SALT LAKE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING City & County Building 451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah Wednesday, August 23, 2017

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Planning Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at <u>5:31:04 PM</u>. Audio recordings of the Planning Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Planning Commission meeting were: Chairperson Matt Lyon, Vice Chairperson Carolynn Hoskins; Commissioners Maurine Bachman, Emily Drown, Weston Clark, Andres Paredes, Clark Ruttinger, Brenda Scheer and Sara Urquhart. Commissioner Ivis Garcia was excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were Wayne Mills, Planning Manager; John Anderson, Senior Planner; Doug Dansie, Senior Planner; Lex Traughber, Senior Planner; Molly Robinson, Urban Planner; David Gellner, Principal Planner; Anthony Riederer, Principal Planner; Lauren Parisi, Associate Planner; Michelle Poland, Administrative Secretary and Paul Nielson, Senior City Attorney.

Field Trip

A field trip was held prior to the work session. Planning Commissioners present were: Carolyn Hoskins, Maurine Bachman, Emily Drown, Weston Clark, Clark Ruttinger and Sara Urquhart. Staff members in attendance were Wayne Mills, Lauren Parisi, David Gellner, John Anderson and Doug Dansie.

- 145 South 600 West Staff gave an overview of the proposal and oriented the Commission to the area. The Commissioners asked if the applicant had made changes to the proposal since the work session in July. Staff stated they hadn't seen changes yet but the applicant should be bringing them to the meeting.
- <u>100/200 South and 200/300 West</u> Staff gave an overview of the proposal and oriented the Commission to the area. The Commission discussed the building height (what was the proposed in relation to what was around it.)
- 421 S Main St Staff gave an overview of the proposal and oriented the Commission to the area. The Commissioners asked about the ordinance requirements for transparent glass.
- <u>63 (65) South 900 East</u> Staff gave an overview of the proposal and oriented the Commission to the area.

APPROVAL OF THE AUGUST 9, 2017, MEETING MINUTES. <u>5:31:22 PM</u>

MOTION <u>5:31:27 PM</u>

Commissioner Urquhart moved to approve the August 9, 2017, meeting minutes. Commissioner Scheer seconded the motion. Commissioners Bachman, Garcia, Paredes, Scheer and Urquhart voted "aye". Commissioner Drown, Clark, Lyon and Ruttinger abstained from voting as they were not present at the subject meeting.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR 5:31:55 PM

Chairperson Matt Lyon stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Carolynn Hoskins reviewed the Mayor's meeting regarding Operation Rio Grande she attended and stated she appreciated the information received.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR 5:32:56 PM

Mr. Wayne Mills, Planning Manager, reviewed the Regent Street Hotel request for a time extension which was approved by the Planning Director. He stated elections for a new Chair and Vice Chair would be held during the first meeting in September.

The Commission and Staff discussed the postponed agenda items and why they were postponed.

5:35:29 PM

Meadowlark Elementary Rezone at approximately 505 N. Morton Drive - Tyler Barnes, on behalf of Salt Lake City School District, has requested a zoning map amendment to rezone the parcel at the above listed address from R-1-5,000: Single-Family Residential to PL: Public Lands. Meadowlark Elementary School intends on using this parcel to expand/reconfigure the existing entrance on the east side of the school's site and would like to rezone the parcel to keep the zoning consistent. The rest of the school's site is also zoned Public Lands and the expansion of the entrance is a part of the school's larger project to rebuild the school. The subject property is located within Council District 1, represented by James Rogers. (Staff Contact: Lauren Parisi, Associate Planner, at (801)535-7226 or lauren.parisi@slcgov.com.) Case Number: PLNPCM2017-00429 (Legislative Matter)

Ms. Lauren Parisi, Associate Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission forward a favorable recommendation to the City Council regarding the petition.

Mr. Paul Shulty, applicant, reviewed the purpose of the proposal and how it would enhance the safety of those using the school.

PUBLIC HEARING 5:40:31 PM

Chairperson Lyon opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Lyon closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION 5:41:13 PM

Commissioner Clark stated based on the findings and analysis in the Staff Report, testimony, and discussion at the public hearing, he moved that the Planning Commission forward on a positive recommendation to the City Council for the requested Meadowlark Elementary Zoning Map Amendment PLNPCM2017-00429. Commissioner Drown seconded the motion. Commissioners Hoskins, Bachman, Drown, Clark, Paredes, Ruttinger, Scheer and Urquhart voted "aye". The motion passed unanimously.

5:42:19 PM

Centro Civico Senior Housing – Planned Development & Conditional Building and Site Design Review at approximately 145 South 600 West - Centro Civico Mexicano is requesting to build the Centro Civico Senior Housing project at the above listed address. The proposed 6-story, 61-unit apartment building would be located on a 0.38 acre (16,500 square foot) vacant parcel in the G-MU – Gateway-Mixed Use zoning district. The project would be the first phase of a larger mixed-use project to be built at this location. The G-MU zoning district requires Planned Development approval for all new principal buildings and uses. In addition, Conditional Building and Site Design Review (CBSDR) approval is requested to address some design aspects of the building. The property is located within Council District 4, represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff contact: David J. Gellner at (801)535-6107 or david.gellner@slcgov.com.) Case Number: PLNSUB2017-00370 & PLNPCM2017-00525 (Administrative Matter)

Mr. David Gellner, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the petition as presented.

Mr. Peter Corroon, Centro Civico Mexicano, Mr. Bernardo Flores-Sahagun, reviewed the west façade, the changes made as a result of the work session, the midblock walkway and the site plan details. They reviewed the new design for the west façade to break it up and make it more interactive. They stated the area was industrial and the development would add to the area.

The Commission and applicant discussed the following:

- The materials and the distance the proposed architectural elements projected into the public right of way.
- The midblock walkway and if it would be accessible from the neighboring property.
- The fencing for the proposal.

PUBLIC HEARING 5:58:10 PM

Chairperson Lyon opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Lyon closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission, Applicant and Staff discussed and stated the following:

- The work session was helpful and a great way to review projects in the future.
- The open space in the proposal.
- The language for the motion.
- The approval for the Art work and how to ensure it was installed.
- The signage for the building and the approval process.

MOTION 6:06:02 PM

Commissioner Drown stated regarding PLNSUB2017-00370 and PLNPCM2017-00525the Centro Civico Senior Housing project, based on the findings and information listed in the Staff Report and the testimony and plans presented, she moved that the Planning Commission approve both the Planned Development and Conditional Building and Site Design Review requests taking into consideration conditions one through three with the addition of verbiage of architectural elements within final Staff approval. Commissioner

Bachman seconded the motion. Commissioners Hoskins, Bachman, Drown, Clark, Paredes, Ruttinger, Scheer and Urquhart voted "aye". The motion passed unanimously.

6:08:04 PM

Goldman Sachs Childcare Conditional Building and Site Design at approximately 421 S Main St. - Goldman Sachs is renovating an existing commercial structure located at the above listed address into a childcare facility for their downtown employees. The project generally meets the standards of the Zoning Ordinance but has requested relief through the Conditional Building and Site Design process to add a privacy film on the Main Street windows. This would reduce the amount of transparent glass from the required 60 percent to 40 percent. The subject property is located in the D-1 Central Business District and in City Council District 4 represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff contact: John Anderson at (801) 535-7214 or john.anderson@slcgov.com.) Case Number: PLNPCM2017-00414 (Administrative Matter)

Mr. John Anderson, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission deny the petition as presented.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Similar proposals that were approved.
- If there was research supporting, the benefits or best practice of blocking out windows to childcare areas.
- The reasoning for the Staff recommendation.
- If there was evidence to support the reduction in glass would it be appropriate to approve the petition.
 - A finding of support or that the petition was consistent with the standards in the ordinance needed to be made
- If Conditional Building and Site Design was the best process for this application.
- If the use was part of the consideration in the proposal.
- If the child care center was located on an upper level would the glass be an issue.

Mr. Troy Anderson, architect, reviewed the proposal and the reason for the request. He stated the use was a permitted use and asked if it was really important to see everything behind the glass. Mr. Anderson reviewed the requirements in the ordinance and how they did not and did apply to the petition. Mr. Anderson reviewed the layout of the child care center, the need to protect the children in the facility from the pedestrian view and asked the Commission to approve the petition.

The Commission and applicant discussed the following:

- If a person on the street would be able to see the entire childcare facility or only the rooms by the windows.
- The reasoning for the proposed layout and location of the facility.
- The requirements to have the children located on the ground floor of the building.
- The makeup of the glass film and amount of glass that would be covered by the film.

- What would and would not be seen from the inside/outside of the windows.
- If the layout of the childcare center could be changed to accommodate the glass requirement.
- If the college was allowed to put up signage why couldn't the current owner.
 - o The college was made to remove the signage and the point was for safety.
- If there were other options for window coverings.

PUBLIC HEARING 6:43:33 PM

Chairperson Lyon opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Lyon closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission, Applicant and Staff discussed and stated the following:

- If advertising, frosted glass or blinds were allowed on the windows.
- There were other options for the layout of the space.
- The space was intended for a more active, store front use.
- The proposal was for the wrong use in the wrong place.
- The use was not appropriate next to a Trax station and it could not fulfil the requirements of the master plan.
- If there was a better location in the building for the daycare center.
- The proposal promoted a walkable downtown and having the children close to where their parents work was ideal.
- Having a daycare in the area was not the issue it was the proposed material on the windows.
- Needed to explore more avenues for orientation of the space and its use.
- Not convinced this was the only layout that could work for this building.
- If the approval of the frosted glass would be tied to the use or the building.
- Surprised the Company wanted to use the prime area for a childcare facility and not the intended use.
- The next steps if the proposal were denied.
- Should be applauding them for the use of an existing building and trying to activate the space.
- If blinds are installed that was their choice and opening or closing them was up to the
 user.
- Tint was a lot safer for kids than blinds.
- Worried the proposal would set a precedent in the area.
- There was no substantial evidence that the glass needed to be covered.

MOTION <u>7:04:22 PM</u>

Commissioner Ruttinger stated regarding PLNPCM2017-00414 Goldman Sachs Childcare Facility Conditional Building and Site Design Review, based on the information in the Staff Report, public testimony, and discussion by the Planning Commission, he moved that the Planning Commission deny the Conditional and Building Site Design Review request to reduce the amount of transparent glass on the ground floor of the structure as it is not consistent with the city's policy of encouraging pedestrian activity in the Main Street Retail Core. Commissioner Scheer seconded the motion. Commissioners Hoskins,

Bachman, Drown, Clark, Paredes, Ruttinger and Scheer voted "aye". Commissioner Urquhart and Drown voted "nay". The motion passed 6-2.

Zoning Amendment at approximately 7:08:08 PM 63 (65) South 900 East - Jon C. Jones is requesting to amend the zoning map at the above listed address to match the adjacent zoning at 63 South 900 East. The entire City Zoning Code was rewritten in 1995 and new zoning districts and maps were created to reflect the City's policy. The landlocked parcel (65 South 900 East) is zoned R-2 Residential. The street fronting parcel (63 South 900 East) is zoned RMF-30. Both lots are used to accommodate a Boarding House. This proposal is to provide the same zoning (RMF-30) on both lots. The petitioner plans on remodeling and upgrading the existing Boarding House. The subject property is within Council District 4 represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff Contact: Doug Dansie at (801)535-6182 or doug.dansie@slcgov.com.) Case Number: PLNPCM2017-00361 (Legislative Matter)

Mr. Doug Dansie, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the petition as presented.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

• The access to the properties.

Mr. Jon C. Jones, applicant, reviewed the history of the property, the purpose of the rezone and the future plans for the property.

The Commission and applicant discussed the following:

• The number of occupants in the boarding house.

PUBLIC HEARING 7:15:06 PM

Chairperson Lyon opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Lyon closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION 7:15:30 PM

Commissioner Scheer stated based on the information in the Staff Report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, she moved that the Commission recommend that the City Council approve PLNPCM2017-00361, regarding the Zoning Map Amendment request to rezone the property located at 65 South 900 East from R-2 to RMF-30. Commissioner Urquhart seconded the motion. Commissioners Hoskins, Bachman, Drown, Clark, Paredes, Ruttinger, Scheer and Urquhart voted "aye". The motion passed unanimously.

7:16:31 PM

<u>Amendments to the Local Historic District Demolition Process</u> - A text amendment to amend sections of Title 21A (Zoning) of the Salt Lake City Code and clarify regulations concerning the demolition of historic resources in the H – Historic Preservation Overlay

District. Changes proposed are intended to clarify language and to make the demolition process more transparent. The proposed regulation changes will affect section 21A.34.020 of the zoning ordinance. Related provisions of title 21A may also be amended as part of this petition as necessary. The changes would apply citywide. (Staff contact: Lex Traughber at (801)535-6184 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com.) Case number: PLNPCM2009-00014 (Legislative Matter)

Mr. Lex Traughber, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the petition as presented.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

• The request to change the review panel from three people to one person.

PUBLIC HEARING 7:27:43 PM

Chairperson Lyon opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Lyon closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION 7:28:04 PM

Commissioner Urquhart stated based on the analysis and findings listed in this Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, as well as input received during the public hearing, she moved that the Commission recommend that the City Council approve petition PLNPCM2009-00014 regarding the amendments to section 21A.34.020 and related sections. The Commission finds that the proposed amendments comply with the review standards as demonstrated in Attachment B of the staff report dated July 6, 2017. Commissioner Hoskins seconded the motion. Commissioners Hoskins, Bachman, Drown, Clark, Paredes, Ruttinger, Scheer and Urquhart voted "aye". The motion passed unanimously.

7:29:17 PM

Amendments to the New Construction Standards for Local Historic Districts - A text amendment to amend sections of Title 21A (Zoning) of the Salt Lake City Code and clarify regulations concerning new construction in the H – Historic Preservation Overlay District. Changes proposed are intended to clarify language and to improve the new construction process. The proposed regulation changes will affect section 21A.34.020 of the zoning ordinance. Related provisions of title 21A may also be amended as part of this petition. The changes would apply citywide. (Staff contact: Anthony Riederer at (801)535-7625 or Anthony.riederer@slcgov.com.) Case number: PLNPCM2016-00905 (Legislative Matter)

Mr. Anthony Riederer, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Planning Commission approve the petition as presented.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

 The wording suggested by the Historic Landmark Commission and if it was the best wording to use. The materials that would not be allowed under the new ordinance.

PUBLIC HEARING 7:45:08 PM

Chairperson Lyon opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Lyon closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION 7:45:36 PM

Commissioner Bachman stated based on the information in the Staff Report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, she moved that the Commission recommend that the City Council approve PLNPCM2016-00905. Commissioner Drown seconded the motion.

Staff asked if the motion included the Staff suggested language. The Commission and Staff discussed what was included in the motion.

Commissioner Bachman amended the motion to include the language presented in the "Issues for Discussion" section of the Staff Report. Commissioner Drown seconded the amendment.

Commissioners Hoskins, Bachman, Drown, Clark, Paredes, Ruttinger, Scheer and Urquhart voted "aye. The motion passed unanimously.

WORK SESSION

7:47:46 PM

Conditional Building and Site Design Review for Portions of Block 67 at approximately 100/200 South and 200/300 West - Dave Abraham of The Richie Group, is requesting to amend the zoning map at 230 W 200 South to rezone the parcel from D-4 to D-1; a conditional use application for a commercial parking structure at 131 S 300 West; a planned development of multiple buildings across both 131 S 300 West and 230 West 200 South (the northwest corner and the southeast corners of block 67), and conditional Building and Site Design Review to Copy of August 23, 2017 Planning Commission Meeting Agenda modify design requirements. The subject property is within Council District 4 represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff Contact: Doug Dansie at (801)535-6182 or doug.dansie@slcgov.com or Molly Robinson at (801)535 7261 or molly.robinson@slcgov.com) Case Numbers: PLNSUB2017-0000418, PLNPCM2017-00419 and PLNPCM2017-00420), PLNPCM2017-00448 (Administrative Matter)

Ms. Molly Robinson, Urban Designer; and Mr. Doug Dansie, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Memo (located in the case file). They stated Staff was looking for comments and suggestions from the Commission regarding the petition.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

The allowable height under the current zoning.

- Midblock crossing were a desired feature and should be added to the proposal.
 - There was currently a walkway and the orientation would change under the development.

Mr. Dave Abraham, architect, Mr. Ryan Richie, the Richie Group, Mr. Jayson Newitt, the Richie Group, reviewed the layout and design of the proposal. They reviewed the reasoning behind the request and how the proposal would benefit the area.

The Commission, Applicant and Staff discussed and stated the following:

- The traffic patterns through the site.
- The location of the front door and the requirements that need to be met for alcohol establishments to use the area.
- Rezone and additional height on that portion of the site needs to address scale and transition to lower-rise development to the north.
- Ways to address and physically connect to the historic Japan Town neighborhood and make the overall like one cohesive block. A connection to 100 S from the center of the block was suggested.
- The festivals in the area and how the development could accommodate and add to the festivals.
- The number of restaurants proposed on the property.
- The amenities, public spaces and the connectivity on the property.
- The timeline for the proposal.
- The benefit of conducting a work session for the rezone prior to its approval.
- The width of the proposed mid-block street was a concern. Suggest narrowing the street and creating a more intimate experience.

The meeting adjourned at 8:52:48 PM