

**SALT LAKE CITY
HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING
City & County Building
451 South State Street, Room 326
Salt Lake City, Utah 84111
Thursday, March 2, 2023**

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30 PM. Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time. These minutes are a summary of the meeting. For complete commentary and presentation of the meeting, please visit <https://www.youtube.com/c/SLCLiveMeetings>.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Babs De Lay, Vice-Chair John Ewanowski, Commissioners Michael Abrahamson, Michael Vela, Amanda De Lucia, Emoli Kearns and Carlton Getz. Commissioner Kenton Peters was absent from the meeting.

City Staff members present at the meeting were: Deputy Director Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager Amy Thompson, Planning Manager Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner Lex Traugher, and Administrative Assistant Aubrey Clark.

APPROVAL OF JANUARY 5 AND FEBRUARY 2, 2023 MEETING MINUTES

Commissioner Mike Vela motioned to approve the minutes. Commissioner Michael Abrahamson seconded the motion. Commissioners Amanda De Lucia, Carlton Getz, Michael Abrahamson, John Ewanowski, Emoli Kearns, Mike Vela, and Chair Babs De Lay voted “aye”. The motion passed.

REPORTS OF THE CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR

The Chair had nothing to report.

The Vice Chair had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

Deputy Director Micheala Oktay shared the statistics on the 2022 Annual Report for the Historic Landmark Commission.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Cindy Cromer commented on contributory status of a structure in the Central City Historic District, a subject that she had previously emailed the commissioners about, and how she viewed it. Chair De Lay asked Staff to update the Commission on that project that Miss Cromer commented on. Deputy Director Michaela Oktay informed the Commission that the project that was referred to did in fact go through the public process in 2012 to adopt the Central City Historic District and the RLS survey. She stated that the structure in question was found to be non-contributory at the time of the 2012 RLS survey. She also stated that a review of the contributory status of the structure had been conducted and after the review Staff agreed that it should remain non-contributory due to alterations to the façade that could not be reversed. Planning Manager Amy Thompson shared that Staff has done an Administrative Interpretation and that was included in the Commissioner’s Dropbox to reference.

Deputy Director Michaela Oktay reported that City Council has granted the Planning Division \$75,000 to put out an RFP (Requests for Proposals) annually to have qualified surveyors submit bids to update all of the Planning Division's surveys, starting with Central City.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. **Major Alteration for Fisher Mansion Carriage House HVAC at Approximately 1206 W. 200 South** - CRSA, on behalf of Parks and Public Lands, is seeking approval for a Major Alteration to the Fisher Mansion Carriage House associated with the Fisher Mansion. The applicant is seeking approval for the installation of HVAC units, conduit, and associated cages on the northern elevation, which have already been installed. The subject property is located at the above-stated address, which is designated as a Salt Lake City Landmark Site. Both structures, the mansion and carriage house are listed as contributing structures to the landmark site. The subject property is located within the I (Institutional) zoning district and within Council District 2, represented by Council Member Alejandro Puy. (Staff contact: Kelsey Lindquist at (385) 226-7227 or kelsey.indquist@slcgov.com) **Case Number PLNHLC2023-00118**

Vice-Chair John Ewanowski and Commissioner Carlton Getz recused themselves due to a conflict of interest.

Planning Manager Kelsey Lindquist reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report. She stated that Staff recommends denial of the petition. She stated that the applicants are proposing two methods of mitigation. The first approaching being the painting of the conduit covers to a similar color of the masonry. The second approach being the planting of vegetation along the western fence to shield the public view along the Jordan River Trail.

The applicants Kenneth Weadon with CRSA, Zach Clegg with CRSA, Tyler Murdock SLC Parks and Public Lands, and Mark Stevens City Engineer with SLC Engineering Department reviewed the project giving the reason for the current design stating that the original plan approved by the HLC would have required air handler units and large duct work which would have been very invasive to the interior of the building. They acknowledged that the initial design isn't what was executed, with the engineer decided that eight units would better meet the use of the building. They discussed the consolidation of the units, feeling it was necessary to mitigate possible theft, by adding the cages around the units. They shared renderings of the proposed methods of mitigation.

Commissioner Vela asked if there would be picnic tables restored to the location. Tyler Murdock stated that the picnic tables will be brought out into the east lawn along with a temporary stage.

Chair De Lay asked about the current windows. The applicants said that the current windows will not be the finished product, the current product is in place to prevent vandalism, that the historic windows will be replaced with storm windows being placed over them.

Commissioner Vela wanted to know if there was consideration to put up a brick screening wall

to cover the condensers. Kenneth Weadon replied that there needed to be a certain amount of airflow front and back, they needed to leave it open to allow for that.

PUBLIC HEARING

Chair Delay opened the public hearing.

- Cindy Cromer – Feels a similar situation happened with the City Creek Park pump building where City departments were not communicating properly.

Seeing that no one else wished to speak, Chair Delay closed the public hearing.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Commissioner Vela asked if the applicants received a permit for the mechanical units. Planning Manager Kelsey Lindquist stated that there was a permit but that it was for the wrong number of units. She stated that the Planning Division had not been updated with the number of units.

Commissioner Kearns asked Staff what the timetable would be to occupy the building. The applicants stated there is a temporary Certificate of Occupancy issued for the building at this time. They also stated that there are a few items remaining to complete before they can fully close the project.

The Commission and Staff discussed the paddle share project and dock.

Tyler Murdock discussed the final projects that needed to be done to complete the Carriage House.

Commissioner De Lucia wanted to know if there were similar projects that had been completed that could serve as an example of how the project could have been done better. Staff commented that there wasn't one they could think of due to the volume of units. Commissioner De Lucia also wanted to know why the applicants chose to preserve the inside of the structure when by historic preservation standards, the outside of the structure has specific preservation standards. The applicant stated they were looking for a compromise between the two. Wanting to leave the interior exposed, but the ductworks would be bulky and covered.

Commissioner Kearns wanted to know why additional units were placed. The applicant stated that it was evaluated based on the use of the rooms, that the engineer was convinced that a one-to-one ratio would better serve the use of the building.

Commissioner Abrahamson wanted to know if there was consideration given to mitigating the appearance of the cages. The applicant stated that he was not sure it was the cages that were problematic, but rather the mass of the units behind them.

Commissioner Vela stated that he would like to see the project open as soon as possible. He felt a 30% or 50% open weave brick wall to cover the conduit would be a valid solution. Commissioner De Lucia agreed that additional screening was needed.

MOTION

Commissioner Amanda De Lucia stated, “Based on the information presented and discussion, I move that the Commission deny this application based on staff’s recommendation.”

Commissioner Emoli Kearns seconded the motion. Commissioners Amanda De Lucia, Michael Abrahamson, Emoli Kearns, Mike Vela, and Chair Babs De Lay voted “aye”. The motion to deny the petition was passed.

Vice-Chair John Ewanowski and Commissioner Carlton Getz rejoined the meeting.

WORK SESSIONS

- 1. Window Requirements for New Construction in Local Historic Districts** - Planning staff requests that the Historic Landmark Commission consider window requirements for new construction projects in the city’s local historic districts. Planning staff is seeking direction regarding appropriate type of windows, particularly in terms of materials and installation, and how we can better clarify requirements in the various documents including the Zoning ordinance standards and design guidelines that are used to evaluate new construction project requests. (Staff Contact: Lex Traughber at 801-535-6184 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com)

Planning Manager Amy Thompson, standing in for Senior Planner Lex Traughber, reported that Staff was seeking input from the Historic Landmark Commission regarding window requirements in the City’s local historic districts. She said that Staff wanted to know what types of materials and window installations the Commission felt were appropriate and how to better clarify the requirements in the zoning ordinance and design standards. She reported areas of the code that Staff feels are unclear and provided examples of other cities requirements throughout the country. She shared examples of not preferred and preferred window installations.

The Commissioners discussed whether they felt there was validity to banning vinyl or having a hybrid option. Staff presented potential alternatives for window use. Staff clarified that the word hybrid would not be used in the zoning code. The commission asked staff to research different types of windows to determine their quality, durability, fail rate, and dimensions.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 6:57 PM.