ATTACHMENT I: ANALYSIS OF STANDARDS FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION

Includes Design Guidelines for New Construction in the Table

STANDARDS & DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION IN A HISTORIC DISTRICT

H Historic Preservation Overlay District – Standards for Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction (21A.34.020.H)
In considering an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness involving new construction, or alterations of noncontributing structures, the Historic Landmark Commission, or Planning Director when the application involves the alteration of a noncontributing structure shall, using the adopted design guidelines as a key basis for evaluation, determine whether the project substantially complies with each of the following standards that pertain to the application to ensure that the proposed project fits into the established context in ways that respect and contribute to the evolution of Salt Lake City's architectural and cultural traditions:

Design Guidelines for Historic Apartment & Multifamily Buildings in Salt Lake City, Chapter 12 New Construction, are the relevant historic design guidelines for this design review. The Design Objectives and related design guidelines are referenced in the following review where they relate to the corresponding Historic Design Standards for New Construction (21A.34.020.H), and can be accessed directly via the links below.
Historic Apartment & Multifamily Buildings in Salt Lake City, Chapter 12 New Construction

Design Standards for New Construction	Design Guidelines for New Construction	Analysis - Complies/Does Not Comply
1. Settlement Patterns & Neighborhood Character **a. Block and Street Patterns** The design of the project preserves and reflects the historic block, street, and alley patterns that give the district its unique character. Changes to the block and street pattern may be considered when advocated by an adopted city plan.	**Settlement Patterns & Neighborhood Character** **Block, Street & Site Patterns - Design Objective** The urban residential patterns created by the street and alley network, lot and building scale and orientation, are a unique characteristic of every historic setting in the city, and should provide the primary design framework for planning any new multifamily building. **12.1** The historic plan of streets and alleys, essential to the historic character of a district and setting, should be preserved and promoted. Consider the following: • Retain the historic pattern of smaller streets and alleys as a particular characteristic of the street block. • Reinstate sections of secondary street and/or alleys where these have been lost. • Design for the particular street patterns of e.g. Capitol Hill. • Respect and retain the distinctive tighter pattern of streets and alleys in The Avenues. • Refer to the specific design guidelines for the historic district for additional details and considerations. **12.2** The historic street pattern, as the unifying framework for a varied range of lot sizes and buildings, should be preserved and reinforced. • Retain historic alignments and widths wherever possible. • Plan the site to avoid adversely affecting the historic integrity of this pattern. **12.3** The historic street pattern, including the network of public and private ways within the street block, should be retained and reinforced. • Secondary streets and alleys maintain the historic permeability within the street block as a means of access and a historic setting for: • Direct and quieter street frontage for smaller buildings. • Rear access to the property and to accessory buildings. • An attractive focus for community social interaction. • An alternative and more intimate choice of routes, helping to reinforce a walkable and livable neighborhood.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** There will be no change to the urban residential patterns created by the South Temple and 1st Avenue that provide the basic framework for the proposed multifamily buildings. The historic street pattern will be retained. As presented, the building's primary access will be off of 1st Avenue, allowing for fewer curb cuts along South Temple than might be required for another design.

1. Settlement Patterns & Neighborhood Character **b. Lot and Site Patterns** The design of the project preserves the pattern of lot and building site sizes that create the urban character of the historic context and the block face. Changes to the lot and site pattern may be considered when advocated by an adopted city plan.	**12.4** The pattern and scale of lots in a historic district should be maintained, as the basis of the historic integrity of the intricate 'fine grain' of the neighborhood. • Avoid assembling or subdividing lots where this would adversely affect the integrity of the historic settlement pattern. **12.5** A new apartment or multifamily building should be situated and designed to reinforce and enhance the established character, or master plan vision, of the context, recognizing its situation and role in the street block and building patterns. • Respect and reflect the scale of lots and buildings associated with both primary and secondary street frontages. • Site a taller building away from nearby small scale buildings. • A corner site traditionally might support a larger site and building. • A mid-block location may require careful design consideration to integrate a larger building with an established lower building scale. • Respect and reflect a lower scale where this is characteristic of the inner block.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** The established pattern and scale of lots along South Temple will be maintained. The proposed building would be built on the existing lot that existed since well inside the historic period. The building is sited along the street similarly to the surrounding buildings in this section of the district. The building will have a visual presence along 1st Avenue, behind the homes proposed for rehabilitation. The effect will be mitigated by the L shape of the upper floor plans and the distance from the smaller-scale buildings facing 1st Avenue.
1. Settlement Patterns & Neighborhood Character **c. The Public Realm** The project relates to adjacent streets and engages with sidewalks in a manner that reflects the character of the historic context and the block face. Projects should maintain the depth of yard and height of principal elevation of those existing on the block face in order to support consistency in the definition of public and semi-public spaces.	**The Public Realm - Design Objective** A new multifamily building should respect the characteristic placement, setbacks, massing and landscape character of the public realm in the immediate context and the surrounding district. **12.6** A new building should contribute in a creative and compatible way to the public and the civic realm. **12.7** A building should engage with the street through a sequence of public to semi-private spaces. **12.8** A new multifamily building should be situated and designed to define and frame adjacent streets, and public and common spaces, in ways that are characteristic of the setting. • Reflect and/or strengthen adjacent building quality, setbacks, heights and massing. • Reinforce the historic streetscape patterns of the facing primary and secondary streets and/ or alleys. **12.9** A building on a corner lot should be designed to define, frame and contribute to the historic character of the public realm of both adjacent streets. • The street character will also depend on the adjacent street blocks and frontage. • Building setbacks may be different. • The building scale may also vary between the streets.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** The South Temple streetscape is well-established by the existing buildings. The R-MU zone does not require any front or side yard setbacks. The front face sits on the front (south) property line, similarly engaging the South Temple streetscape as the existing buildings on the streetscape. The scale and height of the building with the additional height proposed is roughly commensurate with the sizes of the adjacent Elks and Brigham Apartment buildings.

1. Settlement Patterns & Neighborhood Character **d. Building Placement** Buildings are placed such that the project maintains and reflects the historic pattern of setbacks and building depth established within the historic context and the block face. Buildings should maintain the setback demonstrated by existing buildings of that type constructed in the district or site's period of significance.	**Building Placement, Orientation & Use - Design Objective** A new multifamily building should reflect the established development patterns, directly address and engage with the street, and include well planned common and private spaces, and access arrangements. **12.10** The established historic patterns of setbacks and building depth should be respected in the siting of a new multifamily building. **12.11** The front and the entrance of the building should orient to and engage with the street. • A new building should be oriented parallel to lot lines, maintaining the traditional, established development pattern of the block. • An exception might be where early settlement has introduced irregular street patterns and building configurations, e.g. parts of Capitol Hill. **12.12** Access arrangements to the site and the building should be an integral part of the planning and design process at the earliest stage. **12.13** The situation, orientation, configuration and design of a new multifamily building should include provision for common exterior open spaces at ground level. Site and design such space/s to address the following: • Reducing the bulk and the scale of the building. • Configuration for residential amenity and casual social interaction. • Shelter from traffic and traffic noise. • Plan for solar access and seasonal shade. • Landscape and light to enhance residential relaxation, enjoyment and neighboring environmental quality. **12.14** Consider additional common open space on higher terrace or roof levels to enhance residential amenity and city views. • Locate and design to preserve neighboring privacy. • Plan and design for landscape amenity and best practices in sustainable design. (PART IV) **12.15** Private open space for each unit, whether ground level, terrace or balcony space, should be designed to create attractive outdoor space, and to help articulate the design of the building to reduce its bulk and scale. • Private space should be contiguous with the unit. • Private space should be clearly distinguished from common open space. **12.16** Common internal and external social space should be planned and designed to take advantage of solar aspect and energy efficient design. • See Guidelines for Sustainable Design (PART IV)	**Staff Analysis – Complies** The South Temple streetscape is well-established by the existing buildings. The building is oriented parallel to the property lines of the lot. The front face sits on the front (south) property line, parallel to South Temple and aligned with the front walls of adjacent buildings. Direct access to the building's parking structure would be off 1st Avenue, with another driveway for visitor parking and drop-offs proposed between the Elks Building and the new structure. This space would also provide a common exterior open space at ground level between the two buildings. Additional common space accessible to residents is proposed for the roof deck atop the parking structure – on the building's fourth floor. The scale and height of the building with the additional height proposed is roughly commensurate with the heights of the adjacent Elks and Brigham Apartment buildings Renderings show a small landscaped front yard along South Temple, though plans show the building face extends to the front property line. The building should be set back enough from the property line to allow planter boxes or a similar landscaping element to coordinate with the existing planter boxes on the Brigham Apartments and maintain a landscaped front as outlined in the design guidelines for South Temple.

1. Settlement Patterns & Neighborhood Character **e. Building Orientation** The building is designed such that principal entrances and pathways are oriented such that they address the street in the pattern established in the historic context and the block face.	**12.10** The established historic patterns of setbacks and building depth should be respected in the siting of a new multifamily building. **12.11** The front and the entrance of the building should orient to and engage with the street. • A new building should be oriented parallel to lot lines, maintaining the traditional, established development pattern of the block. • An exception might be where early settlement has introduced irregular street patterns and building configurations, e.g. parts of Capitol Hill. **12.15** Private open space for each unit, whether ground level, terrace or balcony space, should be designed to create attractive outdoor space, and to help articulate the design of the building to reduce its bulk and scale. • Private space should be contiguous with the unit. • Private space should be clearly distinguished from common open space. **12.16** Common internal and external social space should be planned and designed to take advantage of solar aspect and energy-efficient design. • See Guidelines for Sustainable Design (PART IV)	**Staff Analysis – Complies** The principal entrance to the building is at its west end, oriented toward South Temple, similar to other buildings in the district. Private open space for some units is provided by balconies above the amenity deck and on the South Temple facade. The balconies do not project beyond the South Temple face of the building and are about four feet deep on levels three through six. The HLC has generally required balconies to be at least five feet deep to provide enough space for their use. The terraces proposed for the penthouse level are significantly deeper because the front wall is set back from the front wall on lower levels.

2. Site Access, Parking & Services **a. Site Access** The design of the project allows for site access that is similar, in form and function, with patterns common in the historic context and the block face. **(1) Pedestrian** Safe pedestrian access is provided through architecturally highlighted entrances and walkways, consistent with patterns common in the historic context and the block face. **(2) Vehicular** Vehicular access is located in the least obtrusive manner possible. Where possible, garage doors and parking should be located to the rear or to the side of the building.	**Site Access, Parking & Services - Design Objective** The site planning and situation of a new multifamily building should prioritize access to the site and building for pedestrians and cyclists, motorized vehicular access and parking should be discreetly situated and designed, and building services and utilities should not detract from the character and appearance of the building, the site and the context. **12.12** Access arrangements to the site and the building should be an integral part of the planning and design process at the earliest stage. **12.17** The primary public entrance to the building should be afforded priority and prominence in access from the street, and appropriately scaled in the design of the street façade/s. • Avoid combining with any vehicular access or drive. • Provide direct access to the sidewalk and street. • Landscape design should reinforce the importance of the public entrance. **12.18** Where the secondary street or alley network is available, rear public access should be retained and used. • Residential access options to the site and building should be retained and/or maximized. • Alternative vehicular access from secondary streets and alleys should be retained and reused. **12.19** Bicycle parking should be situated so that it is convenient and readily accessible within or immediately adjacent to the building, including design for secure storage. **12.20** Convenient storage space for each residential unit should be included to obviate the use of personal outdoor balcony space for bicycle and other storage **12.21** A vehicular access and drive should not be combined with a pedestrian access and entrance. • Place vehicle access away from commercial uses such as cafe, restaurant or retail. **12.22** A vehicular access and driveway should be discreetly placed to the side or to the rear of the building. • A vehicular entrance which incorporates a ramp should be screened from street views. • Landscape should be designed to minimize visual impact of the access and driveway. **12.23** A single curb cut or driveway should not exceed the minimum width required. • Avoid curb cuts and driveways close to street corners. **12.24** Driveways serving groups of similar uses should be consolidated to minimize visual intrusion, and to provide less interruption to the sidewalk, pedestrian character and flow. • Curb cuts should be shared between groups of buildings and uses where possible. • Joint driveway access is encouraged.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** The project's design allows for site access similar in form and function, with patterns typical in the historic context and the block face. Primary pedestrian access is along South Temple, directly accessible from the sidewalk. The building's entrance is architecturally highlighted by large arched windows, a canopy, and massing slightly higher than the base defined by a precast cornice element along the face of the building. Vehicular access is provided to the rear of the building from 1st Avenue, locating the vehicular access in the least obtrusive manner possible. However, this configuration is predicated on the demolition of a contributing structure. No surface parking is proposed for this building.

	12.25 Wherever possible, vehicular parking should be situated below the building, or alternatively behind the building in a manner that does not conflict with pedestrian access from the street. • Surface parking areas should be screened from views from the street and adjacent residential properties.	
2. Site Access, Parking & Services **b. Site and Building Services and Utilities.** Utilities and site/building services (such as HVAC systems, venting fans, and dumpsters) are located such that they are to the rear of the building or on the roof and screened from public spaces and public properties.	**Site & Building Services & Utilities - Design Objective** The visual impact of common and individual building services and utilities, as perceived from the public realm and nearby buildings, should be avoided or completely integrated into the design of the building. **12.26** Utility areas and other ground level building services should be situated away from the frontage of the building. • Screen from street views and adjacent buildings. • Integrate these facilities with the architecture of the building through design, color and the choice of materials. **12.27** Rooftop and other higher level mechanical services and utilities should be situated away from, and also screened from, street views. • Locate the utility equipment within an architectural screen or dedicated housing. • Enclose the facility within a roof that is an integral part of the building. • Select and locate the utility equipment so that it is not seen from adjacent primary and secondary streets. • Finish to match the building where visibility might occur. **12.28** Mechanical services should be acoustically screened from nearby residential properties. • Screening should be compatible with and also integrated into the design of the building. **12.29** Small utilities, such as air conditioning units, should be located away from primary and secondary facades of the building, unless integrated and fully concealed as part of the building design. • Avoid placing AC or other equipment in balcony spaces. **12.30** Exhaust and intake vents and pipes on facades and roofscapes should be avoided through early and coordinated planning of facilities for common utility systems. • Coordinate, group and screen from view where any might penetrate the facade. • Finish to match the facade color unless specifically designed as a detailed architectural embellishment. **12.31** Cellular phone and other antennae, and associated equipment, should not be visible from the public way. • Plan for common satellite TV equipment, with positioning to avoid or minimize any visual impact.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** Utilities and site/building services (such as HVAC systems) will be located on the roof, screened by a parapet wall from public spaces and public properties.

3. Landscape and Lighting **a. Grading of Land** The site's landscape, such as grading and retaining walls, addresses the public way in a manner that reflects the character of the historic context and the block face.	**Front Yard Landscape - Design Objective** The design of residential and commercial front yard landscapes should contribute to a coherent and creative public realm. **12.32** The front yard landscaping for a new multifamily building should coordinate with historic and/or established patterns. • Evaluate existing historic patterns and character. • Design a creative complement to the established historic character. **12.33** Landscape walls and fences perpendicular to the street, which could separate front yards, should be minimized or avoided where this separation is not an inherent part of the established topographic or historic character. • Retaining walls provide significant opportunity for creative design and natural materials, when they are a characteristic of the setting. • Where retaining walls are a part of established historic character, avoid excessive retaining wall height by terracing a change in grade. • Design any fencing to be low and transparent in form. **12.34** Where it is a characteristic of the street, a front yard should be designed and graded to reflect this pattern, retaining the relationship and continuity of open space, and the sense of progression from public to private space. • Reflect the historic grading and landscaping of the area between the street pavement and the building. • The building should readily engage with the street and public realm.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** Renderings show a small landscaped front yard along South Temple, though plans show the building face extends to the front property line. The building should be set back enough from the property line to allow planter boxes or a similar landscaping element to coordinate with the existing planter boxes on the Brigham Apartments and maintain a landscaped front as outlined in the design guidelines for South Temple. The site's topography may require some terracing or retaining walls, but they will be hidden from public view.
3. Landscape and Lighting **b. Landscape Structures** Landscape structures, such as arbors, walls, fences, address the public way in a manner that reflects the character of the historic context and the block face.	**Front Yard Landscape - Design Objective** The design of residential and commercial front yard landscapes should contribute to a coherent and creative public realm. **12.35** Where a new multifamily building includes another use/s, such as restaurant or café, seating should be considered as part of the landscape design for front yard area and/or sidewalk. • Design any seating as a creative element of the landscape design. • Low walls in the landscape design can provide the opportunity for integrated informal seating. • Use ergonomic and durable materials in the design and choice of seating, e.g. wood & metal.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** Renderings show a small landscaped front yard along South Temple, though plans show the building face extends to the front property line. The landscape design is most apparent on the third-floor amenity deck. It is not visible from street level and is not a public space.

3. Landscape and Lighting **c. Lighting** Where appropriate Lighting is used to enhance significant elements of the design and reflects the character of the historic context and the block face.	**Lighting - Design Objective** External Lighting of the building and site should be carefully considered for architectural accent, for basic Lighting of access and service areas, and to avoid light trespass. **12.36** Exterior lighting should be discreetly designed to illuminate entrances and exterior spaces such as balconies, terraces or common spaces. • Design to avoid light trespass beyond the area to be lit. • Design for creative and discrete task lighting. **12.37** Where architectural Lighting is appropriate, it should be designed to strengthen the historic context, providing selective visual accent to specific elements of the primary facades, using discreet and creatively designed light fittings. • Avoid general illumination of a façade or undue prominence of an individual building, since this will detract from the nighttime character of the historic setting. • Design building light fixtures for architectural quality and durability. • Shield architectural illumination at higher levels to avoid a view of any exposed light source from the street or adjacent occupied space. **12.38** Building lighting should be discreetly designed to integrate, in design, location and choice of fittings, with the architecture of the building. **12.39** Landscape lighting should be designed discreetly and creatively to enhance pathways and entrances, while accentuating planting design. • Light specific design features. • Avoid light trespass and glare. **12.40** Conduit and electrical supply equipment for both architectural and utility light fittings should be concealed from view from all streets and adjacent properties. • Plan and design supply runs at an early stage to avoid external surface conduit and equipment. • Conceal within, or integrate with, the design of the building. **12.41** Utilitarian building lighting for service areas should be concealed from view from primary and secondary streets, and from adjacent properties. • Use effective 'cut-off' shields to confine light spread. • Position light fittings to reduce public visibility. • Choose fittings and finishes that complement the design of the building.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** All Lighting will need to be designed as appropriate for a residential development of this nature in compliance with this standard and associated design guidelines. Any proposed architectural lighting will be limited to highlight individual features and avoid general illumination of the building. Light trespass to adjacent properties will be avoided to the extent possible. As a condition of approval, the applicants should supply a lighting plan with additional detail that shows the Lighting will meet the intent of this standard and related design guidelines. Compliance may be delegated to Staff.

4. Building Form and Scale **a. Character of the Street Block** The design of the building reflects the historic character of the street facade in terms of scale, composition, and modeling. **(1) Height** The height of the project reflects the character of the historic context and the block face. Projects taller than those existing on the block face step back their upper floors to present a base that is in scale with the historic context and the block face. **(2) Width** The width of the project reflects the character of the historic context and the block face. Projects wider than those existing on the block face modulate the facade to express a series of volumes in scale with the historic context and the block face. **(3) Massing** The shape, form, and proportion of buildings, reflects the character of the historic context and the block face. **(4) Roof Forms** The building incorporates roof shapes that reflect forms found in the historic context and the block face.	**Building Form & Scale - Design Objective** The form, scale and design of a new multifamily building in a historic district should equate with and complement the established patterns of human scale characteristics of the immediate setting and/or broader context. **12.42** A new multifamily building should appear similar in scale to the scale established by the buildings comprising the current street block facade. • Subdivide a larger mass into smaller "modules" which are similar in size to buildings seen traditionally. • The scale of principal elements, such as entrances, porches, balconies and window bays, are critical to creating and maintaining a compatible building scale. **12.43** A new multifamily building should be designed to create and reinforce a sense of human scale. In doing so consider the following: • Design building massing and modulation to reflect traditional forms, e.g. projecting wings and balcony bays. • Design a solid-to-void (wall to window/door ratio that is similar to that seen traditionally. • Design window openings that are similar in scale to those seen traditionally. • Articulate and design balconies that reflect traditional form and scale. • Design an entrance, porch or stoop that reflects the scale characteristic of similar traditional building types. • Use building materials of traditional dimensions, e.g. brick, stone, terracotta. • Choose materials that express a variation in color and/or texture, either individually or communally. **12.44** A new multifamily building should be designed to respect the access to light and the privacy of adjacent buildings. **12.45** The principal elements of the front facade should reflect the scale of the buildings comprising the block face and historic context. • The primary plane/s of the front facade should not appear to be more than a story higher than those of typical historic structures in the block and context. • Where the proposed building would be taller than those in the historic context, the upper floor/s should step back from the plane of the façade below. • A single wall plane or bay of the primary or secondary facades should reflect the typical maximum facade width in the district. **12.46** The secondary elements, patterns and modeling of the facade composition should reinforce the massing and scale established by the primary elements of the facade/s. • Design a fenestration pattern and a window scale that reflect those of the context and historic district. • Arrange and design balconies to articulate the architecture of both the primary and secondary facades. • In a taller structure, design the ground floor/s to differentiate in stature, plane, detailing and/ or materials from the façade above. • Express the 'base' for the front facade/s of the building through primary architectural elements and patterns, e.g. entrance/porch/portico, fenestration. • Reinforce this definition through detailing and materials.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** The proposed building is similar in scale to the scale established by the buildings comprising the current South Temple streetscape. Height The height of the project reflects the character of the historic context and block face. If the HLC approves the proposed additional height as a special exception, it will be roughly commensurate with the adjacent Elks and Brigham buildings. The building's base is three stories and is differentiated from the upper stories on the primary block face by the use of stone and cast stone elements. The top floor is defined through variation height and materials along the front face and a more significant setback of the front wall plane on the top floor. There is a general sense of an architectural hierarchy in the design of the front facade. However, it could be more strongly expressed through additional variations along the front face or a more apparent change in the colors of the materials. The renderings do not show the varied materials proposed by the applicants and create a monolithic appearance. On the sides and rear of the building, the L shaped plan of the building on a three story base respects the smaller scale of the adjacent 1st Avenue buildings. However, a pattern of taller buildings along South Temple creates a common background for buildings along 1st Avenue from State Street to approximately E Street (500 East). Width The width and massing of the building is modulated through variation of the front wall plane and changes to the fenestration pattern along the primary block face, as well as a bilaterally symmetrical design. The width of these variations is greater than many historic

	• Design a distinct 'foundation' course for the primary and secondary facades, employing a combination of wall plane, materials, texture and/or color. • In a taller structure, consider defining a top floor by a distinct variation in design treatment as part of an architectural hierarchy in the design of the facade. **12.47** Respect the role that architectural symmetry can play in the form of the established historic street frontage and wider setting. • This can be effective in composing the modulation of a wider façade, helping to integrate this within a smaller scale setting. • Evaluation of historic apartment façade symmetry, or asymmetry, will provide valuable direction and inspiration. **Height - Design Objective** The maximum height of a new multifamily building should not exceed the general height and scale of its historic context, or be designed to reduce the perceived height where a taller building might be appropriate to the context. **12.48** The building height should be compatible with the historic setting and context. • The immediate and wider historic contexts are both of importance. • The impact upon adjacent historic buildings will be paramount in terms of scale and form. **12.49** Characteristic of traditional buildings types and context, the first two floors should be designed with greater stature. **12.50** Where there is a significant difference in scale with the immediate context, the building height should vary across the primary façade, and/or the maximum height should be limited to part of the plan footprint of the building. • Step back the upper floor/s of a taller building to achieve a height similar to that historically characteristic of the district. • Restrict maximum building height to particular sections of the depth and length of the building. **12.51** The upper floor/s should step back where a taller building will approach established neighborhoods, streets or adjacent buildings of typically lower height. **12.52** The primary and secondary facades should be articulated and modulated to reduce an impression of greater height and scale, and to enhance a sense of human scale. • Design a distinctive and a taller first floor for the primary and secondary facades. • Design a distinct top floor to help terminate the façade, and to complement the architectural hierarchy and visual interest. • Design a hierarchy of window height and/or width, when defining the fenestration pattern. • Consider designing for a distinctive projecting balcony arrangement and hierarchy. • Use materials and color creatively to reduce apparent height and scale, and maximize visual interest.	buildings in the district but is proportionate to the 165-foot wide street face. <u>Roof Forms</u> The flat roof form with parapet is a typical roof form for multifamily buildings in general and South Temple specifically. Other nearby buildings along this block face and adjacent block faces are typically flat or have a false mansard cap. The mansard cap became common for South Temple buildings dating from the more recent past.

	Width - Design Objective The design of a new multifamily building should articulate the patterns established by the buildings in the historic context to reduce the perceived width of a wider building and maintain a sense of human scale. **12.53** A new multifamily building should appear similar to the width established by the combination of single and multifamily historic buildings in the context. • Reflect the modulation width of larger historic apartment buildings. • If a building would be wider overall than structures seen historically, the facade should be subdivided into significantly subordinate planes which are similar in width to the building facades of the context. • Step back sections of the wall plane to create the impression of similar façade widths to those of the historic setting. **Massing** **12.54** The overall massing of a new multifamily building should respect and reflect the established scale, form and footprint of buildings comprising the street block and historic context. • Modulate the building where height and scale are greater than the context. • Arrange the massing to step down adjacent to a smaller scale building. • Respect, and/or equate with the more modest scale of center block buildings and residences where they provide the immediate context. **Roof Forms** **12.55** The proportions and roof forms of a new multifamily building should be designed to respect and reflect the range of building forms and massing which characterize the district. • Focus on maintaining a sense of human scale. • The variety often inherent in the context can provide a range of design options for compatible new roof forms. • Vary the massing across the street façade/s and along the length of the building on the side facades. • Respect adjacent lower buildings by stepping down additional height in the design of a new building.	

5. Building Character **a. Facade Articulation and Proportion** The design of the project reflects patterns of articulation and proportion established in the historic context and the block face. As appropriate, facade articulations reflect those typical of other buildings on the block face. These articulations are of similar dimension to those found elsewhere in the context, but have a depth of not less than 12 inches. **(1) Rhythm of Openings** The facades are designed to reflect the rhythm of openings (doors, windows, recessed balconies, etc.) established in the historic context and the block face. **(2) Proportion and Scale of Openings** The facades are designed using openings (doors, windows, recessed balconies, etc.) of similar proportion and scale to that established in the historic context and the block face. **(3) Ratio of Wall to Openings** Facades are designed to reflect the ratio of wall to openings (doors, windows, recessed balconies, etc.) established in the historic context and the block face. **(4) Balconies, Porches, and External Stairs** The project, as appropriate, incorporates entrances, balconies, porches, stairways, and other projections that reflect patterns established in the historic context and the block face.	**Façade Articulation, Proportion & Visual Emphasis - Design Objective** The design of a new multifamily building should relate sensitively to the established historic context through a thorough evaluation of the scale, modulation and emphasis, and attention to these characteristics in the composition of the facades. **12.56** Roof forms should reflect those seen traditionally in the block and within the historic district. • Flat roof forms, with or without parapet, are an architectural characteristic of particular building types and styles, including many historic apartment buildings. • Gable and hip roofs are characteristic of the roof forms of smaller scale buildings in most residential historic areas, and in specific styles of historic apartment buildings. • Where it is expressed, roof pitch and form should be designed to relate to the context. • In commercial areas, a wider variety of roof forms and building profiles may be evident, providing a more eclectic architectural context, and wider range of potential design solutions. • Consider roof profiles when planning the location and screening of rooftop utilities. **12.57** Overall facade proportions should be designed to reflect those of historic buildings in the context and neighborhood. • The "overall proportion" is the ratio of the width to the height of the building, especially the front facade. • The modulation and articulation of principal elements of a facade, e.g. projecting wings, balcony sequence and porches, can provide an alternative and a balancing visual emphasis. • With townhouse development, the individual houses should be articulated to identify the individual unit sequence and rhythm. • See the discussion of individual historic districts (PART III) and the review of typical historic building styles (PART I) for more information on district character and façade proportions. **12.58** To reduce the perceived width and scale of a larger primary or secondary façade, a vertical proportion and emphasis should be employed. Consider the following: • Vary the planes of the façade for all or part of the height of the building. • Subdivide the primary façade into projecting wings with recessed central entrance section in character with the architectural composition of many early apartment buildings. • Modulate the height down toward the street, and/or the interior of the block, if this is the pattern established by the immediate context and the neighborhood. • Modulate the façade through the articulation of balcony form, pattern and design, either as recessed and/or projecting elements. • Vary the planes of the primary and secondary facades to articulate further modeling of the composition. • Design for a distinctive form and stature of primary entrance. • Compose the fenestration in the form of vertically proportioned windows. • Subdivide horizontally proportioned windows using strong mullion elements to enhance a sense of vertical proportion and emphasis.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** The project's design reflects patterns of articulation and proportion established in the historic context and the buildings composing the overall block face. The overall proposed design is a modern interpretation of traditional multifamily design. The units are articulated with various setbacks and building design features to avoid a monolithic appearance as previously described. The rhythm, proportion, and scale of openings is commensurate with those of the surrounding buildings, and does not read as out of the ordinary for the immediate area or district. The juxtaposition of windows of varying sizes aligned vertically is evocative of the former Bransford/Eagle Gate apartments that stood on the corner of State Street and South Temple until they were demolished in 1984. The 1986 building that now sits on the site incorporates similar design motifs in a limited way. Similar vertically aligned windows topped with an arched window are also part of the front facade of the Elks Building. Balconies and porches are incorporated into the design, though they do not clearly project beyond the front wall plane and are about four feet in depth. The balconies on secondary elevations extend beyond the wall plane and are more pronounced than those on the South Temple facade.

	12.59 A horizontal proportion and emphasis should be designed to reduce the perceived height and scale of a larger primary or secondary façade. Consider the following: • The interplay of horizontal and vertical emphasis can create an effective visual balance, helping to reduce the sense of building scale. • Step back the top or upper floors where a building might be higher than the context along primary and/or secondary facades as appropriate. • Design for a distinctive stature and expression of the first floor of the primary, and if important in public views, the secondary facades. • Design a distinct foundation course. • Employ architectural detailing and/or a change in materials and plane to emphasize individual levels in the composition of the facade. • Design the fenestration to create and/or reflect the hierarchy of the façade composition. • Change the materials and/or color to distinguish the design of specific levels. **Solid to Void Ratio, Window Scale & Proportion - Design Objective** The design of a new multifamily building in a historic context should reflect the scale established by the solid to void ratio traditionally associated with the setting and with a sense of human scale. **12.60** The ratio of solid to void (wall to window) should reflect that found across the established character created by the historic structures in the district. Consider the following: • Achieve a balance, avoiding areas of too much wall or too much window. • Large surfaces of glass can be inappropriate in a context of smaller residential buildings. • Design a larger window area with framing profiles and subdivision which reflect the scale of the windows in the established context. • Window mullions can reduce the apparent scale of a larger window. • Window frame and mullion scale and profiles should be designed to equate with the composition. **12.61** Window scale and proportion should be designed to reflect those characteristic of this traditional building type and setting. **Fenestration - Design Objective** The window pattern, the window proportion and the proportion of the wall spaces between, should be a central consideration in the architectural composition of the facades, to achieve a coherence and an affinity with the established historic context. **12.62** Public and more important interior spaces should be planned and designed to face the street. • Their fenestration pattern consequently becomes a significant design element of the primary facade/s. • Avoid the need to fenestrate small private functional spaces on primary facades, e.g. bathrooms, kitchens, bedrooms.	

	12.63 The fenestration pattern, including the proportions of window and door openings, should reflect the range associated with the buildings creating the established character of the historic context and area. • Design for a similar scale of window and window spacing. • Reflect characteristic window proportions, spacing and patterns. • Design for a hierarchy within the fenestration pattern to relieve the apparent scale of a larger facade, and especially if this is a characteristic of the context. • Arrange and/or group windows to complement the symmetry or proportions of the architectural composition. • Emphasize the fenestration pattern by distinct windows reveals. • Consider providing emphasis through the detailing of window casing, trim, materials, and subdivision, using mullions and transoms, as well as the profiles provided by operable/ opening windows. See also guideline 12.71-74 on window detailing. **Balconies & Entrance - Design Objective** The design of a new multifamily building in a historic context should recognize the importance of balcony and primary entrance features in achieving a compatible scale and character. **12.64** Balconies, encouraged as individual semipublic outdoor spaces, should be designed as an integral part of the architectural composition and language of the building. • Use projecting and/or recessed balcony forms to complement and embellish the design composition of the facades, and to establish visual emphasis and architectural accent. • Use a balcony or a balcony arrangement to echo and accentuate the fenestration pattern of the building. • Design balcony forms to be transparent or semi-transparent, using railings and/or glass to avoid solid balcony enclosures. • Select and design balcony materials and details as a distinct enrichment of the building facade/s. **12.65** An entrance porch, stoop or portico should be designed as a principal design focus of the composition of the facade. • Design for greater stature to enhance visual focus, presence and emphasis. • Design for a distinct identity, using different wall planes, materials, details, texture and color. • Consider designing the name of the apartment building into the facade or the porch/stoop. **12.66** A secondary or escape stairway should be planned and designed as an integral part of the overall architecture of the building, and positioned at or towards the rear of the building.	

6. Building Materials, Elements and Detailing **a. Materials** Building facades, other than windows and doors, incorporate no less than 80% durable material such as, but not limited to, wood, brick, masonry, textured or patterned concrete and/or cut stone. These materials reflect those found elsewhere in the district and/or setting in terms of scale and character. **b. Materials on Street-facing Facades** The following materials are not considered to be appropriate and are prohibited for use on facades which face a public street: vinyl siding and aluminum siding.	**Materials - Design Objective** The design of a new multifamily building should recognize and reflect the palette of building materials which characterize the historic district, and should help to enrich the visual character of the setting, in creating a sense of human scale and historical sequence. **12.67** Building materials that contribute to the traditional sense of human scale and the visual interest of the historic setting and neighborhood should be used. • This helps to complement and reinforce the palette of materials of the neighborhood and the sense of visual continuity in the district. • The choice of materials, their texture and color, their pattern or bond, joint profile and color, will be important characteristics of the design. • Creative design, based on analysis of the context, will be invaluable in these respects. **12.68** Building materials that will help to reinforce the sense of visual affinity and continuity between old and new in the historic setting should be used. • Use external materials of the quality, durability and character found within the historic district. **12.69** Design with materials which provide a solid masonry character for lower floors and for the most public facades of the building. Consider the following: • Use brick and/or natural stone, in preference to less proven alternatives for these areas. • Limit panel materials to upper levels and less public facades. • Where panel materials are considered, use high quality architectural paneling with a proven record of durability in the regional climate. • Synthetic materials, including synthetic stucco, should be avoided on grounds of limited durability and longevity, and weathering characteristics. **12.70** Materials should have a proven durability for the regional climate, as well as the situation and aspect of the building. • Avoid materials which merely create the superficial appearance of authentic, durable materials. • The weathering characteristics of materials become important as the building ages, in that they should compliment rather than detract from the building and historic setting as they weather and mature. • New materials, which have a proven track record of durability in the regional climatic conditions, may be considered.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** Building materials include precast concrete wall materials and details, cement stucco, aluminum-clad wood windows in several different configurations with a factory applied black finish, metal storefront entrance doors, black clad wood/glass balcony doors, a black metal canopy over the building's main entrance and black metal railings on upper story balconies. Building facades incorporate no less than 80% durable material. Historic buildings on the block face show more variation in materials, both in composition, finish, and color, though the proposed materials don't vary drastically in terms of scale and character. No vinyl or aluminum siding is proposed.

6. Building Materials, Elements and Detailing **c. Windows** Windows and other openings are incorporated in a manner that reflects patterns, materials, and detailing established in the district and/or setting.	**Windows - Design Objective** The design of a new multifamily building should include window design subdivision, profiles, materials, finishes and details which ensure that the windows play their characteristic positive role in defining the proportion and character of the building and its contribution to the historic context. **12.71** Windows should be designed to be in scale with those characteristic of the building and the historic setting. • Excessive window scale in a new building, whether vertical or horizontal, will adversely affect the sense of human scale and affinity with buildings in the district. • Subdivide a larger window area to form a group or pattern of windows creating more appropriate proportions, dimensions and scale. **12.72** Windows with vertical proportion and emphasis are encouraged. • A vertical proportion is likely to have greater design affinity with the historic context. • It helps to create a stronger vertical emphasis which can be valuable integrating the design of a larger scale building within its context. • See also the discussion of the character of the relevant historic district and architectural styles. (PART I) **12.73** Window reveals should be a characteristic of masonry and most public facades. • These help to express the character of the facade modeling and materials. • Window reveals will enhance the degree to which the building integrates with its historic setting. • A reveal should be recessed into the primary plane of the wall, and not achieved by applying window trim to the façade. • This helps to avoid the impression of superficiality which can be inherent in some more recent construction, e.g. with applied details like window trim and surrounds. • A hierarchy of window reveals can effectively complement the composition of the fenestration and facades. **12.74** Windows and doors should be framed in materials that appear similar in scale, proportion and character to those used traditionally in the neighborhood. • Frame profiles should project from the plane of the glass creating a distinct hierarchy of secondary modeling and detail for the window opening and the composition of the facade. • Durable frame construction and materials should be used. • Frame finish should be of durable architectural quality, chosen to compliment the building design. • Vinyl should be avoided as a non-durable material in the regional climate. • Dark or reflective glass should be avoided. • See also the rehabilitation section on windows (PART II, Ch.3) as well as the discussions of specific historic districts (PART III) and relevant architectural styles (PART I).	**Staff Analysis – Complies** The proposed windows are a combination of single-hung, casement, and fixed sash types. The material used will be eitheraluminum-cladd wood. The rhythm, proportion, and scale of openings is commensurate with those of the surrounding buildings, and does not read as out of the ordinary for the immediate area or district. The windows will be set back from the exterior wall plane approximately six inches; providing reveals characteristic of masonry and

6. Building Materials, Elements and Detailing **d. Architectural Elements and Details** The design of the building features architectural elements and details that reflect those characteristic of the district and/or setting.	**Details - Design Objective** The design of a new multifamily building should reflect the rich architectural character and visual qualities of buildings of this type within the district. **12.75** Building elements and details should reflect the scale, size, depth and profiles of those found historically within the district. • These include windows, doors, porches, balconies, eaves, and their associated decorative composition, supports and/or details. **12.76** Where used, ornamental elements, ranging from brackets to porches, should be in scale with similar historic features. • The scale, proportion and profiles of elements, such as brackets or window trim, should be functional as well as decorative. **12.77** Creative interpretations of traditional details are encouraged. • New designs for window moldings and door surrounds, for example, can create visual interest and affinity with the context, while conveying the relative age of the building. • The traditional and characteristic use of awnings and canopies should be considered as an opportunity for creative design which can reinforce the fenestration pattern and architectural detail, while being a sustainable shading asset in reducing energy consumption. See also PART IV on Sustainable Design.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** As previously discussed, proposed building features are characteristic of the district and are compatible with the immediate setting. In addition, this project reflects a modern interpretation of traditional building style and details and is therefore appropriate from an historical perspective.

7. Signage Location Locations for signage are provided such that they are an integral part of the site and architectural design and are complimentary to the principal structure.	**Signs - Design Objective** Signs for a new multifamily building, and for any non-residential use associated with it, should complement the building and setting in a subtle and creative way, as a further architectural detail. **12.78** Signs should be placed on the building or the site where they are traditionally located in the historic context. **12.79** Identify a non-residential use with a sign location, placement, form and design, which relates directly to the 'storefront' and window design. • See also the Design Guidelines for Signs in Historic Districts in Salt Lake City. • See the Design Guidelines for Historic Commercial Buildings and Districts in Salt Lake City. **12.80** Signs and lettering should be creatively designed to respect traditional sign scales and forms. **12.81** Signs for the primary and any secondary use should be designed as an integral part of the architecture of the façade. • Lettering or graphic motif dimensions should be limited to the maximum required to identify the building and any other use/s. • Creativity and subtlety are objectives of the design of any sign for a new multifamily building in a historic setting. **12.82** Signs should take the form of individual lettering or graphic motif with no, or minimal, illumination. **12.83** Any form of illumination should relate discretely to the sign lettering, and avoid any over-stated visual impact upon any residential use or historic setting. • The light source should not be visible. • Internally illuminated lettering and sign boxes should be avoided. • Internally illuminated lettering using a transparent of translucent letter face or returns should be avoided. • Where illumination might be appropriate, it should be external and concealed, or in 'halo' form. • Banner or canopy signs are not characteristic and will not be appropriate. **12.84** Sign materials should be durable and of architectural quality to integrate with the building design. **12.85** Power supply services and associated fittings should be concealed and not be readily visible on the exterior of the building. **12.86** Refer to the City's Design Guidelines for Signs in Historic Districts for more detailed and extensive advice.	**Staff Analysis – Complies** No signage is proposed as part of this application.