SALT LAKE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING City & County Building 451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah Wednesday, August 22, 2018

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Planning Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at 5:32:59 PM. Audio recordings of the Planning Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Planning Commission meeting were: Chairperson Weston Clark, Vice Chairperson Maurine Bachman; Commissioners Amy Barry, Carolynn Hoskins, Matt Lyon, Andres Paredes, Clark Ruttinger, Brenda Scheer and Sara Urquhart.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were Nick Norris, Planning Director; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner; David Gellner, Principal Planner; John Anderson, Senior Planner and Marlene Rankins, Administrative Secretary.

Field Trip

A field trip was held prior to the work session. Planning Commissioners present were: Maurine Bachman, Weston Clark, Clark Ruttinger and Brenda Scheer. Staff members in attendance were Nick Norris, Ashley Scarff, and David Gellner.

• <u>2660 S Highland Drive</u> - Staff gave an overview of proposal.

APPROVAL OF THE AUGUST 8, 2018, MEETING MINUTES. <u>5:33:22 PM</u>

MOTION <u>5:33:33 PM</u>

Commissioner Ruttinger moved to approve the August 8, 2018, meeting minutes. Commissioner Bachman seconded the motion. Commissioners Lyon, Bachman, Ruttinger, and Paredes voted "aye". Commissioners Urquhart, Scheer, and Barry abstained from voting. The motion passed 4-3.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR

Chairperson Clark stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Bachman stated she had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

Mr. Nick Norris, Planning Director, stated the importance of attendance for a quorum for upcoming meetings. He also provided the Commission with updates regarding public hearings that the City Council held.

<u>5:36:52 PM</u>

<u>Sugar House Heights Planned Development & Preliminary Subdivision at 2660 S Highland</u> <u>Drive</u> - A request by David Desso, applicant, for Planned Development and Preliminary Subdivision approvals to develop four (4) new lots with single family homes and a new private driveway at 2660 S. Highland Drive. Planned Development approval is required as two (2) of the proposed lots would not have frontage on a public street. The applicant seeks to achieve the objective of creating a pleasing environment through the use of design, landscape, or architectural features. The subject property is zoned R-1/5,000 (Single Family Residential) and is located within Council District 7, represented by Amy Fowler. (Staff contact: Ashley Scarff (801) 535-7660 or ashley.scarff@slcgov.com) **Case Numbers: PLNSUB2017-01027 & PLNSUB2017-01028**

Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the petition with the conditions listed in the Staff Report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Planned Development standard related to preserving historic features on site, and if it applies to existing single family home on site that is located in a National Historic District
- Applicant's ability to demolish existing structure on site without any special Planning Approvals
- Number of lots allowed that could be built without Planned Development approval

Commissioner Hoskins arrived.

David Desso, Applicant, and Adam Breen, Business Partner and Principal Builder, further reviewed details of the proposal.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Fencing near Highland Drive
- Decision to provide access to site off of Caton Way rather than Highland Drive
- Potential pricing of properties
- Discussion regarding the decision to not include the old house into the project

PUBLIC HEARING 5:59:22 PM

Chairperson Clark opened the Public Hearing;

Judi Short – stated the Community Council is opposed of the project

Patsy McNamara - stated she is opposed of the project

John McNamara – raised concern with vehicular traffic and neighborhood compatibility

Ryan Kempema - raised concern regarding the gate placement

Alison Heyrend – raised concern with congestion from traffic and neighborhood compatibility

Harry Ewing - raised concern with compatibility and traffic

Jerry Schmidt – stated he does not feel this project is compatible with the neighborhood

Grace Sperry (property owner) – discussed history of property and addressed concerns that the public had regarding the project

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Clark closed the public hearing.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant further discussed the following:

- Elevations facing Highland Drive will function as front of the homes
- Easement and legal right to use private drive for access
- Parking and traffic issues
- Compatibility of proposal with surrounding neighborhood
- Materials being used for the project
- Front porch/patio
- Changes applicants made in response to Staff comments

The Commission discussed the following amongst themselves:

- Which Planned Development objective(s) the project meets
- Compliance with the Sugar House Community Master Plan
- Ability to use tax breaks to rehab historic home
- Private driveway placement
- Compatibility with the neighborhood
- Density

MOTION <u>7:03:30 PM</u>

Commissioner Lyon stated, based on the information in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Planning Commission table the Planned Development PLNSUB2017-01027 and associated Preliminary Subdivision PLNSUB2017-01028 with the following that needs to be addressed by the applicant:

- To ensure compatibility with the character of existing development within the vicinity of the site.
- The Eastern elevations of the homes on lots 1 & 2 (that face Highland Drive) should all be altered to include architectural features typically found on the front façade of a single family home, such as: a d listed in the staff report.
- I would also like to add e: that includes roof detailing that would be more consistent with a front of a home.
- I would like the developer to consider primary driveway access off the east side and discuss why it would not be possible.

Commissioner Urquhart second. Commissioners Paredes, Ruttinger, Bachman, Lyon, Barry, Hoskins, Scheer and Urquhart voted "aye". The motion was tabled

<u>7:06:55 PM</u>

<u>Modifications to Centro Civico Senior Housing</u> - A request by Peter Corroon, applicant, to modify the approved development located at 145 South 600 West. The Planning Commission approved the project on August 23, 2017. The proposed modifications include changes to the public art at the street level and architectural details of the street facing façade of the building. These changes are required by ordinance to be reviewed by the Planning Commission. The property is located within Council District 4, represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff contact: David J. Gellner at 801-535-6107 or david.gellner@slcgov.com) Case Numbers: PLNSUB2017-00370 & PLNPCM2017-00525

David Gellner, Principal Planner reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended the Planning Commission take the following action regarding changes, deny the modification to the blank wall on the front street level of the building and require that an element of interest be included in addition to the architectural concrete. Also, deny the change to eliminate the public art, and approve the request to eliminate the 3D architectural elements on the upper level of the building.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Previous approval and proposed design changes
- Clarification with standard regarding allowing the 3rd story to be lacking glass
- Material changes
- Public art work
- Second story corners

Peter Corroon, Applicant, further reviewed the petition.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Ground level art work
- Façade elements

PUBLIC HEARING 7:22:53 PM

Chairperson Clark opened the Public Hearing;

Adam Wade - stated he is in favor of the petition

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Clark closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION 7:27:40 PM (FAILED)

Chairperson Lyon stated, based on the information in this memo and the original staff report as well as the discussion with the Planning Commission, different hearings and testimony presented, including the applicants willingness to work with Staff, I move that the Planning Commission take the following actions in relation to the proposed changes to the Centro Civico Senior Housing project PLNSUB2017-00370 and PLNPCM2017-00525: On the ground level wall, I'll like to deny that motion. On the public art requirements, I'd like to deny that motion, and on the building façade 3D architecture, I'd

like to approve the requested changes and permit Staff to achieve the public art requirements through the landscaping along the frontage of the lot.

Commissioner Bachman second. The Commissioners discussed the motion.

Commissioners Scheer, Barry, Lyon and Bachman voted "Aye". Commissioners Urquhart, Hoskins, Ruttinger and Paredes voted "Nay", which brought the motion to a tie. Chairperson Weston voted "Nay" which brought the motion to fail.

The Commissioners further discussed their thoughts regarding the petition.

MOTION <u>7:44:50 PM</u>

Commissioner Lyon stated, I move that the Planning Commission take the following actions in relation to the proposed changes to the Centro Civico Senior Housing project PLNSUB2017-00370 and PLNPCM2017-00525, that we deny changes proposed to the ground level blank wall, that we deny changes proposed to the public art requirements and that we approve removing the 3D architectural elements from the façade. 3D architectural elements such as bikes, walkers and scooters. (Consistent with the staff recommendation in the report).

Commissioner Bachman second. Commissioners Urquhart, Scheer, Hoskins, Barry, Lyon, Bachman, Ruttinger and Paredes voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Lyon left for the evening due to prior engagement.

<u>7:47:04 PM</u>

D2 Zoning District Amendments – The Planning Commission will receive a briefing on proposed changes to the D2 Downtown Support Zoning District development standards. The proposed changes include addressing setbacks, building design standards, affordable housing incentives, and other changes. The purpose of the briefing will be to introduce the Planning Commission to the proposal, the reasons for the changes and to inform the Commission about the ongoing public process. The D2 Zoning District is generally located south of the Central Business District and between 300 West and 200 East. It includes properties located in Council District 4, represented by Derek Kitchen and Council District 5, represented by Erin Mendenhall. Staff contact John Anderson at 801-535-7214 or john.anderson@slcgov.com

John Anderson, Senior Planner, provided an overview of the D2 Zoning District Amendments.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Length of the building
- Uses of the main floor and building frontage
- Window percentage and window placement
- The elimination of the design review

<u>8:04:47 PM</u>

Inland Port Text Amendments - The Planning Commission will receive an update on changes to the zoning ordinance regarding an inland port to be located in the Northwest Quadrant master plan area. The changes are necessary due to a change in state law that gives the city until December 31, 2018 to adopt specific regulations allowing an inland port as a permitted or conditional use. The majority of the Inland Port Authority Jurisdictional Land area is located in the Light Manufacturing (M-1) zoning district and typical inland port uses are already allowed in the M-1 zone. However, there are seven other zoning districts and six overlay districts located within the inland port area that may not currently allow uses associated with an inland port. The main focus of this project is to identify the types of uses associated with an inland port in Salt Lake City and develop regulations that support the City's sustainability and master plan goals. For more information, visit www.slc.gov/planning/2018/08/02/inlandport/ Staff contact Nick Norris at 801-535-7757 or nick.norris@slcgov.com

Nick Norris, Planning Director, briefed the Planning Commission regarding the Inland Port Text Amendments. He provided information as to what Inland Port is and in-depth details as to what it means.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- The purchasing of the land
- The possibility of the Inland Port limiting the ability to have economic development of other facilities
- How the train traffic will be affected

The meeting adjourned at <u>8:41:14 PM</u>