

SALT LAKE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
City & County Building
451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah
Wednesday, August 8, 2018

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Planning Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:32:11 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Planning Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Planning Commission meeting were: Chairperson Weston Clark, Vice Chairperson Maurine Bachman; Commissioners Amy Barry, Matt Lyon, Andres Paredes and Clark Ruttinger. CommissionersCarolynn Hoskins, Emily Drown, Sara Urquhart and Brenda Scheer were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were Wayne Mills, Planning Manager; Molly Robinson, Planning Manager; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Kelsey Lindquist, Principal Planner; Daniel Echeverria, Senior Planner; David Gellner, Principal Planner; Anna Anglin, Principal Planner, Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner and Marlene Rankins, Administrative Secretary.

Field Trip

A field trip was held prior to the work session. Planning Commissioners present were: Maurine Bachman, Weston Clark, and Clark Ruttinger. Staff members in attendance were Wayne Mills, Molly Robinson, Ashley Scarff, Anna Anglin, Daniel Echeverria and David Gellner.

- **The Birdie (218 S 200 E)** – Staff summarized project – stated that issues need to be - resolved so staff recommends tabling the item.
- **Hopkins Estate Planned Development & Preliminary Subdivision** – Staff summarized project.
- **The Fairmont, Conditional Building & Site Design Review at 1034 E Elm Ave** – Staff summarized project.
- **Urban Alfandre FB-UN2 Zoning District Building Height Amendment** – Staff summarized zoning text change proposal.
- **Staybridge Suites Hotel & Samoan Independent 7th Day Adventist Church** – Were not visited.

APPROVAL OF THE JULY 11, 2018, MEETING MINUTES.

MOTION [5:32:28 PM](#)

Commissioner Bachman moved to approve the July 11, 2018, meeting minutes. Commissioner Ruttinger seconded the motion. Commissioners Lyon, Barry, Bachman and Ruttinger voted “aye”. Commissioner Paredes abstained from voting. The motion passed 4-1.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR [5:32:43 PM](#)

Chairperson Clark stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Bachman stated she had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR [5:32:58 PM](#)

Mr. Wayne Mills, Planning Manager, stated the importance of attendance to meet quorum for the upcoming meetings. He also mentioned that there will be a large time critical project that the Commission will be briefed on in the next Planning Commission Meeting.

[5:33:55 PM](#)

Ninth West Townhomes Planned Development & Preliminary Subdivision Plat at approximately 624 S. 900 W. - Consider the clarifying information requested by the commission regarding the design of the northern and eastern elevations. A reminder that the public hearing was closed and no further public comment or participation is scheduled for this item. The public may listen to the discussion and decision. (Staff contact: Kelsey Lindquist at 801-535-7930 or Kelsey.lindquist@slcgov.com) **Case Number: PLNSUB2018-00059 & PLNSUB2018-00223**

Ms. Kelsey Lindquist, Principal Planner, provided a quick recap of the petition as outlined in the Staff Report. She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve this project as proposed with conditions listed in the motion sheet.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Recess area
- Previous street issues
- Front yard setback conflicts with a proposed porch
- Upgrade patio in lieu of porch

Applicant, reviewed changes made to meet the request list from the previous Planning Commission Meeting.

MOTION [5:42:12 PM](#)

Commissioner Ruttinger stated, based on the information in the Staff Report, the information presented and input received during the public hearing along with the follow up presentation, I move the Planning Commission approve these petitions with the conditions as listed in the Staff Report.

Second by Commissioner Bachman. Commissioners Lyon, Barry, Paredes, Bachman, and Ruttinger voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

[5:42:54 PM](#)

The Fairmont, Conditional Building and Site Design Review at 1034 E Elm Ave - A request by Alex Lowe, representing the property owner Fairmont Apartments LLC, to build a 59 residential unit mixed use building. The property is located in the CSHBD-2 (Sugar House Business District-2) zone which requires buildings over 30 feet in height to go through the Conditional Building and Site Design Review (CBSDR) process. As the building is approximately 60 feet in height it is subject to the CBSDR process. The subject property is located in Council District 7, represented by Amy Fowler. (Staff contact: Daniel Echeverria at (801) 535-7165 or daniel.echeverria@slcgov.com) **Case Number: PLNPCM2018-00323**

Mr. Daniel Echeverria, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the Development.

Alex Lowe, Applicant, further reviewed details of the property. He stated the Development is compatible with the neighborhood.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Office space on the main floor
- Possibilities of retail
- Width of the sidewalk

PUBLIC HEARING [5:59:11 PM](#)

Chairperson Clark open the Public Hearing;

Judi Short, Community Council – Raised concern regarding the width of the sidewalk.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Clark Closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant further discussed the following:

- Options to widen the sidewalk and use some of the road for sidewalk
- McClelland trail

MOTION [6:07:10 PM](#)

Commissioner Lyon stated based on the information in the Staff Report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Planning Commission approve petition PLNPCM2018-00323, The Fairmont Conditional Building and Site Design Review, with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Second by Commissioner Bachman.

Additional comments were made regarding the sidewalk space.

Commissioners Lyon, Barry, Paredes, Bachman and Ruttinger voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

[6:15:10 PM](#)

Conditional Use for the Samoan Independent 7th Day Adventist Church - Aaron Arbuckle, of Architectural Nexus, representing the Samoan Independent 7th Day Adventist Church, is requesting Conditional Use approval for a new church building to be located at 1624 South 1000 West in the RMF-35 – Residential Multi-Family zoning district. The site currently contains an existing church building which will be demolished to accommodate the new building. The new 2-story church building will include a sanctuary space, a multi-function/gym space, conference room, office and support spaces and a residential unit for occasional occupancy by visiting clergy. The property is located within Council District 2, represented by Andrew Johnston. (Staff contact: David J. Gellner at (801- 535-6107 or david.gellner@slcgov.com) **Case Number: PLNPCM2018-00372**

Mr. David Gellner, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the conditional use.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Lot consolidation

Aaron Arbuckle, Applicant, further reviewed proposal and was available for any questions.

PUBLIC HEARING [6:18:57 PM](#)

Chairperson Clark opened the Public Hearing;

Ernest – Stated he’s in favor of the petition.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Clark closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [6:20:25 PM](#)

Commissioner Barry stated, based on the findings and information listed in the staff report and the testimony and plans presented, I move that the Planning Commission approve the requested conditional use application PLNPCM2018-00372 for a new church building for the Samoan Independent 7th Day Adventist Church subject to conditions 1 and 2 as listed in the staff report.

Second by Commissioner Lyon. Commissioners Ruttinger, Bachman, Paredes, Barry and Lyon voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

[6:21:06 PM](#)

The Birdie (218 S 200 E) - A request by Jake Williams at C.W. Urban to build a 70-unit apartment building with a building height of 82-feet, which is below the 100-foot minimum building height for a corner building in the D-1 Central Business District and requires planned development review. The applicant seeks to achieve the objective of fulfilling the goals of the Downtown Community Plan. The subject property is located in D-1 (Central Business District) zoning district and is located in Council District 4, represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff contact: Molly Robinson at (801) 535-7261 or molly.robinson@slcgov.com).
Case Number: PLNSUB2018-00519

Ms. Robinson, Planning Manager, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission table the Planned Development to allow the applicant to produce additional information regarding service and loading and compliance with emergency vehicle access standards.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Questions regarding the necessity of a Public Hearing

Jake Williams and Jon Galbraith, Applicants, further reviewed the petition with structure and design details.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Height of the building
- Minimum parking requirements
- Compatibility of the building to surrounding neighborhood

PUBLIC HEARING [6:47:04 PM](#)

Chairperson Clark opened the Public Hearing; seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Clark closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant further discussed the following:

- Fire code issues
- Height of the building
- Comments received from the general public

MOTION [6:56:38 PM](#)

Commissioner Lyon stated, based on the information in the staff report, public testimony, and discussion by the Planning Commission, I move that the Planning Commission table the Planned Development PLNSUN2018-00519 to allow the applicant to produce additional information regarding service and loading and compliance with emergency vehicle access standards.

Second by Commissioner Bachman. Commissioners Bachman, Paredes, Barry, and Lyon voted “Aye”. Commissioner Ruttinger voted “Nay”. Motion passed 4-1.

[7:01:30 PM](#)

Staybridge Suites Hotel - A request by Douglas Burgan for a Planned Development and Subdivision to define the cross access easements and modify the landscaping requirements for a four lot subdivision in order to develop a 143 Unit Hotel located at approximately 310 N Apollo Road. The applicant seeks to achieve the objective of creating a pleasing environment through use of design, landscape, or architectural features. The subject property is located in an M-1 (Light Manufacturing) zoning district and is located in Council District #1, represented by James Rogers. (Staff contact: Anna Anglin at (801) 535-6050 or anna.anglin@slcgov.com) **Case Number: PLNSUB2018-00264 and PLNSUB2018-00424**

Ms. Anna Anglin, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the petition with the conditions listed in the Staff Report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Relief in landscaping and what is to be removed
- Parking lot ordinance requirements

Douglas Burgan, Applicant, did not wish to speak. [7:07:50 PM](#)

PUBLIC HEARING [7:08:00 PM](#)

Chairperson Clark opened the Public Hearing; seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Clark closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [7:08:29 PM](#)

Commissioner Bachman stated, based on the information in the Staff Report, Public testimony, and discussion by the Planning Commission, I move the Planning Commission approve this Planned Development request PLNSUB2018-00264 and PLNSUB2018-00424 request as proposed and subject to the conditions contained in the Staff Report.

Second by Commissioner Ruttinger. Commissioners Lyon, Barry, Paredes, Bachman, and Ruttinger voted “Aye”. Motion passed unanimously.

[7:10:19 PM](#)

Hopkins Estate Planned Development & Preliminary Subdivision – A request by Clayton Homes, Inc., representing the property owners, for Planned Development and Preliminary Subdivision approvals to develop five (5) new lots and a private driveway at 1950 & 1960 South 1700 East. The Applicant plans to sell each lot individually for the construction of single family homes. For this reason, submitted plans reflect proposed site and landscaping improvements and specify building envelopes for each home, but the design of the five (5) structures would ultimately be decided by the future buyers. Planned Development approval is required as four (4) of the proposed lots would not have frontage on a public street. The applicant seeks to achieve the objective of creating a pleasing environment through use of design, landscape, or architectural features. The applicant has also requested a reduction in the required front and rear yard setbacks for the parcel that abuts 1700 East (lot1). The subject property is zoned R-1/7,000 (Single Family Residential) and is located within Council District 7, represented by Amy Fowler. (Staff contact: Ashley Scarff (801) 535-7660 or ashley.scarff@slcgov.com) **Case Number: PLNSUB2018-00033 & PLNSUB2018-00034**

Ms. Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the Planned Development subject to the conditions listed in the Staff Report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- If Staff would review the building permit plans for the houses when they came in
- The Commission’s desire to ensure that street-facing facades address the street and are compatible with neighborhood
- Planned vegetation in area between Kierstin Place to the north and proposed new private drive

John Clayton, Applicant, further reviewed the petition and material details being used on the Planned Development.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Efforts made to combine the proposed new driveway with Kierstin Place to the north
- The homes will be priced high; therefore, better quality
- Don’t want to commit to specific designs because they want to allow future home buyers to choose style/design of homes
- Applicant is the developer and the builder and will manage project from start to finish
- Potential issues with shared driveways will be mitigated with CC&Rs

PUBLIC HEARING [7:37:13 PM](#)

Judi Short – Raised concern regarding high priced homes, but stated that this type of housing is still needed in the community and overall is in favor of the development

Keith Brown – Voiced he’s in favor of the petition

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Clark closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission and Staff further discussed the following:

- Design of front facing facade and if recommended condition of approval is adequate
- Landscaping and possibility of added vegetation between proposed development and development to the north

MOTION [7:55:48 PM](#)

Commissioner Barry stated, based on the information in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Planning Commission approve the Planned Development petition PLNSUB2018-00033 and associated Preliminary Subdivision PLNSUB2018-00034 with the following conditions listed in the Staff Report in addition:

- 1. That the front facing 1700 E lot come back before the Planning Commission based on the standard of compatibility**

Second by Commissioner Lyon. Commissioners Ruttinger, Bachman, Paredes, Barry and Lyon voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

[7:57:18 PM](#)

Urban Alfandre FB-UN2 Zoning District Building Height Amendment - James Alfandre, representing the property owner, requests an amendment to the Zoning Ordinance to allow additional building height for a property in the FB-UN2 Zoning District (Form Based Urban Neighborhood) located at approximately 231 West 900 South. Specifically the request would include the subject property in the designated area for building height up to 5 stories with a maximum 65 feet. The property is currently subject to a height limit of 4 stories with maximum 50 feet. This proposed amendment would affect Section and Table 21A.27.050.C FB-UN2 Building Form Standards: Height, in the Salt Lake City Zoning Ordinance. (Staff Contact: Casey Stewart at (801)535-6260 or casey.stewart@slcgov.com; **Case number: PLNPCM2017-00590 (Legislative matter)**)

Ms. Molly Robinson, Planning Manager, filled in for Casey Stewart. She reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report. She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission forward a negative recommendation to the City Council.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Height of development in the neighborhood
- Form base code, its establishment and neighborhood support
- Spot zoning

James Alfandre, Applicant, provided further details on proposed project. He stated he was preparing to present the project to neighborhood meetings for public feedback.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- The possibility of rezoning to FB-UN1
- Nodal versus corridor development on major streets

PUBLIC HEARING [8:26:22 PM](#)

Rosa Hernandez – Raised concerns regarding the outcome of project and how it will affect her business

Bruce Johnson – Expressed he's in favor of increased density

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Clark closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission and Staff further discussed the following:

- Proposed text amendments
- Urban Planning and Urban design principals
- Height of the building and street width
- Increased density near TRAX stations
- Building compatibility with surrounding buildings
- Community understanding of the requested proposal
- Previous Community comments

MOTION [8:47:00 PM](#)

Commissioner Paredes stated, based on the information in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Planning Commission recommend that the City Council deny the Alfandre zoning map amendment petition PLNPCM2017-00590.

Second by Commissioner Bachman. Commissioners Barry, Paredes and Bachman voted “Aye”. Commissioners Lyon and Ruttinger voted “Nay” bringing the Chairperson to vote. Chairperson voted “Aye”. The motion passed 4-2.

[8:50:57 PM](#)

Chair and Vice Chair Elections – Were postponed until September 12, 2018.

The meeting adjourned at [8:51:22 PM](#)