

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING
City & County Building
451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah
February 6, 2020

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson, Kenton Peters; Commissioners Jessica Maw, Rocio Torres Mora, Victoria Petro-Eschler, Esther Stowell, and Paul Svendsen. Vice Chairperson, Robert Hyde; Commissioners Stanley Adams and David Richardson were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Amy Thompson, Senior Planner; Sara Javoronok, Senior Planner; Lex Traugher, Senior Planner; and Merili Carter, Administrative Secretary.

Field Trip

A field trip was held prior to the work session. Historic Landmark Commissioners present were: Jessica Maw, Esther Stowell, Paul Svendsen, and Michael Vela. Staff members in attendance were Michaela Oktay, and Lex Traugher.

- **340 W South Temple** - Staff gave an overview of the proposal.
- **432 North 300 West** – Staff gave an overview of the proposal.
- **639 East 500 South** - Staff gave an overview of the proposal.

APPROVAL OF THE JANUARY 16, 2020, MEETING MINUTES. [5:34:18 PM](#)

MOTION [5:34:30 PM](#)

Commissioner Svendsen moved to approve the January 16, 2020, meeting minutes. Commissioner Stowell seconded the motion. All were in favor, the minutes passed unanimously.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR [5:34:50 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Hyde was not present.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR [5:34:59 PM](#)

Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director, updated the commission regarding the upcoming Appeals Hearing on the painted façade project that the Historic Landmark Commission denied.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS [5:36:58 PM](#)

Cindy Cromer – Provided comments regarding the upcoming Appeals Hearing regarding the painted façade.

[5:39:50 PM](#)

Liberty Square Apartments at approx. 639 East 500 South: Chris Zarek, representative for the property owner, is requesting approval of a material change on each of the Liberty Square Apartment structures. The Historic Landmark Commission approved the new construction of Liberty Square on May

3, 2018. A new approval is required due to material changes from the approved design. The site is zoned TSA-UN-C (Transit Station Area-Urban Neighborhood Core) and is located within the Central City Local Historic District. The subject property is located within Council District 4 which is represented by Ana Valdemoros. Staff contact is Kelsey Lindquist at 801-535-7930 or at kelsey.lindquist@slcgov.com Case number **PLNHLC2017-00266**.

Kelsey, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the change of materials.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification on whether there will be a change in the color of the material
- How the dimensions of the angles compare to the wood panel that was previously part of the project

Chris Zarek, applicant, provided a presentation and provided further design details.

PUBLIC HEARING [5:46:25 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Cindy Cromer – Raised concern about what she considers to be the late entry of input from the fire marshal regarding this site plan.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Clark closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [5:50:26 PM](#)

Commissioner Torres Mora stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2017-00226, a request for a Certification of Appropriateness for a modification to the approved Liberty Square New Construction at 639 East 500 South.

Commissioner Svendsen seconded the motion. Commissioners Stowell, Maw, Torres Morra, Vela, Petro-Eschler, and Svendsen voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

[5:51:17 PM](#)

Devereaux House Re-roof at approx. 340 W South Temple: The property owner, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, is requesting approval to replace the existing slate on the mansard roof with asphalt shingle roofing. This matter is being referred to the Historic Landmark Commission for a decision because of the proposed change in roofing material on a Local Landmark. The subject property is located within Council District 3 which is represented by Chris Wharton. Staff contact is Sara Javoronok at 801-535-7625 or at sara.javoronok@slcgov.com .Case number **PLNHLC2019-00916**.

Sara Javoronok, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission deny the request.

Emily Utt, applicant, provided history information regarding the Devereaux House and further details.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Clarification as to what a composition shingle was were made of in 1880
- Underlayment
- Clarification on why synthetic slate was removed for a possible replacement
- Clarification on materials being proposed
- When the house had a wood shake as a roof

PUBLIC HEARING [6:18:27 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing; seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

The following comments and discussions were made:

- I think the proposal is reasonable and I'd be happy to delegate to final product to staff
- I don't have an issue with composition roofing
- Clarification on why the applicant prefers not to use slate
- Maintenance issues were discussed
- I am deeply opposed to the shingles that are there now

MOTION [6:29:39 PM](#)

Commissioner Stowell stated, based on the information in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission deny the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a re-roof with asphalt shingles, as presented in petition PLNHLC2019-00916.

Commission Vela seconded the motion. Commissioner Svendsen voted "Nay". Commissioners, Petro-Eschler, Vela, Torres Mora, and Maw voted "Aye". Commissioner Stowell abstained from voting. The motion passed 4-2.

WORK SESSION

[6:31:44 PM](#)

The Quince New Construction and Special Exceptions at approx. 432 N 300 W: Paul Garbett, of Garbett Homes, has submitted applications for new construction of a single-family attached residential development in an historic district and two associated special exception requests located at approximately 432 N. 300 West (Bishop Place – a private street). Currently, the properties associated with the proposed development are occupied by abandoned structures that have been approved for demolition. The subject property is zoned SR-3 (Special Development Pattern Residential District) and is located in Council District 3 which is represented by Chris Wharton. Staff contact is Lex Traughber at 801-535-6184 or at lex.traughber@slcgov.com.

a. New Construction (Case number PLNHLC2019-01157): This project request requires approval for new construction in a historic district.

b. Two Special Exceptions (Case Numbers PLNHLC2019-01157 & 01158):

- i. The applicant requests a modification of the rear yard setback. The applicant is requesting a ten-foot (10') rear yard setback. The rear yard setback in the SR-3 Zone is 20% of the lot depth but not less than fifteen feet (15') and not to exceed thirty feet (30').

- ii. The applicant is requesting a modification to the minimum lot width requirement. The applicant is requesting a minimum lot width of nineteen feet (19'). The minimum lot width in the SR-3 Zone for single-family attached dwellings is twenty-two feet (22').

Lex Traugher, Senior Planner, provided the Historic Landmark Commission with information regarding the proposed development and special exception request.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification as to why the entire East side was not rear yard
- Clarification on whether it's a single-family home and how many bedrooms
- Rear setback requirements clarification

Bryson Garbett, with Garbett Homes, and Tyler Kirk, with Think Architecture, provided a presentation with further design details.

The following comments and discussions were made:

- Whether the proposal has been reviewed by the Fire Marshal
- Clarification on what was the inspiration for the 3rd West facing property
- Windows
- Colors of proposal
- The neighborhood is quirky, and the project can use changes to help fit into the neighborhood
- I think the frontage on 3rd West should be considered a little more
- Clarification on what the applicant has done in terms in visiting the surrounding neighborhood and Community Council
- The single garage entrance
- Density, setbacks, and lot widths

The meeting adjourned at [7:32:46 PM](#)