

**SALT LAKE CITY
HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING
City & County Building
451 South State Street, Room 326
Salt Lake City, Utah 84111
Thursday, January 5, 2023**

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30 PM. Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time. These minutes are a summary of the meeting. For complete commentary and presentation of the meeting, please visit <https://www.youtube.com/c/SLCLiveMeetings>.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Babs De Lay, Vice-Chair John Ewanowski, Commissioners Michael Vela, Kenton Peters, Amanda De Lucia, and Carlton Getz. Commissioner Michael Abrahamson was absent from the meeting.

City Staff members present at the meeting were: Planning Managers Kelsey Lindquist and Amy Thompson, Senior Planner Sara Javoronok, Principal Planner Aaron Barlow, Senior City Attorney Katherine Pasker, and Administrative Assistant Aubrey Clark.

APPROVAL OF DECEMBER 1, 2022, MEETING MINUTES

Commissioner Mike Vela motioned to approve the minutes. Commissioner Carlton Getz seconded the motion. All commissioners present voted “aye”.

REPORTS OF THE CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR

Chair Babs De Lay had nothing to report.
Vice Chair John Ewanowski had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

Planning Manager Kelsey Lindquist reported on the public safety building saying a new RFP will be released in 2023. She also stated there would be a new procedure to the meeting presentations with questions and comments from the commissioners held until after the applicant presentation.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Cindy Cromer reported on changes coming to Preservation Utah, primarily about the exit of David Amott. She also announced that the annual home tour will be held in May which will be held in Federal Heights this year.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

1. **Amendment to New Construction & Special Exception at approximately 237 N. Almond Street** - Michael Sommer is requesting to amend the approval from the HLC for New Construction of the single-family dwelling at the above-stated address. The applicant is proposing changes to the design of the structure and requesting modifications to three standards:
 - i. Modification in the front yard setback from 25' to 15'.

- ii. Modification in the north side yard setback from 10' to 4'.
- iii. New modification request for the distance of the driveway from the adjacent property line from 6' to 4'.

The subject property is located within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Sara Javoronok at 801-535-7625 or sara.javoronok@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNHLC2021-00967 & PLNHLC2021-00966**

Senior Planner Sara Javoronok reviewed the petition as outlined in the staff report. She reviewed the design changes the applicant is requesting. She stated that Staff recommends approval of the modifications to the proposal with the conditions listed in the Staff Report.

The applicant did not have a presentation to share.

Chair De Lay asked why the applicant was wanting to replace the garage with a carport.

The applicant, Michael Sommer, stated that the reason for the requested modifications is due to budgetary concerns.

No other commissioners had questions for the applicant.

Chair Delay opened the public hearing.

PUBLIC HEARING

Seeing that no one wished to speak, Chair De Lay closed the public hearing.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

No commissioners wished to speak.

MOTION

Commissioner Kenton Peters stated, "Based on the information presented and the discussion, I moved that the Commission approve this application at 237 North Almond Street, with the conditions listed in the staff report and no further modifications."

Commissioner Mike Vela seconded the motion. Commissioners John Ewanowski, Mike Vela, Kenton Peters, Carlton Getz, Amanda De Lucia, and Chair Babs De Lay voted "yes". The motion passed unanimously.

2. **Trolley North New Construction at Approximately 675 East 500 South** - Mark Isaac of Pinyon8 Consulting, LLC, representing the property owner Alta Terra Real Estate, LLC, is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new, 8-story (85-foot-tall) mixed-use/multi-family development (intended for student housing) at approximately 675 East 500 South. The subject property is located within the TSA-UN-C (Transit Station Area Urban Neighborhood Core) zoning district and the Central City Local Historic District. Approval to demolish the existing structures on the site has already been granted by Planning staff. As part of this petition, the applicant has requested modifications to the following development

standards:

- i. An increase to the allowed spacing between entry doors along all the street-facing façades.
- ii. An allowance for all street-facing façades to exceed the 200-foot maximum length.
- iii. An increase in the maximum setback along Green Street from 5 feet to 10 feet.

The subject property is located within Council District 4, represented by Ana Valdemoros. (Staff Contact: Aaron Barlow at 801-535-6182 or aaron.barlow@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNHLC2022-00675**

Principal Planner Aaron Barlow reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report. He reviewed the project layout and setbacks. He stated there is an attempt to mitigate the long façades by breaking up the materials used. He also addressed concerns Staff had regarding the project and the applicants' responses regarding the blank wall on the north façade, set back and step back on the north wall, lack of doors on the ground floor, and the utility box on 700 East. He stated that Staff recommends approval with a condition and the requested modifications listed in the Staff Report. He stated the final approval of some standards should be delegated to staff.

The applicant, Marc Isaac, introduced Craig Zigby, Maki Mosley, and Michael Augustine. He said that they were keeping 3 different districts in mind, and they spent a lot of time with Staff to meet the code criteria with the exception of the 3 requested modifications. He discussed the design and how they are trying to break up the articulation and massing. He stated that the ADA requirements have created some design challenges for the team.

Chair De Lay felt the proposed building to be one giant mass. They asked the applicant how they justified the modifications to the grade change. The applicants stated that there is roughly a 7 foot grade change from 7th to 5th east and discussed materials used. Commissioner De Lay also stated that they struggle with the lack of doors providing limited ways to escape should people need to leave the building.

Commissioner Peters asked how old the SITLA building is. Staff clarified it was outside the period of significance, being 1963, and was built in 1980. Commissioner Peters stated that he was bothered by the demolition of a viable building and wanted to know if the applicant had considered integrating it into the design of the project. The applicant explained that they had tried but failed to find a way to make it a plausible option. Commissioner Peters said he felt the floor plans do not show a two building feel and that the drawings lack a streetscape comparative. He stated that it would be helpful to see a comparison in height to the buildings around the project. Marc Isaac asked for clarification on what Commissioner Peters wants to see to get a clearer visual. Commissioner Peters stated that he would like to see a streetscape of the façade, and he wants to see the two building feel that the applicant stated they are after. He stated his concerns are openings, façade length, ADA access, and he would like to see a better breaking down of the mass of the building.

Staff and the commission discussed what should be submitted by the applicant.

Commissioner Getz asked the applicant how they came to their parking count. The applicant stated they see this as primarily student housing and counted 1 car per bedroom.

Commissioner Getz stated that he felt it would be worth the time to design in a way to highlight the historic structure rather than overshadow it.

Chair De Lay opened the public hearing.

PUBLIC HEARING

- Cindy Cromer – Felt the structure is out of scale to the neighborhood and walling in the Malloy Mansion.
- Steve Murdock – Gave his time to Danell Murdock.

Chair De Lay and Planning Manager discussed an upcoming petition that would address the process relating to contributing status of structures and how discrepancies can be challenged.

Chair De Lay noted that there were 8 commenters that deferred their time to Danelle Murdock.

- Danell Murdock – Stated that they call their property Hancock Mansion rather than the Malloy Mansion. She asked the Commission to deny the proposed project. She wants to know if the site plan is accurate. She pointed out what she felt were discrepancies in the plans.
- Steve Murdock – Stated that he felt the artist renderings are incorrect depictions of the proposal.

There was discussion between Staff and the Commission over possible discrepancies.

Chair De Lay offered time to the applicant for rebuttal. Marc Isaac stated that they are open to the item being tabled in order to address the raised concerns.

Chair De Lay closed the public hearing.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Commissioner Getz felt the plans as they are inadequate to make a decision. He encourage the applicant to frame the adjacent historic property. He wants to see corrected plans that are consistent with the measurements.

In regard to the proximity of neighboring properties Commissioner Peters felt that this project isn't successful at being a good neighbor. He referred to design guideline 12.6 that a new building should be contributing to the character of the neighborhood. He doesn't feel the project as is fulfills the standard.

Commissioner De Lay shared concern about blocking visibility and says they are in danger of losing the character of the neighborhood. They want to see something the compliments Trolley Square.

Commissioner and Staff discussed the parking requirements.

Commissioner De Lay is also concerned with the lack of green space provided in the plans.

Planning Manager Amy Thompson informed the commission about their authority regarding the massing of the building.

Planning Manager Kelsey Lindquist asked that the commission consider leaving the public hearing open if they plan on tabling the item.

MOTION

Commissioner Kenton Peters motioned to table based on City Code 21A.37.050 D building entrances and 21A.37.050 F maximum length of façade and 12.5 and others that go with it citing tall buildings away from nearby smaller scale structures. And 12.6 new buildings should contribute in a creative and compatible way to the public and civic realm and that they consider reducing the massing of the building accordingly. Perhaps by removing some parking stalls and trying to give a little bit more definition to the various multi-story parts of the building, reducing the blockiness.

Commissioner Getz seconded the motion. Commissioners John Ewanowski, Mike Vela, Kenton Peters, Carlton Getz, Amanda De Lucia, and Chair Babs De Lay voted “aye”. The motion to table passed.

The meeting was adjourned at approximately 7:09 PM.