

ATTACHMENT K: STANDARDS FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION EVALUATION

H Historic Preservation Overlay District – Standards for Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction (21A.34.020.H)

In considering an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness involving new construction, or alterations of noncontributing structures, the Historic Landmark Commission, or Planning Director when the application involves the alteration of a noncontributing structure shall, using the adopted design guidelines as a key basis for evaluation, determine whether the project substantially complies with each of the following standards that pertain to the application to ensure that the proposed project fits into the established context in ways that respect and contribute to the evolution of Salt Lake City’s architectural and cultural traditions:

The proposed project is a utility structure in a park in the Open Space zoning district. There are no specific objectives/guidelines for this type of structure; however, the site is located within an area that consists mainly of single-family and multi-family land uses.

Standard	Analysis	Finding
<p>1. SETTLEMENT PATTERNS AND NEIGHBORHOOD CHARACTER 1.a Block and Street Patterns: The design of the project preserves and reflects the historic block, street, and alley patterns that give the district its unique character. Changes to the block and street pattern may be considered when advocated by an adopted City plan.</p>	<p><i>RDG: The Public Realm – Design Objective</i> <i>12.3 When designing a new building, the historic settlement patterns of the district and context should be respected.</i></p> <p>The proposed pump house does not alter the existing block, street and alley patterns. Additionally, the orientation of the structure is compatible with the existing block and street pattern. No alterations to any of the existing block or street patterns is included in this proposal.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 1.a.</p>
<p>1.b Lot and Site Patterns: The design of the project preserves the pattern of lot and building site sizes that create the urban character of the historic context and the block face. Changes to the lot and site pattern may be considered when advocated by an adopted City plan.</p>	<p><i>RDG: The Public Realm – Design Objective</i> <i>12.3 When designing a new building, the historic settlement patterns of the district and context should be respected.</i></p> <p>The design of the structure preserves the pattern of lot and building site sizes. The subject property is approximately 10,853 square feet which is larger than the surrounding historic context. The building footprint, which is approximately 511 square feet with an additional 111 square feet of fenced area, preserves 95% of the existing parcel. The footprint of the structure does not incorporate the entirety of the buildable area.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 1.b.</p>

<p>1.c The Public Realm: The project relates to adjacent streets and engages with sidewalks in a manner that reflects the character of the historic context and the block face. Projects should maintain the depth of yard and height of principal elevation of those existing on the block face in order to support consistency in the definition of public and semi-public spaces.</p>	<p><i>RDG: The Public Realm – Design Objective</i> <i>12.3 When designing a new building, the historic settlement patterns of the district and context should be respected.</i></p> <p>The proposed project relates to the surrounding streets, which includes: Canyon Road, Canyon Side Road, 4th Avenue and 220 North by the orientation towards 4th Avenue. The proposed structure provides entrances that are located on the south and west elevations, which reflects the character of the existing context. The design of the structure integrates similar materials and features that relate both to the residential and the park context.</p> <p>In regard to the block face relationship, this parcel is its own block face. However, the placement of the structure relates to the location of the well head and not necessarily the setbacks of the surrounding residential structures. However, the surrounding context includes a variety of setbacks from 0’-35’1”, the proposed location is not out of character for the context. Utilizing the existing well head will place the structure within a similar area of disturbance, due to the existing well equipment.</p> <p>The height of the structure is lower than the residential structures that surround the site. The surrounding structures vary from 1.5 – 2 stories in height.</p> <p>Additionally, this is a public space and there is no incorporation of semi or full private spaces. The exterior of the structure and park will be accessible by the general public.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 1.c.</p>
<p>1.d Building Placement: Buildings are placed such that the project maintains and reflects the historic pattern of setbacks and building depth established within the historic context and the block face. Buildings should maintain the setback demonstrated by existing buildings of that type constructed in the district or site’s period of significance.</p>	<p><i>RDG: Building Placement, Orientation & Use – Design Objective</i> <i>12.4 The front and the entrance of a primary structure should orient to the street.</i></p> <p>The proposed setbacks for this structure are 2’3” to 5’5” for the southern yard. The front yard setbacks within the neighborhood vary between 0’-35’1”. All existing setbacks follow an urban development pattern – relatively close to the street and oriented to the public way. The proposed structure is similar to the existing setbacks.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with standard 1.d.</p>

<p>1.e Building Orientation: The building is designed such that principal entrances and pathways are oriented such that they address the street in the pattern established in the historic context and the block face.</p>	<p><i>RDG: Building Placement, Orientation & Use – Design Objective 12.4 The front and the entrance of a primary structure should orient to the street.</i></p> <p>The structure was designed with distinct visual entrances along the street frontages. The design is consistent with the surrounding development pattern. The southern orientation places the primary entrance on the south elevation facing 4th Avenue.</p> <p>A pedestrian path will be placed at the southern entrance. An additional entrance is placed on the west elevation. The pedestrian walkway is not altered with this proposal.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 1.e.</p>
<p>2. Site Access, Parking, And Services:</p> <p>a. Site Access: The design of the project allows for site access that is similar, in form and function, with patterns common in the historic context and the block face.</p> <p>(1) Pedestrian: Safe pedestrian access is provided through architecturally highlighted entrances and walkways, consistent with patterns common in the historic context and the block face.</p> <p>(2) Vehicular: Vehicular access is located in the least obtrusive manner possible. Where possible, garage doors and parking should be located to the rear or to the side of the building.</p>	<p><i>RDG & MFDG: Site Access, Parking & Services – Design Objective 12.4, 12.17, 12.18, 12.19, 12.20, 12.21, 12.22, 12.23, 12.24, 12.25, 12.27, 12.28, 12.29, 12.30, 12.31</i></p> <p>a.(1) The pedestrian access to and within the park will remain unaltered with this proposal. The proposal does not alter the existing pedestrian access within the park and will introduce additional sandstone pavers at the southern entrance of the proposed structure. The pedestrian access will remain unaltered with this proposal, with the small addition of sandstone pavers at the southern entrance of the proposed structure.</p> <p>a.(2) The proposal does not include any vehicle access on the site. The elimination of the driveway and access was to reduce the additional impact on the existing vegetation. The vehicle access will be located on the public street. It is also important to note that the street parking would only be utilized by maintenance vehicles approximately 15-30 minutes per day and 2 hours once every 3-4 weeks.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 2a (1-2).</p>

<p>2.b Site and Building Services and Utilities: Utilities and site/building services (such as HVAC systems, venting fans, and dumpsters) are located such that they are to the rear of the building or on the roof and screened from public spaces and public properties.</p>	<p><i>RDG & MFDG: Site Access, Parking & Services – Design Objective 12.4, 12.17, 12.18, 12.19, 12.20, 12.21, 12.22, 12.23, 12.24, 12.25, 12.27, 12.28, 12.29, 12.30, 12.31</i></p> <p>The pump house design incorporates two HVAC units located on the interior of the structure. The air intake and relief air grilles are located on the north elevation. Additionally, small electric unit heaters will be used to protect from freeze in winter months. These systems will not be readily visible. The systems located on the north elevation are proposed to be screened with a stone wall.</p> <p>One utility box is proposed further north of the building. This location was selected to minimize damage to existing vegetation. No screening is proposed for this utility box.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 2b.</p>
<p>3. Landscape And Lighting: a. Grading of Land: The site’s landscape, such as grading and retaining walls, addresses the public way in a manner that reflects the character of the historic context and the block face.</p>	<p><i>RDG & MFDG: Site Access, Parking & Services – Design Objective 12..32, 12.33, 12.34, 12.36, 12.37, 12.39, 12.40, 12.41</i></p> <p>The grading will remain as is. No grading or retaining walls are proposed.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 3.</p>
<p>3.b Landscape Structures: Landscape structures, such as arbors, walls, fences, address the public way in a manner that reflects the character of the historic context and the block face.</p>	<p><i>RDG & MFDG: Site Access, Parking & Services – Design Objective 12..32, 12.33, 12.34, 12.36, 12.37, 12.39, 12.40, 12.41</i></p> <p>The pump house integrates several design elements that will ideally transition this building to read as a utility structure. The combination of the materials, articulation of the pilasters and the varying brick coursing and colors will aid in the transition of this structure within the landscaped park. Additionally, elements that reflect the historic Brigham Young wall are integrated into the stone wall. The wall will hide less desirable features of the structure. No additional landscape structures are proposed with this project.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 3b.</p>
<p>3.c Lighting: Where appropriate lighting is used to enhance significant elements of the design and reflects the character of the historic context and the block face.</p>	<p><i>RDG & MFDG: Site Access, Parking & Services – Design Objective 12..32, 12.33, 12.34, 12.36, 12.37, 12.39, 12.40, 12.41</i></p> <p>The structure includes exterior sconces on the south and west elevations. All exterior lighting will turn off with the existing street lights. Staff recommends a condition that the lighting plan is reviewed by Planning Staff, prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. This is to ensure lighting compatibly with the surrounding uses.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 3c with the proposed condition.</p>

<p>4. Building Form and Scale: a. Character Of The Street Block: The design of the building reflects the historic character of the street façade in terms of scale, composition, and modeling.</p> <p>(1) Height: The height of the project reflects the character of the historic context and the block face. Projects taller than those existing on the block face step back their upper floors to present a base that is in scale with the historic context and the block face.</p> <p>(2) Width: The width of the project reflects the character of the historic context and the block face. Projects wider than those existing on the block face modulate the façade to express a series of volumes in scale with the historic context and the block face.</p> <p>(3) Massing: The shape, form, and proportion of buildings, reflects the character of the historic context and the block face.</p> <p>(4) Roof Forms: The building incorporates roof shapes that reflect forms found in the historic context and the block face.</p>	<p><i>RDG & MFDG: Building Form & Scale – Design Objective 12.5, 12.6, 12.7, 12.8, 12.9, 12.10, 12.11, 12.14</i></p> <p>Height: The height of the structure is 13 feet. The height is in character with the surrounding residential context. The surrounding structures vary from 1.5 to 2 stories in height. This structure is lower in height than the surrounding residential structures and is in scale with the historic context.</p> <p>Width: The pump house is approximately 17’5” wide along 4th Ave. This width is slimmer than the surrounding residential structures. The applicant provided the following measurement: the narrowest house along this section of Canyon Road is approximately 25 feet. The width of the proposed pump house is in character with the surrounding context.</p> <p>Massing: The proposed pump house is a rectangle shape, which is similar to the surrounding residential structures. The lowered roof plane and façade articulation along the elevations reduces the overall massing of the proposed structure. The massing is further distributed through the four distinct vertical sections of the structure. The vertical sections are defined by the vertical brick pilasters. Additionally, vertical emphasis is distinguished by the darker brick coursing below each detailed arch. The vertical emphasis, change in planes and variety of brick color reduces the scale of the utility structure. The massing of the pump house is in character with the surrounding residential context.</p> <p>Roof forms: The flat roof of the pump house does reflect a roof form found within the residential context. The structure reflects the minimum height needed to accommodate the proposed equipment. Additionally, to achieve a lower height and to reduce the massing the architect integrated a flat roof. One additional flat roofed structure is located within the residential context. The flat roofed structure is a multi-family structure and is approximately 4 stories in height.</p>	<p>The proposal generally complies with Standard 4.</p>
---	---	---

<p>5. Building Character:</p> <p>a. Façade Articulation And Proportion: The design of the project reflects patterns of articulation and proportion established in the historic context and the block face. As appropriate, façade articulations reflect those typical of other buildings on the block face. These articulations are of similar dimension to those found elsewhere in the context, but have a depth of not less than twelve inches (12”).</p> <p>(1) Rhythm Of Openings: The facades are designed to reflect the rhythm of openings (doors, windows, recessed balconies, etc.) established in the historic context and the block face.</p> <p>(2) Proportion And Scale Of Openings: The facades are designed using openings (doors, windows, recessed balconies, etc.) of similar proportion and scale to that established in the historic context and the block face.</p> <p>(3) Ratio Of Wall To Openings: Facades are designed to reflect the ratio of wall to openings (doors, windows, recessed balconies, etc.) established in the historic context and the block face.</p> <p>(4) Balconies, Porches, And External Stairs: The project, as appropriate, incorporates entrances, balconies, porches, stairways, and other projections that reflect patterns established in the historic context and the block face.</p>	<p><i>RDG & MFDG: Façade Articulation, Proportion & Visual Emphasis – Design Objective 12.12, 12.13, 12.15, 12.16</i></p> <p>Façade Articulation and Proportion: The design of the pump house includes patterns and articulation that reflect the utility use of the structure. The structure contains traditional building articulation with an exposed foundation, and masonry veneers as the central material and then finished with a cornice extension. The façade is broken down by a shift in material color and substantial shifts in planes. Additionally, the pump house includes articulated architectural elements, which include the detailed arch and rectangular vertical features, masonry pilasters, canopy extensions and a stone wall. All of these features heavily articulate the architectural elements across each elevation.</p> <p>Rhythm of Openings: The pump house incorporates maintenance crew entrances on the south and west elevation. The doors are glazed with obscured glass for security purposes. There are no window openings on the structure. The windows were eliminated for sound attenuation and security purposes. The architects designed the dark brick vertical panels to evoke window openings.</p> <p>Proportion and Scale of Openings: As stated above, the doors and the brick vertical features are scaled for pedestrian engagement and façade articulation. Due to the utility function and the provided acoustic concerns from the public, the current iteration does not provide window openings. This is to aid in the sound attenuation for the site.</p> <p>Ratio of Wall to Openings: The two primary elevations, which are the south and west elevations incorporate the entrances. Due to the utilitarian design and nature, the ratio is not consistent with the established residential context.</p> <p>Balconies, Porches and External Stairs: The pump house does not incorporate these features. However, canopy extensions are included over the entrances and the dark brick vertical features. The extensions reflect the residential porch features in the surrounding residential context.</p>	<p>The proposal generally complies with Standard 5a (1-4).</p>
--	---	--

<p>6. Building Materials, Elements And Detailing: a. Materials: Building facades, other than windows and doors, incorporate no less than eighty percent (80%) durable material such as, but not limited to, wood, brick, masonry, textured or patterned concrete and/or cut stone. These materials reflect those found elsewhere in the district and/or setting in terms of scale and character.</p> <p>6.b. Materials On Street-Facing Facades: The following materials are not considered to be appropriate and are prohibited for use on facades which face a public street: vinyl siding and aluminum siding.</p>	<p><i>RDG & MFDG: Materials – Design Objective 12.17, 12.18, 12.19</i></p> <p>The proposal only integrates durable materials for each elevation. The materials include: two types of masonry veneer, metal coping, metal canopy extensions, concrete and cobble stone. The main materials reflect those found within the residential context and the linear park context.</p> <p>The proposal does not include any vinyl or aluminum siding on any of the elevations.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 6a & b.</p>
<p>6.c. Windows: Windows or other openings are incorporated in a manner that reflects patterns, materials, and detailing established in the district and/or setting.</p>	<p><i>RDG & MFDG: Materials – Design Objective 12.17, 12.18, 12.19</i></p> <p>The architects have integrated dark masonry vertical panels, in order to articulate the facades similar to window openings. The masonry panels are scaled to the pedestrian level. This design does not reflect an existing design within the established context. However, the design does reflect the utilitarian design and nature of the proposed structure.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 6c.</p>
<p>6.d. Architectural Elements And Details: The design of the building features architectural elements and details that reflect those characteristic of the district and/or setting.</p>	<p><i>RDG & MFDG: Materials – Design Objective 12.23, 12.24, 12.25</i></p> <p>The architect included design details and elements that reflect characteristics found in the linear park and the residential context. The architects integrated commonly found masonry and river rock within the linear park, as well as within the neighboring areas. The utilization of these materials integrates the park spaces and the common materials. Additionally, the masonry veneer reflects the surrounding residential masonry structures. The canopy structures reflect commonly found porch elements within the residential context.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 6d.</p>
<p>7. Signage Location: Locations for signage are provided such that they are an integral part of the site and architectural design and are complementary to the principal structure.</p>	<p><i>RDG & MFDG: Signs – Design Objective 12.78, 12.79, 12.80, 12.81</i></p> <p>Public Utilities wishes to incorporate some signage on the south elevation. The signage will include: a date stone, the building name, and a plaque to reflect and provide information on the history of water use on the subject site.</p>	<p>The proposal complies with Standard 7.</p>