SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING This meeting was held electronically pursuant to Salt Lake City Emergency Proclamation No. 2 of 2020 (2)(b) Thursday, September 3, 2020

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at <u>5:30:18 PM</u>. Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson, Kenton Peters; Commissioners; Jessica Maw, Rocio de Maria Torres Mora, Victoria Petro-Eschler, David Richardson, Paul Svendsen, and Michael Vela.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director; Molly Robinson, Planning Manager; Paul Nielson, Attorney; and Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner.

<u>5:30:46 PM</u> Chairperson, Kenton Peters, read the emergency proclamation.

APPROVAL OF THE AUGUST 6, 2020, MEETING MINUTES. 5:34:44 PM MOTION 5:35:02 PM

Commissioner Vela moved to approve the August 6, 2020 meeting minutes. Commissioner Maw seconded the motion. Commissioners Torres Mora, Petro-Eschler, Maw, Vela, Richardson, and Svendsen voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR 5:36:09 PM

Chairperson Peters stated that the time for voting for a new Chair is approaching. He asked the commission to start considering who they would like to be the next Chairperson.

Vice Chairperson Hyde was not present.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR 5:37:01 PM

Molly Robinson, Planning Manager, stated she had nothing to report.

5:37:43 PM

Major Alteration located at approximately 529 South Temple - The property owner representative, Ralph Nagasawa, is requesting approval for a Major Alteration to the Salt Lake City Landmark Site located at 529 E. South Temple. The applicant is proposing to construct an elevator addition oriented to the north of the existing principal structure. The addition is under 90 square feet in size and approximately 41'6" in height. The subject property is located in the RO (Residential Office) Zoning District and the South Temple Historic District. The subject property is located within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Kelsey Lindquist at (801) 535-7930 or Kelsey.Lindquist@slcgov.com) Case number PLNHLC2020-00468.

Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request for a major alteration with the condition listed in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

Clarification on whether all interior locations options have been explored

- Proposed material to be used
- South facade material variations

Ralph Nagasawa, applicant, provided further detailed information.

PUBLIC HEARING 5:52:59 PM

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Patrick – Stated his support of the request.

Ken Wheadon – Provided an email comment requesting the materials differ from the original materials.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission made the following comments:

- I'm not too concerned about the color not being exactly the same
- I'm always in favor of modifications that increase accessibility, particularly historical structures.
- I think they have carefully designed the elevator and I'm also all for accessibility.
- I think it's a worthwhile improvement.
- I do feel that it should stand out a little more.
- I think this is a classic solution to an addition to a historic building.

MOTION 6:04:16 PM

Commissioner Vela stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2020-00468.

Commissioner Maw seconded the motion. Commissioners Richardson, Maw, Svendsen, Torres- Mora, Petro-Eschler, and Vela voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

6:05:35 PM

Fisher Mansion Carriage House Adaptive Reuse located at approximately 1206 W. 200 S -CRSA, on behalf of Salt Lake City Parks and Public Lands, are requesting a Major Alteration to the Fisher Mansion Carriage House located at 1206 W. 200 S. This property is listed as a Salt Lake City Landmark Site. The requested major alteration is to accommodate an adaptive reuse of the carriage house into a River Recreation and Community Engagement Hub. The property is located in the I (Institutional) zoning district and located within Council District 2, represented by Andrew Johnston. (Staff contact Kelsey Lindquist at (801)535-7930 or Kelsey.lindguist@slcgov.com) Case number PLNHLC2020-00509

Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request of major alteration with the condition listed in the motion sheet.

Lewis Kogan, Salt Lake City Parks and Public Lands, and John Ewanoski, provided a presentation with further details.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on whether the applicant is still considering anti-graffiti coating
- Clarification on the reason for wanting to utilize the coating
- Whether there would be an upgrade to the masonry

PUBLIC HEARING 6:34:10 PM

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Cindy Cromer – Provided history on the property.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission made the following comments:

- I think this kind of work is a clear example of an adaptive reuse
- I'm excited for this project
- I'm in love with this project
- I think this is a lovely project

MOTION <u>6:41:45 PM</u>

Commissioner Richardson stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2020-00509, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Major Alteration of a contributing structure at 1206 W 200 S with the following condition:

1. Approval of all final design details, including specific direction expressed by the Commission, shall be delegated to Planning Staff.

Commissioner Vela seconded the motion. Commissioners Maw, Petero-Eschler, Torres-Mora, Svendsen, Vela, and Richardson voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

6:43:44 PM

<u>Liberty Square Apartments Material Alteration located at approximately 461 S 600 E</u> - Chris Zarek, a representative for the property owner, is requesting approval of a material change on Building 1 of the Liberty Square Apartments. The Historic Landmark Commission approved the new construction of Liberty Square on May 3, 2018. A new approval is required due to material changes from the approved design. The site is zoned TSA-UN-C (Transit Station Area-Urban Neighborhood Core) and is located within the Central City Local Historic District. The subject property is located within Council District 4, represented by Ana Valdemoros. (Staff contact is Kelsey Lindquist at (801) 535-7930 or at Kelsey.Lindquist@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNHLC2017-00266**

Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request of material change.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

Clarification on materials

Chris Zarek, applicant, provided further detailed information.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on whether the applicant is proposing to take a material that's already installed, remove it and replace it with another material
- · Color of the material
- What type of corner can be achieved with the proposed material
- Clarification on what other types of materials were explored

PUBLIC HEARING 7:10:08 PM

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing; seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION 7:11:18 PM

Commissioner Richardson stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2017-00266, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a modification to the approved Liberty Square New Construction at 639 E. 500 S. Also, to add to delegate to staff some of the minor issues of color sheen and corner details.

Commissioner Torres-Mora seconded the motion. Commissioners Svendsen, Vela, Petro-Eschler, Richardson, and Maw voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

7:13:35 PM

<u>Window Replacement located at approximately 88 North R Street</u> - Byron Cannon, property owner, is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of eight windows on the property located at 88 N. R Street. The subject property is currently under enforcement, as the windows have already been installed. The property is a contributing structure within the Avenues Local Historic District and is located within the SR-1A (Special Development Pattern Residential Pattern) zoning district. The property is located within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact Kelsey Lindquist at 801-535-7930 or Kelsey.lindquist@slcgov.com). **Case number PLNHLC2020-00016**

Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission deny the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

• Whether there has been a discussion to change the design guidelines

Byron Cannon, applicant, provided further information.

PUBLIC HEARING 7:31:36 PM

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Cindy Cromer – Stated she knows the property owner because they are neighbors. The comment she would like to make is that she doesn't see how the owner of an income producing property can acquire the building permit. Permits require a license to pull permits associated with income producing properties. The window contractor should be held responsible. If a window is replaced, a building permit is required. The property owner wouldn't have been able to pull a permit.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission made the following comments:

- This is not the first time where we had a homeowner caught between the actions of a contractor
- Clarification on at what point are contractors held responsible
- I think there needs to be something on all closing documents when you're buying a historical district that says "I understand I'm buying something in the historical district, and I will be responsible for the contributing structure"
- I believe if a company has a professional license there ought to be penalties for doing something that they either know or don't know that's inappropriate in a particular location

MOTION 7:53:51 PM

Commissioner Svendsen stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission deny petition PLNHLC2020-00016, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of 8 original windows on the subject property located at 88 R Street.

Commissioner Richardson seconded the motion. Commissioners Maw, Petro-Eschler, Vela, Torres-Mora, Svendsen, and Richardson voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 8:02:24 PM