

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING

This meeting was held electronically without an anchor location

Thursday, February 3, 2022

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30 PM. Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time. These minutes are a summary of the meeting. For complete commentary and presentation of the meeting, please visit <https://www.youtube.com/c/SLCLiveMeetings>.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Michael Vela; Commissioners Kenton Peters, Carlton Getz, Michael Abrahamson, and Robert Hyde. Commissioners Aiden Lillie, John Ewanowski, and Vice-Chair Babs De Lay were excused from the meeting.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Deputy Director Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager Wayne Mills, Senior City Attorney Hannah Vickery, Senior Planner Nannette Larsen, Principal Planner Katia Pace, Principal Planner Aaron Barlow, Urban Planner Laura Bandara, and Administrative Assistant Aubrey Clark.

Prior to the start of the meeting Staff held training for the Commissioners beginning at 5:00 PM. Staff gave a general overview of the role of the Historic Landmark Commission.

Chairperson Vela read the virtual meeting determination.

APPROVAL OF JANUARY 6, 2021 MEETING MINUTES

Commissioner Kenton Peters motioned to approve the minutes. Commissioner Carlton Getz seconded the motion. Commissioners Carlton Getz, Kenton Peters, Michael Abrahamson, and Robert Hyde voted “yes”. The motion passed.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE-CHAIR

Chair Vela stated that he had nothing to report.
Vice-Chair De Lay was not in attendance.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

Deputy Director Michaela Oktay stated that she had nothing to report.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Cindy Cromer reported the date for the Historic Home Tour as May 21st and that it will be held in the Central City Historic District. She also reported on a project on the corner of 5th South and 5th East that she is very excited about. She feels it is an enhancement to the community.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Marmalade Condos located at approximately 230 West 300 North - Ralph Nagasawa with MJSA Architects, representing the property owner, has submitted a request for New Construction to facilitate the creation of 3 new residential townhouse type of structures, with a total of 12 residential units. The request also includes modifications to building setbacks and lot width in the RMF-35 Zoning District. The Marmalade Condo project is located in the Capitol Hill Local Historic District. The subject property is within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Nan Larsen at (801) 535-7645 or nannette.larsen@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNHLC2020-00803**

Senior Planner Nannette Larsen review the petition as outlined in the Staff Report. She stated that Staff recommends approval. She stated that the applicant is requesting three modifications; a reduction in lot width in order to preserve the two residential units already on site, a request for a reduction in the side yard setbacks from 12 feet to 6 feet, and a reductions of the rear yard setback from 25 feet to 9 feet.

Commissioner Kenton Peters asked if there were conditions recommended. Staff clarified that there were no recommendations attached to the approval.

Chair Vela asked if the fire access alley would be approved by fire marshals. Staff clarified that the project was submitted to the fire department, and they did not raise concerns regarding the fire access. Chair Vela asked about how the City would access trash removal. Staff explained that getting comments from waste management is not typically part of the review process.

Project Architect Ken Hang stated that the fire access is approved. Mr. Ralph Nagasawa reviewed the project planning timeline. They stated that they want to maintain the existing structures and want to use materials consistent with the neighborhood.

Commissioner Kenton Peters asked the applicant to talk about the relationship between the existing structures to the new proposed building. The applicant says they will be far enough away.

Commissioner Abrahamson asked about the space between the structures and parking. The applicants stated it is green gathering space for the tenants.

PUBLIC HEARING

Chairperson Michael Vela opened the public hearing.

- Jonathan Lee – asking the Commission to deny any request to change the setbacks on the north side of the property.
- Email from Amy Richardson was read into the record. – In opposition to the petition
- Email from Owen Richardson was read into the record – In opposition to the petition
- Emails from Jo Ellen Millard were read into the record – In opposition to the petition

Chair Vela asked the applicant to address concerns from the public comments.

The Applicants stated:

- Regarding light interruptions to neighboring properties: The north edge of the property will have a fence and landscaping to reduce the light interruption from vehicles
- Regarding the proposed height of the project: 35 feet is allowed but they are maintaining consistency with the front historical building, which stands at 29 feet, by keeping the proposed project at 29 feet
- Regarding the alleyway: They will not be using the alleyway, do not need the use of the alleyway for fire department access. The fire department has given approval based on the onsite plans
- Regarding the setback reductions: There will be 43 feet between the back wall and the home to the rear of the structure and 35 feet from the other property.
- Regarding fencing materials: The fencing will be opaque and solid with reflective materials for safety at the end of the alley

Commissioner Peters asked if the zoning changes to residential. The applicant stated that it is surrounded by SR1 zoning. Commissioner Peters then asked why there have been so many iterations of the project that led to asking for relief from the setbacks. The applicant stated that it was due to the requirements for the firetruck turn around and not wanting the dumpster to be in an area that would disrupt the neighbors. Commissioner Peters asked if they had considered reducing the number of units in the larger building to keep within the setback requirements. The applicant stated that due to the infrastructure requirements that the project isn't financially viable without the additional units.

Chair Vela closed the public hearing.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Chair Vela asked Senior Planner Nannette Larsen to share the site plan. She reviewed the drive and the balcony encroachment.

Chair Vela asked if there had been any consideration to having the turn around at the end of the lot rather than in the middle. The applicant stated there is a 150 depth they are allowed to go to meet fire department restrictions.

A 10-minute break was taken due to Commissioner Peters needing to step away.

The meeting resumed at 6:40 PM

Commissioner Abrahamson felt there is a disconnect between the staff report and the renderings on the window proportions.

Commissioner Peters wonders if there is a way to give more breathing room in regard to the proximity of the SR-1 abutting properties.

Chair Vela feels the windows fit the character of the existing structures, that the elevations are very well broken up and match the vocabulary of the neighborhood, and the horizontal banding and height seem to be within the zoning parameters. He remarked that the small variations

concerning the setback work because it is filling the need for middle housing.

Commissioner Hyde said he agrees and supports what Staff is recommending.

MOTION

Commissioner Robert Hyde stated, Based on the information in the staff report I move that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the proposed New Construction as presented in petition PLNHLC2020-00803.

Commissioner Michael Abrahamson seconded the motion. Commissioners Robert Hyde , Kenton Peters, Carlton Getz, and Michael Abrahamson voted “aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

Major Alteration located at approximately 229 N Almond Street - Brock Whitworth, representing the property owner, is requesting approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (CoA) for the removal of a dormer, replacement of roof, removal of chimneys, windows, door, siding, trimming, soffit, and fascia. The property is currently under enforcement, as many of the requested items have already been installed. The property is located at the address listed above and is a contributing structure within the Capitol Hill Local Historic District. The property is located within the RMF-35 and RMF-45 zoning districts and within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Katia Pace at 801-535-6354 or katia.pace@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNHLC2021-01144**

Principal Planner Katia Pace reviewed the petition as outlined in the staff report. She stated that Staff recommends approval with the conditions listed in the Staff Report. She reviewed the changes that were made on the enforcement case.

Chair Vela asked whether his understanding that the home is being restored to its previous state, minus the chimneys, is correct. Staff stated that the changes that were done inappropriately were being restored to a state that complies with the standards and guidelines.

Applicant representative Brock Whitworth stated that Katia did a great job what is going into the project. He said their objective is to restore the home to its architectural style and period of significance.

PUBLIC HEARING

Chair Vela opened the public hearing.

- Cindy Cromer – In favor of the changes that have been made
- Kailen Fernandez – Wants the environmental impact of the removal of viable construction materials to be considered and would like them to be kept out of the landfill.

Mr. Whitworth said that they did try to revise the dormer to meet the standards but they were unable to find a solution.

Chair Vela closed the public hearing.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Commissioner Peters feels it's a good solution and commends the applicant for working with staff. Commissioner Abrahamson asked for clarification about the rear façade windows. Chair Vela asked Katia Pace to share the photos of the rear façade. She clarified that the windows are being recommended for approval because that side is not seen from the public right of way. Commissioner Abrahamson asked for further clarification on why the vinyl siding needs to be removed. Staff clarified that vinyl siding is not allowed but there is more wiggle room on the windows.

MOTION

Commissioner Kenton Peters stated, Based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2021-01144, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for Major Alterations at 229 N Almond Street. Approve the following changes: 1. Approve the roof replacement. 2. Replace nine vinyl windows (East, North and South elevations) with wood double hung windows. 3. Approve the five windows in the West elevation as is. 4. Replace window trim on primary façades to match the original trim. 5. Approve the front door that was replaced. 6. Replace the frame of the front door to match the original frame. 7. Approve basement door as is. 8. Approve the removal of the asbestos shingles and exposure of the original siding. 9. Replace the vinyl siding on the West elevation with cement fiber. 10. Reinstate the barge boards on the gable with wood and the original design. 11. Restore/replicate the aluminum soffit and fascia with original wood design. 12. Approve removal of two chimneys. 13. Approve replacement of the wood deck in the front porch. 14. Remove the new dormer and restore the roof.

Commissioner Robert Hyde seconded the motion. Commissioners Robert Hyde, Kenton Peters, Carlton Getz, and Michael Abrahamson voted "aye". The motion passed unanimously.

Rear Addition at Approximately 563 East 800 South - Ted Konold, representing the property owner, is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Historic Landmark Commission to construct a rear addition to the house. The applicant is asking for additional height and a modification to the interior side-yard setback. The subject property is located within the Central City Local Historic District, the RMF-30 Low-Density Multi-Family Zoning District, and Council District 4, represented by Analia Valdemoros. (Staff Contact: Aaron Barlow at 801-535-6182 or aaron.barlow@slcgov.com) **Case numbers PLNHLC2021-00900**

Principal Planner Aaron Barlow reviewed the petition as outlined in the staff report. He stated that Staff recommends denial of the petition due to established roof height and form, rear façade, and chimney.

There were no questions from Commissioners for Staff.

Chair Vela told Arron that the report was well done.

Applicant Representative Ted Konold reviewed the project description and shared that he feels this project fits within the goals of the district. He shared examples of other homes in the neighborhood.

Chair Vela reminded the Commission that there are two standards that they are looking at. He stated that standard 2 and 9 are not being complied with.

Commissioner Peters asked about the other examples that were shown and whether or not the applicant knows when they were built and when the permits were issued. The applicant stated that some of the permits were issued before Central City was made a historic district. He said that the ones he shared with the Commission most like Mr. Fernandez's property were believed to be issued 2012 and 2013.

Deputy Director Michaela Oktay interjected that the Commissioner should be looking at this project with regard to the standards and design guidelines. She stated that if there were inappropriate additions that don't meet the standards within the neighborhood that wouldn't help this project meet the standards.

Commissioner Peters asked when the Central City Historic District was established. Staff commented it was done in 1991.

PUBLIC HEARING

Chairperson Vela opened the public hearing.

- Cindy Cromer – asks the Commission to table because she believes there is way increase the square footage of the house without disturbing the streetscape.

Kailen Fernandez, the homeowner, shared a slide of pictures of the property. He stated that he has tried to preserve a large number of historic aspects of the house.

Seeing that no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Vela closed the public hearing.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

The Commissioners discuss:

- The addition being too far forward and too tall for the building and the gable roof form being too harsh.
- Standard 9 being the tipping point on this particular project.
- Feeling like moving the project further back would help it feel like the addition was not dominating the home.

MOTION

Commissioner Carlton Getz motioned to table the matter to a later meeting date.

Commissioner Kenton Peters seconded the motion. Commissioners Robert Hyde, Kenton Peters, Carlton Getz, and Michael Abrahamson voted "aye". The motion passed

unanimously.

WORK SESSIONS

Pioneer Park Cultural Landscape Report Findings Briefing - In collaboration with the Planning and Engineering Divisions, the Public Lands Department has completed a Cultural Landscape Report (CLR) for Pioneer Park. The report includes a site history; existing conditions; comparative analysis and evaluation of historic and existing conditions; and treatment recommendations for the park. The consultant historic landscape architect, Shalae Larsen of IO LandArch, will provide a briefing on the report's findings. Planning will briefly discuss the CLR's role in guiding evaluations of future proposals for park improvements and maintenance. This is a follow up briefing from the August 5, 2021 presentation on this project. Pioneer Park is within Council District 4, represented by Ana Valdemoros. (Staff contact: Nancy Monteith, Engineering Division at (801) 535-6157 or nancy.monteith@slcgov.com or Laura Bandara, Planning Division, at (801) 535-6188 or laura.bandara@slcgov.com)

Urban Planner Laura Bandara introduced the project. She stated the purpose of a Cultural Landscape Report is to that provide secretary of interior standards for documentation and guidance on landscapes with cultural and historic significance and to provide guidance on these landscape to decision makers and land managers.

Shalea Larsen of IO LandArch reviewed the CLR and how the information is used and how they plan to preserve significant resources. She reviewed the treatment plan.

Chair Vela asked what kind of plan is in place for the trees as they begin to die out. Shalea Larsen stated that was not specifically addressed in their report but felt that would be covered by the recommendation that the City develop a tree succession planting plan.

Commissioner Abrahamson was impressed with the report. He wanted to know whether the size and shape of the park had been changed with the construction of the interstate. Shalea stated that street widening did impact the park, but they did not have exact information on that.

The meeting adjourned 9:46 PM.