

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING
This meeting was held electronically without and anchor location
Thursday, June 3, 2021

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order approximately 5:30 PM. Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time. These minutes are a summary of the meeting. For complete commentary and presentation of the meeting, please visit <https://www.youtube.com/c/SLCLiveMeetings>.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Robert Hyde; Vice Chairperson Michael Vela; Commissioners Babs De Lay, John Ewanowski, Adien Lillie, Kenton Peters, Victoria Petro-Eschler, and David Richardson.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Deputy Director Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager Wayne Mills, Planning Manager Molly Robinson, Senior City Attorney Hannah Vickery, Administrative Assistant Aubrey Clark.

Chairperson Hyde read the virtual meeting determination.

APPROVAL OF THE OTHER BUSINESS AND MAY 6, 2021 MEETING MINUTES.

Commissioner Peters motioned to postpone the discussion review of the Rules of Procedure until the end of the meeting. Commissioner Vela seconded that motion. Commissioners Ewanowski, Lillie, Peters, Petro-Eschler and Richardson voted “aye”. The motion passed. Commissioner De Lay was not yet present.

Commissioner John Ewanowski motioned to approve the May 6, 2021 meeting minutes. Commissioner Petro-Eschler seconded the motion. Commissioners Vela, Ewanowski, Lillie, Pedro-Eschler, and Richardson voted “aye”. Commissioner Peters recused himself. The motion passed. Commissioner De Lay was not yet present.

PUBLIC COMMENTS –

Cindy Cromer made a comment on the cultural landscape that was a work session item on April’s agenda. She stated there is a lack of predictable process for the public regarding modifications to publicly owned property.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR

Chairperson Hyde stated he had nothing to report

Vice Chairperson Vela stated he had nothing to report

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

Planning Manager Wayne Mills stated he had nothing to report. Planning Manager Molly Robinson let the Commission know that she has stepped down as a Planning Manager for Salt Lake City.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Dormer Addition at approximately 1017 E 1st Avenue – Dennis Webb, the property owner, is requesting approval for a Minor Alteration and Special Exception at approximately 1017 E 1st Avenue. The Minor Alteration and Special Exception are to accommodate the construction of the proposed attic additions on the east and north roof slopes of the structure. The property is presently occupied as a single-family residential house and is located within the Avenues Local Historic District and is zoned SR-1A (Special Development Pattern Residential). The subject property is within Council District 3 represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Nannette Larsen, (385) 386-2761 or nannette.larsen@slcgov.com) **Case number: PLNHLC2019-00335 & PLNHLC2021-00501**

Nannette Larsen, Principal Planner, reviewed the application as outlined in the staff report. She stated that Planning Staff is recommending approval of the requests.

Applicant, Dennis Webb, stated that he wanted the project to be compliant.

Commission and Applicant discuss:

- The reason for the alteration without a permit

Commissioner Hyde opened the meeting for public comment. Seeing that no one wished to speak he closed the public comments.

MOTION:

Commissioner Kenton Peters stated, Regarding petition PLNHLC2019-00335 and PLNHLC2021-00501 1017 E 1st Avenue. Based on the information in the staff report I move that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the proposed Minor Alteration as presented in that petition. Additionally, I move that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the proposed Special Exception, as presented in the second petition. Commissioner Mike Vela seconded the motion. Commissioners Vela, Ewanowski, Lillie, De Lay, Peters, Petro-Eschler and Richardson voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

Major Alteration and Special Exception Modification at approximately 761 North Wall Street - Sarah Ivy, property owner, is requesting modification to the approval she received for a major alteration and special exception to construct a new addition on the eastern side of her home. This addition will encroach into the eastern side and front yard setbacks to allow for additional living space. The original approval was received June 4, 2020. The subject property is located within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact is Caitlyn Tubbs at (385)-315-8115 or caitlyn.tubbs@slcgov.com) **Case number: PLNHLC2020-00125 & PLNHLC2020-00127**

Caitlyn Tubbs, Principal Planner, outlined the application as outlined in the staff report. She stated that the Planning Staff found that it complied with ordinances.

Commission and Staff discuss:

- Location of the property
- The shred roof that has been demolished

Architect, Osamu Uchiyama, stated that they are looking to expand the writing nook and not changing the roof line or materials.

Applicant, Sarah Ivy, stated she didn't realize until they were ready to do the construction just how small the addition was. She felt that adding the extra foot space would make the addition much more functional.

Commissioner Hyde opened the meeting for public comment. Seeing that no one wished to speak he closed the public comments.

The Commission discussed:

- The appropriateness of the request

MOTION:

Commissioner Peters stated, regarding PLNHLC2020-00125 based on the information in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the proposed modifications to petition with the following conditions:

- 1. That the Applicant obtain all required demolition and building permits as well as comply with all applicable standards set forth in Salt Lake City ordinances.**
- 2. That Staff will be responsible for reviewing the building permit request to ensure compliance with the issued Certificate of Appropriateness.**

Commissioner Richardson seconded the motion. Commissioners Vela, Ewanowski, Lillie, De Lay, Peters, Petro-Eschler and Richardson voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Petro-Eschler was excused from the remainder of the meeting.

Murphy Garage and ADU at approximately 1076 E Third Avenue - Jason Wheeler, of Assist Community Design Center, is requesting approval to construct a new two story building located in the rear yard of an existing single-family residence. The structure would include a main-level garage, with exterior stairs accessing a second-level accessory dwelling unit. The property is zoned SR-1A and is located in the Avenues Historic District. It is within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Nelson Knight at 385-226-4493 or nelson.knight@slcgov.com) **Case number: PLNHLC2020-00615**

Nelson Knight, Senior Planner, outline the application as outlined in the staff report. He stated that Staff recommends approval of the petition.

Commission and Staff discuss:

- What the square footage is of the upper level of the garage
- The alley face of the garage to in relation to other accessory buildings in the alley
- Parking
- The height of the house across the street

Applicant, Jason Wheeler, discussed the slopes of the terrain in the neighborhood. He stated that all of the properties along that side of Third Avenue are at least a full story higher than the Murphy's residence, it's the only single story bungalow on that street.

Paul Murphy, homeowner, thanked Nelson and Jason for a job well done.

Chairperson Hyde opened the public hearing.

William Swinyard – Neighbor on Second Avenue is concerned about the height consideration with the grading of the block from the back side of the project. He is also concerned with drainage problems.

Susan Swinyard – Concerned with adding more renters to the area because of the trash they leave behind. She is also concerned with the drainage.

Commission and Applicant discuss:

- Alley drainage
- ADU ordinance allows to have landlord on site
- Proposed height of the project

Chairperson Hyde closed the public comment hearing.

Chairperson Hyde opened to the Commission and they discussed:

- The Certificate of Appropriateness in regard to the design standards
- The design guidelines calling for a modernistic approach for new construction
- Drainage not being within the Commission's perview

MOTION:

Commissioner Babs De Lay stated, Based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2020-00615, which is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the New Construction of an accessory structure in the rear yard that contains a garage and accessory dwelling unit (ADU), and petition PLNHLC2021-00479, which is a request for a Special Exception to permit a structure that exceeds the maximum permitted height and based on the information in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2020-00615, which is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the New Construction of an accessory structure in the rear yard that contains a garage and accessory dwelling unit (ADU), and petition PLNHLC2021-00479, which is a request for a Special Exception to permit a structure that exceeds the

maximum permitted height with the following direction: 1. Approval of all final design details, including specific direction expressed by the Commission, shall be delegated to Planning Staff.

Commissioner Richardson seconded the motion. Commissioners Babs De Lay, John Ewanowski, Adien Lillie, Kenton Peters, David Richardson, and Michael Vela all voted “aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

Thistle Avenue Triplex at approximately 1126 E Thistle Avenue - Gary Knapp, of KZW Architects, is requesting approval from the City to develop a new three-story building housing three attached dwelling units at the above-listed address. The current use of the property is an unoccupied structure that has previously been determined to be non-contributing to the University Historic District and is proposed to be demolished. The property is zoned RMF-35 and is within the University Historic District. This type of project must be reviewed by the Historic Landmark Commission for the construction of a new principal building. The property is within Council District 4, represented by Ana Valdemoros. (Staff Contact: Nelson Knight at 385-226-4493 or nelson.knight@slcgov.com) **Case number: PLNHLC2021-00081**

Nelson Knight, Senior Planner, outlined the application as outlined in the staff report. He stated that Staff recommends the Commission approve the proposal with adjustments to the landscaping and the windows be recessed.

Commission and Staff discuss:

- Whether this petition had previously been heard as a work session

Applicant, Gary Knapp, discussed the front façade and the entry side, the windows being recessed, and an entry feature. He spoke about the landscaping and the rear setback.

Commission and Applicant discuss:

- Whether the existing trees will be maintained and whether trees and other vegetation will be added along Thistle.
- Whether a surface fault rupture study had been performed

Chairperson Hyde opened the public hearing.

John Wood – representing Boxcar 8 plex, directly west of proposed the site. In favor of the petition. Wants them to consider communicating with them in a direct fashion. He lives close by and care deeply for the neighborhood.

Cindy Cromer – Says the existing structure is extremely hazardous and is concerned with the proposed setback. She does not believe the design is sympathetic to the current streetscape. She is concerned that some of the trees on the lot should not be removed.

Planning Manager Molly Robinson read an email received from Oscar Arvizu. He is opposed to the petition.

Planning Manager Wayne Mills read an email received from Lewis Francis. He is opposed to the petition.

Garry Knapp spoke on the they would be happy to reach out to John Wood and that removing the current structure and building on the lot will beautify the area.

Mike Culligan spoke on the current structure and stated they believe the site will still draw wildlife and beautify the area with the proposed development.

Chairperson Hyde closed the public hearing and opened comments from the Commission.

Commission discussed:

- Feeling the project is rushed
- Surrounding buildings being of a midcentury mod design and the new project should complement that
- The fault line and whether it is in the Commissions purview and whether the project can move forward if there is a fault line
- The setback

Mike Culligan stated that he is not opposed to the case being tabled but he was concerned that it was only being table due to seismic activity. The Commissioners reiterated the reason for tabling is architectural observations that need more development.

Commission stated that they would like to see:

- A style to enhance the surrounding midcentury modern buildings – a design less complicated and more coherent
- Recessed windows
- The Thistle Ave face of the building being a public face
- The solid to void ratio considered
- The massing along with the roof lines
- The entrances being more defined

Commission and Applicants discussed:

- The front elevation
- The materials
- The area being at the end of an alley
- The Commission felt like the building needed some redesign, not to look exactly like the neighboring buildings but being a step above.
- Including the design standards for new construction in the next presentation

Nelson Knight, Senior Planner, asked for clarification on whether the Commission concurs with the standards listed in the staff report.

MOTION:

Commissioner Kenton Peters stated, In the case of petition PLNHLC2021-00081 and PLNHLC2021-00534 I move that we table this petition and ask that the Applicant make design revisions as requested by the Commission and return to us at a future date for

another review. Commissioner De Lay seconded the motion. Commissioners Babs De Lay, John Ewanowski, Adien Lillie, Kenton Peters, David Richardson, and Michael Vela all voted “aye”. The motion to table passed unanimously.

OTHER BUSINESS

Revisions to Rules of Procedure Document – The Commission will review and will taking action to adopt the revisions to the Rules of Procedure Document. (Staff Contact: Michaela Oktay at (385) 214-5311 or michaela.oktay@slcgov.com)

Commission David Richardson moved to approve. Commissioner John Ewanowski seconded the motion. Commissioners Babs De Lay, John Ewanowski, Adien Lillie, Kenton Peters, David Richardson, and Michael Vela all voted “aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

WORK SESSION

900 Line Construction along Liberty Park - Salt Lake City's Transportation Division will provide an overview of the reconstruction of 900 South, including the segment between 500 East and 700 East on the northern edge of Liberty Park. Although all work will occur within the public right-of-way, it will affect the perceived design of that edge of Liberty Park and the north entrance. The project is currently in design. Transportation will discuss what's next, and what construction in 2022 and 2023 will look like. (Staff Contact: Tom Millar (801) 535-6134 or tom.millar@slcgov.com)

Tom Millar, Transportation Planner, reviewed the project design for the reconstruction of 900 South Line along Liberty Park.

The Commissioners and Staff discussed:

- The Liberty Park monuments
- The 7 canyons sculpture

The meeting adjourned at 9:00 PM