

Motion Sheet for PLNHLC2020-00376:

Motion to Approve as Proposed:

(Consistent with Staff Recommendation)

Based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2020-00376, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Minor Alteration of a contributing structure at 1106 E. South Temple with the following conditions:

1. Any replacement sandstone to the existing foundation will match the existing sandstone foundation, as close as possible.
2. Any changes to the reconstruction and restoration of the incorrect egress openings be forwarded to the Historic Landmark Commission.
3. That the porch balusters on the lower and upper portions of the porch reconstruction be spaced 2" apart.
4. Any additional details of the porch restoration be delegated to staff for final review.

Motion to Approve as Proposed with Additional Conditions:

(Consistent with Staff Recommendation)

Based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2020-00376, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Minor Alteration of a contributing structure at 1106 E. South Temple with the following conditions:

1. Any replacement sandstone to the existing foundation will match the existing sandstone foundation, as close as possible.
2. Any changes to the reconstruction and restoration of the incorrect egress openings be forwarded to the Historic Landmark Commission.
3. That the porch balusters on the lower and upper portions of the porch reconstruction be spaced 2" apart.
4. Any additional details of the porch restoration be delegated to staff for final review.
5. Any additional conditions required by the Historic Landmark Commission.

Motion to Deny:

(Contrary to Staff Recommendation)

Based on the information listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission deny petition PLNHLC2020-00376, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Major Alteration of a contributing structure at 1106 E. South Temple, because evidence has not been presented that demonstrates that the proposal complies with the following standard(s):

Specifically, the commission should make findings related to which standard or standards the proposal does not comply with:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be used for a purpose that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment;
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided;

- 3.** All sites, structures and objects shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create a false sense of history or architecture are not allowed;
- 4.** Alterations or additions that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved;
- 5.** Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved;
- 6.** Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced wherever feasible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other structures or objects;
- 7.** Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible;
- 8.** Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant cultural, historical, architectural or archaeological material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment;
- 9.** Additions or alterations to structures and objects shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible in massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment;
- 10.** Certain building materials are prohibited including the following:
 - a.** Aluminum, asbestos, or vinyl cladding when applied directly to an original or historic material.
- 11.** Any new sign and any change in the appearance of any existing sign located on a landmark site or within the H Historic Preservation Overlay District, which is visible from any public way or open space shall be consistent with the historic character of the landmark site or H Historic Preservation Overlay District and shall comply with the standards outlined in chapter 21A.46 of this title.