

## **Motion Sheet for PLNHLC2020-00103 – 33<sup>rd</sup> Ward – Minor Alterations – 453 S. 1100 East**

### **Motion to approve:**

Based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness involving various minor alterations (as listed in the staff report) in a local historic district have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Commission approve the request for the various minor alterations located at approximately 453 S. 1100 East.

### **Motion to deny:**

Based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness involving various minor alterations (as listed in the staff report) in a local historic district have not been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Commission deny the request for the various minor alterations located at approximately 453 S. 1100 East. Specifically, the Commission finds that the proposed project does not comply with Standards (Commissioner then states findings based on the Standards (following) to support the motion):

G. Standards For Certificate Of Appropriateness For Alteration Of A Landmark Site Or Contributing Structure Including New Construction Of An Accessory Structure: In considering an application for a certificate of appropriateness for alteration of a landmark site or contributing structure, the Historic Landmark Commission, or the Planning Director, for administrative decisions, shall find that the project substantially complies with all of the following general standards that pertain to the application and that the decision is in the best interest of the City:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be used for a purpose that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment;
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided;
3. All sites, structures and objects shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create a false sense of history or architecture are not allowed;
4. Alterations or additions that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved;
5. Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved;
6. Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced wherever feasible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other structures or objects;
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible;
8. Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant cultural, historical, architectural or archaeological material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment;
9. Additions or alterations to structures and objects shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible in massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment;
10. Certain building materials are prohibited including the following:
  - a. Aluminum, asbestos, or vinyl cladding when applied directly to an original or historic material.

11. Any new sign and any change in the appearance of any existing sign located on a landmark site or within the H Historic Preservation Overlay District, which is visible from any public way or open space shall be consistent with the historic character of the landmark site or H Historic Preservation Overlay District and shall comply with the standards outlined in chapter 21A.46 of this title.