PM MOTION 5:34:20 PM

Commissioner Hoskins moved to approve the October 24, 2018, meeting minutes. Commissioner Bell seconded the motion. Commissioners Barry, Bell, Hoskins, Clark, Urquhart and Ruttinger voted "Aye". Commissioner Paredes abstained from voting. The motion passed.

# REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR 5:34:56 PM

Chairperson Bachman stated she had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Urquhart stated she had nothing to report.

# **REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR 5:35:04 PM**

Mr. Wayne Mills, Planning Manager, stated he had nothing to report.

### 5:35:13 PM

Planned Development and Conditional Building and Site Design Review for the Union Pacific Hotel at 2 S. 400 West - The Athens Group and HKS Architects, on behalf of Vestar Gateway, LLC, have requested the above-mentioned planning petitions to accommodate the development of an 8-story, 225-room hotel on the west side of the existing Union Pacific Railroad Station. The hotel project is in conjunction with the adaptive reuse of the historic train station itself, which entails the preservation of the existing Grand Train Hall in the center of the station and the addition of other hotel amenities. All new construction in the Gateway-Mixed Use zoning district must be reviewed as a planned development. Additionally, the applicants have elected to go through the Conditional Building and Site Design Review process to accommodate approximately 99 feet of building height in lieu of 75 feet that is permitted outright. However, the building will be no taller than the existing train station. The subject property is

located in Council District 4, represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff Contact - Lauren Parisi at 801-535-7226 or lauren.parisi@slcgov.com) Case numbers PLNPCM2018-00617 & PLNSUB2018-00618

Lauren Parisi, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the petition.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Monument signs
- Whether the easements are blocking any access to walkways
- Accessibility hour restrictions

Jeff Mongan, Emir Tursic, Mark Sanford and Scott Howell, The Athens Group representatives, reviewed the history property and provided a presentation of the proposed project. Mr. Mongan also addressed hour restriction concerns.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

# **PUBLIC HEARING 6:05:04 PM**

Chairperson Bachman opened the Public Hearing;

Roger Borgdenicht – Stated his concerns regarding the public access with the easements.

seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Bachman closed the public hearing.

The Commission, Applicant and Staff further discussed the following:

- The atrium between the new proposed building and the Depo
- Management of guest rooms
- The reason the Gateway must go through a Planned Development process
- Who has oversight in the City over the easement
- Clarification as to why 75 ft to the easement was chosen
- Clarification for blank wall with no windows

# **MOTION** <u>6:23:01 PM</u>

Commissioner Barry stated, based on the findings listed in the findings listed in the Staff Report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Planning Commission approve Planned Development request petition PLNSUB2018-00618 and conditional building and site design request petition PLNPCM2018-00617 with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Commissioner Urquhart second. Commissioners Barry, Bell, Hoskins, Urquhart, Ruttinger and Paredes voted "Aye". Commissioner Clark voted "Nay". The motion passed 6-1.

# 6:24:46 PM

<u>Single Room Occupancy (SRO) Text Amendments</u> - A request by Mayor Jackie Biskupski to amend sections of the zoning ordinance to better define the Single Room Occupancy (SRO) housing type and determine appropriate locations within the city for this use. The intent of the proposed amendments is to implement the recently-adopted Growing SLC: A Five-Year Housing Plan (2017-2021). The amendments will affect the following sections of the Zoning Ordinance: 21A.62.040 Definitions of Terms, 21A.33 Land Use Tables, 21A.36 General Provisions, and 21A.44.030 Number of Off-Street Parking Spaces Required. Related provisions of Title 21A (Zoning) may also be amended as part of this petition. (Staff Contact:

Ashley Scarff (801) 535-7660 or ashley.scarff@slcgov.com) Case number PLNPCM2018-00066 (Legislative Matter)

Tony Milner, HAND Project and Policy Manager, provided a presentation on the SRO housing type, and how they are operated. Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner, reviewed the latest version of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated that Staff recommended the Planning Commission forward a positive recommendation to the City Council.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Whether SRO's are furnished
- If an SRO could have both shared kitchens and bathrooms
- Occupancy restrictions
- How the minimum amount of required common space was selected
- Management of the SRO's

# **PUBLIC HEARING 7:09:00 PM**

Pamela Atkinson – Described her experience working with the homeless population, as well as findings from an SRO focus group study that she conducted with the Kem Gardner Center. She feels that different SRO's could house different population types with varying needs.

Daniel Nackerman, HASLC Executive Director – Expressed support of the revised proposal, outlined the need for this type of housing and asked the Commission to please approve the project. He would like to see the minimum parking requirement reduced.

Brent Willis, Operator of the Rio Grande Hotel – Raised concern regarding the proposed minimum floor area of the SRO's. He feels that one on-site manager can monitor a maximum of 55-60 rooms. He recommended reducing the minimum required floor area to 100 sf for one tenant and 120 sf for a room that could hold two tenants.

Judi Short, Sugar House Community Council – Stated she is interested in the petition because of the potential for SRO's in the community. She is in favor of the SRO use but believes that it should be a conditional use.

Lynn Schwarz – Would like the city to require SRO's to be contained with private kitchens and bathrooms and expressed that they should be a conditional use.

Marie Taylor – Made several comments related to an SRO that was formerly located near her home and mad suggestions for what should be included in the units.

Emir Tursic – Is concerned about impacts to the neighborhoods and stated that he believes the conditional use permit should be required.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Bachman closed the public hearing.

The Commission and Staff further discussed the following:

- Minimum parking requirements
- Minimum floor area of individual rooms
- The possibility of a mini kitchen
- Onsite management

- Whether a duplex can add an SRO
- If the city is creating an incentive to build or convert to an SRO

# **MOTION FAILED 8:01:07 PM**

Commissioner Barry stated, based on the analysis and findings contained in the staff report dated June 27, 2018, the additional information contained in the two memo's dated July 18, 2018, and November 14, 2018, and testimony provided, I move that the Planning Commission forward a positive recommendation for PLNPCM2018-00066 to the City Council to adopt the proposed zoning ordinance text amendments related to the Single Room Occupancy dwellings use with the following deviations:

- 1. The minimum square footage for a single unit be 100 square feet and a bunk unit be 130 square feet
- 2. A conditional use

Commissioners discussed the 130-foot square foot suggestion versus 120 square feet.

Commissioner Clark seconded the motion with an amendment changing the minimum square footage for a bunk unit to 120 square feet. Commissioner Barry accepted the amendment. Commissioners Barry, Hoskins, Clark and Paredes voted "Aye". Commissioners Bell, Urquhart and Ruttinger voted "Nay".

Policy and procedures require majority of those present to vote "Aye" in order for a motion to pass. Chairperson Bachman voted "Nay" and the motion failed.

#### **MOTION** 8:04:03 PM

Commissioner Urquhart stated, based on the analysis and findings contained in the staff report dated June 27, 2018, the additional information contained in the two (2) memos dated July 11, 2018, and November 14, 2018, and testimony provided, I move that the Planning Commission forwards a positive recommendation for PLNPCM2018-00066 to the City Council to adopt the proposed zoning ordinance text amendments related to the Single Room Occupancy (SRO) Dwellings use.

Commissioner Ruttinger requested to amend the motion with the condition as follows:

1. The minimum square footage for a single unit be 100 square feet and a bunk unit be 120 square feet.

Commissioner Urquhart accepted the amendment. Commissioners Bell, Hoskins, Urquhart, and Ruttinger voted "Aye". Commissioners Barry, Clark and Paredes voted "Nay". Chairperson Bachman was required to vote and voted "Aye". The motion passed 5-3.

8:06:07 PM Commissioner Bell left the meeting due to prior engagement.

## 8:06:37 PM

<u>Partial Street Vacation at 239 N East Capitol Street</u> - A request by Brian and Jennifer Reuben for a Partial Street Vacation of a portion of East Hillside Avenue adjacent to their property at 239 N East Capitol Street. The purpose of the vacation is to reconcile the location of two accessory buildings and a masonry wall in the public right-of-way. The subject property is located in RMF-35 (Moderate Density Multi-Family Residential District) zoning district and is located in Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton.

(Staff contact: Molly Robinson at (801) 535-7261 or molly.robinson@slcgov.com) Case number PLNPCM2018-00121

Molly Robinson, Planning Manager, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommends the Planning Commission forward a positive recommendation to the City Council to approve the partial street vacation.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification with the park strip location
- Annual lease on property
- Discussion regarding the right of way and property line

Jennifer Reuben, Applicant, provided further details regarding the petition.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification as to which homes face Hillside Avenue
- Monthly lease cost

# **PUBLIC HEARING 8:34:20 PM**

Marie Taylor – Raised a concern if property owner will have fee simple title once the lot line adjustment is done.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Bachman closed the public hearing.

The Commission and Staff further discussed the following:

The Commission's purview over vacation of land

## **MOTION** 8:40:14 PM

Commissioner Ruttinger stated, based on the information in the staff report, public testimony, and discussion by the Planning Commission, I move that the Planning Commission forward a positive recommendation to the City Council to approve PLNPCM2018-00121 Partial Street Vacation at 239 N East Capitol Street.

Commissioner Clark second. Commissioners Paredes, Ruttinger, Urquhart, Clark, Hoskins, and Barry voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

The Commissioners took a break 8:41:38 PM

## 8:48:04 PM

<u>Guadalupe Row Houses</u> - A request by Jarod Hall, on behalf of the owner, Riley Rogers, to develop residential row houses on seven parcels at approximately 529 West 500 north via planned development and subdivision petitions. The proposed development will consist of two residential buildings with a total of 13 units. The zoning standards in that area specify that no more than 6 dwellings may be attached together. Consequently, the planned development petition is for one building containing 6 units and a second building with 7 units, as well as allowing for lots not fronting on a street, and reductions to front and side yard setbacks and lot dimensions. The subdivision is to reapportion the land to provide a lot for each unit. The subject parcels are located in the SR-3 (Special Development Pattern Residential) zoning district within City Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Chris Lee at 801-535-7706 or chris.lee@slcgov.com). Case numbers PLNSUB2018-00496 & PLNSUB2018-00668

Wayne Mills, Planning Manager, reviewed the petition as outline in the Staff Report. He stated Staff recommended the Planning Commission approved the proposed petition.

Riley Rogers, Applicant and Jarod Hall, Architect, provided a presentation with further details regarding the proposed project.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Walk ways and entrances
- Whether the units will have an HOA
- · Market price of the units

# **PUBLIC HEARING 9:02:13 PM**

Dallin Jolley – Raised concerns regarding the use of Beaumont Court and his access to his property.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Bachman closed the public hearing.

The Applicant addressed the public concerns.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant further discussed the following:

- Whether Beaumont Court will be considered a public or private road
- Whether the current adjacent property owner will continue to have access to his property
- Fire truck access
- Garbage disposal location
- Whether the property will also have recycling

# **MOTION 9:11:07 PM**

Commissioner Barry stated, based on the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve Planned Development PLNSUB2018-00496 at approximately 529 West 500 North.

Commissioner Hoskins second. Commissioner Barry, Hoskins, Clark, Urquhart, Ruttinger and Paredes voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

#### **MOTION** 9:12:33 PM

Commissioner Barry stated, based on the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve Preliminary Subdivision PLNSUB2018-00668 at approximately 529 West 500 North.

Commissioner Ruttinger second. Commissioners Paredes, Ruttinger, Urquhart, Clark, Hoskins and Barry voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

# 9:13:26 PM

The Birdie (218 S 200 E) - A request by Jake Williams at C.W. Urban to build a 70-unit apartment building with a building height of 82-feet, which is below the 100-foot minimum building height for a corner building in the D-1 Central Business District and requires planned development review. The applicant seeks to achieve the objective of fulfilling the goals of the Downtown Community Plan. The subject property is located in D-1 (Central Business District) zoning district and is located in Council District 4, represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff contact: Molly Robinson at (801) 535-7261 or molly.robinson@slcgov.com) Case number PLNSUB2018-00519

Molly Robinson, Planning Manager, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended the Planning Commission approve the petition with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Jake Williams, Applicant, provided a presentation along with further details regarding the proposed project.

# **PUBLIC HEARING 9:30:02 PM**

Chairperson Bachman opened the public hearing;

The Commission and staff discussed whether an anonymous comment can be heard.

Seeing no one wished to speak, Chairperson Bachman closed the public hearing.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- · Height of the building
- Permitted building height

# **MOTION** <u>9:49:39</u> PM

Commissioner Urquhart stated, based on the information in the staff report, public testimony, and discussion by the Planning Commission, I move that the Planning Commission approve the Planned Development PLNSUB2018-00519. In order to comply with the applicable standards as listed in the staff report 1-6.

Commissioner Barry Second. Commissioners Barry, Hoskins, Clark, Urquhart, Ruttinger, and Paredes voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

# 9:52:13 PM

#### **WORK SESSION**

<u>Early Notification Text Amendment</u> – A petition by the City Council to review regulations and processes related to early notification and public participation in planning processes. The Planning Commission reviewed this request in May 2017 and tabled this item for additional information. The purpose of the proposed changes is to clarify the language in the ordinance as well as increase awareness and participation by the public while affording a timely review process for applicants and projects. The proposed regulation changes will affect various sections of the City Code including Section 2.60, Recognized Community Organizations, Title 20, Subdivisions and Title 21A, Zoning Ordinance. Related provisions of the City Code may also be amended as part of this petition. (Staff contact: Tracy Tran at (801) 535-7645 tracy.tran@slcgov.com). **Case number: PLNPCM2016-00300** 

Tracy Tran, Senior Planner, briefed the Commission regarding the proposed petition.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Considering a mechanism to provide a better platform for the public to access information
- Suggestion to provide notices in Spanish for the Spanish speaking community
- Outreach with social media

The meeting adjourned at 10:09:17 PM