

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING

**This meeting was held electronically pursuant to Salt Lake City Emergency Proclamation
No. 2 of 2020 (2)(b)
Thursday, May 7, 2020**

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:34:43 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Kenton Peters, Vice Chairperson Robert Hyde; Commissioners Rocio Torres Mora, Victoria Petro- Eschler, Michael Vela, Jessica Maw, Esther Stowell, David Richardson, and Paul Svendsen. Commissioner Stanley Adams was excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Nick Norris, Planning Division Director; Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director; John Anderson, Planning Manager; Wayne Mills, Planning Manager, Paul Nielson, Attorney; Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner; Lex Traughber; Amy Thompson, Senior Planner; Mayara Lima, Principal Planner; and Rosie Jimenez, Administrative Secretary.

Chairperson Peters provided participation options and instructions to the public.

APPROVAL OF THE MARCH 5, 2020, MEETING MINUTES. [5:38:09 PM](#)

MOTION [5:38:22 PM](#)

Commissioner Stowell moved to approve the March 5, 2020, meeting minutes.

Commissioner Eschler-Petro seconded the motion. Commissioners Stowell, Eschler-Petro, Hyde, Maw, Richardson, Svendsen, Torres Mora. "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR [5:39:31 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Hyde stated he had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR [5:39:44 PM](#)

Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director, reported on April 30, 2020 there was an appeal heard before the Hearing Officer, the appeal was of the Historic Landmark Commission decision to approve the Masonic Temple Apartments at about 33 South 600 East. The property was rezoned from institutional to RO Residential Office on Sept 30, 2019. The Historic Landmark Commission Approved new construction for 125-unit multi-family residential development. Phillip McCarthy represented by Gary Sackett appealed that decision. The basis of the appellant was The Historic Landmark Commission, failed to consider several design objectives. The matter is under advisement. When we do have a decision from the Hearing officer, we will send the decision to The Landmark Commission. Another item to address is the Salt Lake Regional Hospital signs. Several signs in Building Services, last year were approved and were issued erroneously without The Historic Landmark Commissions sign off and review. Signs are in installed and in operation. The City has been investigating and will be taking enforcement action on those signs. We will keep the Historic Landmark Commission updated. Salt Lake City is currently discussing with Verizon where they can relocate a small cell antenna. Salt Lake City has discussed 600 East medians. Salt Lake City is working on updating fact sheets and working with Verizon on updating them of our Historic areas.

[5:46:25 PM](#)

4th Avenue Pump House at approximately 300 North Canyon Road - Salt Lake City Department of Public Utilities is proposing the new construction of a pump house located at 300 N. Canyon Road (South West Corner of Canyon Road and 4th Avenue). The pump house is proposed in order to continue to provide drinking water to the community and to ensure the well, located on the site, is safe and secure. The pump house will contain equipment to operate the well, and to disinfect the water. The petitions associated with the proposal:

- a. **New construction** of a pump house located at 300 N. Canyon Road, petition number: **PLNHLC2018-00557**
- b. **Associated special exception** for the proposed new construction in the Open Space Zoning District, Petition number: **PLNHLC2018-00558**
 - i. Building setbacks: A reduction of approximately 4'7" - 7'9" for the southern front yard setback.
 - ii. Landscaped yards: A reduction of approximately 4'7" – 7'9" for the southern landscaped yard.

The subject property is located within the OS (Open Space) zoning district and Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff Contact: Kelsey Lindquist at (801)535-7930 or kelsey.lindquist@slcgov.com). **Case number PLNHLC2018-00557 & PLNHLC2018-00558**

Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the Proposal with the conditions listed in the Staff Report and the Motion Sheet.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Special Exceptions Staff has decided there is a front and corner side yard but no rear yard

Laura Briefer, Director Salt Lake City Public Utilities, John Ewanowski, CRSA Architect were available for questions.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Architectural components and iteration Presentation
- Concerned about the separate slab under the equipment is it going to be isolated with an acoustic barrier. Is there something that is going to help with the vibration
- In other installations is there ever cause a lot of vibration and cause a lot of noise
- What is the proximity to the building and the set back
- Is the design due to public outreach sessions that was the push in your direction
- What are other color options

PUBLIC HEARING [6:23:11 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Mercedes Smith - Due to Covid 19 and budget constrictions the city will be facing what assurances can you give property owners who might be concerned about possible changes or compromises that might have to be made to the aesthetics of the property plan due to budget constraints?

Shane Franz – Concerned about the acoustic design and what is to be considered noise pollution. Feels this is going to ruin the atmosphere in the park.

Cindy Cromer – Sent written comments about historic stucco or concrete, worried about what information was not shared in the process.

Linya Noyes – Has been appreciative of the collaborative process with Public Utilities. However, after the process of the design phase there was only one color of brick and no other consideration of other possible design material. She is onboard with Cindy Cromer on the idea that materials should be similar as the ones used in the park. There should be more consideration to the color of the brick and colors chosen. Very disappointed in the choices made.

Evan Smith - Provided an email comment stating his opposition of the request

Craig Ogan - Provided an email comment stating his opposition of the request

Jordan Umberg - Provided an email comment stating his support of the request

Dave Johnson - Provided an email comment stating his opposition of the request

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission and Staff further discussed the following:

- Budget of the well
- Disruption of the site and process for Public Utilities
- Landscaping of the site
- Clarification of Special Exceptions
- Roles of being bias
- Building Permit Reviews
- Pump Location

MOTION [7:23:28 PM](#)

Commissioner Vela stated, I want to have a motion to approve with the conditions listed in the staff report in other words be consistent with the staff recommendations. And based on the information in the staff report and information presented, and the information received in the public hearing. I move the commission approve PLNHLC2018-00557 4th Avenue Pump House at approximately 300 North Canyon Road.

Commissioner Richardson seconded the motion Chairperson Peters went down the list of commissioner names to respond yes or no. Commissioners Richardson, Stowell, Maw, Vela, Svendsen, Torres-Mora, and Petro- Eschler voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

MOTION [7:25:42 PM](#)

Commissioner Vela stated, motion to approve with the conditions listed in the staff report and based on the information in the staff report and the information presented and the input received during the public hearing, I move to have the commission approve PLNHLC2018-00558 4th Avenue Pump House at approximately 300 North Canyon Road.

Commissioner Torres-Mora seconded the motion. Commissioners Petro-Eschler, Torres-Mora, Hyde, voted “Aye”. Svendsen voted “No”, Vela, Maw, Richardson voted “Aye”. The motion passes 7 to 1

[7:28:19 PM](#) The commission took a small break.

[7:31:15 PM](#)

33rd Ward Minor Alterations at approximately 453 South 1100 East - Brad Gygi, Bradley Gygi Architect & Associates, PLLC, representing the property owner, the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter Day Saints, is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for various site improvements including an expansion of parking on site, an outdoor pavilion, a new ADA access, and a new dumpster enclosure on the property located at 453 S. 1100 East in the University Historic District. All proposed site improvement are located at the rear of the property and are not readily visible from the street. The subject property is zoned I - Institutional and is located in Council District 4 represented by Ana Valdemoros. (Staff Contact: Lex Traughber at (801)535-6184 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com). **Case number PLNHLC2020-00103**

Lex Traughber, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the Proposal with the conditions listed in the Staff Report and the Motion Sheet.

Brad Gygi, from Bradley Gygi Architect & Associates, PLLC and Jason K. Killian, from the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints were available for questions.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Architectural components Presentation

PUBLIC HEARING [7:52:50 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Christy P – Stated her concern of the loss of green space.

Esther Hunter - Chair of the East Central Community Council – Concerned about the loss and history of the garden. Is grateful for the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints for listening and working on keeping a large portion of the garden preserved.

Kristen Park - Provided an email comment stating her opposition

Jerry Faust - Provided an email comment stating his opposition

Tina Jensen Augustine - Provided an email comment stating her opposition

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission and Staff further discussed the following:

- What are the guidelines that address open area or is it just building related in the HLC mandate?
- What does the space represent in the historical area?
- Property rights and Ordinance
- Historic versus non-historic
- Elevator shaft through the existing rooftop

MOTION [8:30:21 PM](#)

Commissioner Stowell stated, based on the analysis and findings in the staff report, that the standards for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness have been substantially met to include the elevator shaft and fence around the garden area. In the proposal presented I move the commission approve the minor alterations at approximately 453 South 1100 East

Commissioner Torres-Mora seconded the motion. Commissioners Hyde requeued himself, Vela voted "Yes", Svendsen "Yes", Torres-Mora "Yes", Richardson "Abstain", Stowell "Yes", Maw "No", Petro-Eschler "Yes". Commissioner Peters reported we Five "Yes", one "No" and two "abstentions". We have a quorum motion passes. The application is approved.

[8:33:01 PM](#)

Demolition of a Contributing Building at approximately 58 E Hillside Avenue - Jeff Garbett, the owner of the property, is proposing to demolish a residential structure on the subject lot that is identified as a contributing building to the Capitol Hill local historic district and subject to the standards of the H Historic Preservation Overlay. The applicant has indicated the purpose of the request is so a new single-family house could be constructed on the property. No specific development plan has been submitted in conjunction with this demolition request. The subject parcel is zoned RMF-35 (Moderate Density Multi-Family Residential). A request for demolition of a contributing structure in a local historic district must be reviewed by the Historic Landmark Commission. The subject property is within Council District #3 represented by Chris Wharton (Staff Contact: Amy Thompson at (801)535-7281 or amy.thompson@slcgov.com). **Case number PLNHLC2020-00068**

[8:33:11 PM](#) The commission took a small break.

Amy Thompson, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission deny the Proposal.

Jeff Garbett was available for questions and provided a presentation.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Went over the standards for a demolition
- Familiar with Historical District when buying the home
- Historical integrity
- Looked into zoning that might help with preserving the structure
- Budgeting aspect to other resolutions instead of the demolition
- Offered other designs to the structure to comply with Historic District
- Economic Hardship Process

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on physical integrity versus the condition of the building

PUBLIC HEARING [9:10:56 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Cindy Cromer – Stated her opposition of the request and sent in emails to staff about her opposition and provided history of the structure and community.

Jan Garbett- Stated her history and work within the Historic Landmark District, she provided her support on the demolition.

Allyssa Barns - Provided an email comment stating her support of the request.

Elizabeth and Duran Lucas - Provided an email comment stating their support of the request.

Wanda Pillow - Provided an email comment stating her opposition of the request.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [9:34:22 PM](#)

Commissioner Maw Commissioner stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report and the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Historic Landmark Commission deny the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition for a contributing principle building in a Historic Preservation District. The demolition substantially fails to comply with the standards of approval in 21(a).34.02O.K.1 as only one standard for demolition has been met.

Commissioner Petro-Eschler seconded the motion. Commissioners Richardson, Stowell, Maw, Svendsen voted “Aye” Hyde “No”, Torres-Mora and Petro-Eschler, Peters voted “Aye”. The motion passed 7 to 1. The application is denied.

[9:36:16 PM](#) The commission took a small break.

[9:37:49 PM](#)

Wasatch Community Gardens at approximately 625, 629 and 633 E 800 S - Ashley Patterson, representing Wasatch Community Gardens, the property owner, is requesting design approval to construct a new multi-family dwelling, install a wood deck and replace two front doors at the above listed properties. The properties are located in the Central City Local Historic District and are zoned RMF-30 Low Density Multi-Family Residential District, with two of the properties pending a zone change to R-MU-35 Residential/Mixed Use District. The applicant is requesting the following approvals:

- a. New Construction – Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to construct an 8-unit apartment building and associated parking lot to the rear of the properties located at approximately 629 E 633 E 800 S. Case number PLNHLC2020-00111.
- b. Major Alteration – Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to install a wood deck between the existing buildings on the properties and to replace the original front doors of the existing buildings on 625 and 629 E 800 S. Case number PLNHLC2020-00062.
- c. Special Exceptions – Request to reduce the rear setback of the existing building at 629 E 800 S and allow a deck over 2 feet in height to encroach in the required yard setbacks. Case number PLNHLC2020-00105.

The subject properties are within Council District 4, represented by Ana Valdemoros. (Staff contact: Mayara Lima at (801)535-7118 or mayara.lima@slcgov.com).

Mayara Lima, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request with the conditions listed in the staff report and the new deck in the Special Exception. Staff also recommends the HLC deny the Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the front doors.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification on building design

Ashley Patterson, Jesse Allen and Kirk Huffaker from Wasatch Community Gardens and Kristen Clifford, Planning Consultant provided a presentation with further detailed information.

The Commission, Applicant and Staff discussed the following:

- If doors are replaced what is the design
- Clarification of the doors being ADA

PUBLIC HEARING [10:05:14 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Cindy Cromer – Stated her support of the request.

Bart Urlichec – Stated his support of the request.

Ryan Barber – Stated he is concerned about the parking on Green St

Maren Robins – Provided an email of her opposition due to the parking

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [10:27:41 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson stated his motion to approve, based on the information listed in the staff report, and information presented, and the input received during public hearing, I move that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction for the Multi-Family Building located at 629 E 633 E 800 S and Special Exceptions at 629 E 800 S and present PLNHLC2020-00111 and PLNHLC2020-00105 with conditions listed in the Staff Report. Additionally, I move that the commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness of the new deck at 625, 629, and 633 East 800 South and Special Exception that allow the deck encroachment at 625, 629 E 800 S PLNHLC2020-00062 and PLNHLC2020-00105 also with conditions listed in the Staff Report.

Commissioner Vela seconded the motion. Commissioners Petro-Eschler, Torres-Mora, Hyde, Svendsen, Vela, Maw, Stowell, Peters Voted “In Favor” Richardson voted “Aye” Motion passes Unanimously.

Q&A Session for Historic Landmark Commission Meeting 5/7

Session number: 969552761

Date: Thursday, May 7, 2020

Starting time: 5:10 PM

-Jeffrey Garbett (jeff@garbetthomes.com) - 5:20 PM

Q: How do I show my powerpoint during my presentation-Jeff. Thanks

Priority: N/A-

-John Anderson - 5:29 PM

A: Jeff, when your item is being discussed, you will be able to share your screen. You can click on Share in the top of the screen and then click on Share Screen.-

-Jesse Stewart (jesse.stewart@slcgov.com) - 5:27 PM

Q: I have called in

Priority: N/A-

-Jeffrey Garbett (jeff@garbetthomes.com) - 5:31 PM

Q: Does the "Share" only show when it is my turn? Currently I don't see the option.

Priority: N/A-

-Jeffrey Garbett (jeff@garbetthomes.com) - 5:33 PM

Q: I think I found the Share, it currently has the option to share greyed out. I'm assuming that will be the option when it is my turn.

Priority: N/A-

-John Anderson - 5:35 PM

A: That is correct. -

-Esther Hunter (eastcentralcommunity@gmail.com) - 5:46 PM

Q: Hi. How do I let you know that I would like to make a comment. I can't see a place to raise my hand. Thanks. e

Priority: N/A-

-Michaela Oktay - 5:49 PM

A: Esther, in your right lower corner, there is a tiny little hand. Click it.-

-Esther Hunter (eastcentralcommunity@gmail.com) - 5:51 PM

Q: Thank you but not seeing a hand. I have a bar of options that include mute on the bottom of the screen and this q and a section to the right. ?

Priority: N/A-

-John Ewanowski (jewanowski@crsa-us.com) - 5:57 PM

Q: am I going to have to be a panelist to present? I'm up next

Priority: N/A-

-Wayne Mills - 5:58 PM

A: Yes, we will make you a presenter.-

-Esther Hunter (eastcentralcommunity@gmail.com) - 5:58 PM

Q: Sorry...no hand on my screen. Lower portion I have the bar with features including the mute but in the bottom right I have only this q and a section. ??

Priority: N/A-

-Wayne Mills - 6:02 PM

A: Hi Esther. What item would you like to speak on?-

-Esther Hunter (eastcentralcommunity@gmail.com) - 6:01 PM

Q: Never mind..just found it. On my screen it's mid screen after attendees. Awesome..Thanks.

Priority: N/A-

-Michaela Oktay - 6:12 PM

A: sorry, it is such a tiny little button. glad you found it.:)-

-Christy Porucznik (christy.porucznik@gmail.com) - 6:03 PM

Q: Esther, if you click on the > to the left of Participants it will bring up the list of people. Scroll down to find yourself, and you will find your hand there.

Priority: N/A-

-Vickey Walker (vwalker693@gmail.com) - 7:18 PM

Q: This is Vickey Walker, a Canyon Road resident. We have worked with the utility department to keep as many trees as possible. By keeping the front set back to a minimum, that allows most trees to remain.

Priority: N/A-

-Wayne Mills - 7:21 PM

A: Thank you Ms. Walker, but the public hearing is over so we are not allowed to provide your comments to the Commissioners. We do appreciate your participation.-

-John Ewanowski (jewanowski@crsa-us.com) - 7:28 PM

Q: Thanks, all

Priority: N/A-

-Christy Porucznik (christy.porucznik@gmail.com) - 8:04 PM

Q: It has been a garden since the 1970's

Priority: N/A-

-Jesse Allen (jallen@gbsarchitects.com) - 8:46 PM

Q: I am going to be the presenter for the next agenda item. Can you confirm that I am in the meeting correctly so that when it is time, I will be able to share my screen?

Priority: N/A-

-Rick Dahmer (rdahmer@comcast.net) - 9:24 PM

Q: Living across from this home for over 15 years, it is clear that it was purposely neglected so it could be torn down. I have never seen anyone do anything to take care of it.

Priority: N/A-

-Rick Dahmer (rdahmer@comcast.net) - 9:27 PM

Q: Garbett clearly had the resources to take care and restore it, but he never did.
Priority: N/A-

-Rick Dahmer (rdahmer@comcast.net) - 9:30 PM

Q: Also others who have tried to buy it to restore it but Garbett would only sell for twice the current market value.

Priority: N/A-

-Rick Dahmer (rdahmer@comcast.net) - 9:32 PM

Q: The developer definitely contributed to the disrepair. Those who live around it all witnessed it.

Priority: N/A-

-Michael Hughes (hesmichael@hotmail.com) - 10:09 PM

Q: I am very much in favor of this plan for the Wasatch Community Garden plan. Michael Hughes

Priority: N/A-

-Michael Hughes (hesmichael@hotmail.com) - 10:37 PM

Q: thank you all

Priority: N/A-

The meeting adjourned at [10:32:40 PM](#)