

## **ATTACHMENT E: HLC WORK SESSION MINUTES**

---

March 4, 2021

April 1, 2021

**SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING**  
**This meeting was held electronically pursuant to the**  
**Salt Lake City Emergency Proclamation**  
**Thursday, March 4, 2021**

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at approximately 5:30 pm. Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time. These minutes are a summary of the meeting. For complete commentary and presentation of the meeting, please visit <https://www.youtube.com/c/SLCLiveMeetings>.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson, Robert Hyde; Vice Chairperson, Michael Vela; Commissioners Babs De Lay, John Ewanowski, Aiden Lillie, Jessica Maw, Kenton Peters, Victoria Petro-Eschler, and David Richardson.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director; Nick Norris, Planning Director; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Nelson Knight, Senior Planner; and Sara Javoronok, Senior Planner.

Chairperson Hyde read the emergency proclamation.

**APPROVAL OF THE FEBRUARY 4, 2021, MEETING MINUTES.**

**MOTION**

**Commissioner Vela moved to approve the February 4, 2021 meeting minutes. Commissioner De Lay seconded the motion. Commissioners Lillie, De Lay, Richardson, Maw, Ewanowski, Peters and Vela voted “Aye”.**

**REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR**

Chairperson Hyde stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Vela stated he had nothing to report.

**REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR**

Nick Norris, Planning Director, informed the commission that there will be a requirement of 4 hours of training.

**GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS**

Cindy Cromer – Provided comments regarding the RMF-30 zone proposed modifications and how they potentially affect property owners.

**PUBLIC HEARING**

**New Construction & Special Exception at approximately 738 S. Green St.** - Matt Hintze, of Matthew Hintze Architecture, on behalf of the property owner, Matt Fletcher, is requesting approval from the City to construct a single-family residence and accessory dwelling unit at 738 S. Green Street. The property is currently vacant and is within the Central City Historic District and is zoned RMF-30 (Low Density Residential Multi-Family Zoning District). This proposal requires Historic New Construction and Special Exception review.

- a. **New Construction:** This project request requires approval for new construction in an

1. Allow the applicant to modify special exception #1 for the front yard setback to allow the applicant; not only this modification but to move the front façade of the house so that it aligns with the house to the South;
2. To increase the height of the ADU from 24 feet to 25 feet 2 inches
3. To reduce side yard setback of the ADU from 10 feet to 9 feet

Commissioner Lillie requested a friendly amendment to add: To add the condition listed in the staff report.

Commissioner Richardson accepted the amendments. He also added to address fenestration to appear a little more historic.

Commissioner Peters seconded the motion. Commissioners Lillie, De Lay, Richardson, Maw, Ewanowski, Peters, and Petro-Eschler voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairperson Hyde and Vice Chairperson Vela recused themselves due to possible conflict of interest. Chairperson Hyde requested commissioner Peters to run the work session for Elks Block Redevelopment.

## **WORK SESSIONS**

**Elks Block Redevelopment** – The Historic Landmark Commission will hold a work session to provide a preliminary review of a proposal and application by David Davis, of Dale Gardon Design, representing Property Reserve, Inc, for a project centered around the former Elks Club Building located at approximately 139 E South Temple. The project is proposed to include:

- Rehabilitation of the Elks Building and connected parking garage on 1st Avenue;
- New construction of a residential building on the parking lot at approximately 151 E South Temple;
- Rehabilitation of six existing contributing buildings between 124 and 136 E 1st Avenue and;
- Demolition of the contributing building at 120 E 1st Avenue.

This will be a work session review; no formal public hearing will be held, and a decision will not be made at this meeting. The subject properties are within the SLC Avenues Historic District (H Historic Preservation Overlay). The properties along South Temple are zoned R-MU (Residential Mixed Use) and the homes on 1st Avenue are zoned RMF-75 (High-Density Multifamily Residential District). All are within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Nelson Knight at (385) 226- 4493 or nelson.knight@slcgov.com) **Case numbers PLNHLC2020-00816, PLNHLC2020-00915 & PLNHLC2020-00916**

Nelson Knight, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file).

The Commission and staff discussed the following:

- Clarification on whether there would be demolition
- Clarification on whether the Elks building is currently occupied and what the percentage is

Matt Baldwin and David Davis, applicant representatives, provided a presentation with further details.

The Commission, applicant and staff discussed the following:

- Whether the building will have to undergo similar process that the Temple is currently undergoing
- Clarification on exception for height
- Clarification on where the Elk will be placed
- Whether there was a previous use for the roof
- Clarification on what is the reference to diversity being used as a term

The Commission made the following comments and discussion:

- I think the presentation was very thorough
- What I see here looks good
- I love the roof top
- I am a preservationist, I lived within 2 block for 30 years, active member of the Alta Club, preservation Utah, this board, and many organizations; I'm grateful that we have a developer that is sensitive to this area.
- Ground floor space use
- Foot traffic expected
- Request to keep some of the design of the façade
- Regarding 120 E 1<sup>st</sup> avenue I think a structure of that does need to be saved
- Clarification on access on South Temple

**Planning and Zoning training:** Planning staff will provide a planning and zoning training to the Commission. Topics will include the role of community plans, an overview of the zoning code and map, a review of the approval processes in the zoning code and how they relate to the Historic Landmark Commission.

Nick Norris, Planning Director, provided the commission with training on Planning and Zoning.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification on baseline regulations on esthetics of a building and whether it will be removed
- Clarification on who is leading the bill
- Clarification on movement through the legislature that restricts appointed citizen boards
- Commissioner asked to receive some guidelines to purviews
- Clarification on why staff hasn't standardized roof heights from a zoning perspective

**The meeting adjourned.**

**SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING**  
**This meeting was held electronically pursuant to the**  
**Salt Lake City Emergency Proclamation**  
**Thursday, April 1, 2021**

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at 5:30 pm. Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time. These minutes are a summary of the meeting. For complete commentary and presentation of the meeting, please visit <https://www.youtube.com/c/SLCLiveMeetings>.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Vice Chairperson, Michael Vela; Commissioners Babs De Lay, John Ewanowski, Aiden Lillie, Jessica Maw, and David Richardson.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director; Molly Robinson, Planning Manager; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner; Nelson Knight, Senior Planner; Nancy Monteith, Aubrey Clark, Administrative Secretary.

**APPROVAL OF THE March 4, 2021, MEETING MINUTES.**  
**MOTION**

**Commissioner De Lay moved to approve the March 4, 2021 meeting minutes. Commissioner Ewanowski seconded the motion. Commissioners De Lay, Ewanowski, Lillie, Maw and Richardson voted “Aye”. The motion passed.**

**REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR**

Chairperson was not present.

Vice Chairperson stated he had nothing to report.

**REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR**

Michaela Oktay Deputy Director reported there will be a campaign starting next month to elect new commission members. She stated that there will be a review of rules and procedures in the coming commission meetings.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

Cindy Cromer – regarding the Cultural Landscape Report Work Session – “I’m sort of taking a privilege here, but I am concerned that this proposal has not gone to the public where there might be input. And I am concerned by the time it comes back to you again it will be very far down the road. So this is the third city staff person and Nancy is highly qualified to be doing this work, but this is the third city staff person to tackle this project. I’ve been on it as a volunteer for almost 25 years. Um and it is incredibly important to identify the historic features in publicly owned open space. Obviously so they can be protected. And number two, and this is one that I am probably best qualified to address since Rick Graham is no longer employed by the city, is the cost to the city um heading down the wrong path? And that usually occurs when public utilities or parks wants to do a project in publicly owned space. And the cost the costs have been staggering. And we really need to address these guidelines so that we are not wasting public funds. Um it is of concern to me that Gilgal in particular is not on the list, that the 60’s mini park behind the Utah retirement system building is on the list. And I recall that was on the site of a three-story historic walk up and I don’t know why that’s down there as historic open space. The Geo-antiquity on the Bonneville bench which is the basis for natural open space is not on the list. And the effort that I’ve worked on most recently for two solid years, the city creek islands at 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue is not include in the Memory Grove

## MOTION

Commissioner Babs De Lay stated, Based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petitions PLNHLC2020-00964 and PLNHLC2021-00010 a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the minor alteration and the associated special exception for 68 B Street with the following condition:

1. The custom metal covering system be installed with as little impact to the masonry, as possible.

Commissioner Jessica Maw seconded the motion. Commissioners De Ley, Maw, Ewanowski, Lillie, Richardson voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

Vise Chairperson Vela recused himself due to a possible conflict of interest on the Elks Block Redevelopment. Commissioner Jessica Maw took over as stand in Chairperson for the Work Sessions.

## WORKS SESSION (NOT A PUBLIC HEARING)

**Elks Block Redevelopment** – David Davis, of Dale Gardon Design, representing Property Reserve, Inc, is proposing a Major Alteration to the former Elks Club Building located at approximately 139 E South Temple. The project includes:

- Rehabilitation of the Elks Building and connected parking garage on 1st Avenue
- New construction of a residential building on the parking lot at approximately 151 E South Temple
- Rehabilitation of six existing contributing buildings between 124 and 136 E 1st Avenue and
- Demolition of the contributing building at 120 E 1st Avenue.

This will be a work session review; no formal public hearing will be held, and a decision will not be made at this meeting. The subject properties are within the SLC Avenues Historic District (H Historic Preservation Overlay). The properties along South Temple are zoned R-MU (Residential Mixed Use) and the homes on 1st Avenue are zoned RMF-75 (High-Density Multifamily Residential District). All are within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Nelson Knight at (385) 226- 4493 or [nelson.knight@slcgov.com](mailto:nelson.knight@slcgov.com)) **Case numbers PLNHLC2020-00816, PLNHLC2020-00915 & PLNHLC2020-00916**

Senior Planner Nelson Knight reviewed the project proposal as outlined in the memorandum and he outlined the next steps for the proposal.

David Davis, applicant representative, discussed:

- Site issues including grade, circulation, and age
- Items they felt received favorable response from the Commission in the last work session
- Removal of 2-story addition at 134 E 1<sup>st</sup> Ave
- List of items to be reviewed in this HLC meeting

- South Temple residential request for new construction – reviewing overall exterior design
- Historic homes request for minor alterations – strategy for exterior rehabilitation of 6 homes
- Elks building request for major alteration – main entry and arrival along South Temple

Aiden Lillie asked the commission for clarification on whether the 2-story addition had been previously discussed.

Davis Davis and the Commission discussed:

- The proposed design elements for the South Temple Residential building
- The proposed historic homes rehabilitation:
  - repairs
  - refacing
  - seismic upgrades
  - landscaping
  - possible demolition of the addition on 134 E 1<sup>st</sup> Ave.
- Painting historic brick or stone buildings
- The proposed Elks Building upgrade:
  - The tunnel entry and the berm
  - The original use for the Elks Building
  - Current conditions
  - Reasons for requesting the change to the front entry
  - The proposed usage for the building
  - Accessibility and functionality of the tunnel
  - The proposed plaza and incorporating an arch feature to mimic the current design
  - Keeping the arch and getting rid of the tunnel
- The complexity of the project
- The commissioners didn't feel like they had seen enough regarding the tunnel and the Elks Building
- How to proceed with this and future work sessions pertaining to this item, wanting each section addressed as its own item rather than lumping them together
  - The commission wants to see other ideas for the tunnel and Elks building
  - The demolition of the contributing structure to make room for the parking garage
  - The rehabilitation of the historic homes on 1<sup>st</sup> Ave agreeing that rehabilitation would be approved at a staff level, not including the demolition of the addition on 134 E 1<sup>st</sup> Ave
  - South Temple Residential Building
- Whether there should be additional work sessions or moved to Public Hearing