

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING
This meeting was held electronically pursuant to the
Salt Lake City Emergency Proclamation
October 1, 2020

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:30:10 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson, Kenton Peters; Vice Chairperson, Robert Hyde; Commissioners, Jessica Maw, Rocio De Maria Torres Mora, Victoria Petro-Eschler, David Richardson, Paul Svendsen, and Michael Vela.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Nick Norris, Planning Director; John Anderson, Planning Manager; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Aaron Barlow, Principal Planner; Mayara Lima, Principal Planner; Lex Traugher, Senior Planner, and Nelson Knight, Senior Planner.

APPROVAL OF THE SEPTEMBER 3, 2020, MEETING MINUTES. [5:33:39 PM](#)

MOTION [5:33:52 PM](#)

Commissioner Vela moved to approve the September 3, 2020 meeting minutes. Commissioner Richardson seconded the motion. Commissioners Petro-Eschler, Torres Mora, Hyde, and Svendsen voted “Aye”. Not all commissioners were called on to vote. The motion passed unanimously.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR [5:34:46 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters stated he had opportunity to visit the multi-family apartment building project that the Commission approved on 500 South and thinks the process worked out well.

Vice Chairperson Hyde stated he supports Chairpersons comment, he went by the project himself and thought it looked nice.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR [5:35:54 PM](#)

Nick Norris, Planning Director, stated he had nothing to report.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS [5:37:37 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the general public comments,

Cindy Cromer – Stated she would like to speak about the proposed modifications to the RMF-30 zone. She mentioned it is on the City Council’s agenda for October 6, 2020. She stated her concern with displacement of existing residence from older, less expensive housing and about the demolition of that older housing for market rate and luxury units.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Peters closed the general public comment.

Wayne Mills, Planning Manager, provided the public with information on how to participate for the public hearing.

[5:42:26 PM](#)

National Register Nomination for Harlan & Marie Nelson House at approximately 2785 Lancaster Drive - The State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) has received a request to add the Harlan & Marie Nelson House, located at 2785 Lancaster Drive, to the National Register of Historic Places. SHPO will consider this nomination at their Board meeting on October 29, 2020 and is requesting review and input from Salt Lake City as the Certified Local Government in this matter. The property is not located within a Local Historic District or listed as a Local Landmark Site and would not be subject to any local preservation standards found in the H Historic Preservation Overlay zoning district. The property is located within council District 6 represented by Dan Dugan (Staff contact: Aaron Barlow at (385) 386-2764 or aaron.barlow@slcgov.com)

Aaron Barlow, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission forward a positive recommendation.

Kirk, applicant, was available for questions from the commission.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on whether the City can do anything about the street damage

PUBLIC HEARING [5:47:53 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing; seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [5:48:30 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson stated, based on the information in the memorandum provided by staff and the attached National Register of Historic Places Registration Form, I find that the Harlan and Marie Nelson House, located at 2785 East Lancaster Drive, appears to meet the National Register criteria and I move that the Historic Landmark Commission forward a positive recommendation to the SHPO that the Harlan and Marie Nelson House should be listed on the National Register of Historic places.

Commissioner Torres-Mora seconded the motion. Commissioners Vela, Maw, Svendsen, Torres-Mora, and Hyde voted "Aye". Not all commissioners were called on to vote. The motion passed unanimously.

[5:50:20 PM](#)

New Construction & Special Exception at approximately 1117 E South Temple - Michelle MacDonnell, architect representing the property owner, is requesting approval to build a new multifamily structure at the above-listed address, which is within the South Temple Local Historic District. The proposed building will have 4 residential units and will match the front yard setback of the apartment building to the west as required by a development agreement signed with the city. The applicant is also requesting special exception approval to allow additional height up to 40 feet 6 inches to accommodate a roof deck. The maximum building height allowed in the zoning district is 35 feet. The property is zoned R-MU-35 and is located within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Mayara Lima at (801) 535-7118 or mayara.lima@slcgov.com) **Case numbers PLNHLC2020-00388 & PLNHLC2020-00506**

Mayara Lima, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request with the conditions listed in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification on revision to special exceptions

Michelle MacDonnell, applicant, provided further detailed information.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on site plan

PUBLIC HEARING [6:01:09 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Chairperson Peters read the email public comments provided to the Commission in dropbox from the following;

Scott Anderson – Email comment stated opposition of the request.

Bill Peterson – Email comment raised concern with parking, neighborhood character, and zoning.

Tariq Mughal, Property Homeowner – Provided further details for the request.

Cindy Cromer – Stated it's illogical to prohibit the purpose statement of a zone in rezoning a property. She also stated the ordinance needs to be fixed and that the reduction number of units is appropriate.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission made the following comments:

- Less density is a good alternative
- It feels like a more responsible use of the space
- The applicant did a good job adapting their initial proposal
- I'm happy to see something like this going in, I really like this proposal
- I think the current proposal is more appropriate in terms of density than the previous proposal
- I think this is appropriate use of the vacant land that's there

MOTION [6:21:52 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson stated, based on the information listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new construction of the multi-family building and special exception for additional building height at 1117 E South Temple, as presented in PLNHLC2020-00388 & PLNHLC2020-00506, with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Commissioner Vela seconded the motion. Commissioners Svendsen, Hyde, Torres-Mora, Petro-Eschler, and Maw voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

[6:23:23 PM](#)

Bishop Place (Formerly The Quince) New Construction & Special Exceptions at approximately 432 North 300 West - Garbett Homes, has submitted applications for new construction in an historic district for a single-family attached residential development of twenty-four (24) dwelling units and three (3) associated special exception requests located at approximately 432 N. 300 West (Bishop Place – a private street). Currently, the properties associated with the proposed development are occupied by abandoned structures that have been approved for demolition.

- a. **New Construction** - This project request requires approval for new construction in an historic district. **Case number PLNHLC2019-01157**
- b. **Three Special Exceptions:**
 - i. The applicant requests a modification to the minimum lot width requirement. The applicant is requesting a minimum lot width of nineteen feet (19'). The minimum lot width in the SR-3 Zone for single-family attached dwellings is twenty-two feet (22').
 - ii. The applicant requests a modification of the rear yard setback. The applicant is requesting a ten foot (10') rear yard setback. The rear yard setback in the SR-3 Zone is 20% of the lot depth but not less than fifteen feet (15') and not to exceed thirty feet (30').
 - iii. The applicant is requesting modification to maximum building/wall height for certain units located on the interior of the development. The maximum building height in the SR-3 zone is twenty-eight feet (28') and wall height is twenty feet (20'). The applicant is requesting a building height of thirty-six feet (36') and a maximum wall height of twenty-eight feet (28') for eight (8) of the units. **Case number PLNHLC2019-01158**

The subject property is zoned SR-3 (Special Development Pattern Residential District) and is located within Council District 3 represented by Chris Wharton (Staff contact: Lex Traughber at (801) 535-6184 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com)

Lex Traughber, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the requests with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Paul Garbett, applicant, provided a presentation with further design details.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on use for community garden

PUBLIC HEARING [6:45:35 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Cindy Cromer – Stated she thinks the diversity, materials, and colors will help with wayfinding as people look for their friends units. The diversity she sees in this historic district is amongst the residence and the type of architecture and she doesn't see this level of diversity in materials and colors, especially in multiple unit buildings. She would dial back 1 material per unit and 1 color change per unit.

Ashley Patterson – Provided an email comment stating her support of the request.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

The applicant addressed the public comments.

The Commission made the following comments:

- I'm surprised to see black roofs in this time of climate change and global warming
- I like the modifications to the entry way of the building
- I agree with the use of the materials
- The applicant is only proposing to exceed the height limit of 25% or 8 of 24 buildings, and the way they're scattered throughout the development, reads nicely
- I really like what they've done

MOTION [7:00:35 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson stated, based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for a Certificate of Appropriateness involving new construction in a local historic district have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Commission approve the request for new construction located at approximately 432 N 300 West (Bishop Place), subject to the following condition:

- 1. Vinyl windows shall be avoided as they are not a durable material and therefore inappropriate for new construction in the City's local historic districts. The applicant will work with Planning Staff to identify a type of window that meets New Construction Standard 21.34.020(H)(6)(c) - Windows and the associated design guidelines highlighted in this staff report prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.**

Motion to approve the Special Exceptions:

Based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for Special Exceptions have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Commission approve the request for the three (3) Special Exceptions located at approximately 432 N 300 West (Bishop Place).

SUBSTITUE MOTION [7:02:54 PM](#)

Commissioner Svendsen stated, the substitute motion is Commissioner Richardson's motion verbatim except with a revision that the Commission specify that the windows need to be wood or wood clad.

Commissioner Richardson accepts the substitute motion.

Commissioner Vela seconded the motion with amendment. Commissioners Maw, Petro-Eschler, Hyde, and Vela voted "Aye". Commissioner Torres-Mora abstained from voting. Commissioner Svendsen voted "Nay". The motion passed 5-1.

[7:06:57 PM](#)

Addition, New Garage & Associated Special Exceptions at approximately 1218 3rd Avenue - Jeff Schindewolf, Architect, on behalf of the property owners, Scott and Jen Provost, is requesting approval from the City to construct an addition to the rear of the existing single-family residence, demolition of the existing garage, and construction of a new garage in a new configuration in the same location. The house is a contributing building within the Avenues Historic District and is zoned SR-1A (Special Development Pattern Residential District). This proposal requires review and approval of the following petitions:

- a. Certificate of Appropriateness for Minor Alterations to a contributing structure, and**

construction of a new accessory structure (garage) Case number **PLNHLC2020-00714**

- b. Special Exceptions:** The applicant is requesting two special exceptions for this project:
- iv. The applicant requests an exception to the maximum width of a dormer wall from ten feet (10') to fifteen feet (15').
 - v. The applicant requests an exception to the maximum detached garage height to allow for a gable roof **Case number PLNHLC2020-00590**

The subject property is within Council District #3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Nelson Knight (801) 535-7758 or nelson.knight@slcgov.com)

Nelson Knight, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the requests with the conditions listed in the staff report.

Jennifer Dailey, applicant, provided further information.

PUBLIC HEARING [7:27:54 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing; seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

Jeff Schindewolf, Architect – Provided detailed information regarding the project and was available for questions.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Design idea for 15-foot dormer

The Commission made the following comments:

- The project feels intuitive and wise use of resources
- I support it
- Great house, great upgrade, looking forward to seeing it get done
- I think there's so many good things going on that they deserve the special exception
- Well done

MOTION [7:37:02 PM](#)

Commissioner Vela stated, based on the information in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Historic Landmark Commission approve petition PLNHLC2020-00714 in addition included would be the Special Exceptions, case number PLNHLC2018-00590.

Commissioner Svendsen seconded the motion. Commissioners Maw, Petro-Eschler, Torres-Mora, Hyde, Svendsen, Richardson and Vela voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at [7:39:39 PM](#)