

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING

This meeting was held electronically pursuant to the

Salt Lake City Emergency Proclamation

Thursday, April 1, 2021

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at 5:30 pm. Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time. These minutes are a summary of the meeting. For complete commentary and presentation of the meeting, please visit <https://www.youtube.com/c/SLCLiveMeetings>.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Vice Chairperson, Michael Vela; Commissioners Babs De Lay, John Ewanowski, Aiden Lillie, Jessica Maw, and David Richardson.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director; Molly Robinson, Planning Manager; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner; Nelson Knight, Senior Planner; Nancy Monteith, Aubrey Clark, Administrative Secretary.

APPROVAL OF THE March 4, 2021, MEETING MINUTES.

MOTION

Commissioner De Lay moved to approve the March 4, 2021 meeting minutes. Commissioner Ewanowski seconded the motion. Commissioners De Lay, Ewanowski, Lillie, Maw and Richardson voted “Aye”. The motion passed.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR

Chairperson was not present.

Vice Chairperson stated he had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

Michaela Oktay Deputy Director reported there will be a campaign starting next month to elect new commission members. She stated that there will be a review of rules and procedures in the coming commission meetings.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

Cindy Cromer – regarding the Cultural Landscape Report Work Session – “I’m sort of taking a privilege here, but I am concerned that this proposal has not gone to the public where there might be input. And I am concerned by the time it comes back to you again it will be very far down the road. So this is the third city staff person and Nancy is highly qualified to be doing this work, but this is the third city staff person to tackle this project. I’ve been on it as a volunteer for almost 25 years. Um and it is incredibly important to identify the historic features in publicly owned open space. Obviously so they can be protected. And number two, and this is one that I am probably best qualified to address since Rick Graham is no longer employed by the city, is the cost to the city um heading down the wrong path? And that usually occurs when public utilities or parks wants to do a project in publicly owned space. And the cost the costs have been staggering. And we really need to address these guidelines so that we are not wasting public funds. Um it is of concern to me that Gilgal in particular is not on the list, that the 60’s mini park behind the Utah retirement system building is on the list. And I recall that was on the site of a three-story historic walk up and I don’t know why that’s down there as historic open space. The Geo-antiquity on the Bonneville bench which is the basis for natural open space is not on the list. And the effort that I’ve worked on most recently for two solid years, the city creek islands at 4th Avenue is not include in the Memory Grove

Freedom Trail Analysis. And finally, the Second South medians are not in the Central Cities District. They are in the Bryant Extension um of the east side district. They're in the national registry district. So I have concerns that the public process um, particularly with the pandemic underway, has just not been robust here. This is the first I've seen and it's a work session where the public can't comment. Um it's critical to address the sites that have previously been a source of contention. And I would that the number one one is Liberty park. And then also ones which the staff report outlines which are likely to experience pressure um from development. Thank you very much."

Seeing that no one else wished to speak, Commissioner Vela closed the public comments portion of the meeting.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

68 B Street Minor Alteration and Special Exception - Kate Little, property owner, is requesting approval of a special exception and a certificate of appropriateness for the installation of three HVAC units and the associated conduit lines along the southern elevation of the subject property. The property is currently under enforcement, as all of the requested items have already been installed. The property is located at 68 B Street and is a contributing structure within the Avenues Local Historic District. The property is located within the RMF-35 zoning district and within council district 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Kelsey Lindquist at (385) 226-7227 or kelsey.lindquist@slcgov.com) **Case numbers: PLNHLC2020-00964 and PLNHLC2021-00010**

Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner, reviewed the information in the staff report (located in the case file). She identified key issues and discussed the applicants desire to address the issues. She stated that Staff recommends the Historic Landmark Commission to approve the requested minor alteration and special exception as stated with the condition as stated in the in the staff report and motion sheet.

Staff and Commissioners discussed:

- Whether the building permit previously issued was an oversight by Building Services
- Whether rules regarding modern mechanics are dated
- Whether the building was contributing or non-contributing

Kate Little, applicant, gave background on the project. She reviewed the reasons for discontinuing the use of the boiler and possible replacements. She stated that they went with the installed system because it provided both heat and air conditioning controlled by the occupant. She outlined the issues of placement of the units. She described the possible soffit that would cover the conduit. She agreed with the staffs recommendations.

Commissioners, Staff and the Applicant discuss:

- Communication with the neighbors
- The purpose of the proposed covering
- The placement of the HVAC units

PUBLIC HEARING

Commissioner Mike Vela opened the Public Hearing portion of the meeting.

Seeing that no one wished to speak, Commissioner Mike Vela, closed the public hearing.

The commission discussed whether there was another option of placement for the HVAC units.

MOTION

Commissioner Babs De Lay stated, Based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petitions PLNHLC2020-00964 and PLNHLC2021-00010 a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the minor alteration and the associated special exception for 68 B Street with the following condition:

1. The custom metal covering system be installed with as little impact to the masonry, as possible.

Commissioner Jessica Maw seconded the motion. Commissioners De Ley, Maw, Ewanowski, Lillie, Richardson voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

Vise Chairperson Vela recused himself due to a possible conflict of interest on the Elks Block Redevelopment. Commissioner Jessica Maw took over as stand in Chairperson for the Work Sessions.

WORKS SESSION (NOT A PUBLIC HEARING)

Elks Block Redevelopment – David Davis, of Dale Gardon Design, representing Property Reserve, Inc, is proposing a Major Alteration to the former Elks Club Building located at approximately 139 E South Temple. The project includes:

- Rehabilitation of the Elks Building and connected parking garage on 1st Avenue
- New construction of a residential building on the parking lot at approximately 151 E South Temple
- Rehabilitation of six existing contributing buildings between 124 and 136 E 1st Avenue and
- Demolition of the contributing building at 120 E 1st Avenue.

This will be a work session review; no formal public hearing will be held, and a decision will not be made at this meeting. The subject properties are within the SLC Avenues Historic District (H Historic Preservation Overlay). The properties along South Temple are zoned R-MU (Residential Mixed Use) and the homes on 1st Avenue are zoned RMF-75 (High-Density Multifamily Residential District). All are within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Nelson Knight at (385) 226- 4493 or nelson.knight@slcgov.com) **Case numbers PLNHLC2020-00816, PLNHLC2020-00915 & PLNHLC2020-00916**

Senior Planner Nelson Knight reviewed the project proposal as outlined in the memorandum and he outlined the next steps for the proposal.

David Davis, applicant representative, discussed:

- Site issues including grade, circulation, and age
- Items they felt received favorable response from the Commission in the last work session
- Removal of 2-story addition at 134 E 1st Ave
- List of items to be reviewed in this HLC meeting

- South Temple residential request for new construction – reviewing overall exterior design
- Historic homes request for minor alterations – strategy for exterior rehabilitation of 6 homes
- Elks building request for major alteration – main entry and arrival along South Temple

Aiden Lillie asked the commission for clarification on whether the 2-story addition had been previously discussed.

Davis Davis and the Commission discussed:

- The proposed design elements for the South Temple Residential building
- The proposed historic homes rehabilitation:
 - repairs
 - refacing
 - seismic upgrades
 - landscaping
 - possible demolition of the addition on 134 E 1st Ave.
- Painting historic brick or stone buildings
- The proposed Elks Building upgrade:
 - The tunnel entry and the berm
 - The original use for the Elks Building
 - Current conditions
 - Reasons for requesting the change to the front entry
 - The proposed usage for the building
 - Accessibility and functionality of the tunnel
 - The proposed plaza and incorporating an arch feature to mimic the current design
 - Keeping the arch and getting rid of the tunnel
- The complexity of the project
- The commissioners didn't feel like they had seen enough regarding the tunnel and the Elks Building
- How to proceed with this and future work sessions pertaining to this item, wanting each section addressed as its own item rather than lumping them together
 - The commission wants to see other ideas for the tunnel and Elks building
 - The demolition of the contributing structure to make room for the parking garage
 - The rehabilitation of the historic homes on 1st Ave agreeing that rehabilitation would be approved at a staff level, not including the demolition of the addition on 134 E 1st Ave
 - South Temple Residential Building
- Whether there should be additional work sessions or moved to Public Hearing

Cultural Landscape Report (CLRs): – The Historic Landmark Commission will receive a briefing on Cultural Landscape Reports and ongoing efforts that have resulted from a 2019 Legislative Intent by City Council to get CLRs for Historic Parks within the City. The briefing will provide a broad overview of Public Land’s collaboration with Planning and Engineering Divisions to improve upon historic documentation of city owned landscapes to guide subsequent stewardship and maintenance of these valued community assets. (Staff contact: Nancy Monteith at (801) 535-6157 or nancy.monteith@slcgov.com)

Nancy Monteith presented that landscapes need a site-specific approach rather than an all grasping rule. She addressed the trees at Liberty Park and that they are getting older and dying. She outlined the Cultural Landscape Report has two parts: 1) site history and evaluation (cataloging) and 2) treatment (design guidelines). She outlined landscape characteristics.

Commissioner De Lay and Nancy Monteith discussed:

- The archeological sites in the city

Public Lands Division role: responsible for ongoing maintenance, stewardship, initiating funding requests, collaborating with Planning, and sharing information with the public.

Planning Division role: Collaborate on review and development of CLR and providing that information to the public, incorporating documents online for historic preservation, facilitate review of proposed changes, share information with the public.

Engineering Division role: Collaborate on review and development of Cultural Landscape Reports, incorporating CLR Treatment recommendations in capital improvements.

Works in progress: Pioneer Park, Liberty Park

Other important sites: Allen Park, Historic Nature Park, Jordan Park, Riverside Park.

Historic Districts: Addresses streetscapes and greenspaces that are integral to a historic district.

Commissioner Babs De Lay asked about Allen park funding.

David Richardson asked about hiring a preservationist for public lands.

The meeting adjourned.