

1126 E Thistle Avenue Motion Sheet:

PLNHLC2021-00081:

COA for New Construction of a three-story triplex at 1126 E Thistle Avenue

PLNHLC2021-00534:

Requests for two special exceptions:

- **A reduction in the required east side yard setback from ten feet (10') to five feet (5').**
- **Allow the encroachment of two balconies approximately three feet (3') into the same setback.**

Motion to Approve as Proposed:

(Consistent with Staff Recommendation)

Based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2021-00081, which is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the New Construction of a three story triplex, and petition PLNHLC2021-00534, which is a request for two special exceptions associated with the proposed new building. These include:

- A reduction in the required east side yard setback from ten feet (10') to five feet (5'); and
- An exception to allow the encroachment of two balconies approximately three feet (3') into the same setback.

with the following conditions:

1. The landscaping plan shall be revised to create a distinct pedestrian entry from Thistle Avenue separate from the proposed driveway, and to break up the visual and physical impact of the concrete driveway with more landscaping, permeable pavers, or something similar.
2. Windows on the front facade and those visible from the street shall be recessed into their openings to create depth and to avoid creation of "flat plane surfaces" which are inappropriate from a historic perspective.
3. Synthetic stucco or stucco panels shall not be utilized as an exterior building material. Real cement stucco shall be used in those areas where synthetic stucco is proposed.
4. Fiber cement siding shall be a smooth finish as opposed to a simulated wood grain finish.
5. An entry feature such as an awning shall be added to the north doorway to create a more prominent entrance.
6. Approval of all final design details, including specific direction expressed by the Commission, shall be delegated to Planning Staff.

Motion to approve with conditions modified by the Historic Landmark Commission:

Based on the information in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2021-00081, which is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the New Construction of a three story triplex, and petition PLNHLC2021-00534, which is a request for two special exceptions associated with the proposed new building. These include:

- A reduction in the required east side yard setback from ten feet (10') to five feet (5'); and
- An exception to allow the encroachment of two balconies approximately three feet (3') into the same setback.

With the following conditions:

1. *(List the conditions that are to be modified, added, or removed.)*

Motion to Deny:

(Not Consistent with Staff Recommendation)

Based on the information listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission deny petition PLNHLC2021-00081, which is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the New Construction of a three story triplex, and petition PLNHLC2021-00534, which is a request for two special exceptions associated with the proposed new building. These include:

- A reduction in the required east side yard setback from ten feet (10') to five feet (5'); and
- An exception to allow the encroachment of two balconies approximately three feet (3') into the same setback.

because evidence has not been presented that demonstrates that the proposal complies with the following standard(s):

Specifically, the Commission should make findings related to which standard or standards the proposal does not comply with:

1. *List ALL findings wherein the proposal does not meet the standards of approval.*

Ordinance Standards for New Construction and Special Exceptions:

New Construction:

1. Settlement Patterns And Neighborhood Character:

a. Block And Street Patterns: The design of the project preserves and reflects the historic block, street, and alley patterns that give the district its unique character. Changes to the block and street pattern may be considered when advocated by an adopted City plan.

b. Lot And Site Patterns: The design of the project preserves the pattern of lot and building site sizes that create the urban character of the historic context and the block face. Changes to the lot and site pattern may be considered when advocated by an adopted City plan.

c. The Public Realm: The project relates to adjacent streets and engages with sidewalks in a manner that reflects the character of the historic context and the block face. Projects should maintain the depth of yard and height of principal elevation of those existing on the block face in order to support consistency in the definition of public and semi-public spaces.

d. Building Placement: Buildings are placed such that the project maintains and reflects the historic pattern of setbacks and building depth established within the historic context and the block face. Buildings should maintain the setback demonstrated by existing buildings of that type constructed in the district or site's period of significance.

e. Building Orientation: The building is designed such that principal entrances and pathways are oriented such that they address the street in the pattern established in the historic context and the block face.

2. Site Access, Parking, And Services:

a. Site Access: The design of the project allows for site access that is similar, in form and function, with patterns common in the historic context and the block face.

(1) Pedestrian: Safe pedestrian access is provided through architecturally highlighted entrances and walkways, consistent with patterns common in the historic context and the block face.

(2) Vehicular: Vehicular access is located in the least obtrusive manner possible. Where possible, garage doors and parking should be located to the rear or to the side of the building.

b. Site And Building Services And Utilities: Utilities and site/building services (such as HVAC systems, venting fans, and dumpsters) are located such that they are to the rear of the building or on the roof and screened from public spaces and public properties.

3. Landscape And Lighting:

a. Grading Of Land: The site's landscape, such as grading and retaining walls, addresses the public way in a manner that reflects the character of the historic context and the block face.

b. Landscape Structures: Landscape structures, such as arbors, walls, fences, address the public way in a manner that reflects the character of the historic context and the block face.

c. Lighting: Where appropriate lighting is used to enhance significant elements of the design and reflects the character of the historic context and the block face.

4. Building Form And Scale:

a. Character Of The Street Block: The design of the building reflects the historic character of the street facade in terms of scale, composition, and modeling.

(1) Height: The height of the project reflects the character of the historic context and the block face. Projects taller than those existing on the block face step back their upper floors to present a base that is in scale with the historic context and the block face.

(2) Width: The width of the project reflects the character of the historic context and the block face. Projects wider than those existing on the block face modulate the facade to express a series of volumes in scale with the historic context and the block face.

(3) Massing: The shape, form, and proportion of buildings, reflects the character of the historic context and the block face.

(4) Roof Forms: The building incorporates roof shapes that reflect forms found in the historic context and the block face.

5. Building Character:

a. Facade Articulation And Proportion: The design of the project reflects patterns of articulation and proportion established in the historic context and the block face. As appropriate, facade articulations reflect those typical of other buildings on the block face. These articulations are of similar dimension to those found elsewhere in the context, but have a depth of not less than twelve inches (12").

(1) Rhythm Of Openings: The facades are designed to reflect the rhythm of openings (doors, windows, recessed balconies, etc.) established in the historic context and the block face.

(2) Proportion And Scale Of Openings: The facades are designed using openings (doors, windows, recessed balconies, etc.) of similar proportion and scale to that established in the historic context and the block face.

(3) Ratio Of Wall To Openings: Facades are designed to reflect the ratio of wall to openings (doors, windows, recessed balconies, etc.) established in the historic context and the block face.

(4) Balconies, Porches, And External Stairs: The project, as appropriate, incorporates entrances, balconies, porches, stairways, and other projections that reflect patterns established in the historic context and the block face.

6. Building Materials, Elements And Detailing:

a. Materials: Building facades, other than windows and doors, incorporate no less than eighty percent (80%) durable material such as, but not limited to, wood, brick, masonry, textured or patterned concrete and/or cut stone. These materials reflect those found elsewhere in the district and/or setting in terms of scale and character.

b. Materials On Street-Facing Facades: The following materials are not considered to be appropriate and are prohibited for use on facades which face a public street: vinyl siding and aluminum siding.

c. Windows: Windows and other openings are incorporated in a manner that reflects patterns, materials, and detailing established in the district and/or setting.

d. Architectural Elements And Details: The design of the building features architectural elements and details that reflect those characteristic of the district and/or setting.

7. Signage Location: Locations for signage are provided such that they are an integral part of the site and architectural design and are complementary to the principal structure.

Special Exceptions:

Specifically, the commission should make findings related to which standard or standards the proposal does not comply with:

A. Compliance With Zoning Ordinance And District Purposes:

The proposed use and development will be in harmony with the general and specific purposes for which this title was enacted and for which the regulations of the district were established.

B. No Substantial Impairment Of Property Value:

The proposed use and development will not substantially diminish or impair the value of the property within the neighborhood in which it is located.

C. No Undue Adverse Impact:

The proposed use and development will not have a material adverse effect upon the character of the area or the public health, safety and general welfare.

D. Compatible With Surrounding Development:

The proposed special exception will be constructed, arranged and operated so as to be compatible with the use and development of neighboring property in accordance with the applicable district regulations.

E. No Destruction Of Significant Features:

The proposed use and development will not result in the destruction, loss or damage of natural, scenic or historic features of significant importance.

F. No Material Pollution Of Environment:

The proposed use and development will not cause material air, water, soil or noise pollution or other types of pollution.

G. Compliance With Standards:

The proposed use and development complies with all additional standards imposed on it pursuant to this chapter.