

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING
City & County Building
451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah
January 16, 2020

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:30:54 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting: Commissioners Victoria Petro–Eschler, Esther Stowell, Paul Svendsen, Stanley Adams, Rocío de María Torres Mora, and Jessica Maw.

Excused from the Historic Landmark Commission meeting: Chairperson Kenton Peters and Vice Chairperson Robert Hyde; Commissioners David Richardson and Michael Vela.

Planning staff present at the meeting were Planning Manager Wayne Mills, Senior Planner Amy Thompson, Senior Planner Lex Traughber, and Administrative Secretary Merili Carter.

Senior City Attorney Paul Nielson was also in attendance.

Field Trip

A field trip was held prior to the work session.

Present for the field trip were Commissioners Esther Stowell and Rocío de María Torres Mora; and City Staff: Planning Manager Wayne Mills and Senior Planner Lex Traughber.

- **Masonic Temple Apartments** – Staff summarized the project and existing neighborhood conditions.

Dinner- No public business was discussed.

Commission Meeting Begins [5:30:54 PM](#)

Discussion to approve the December 5, 2019, MEETING MINUTES [5:31:36 PM](#)

MOTION to approve [5:31:36 PM](#)

Commissioner Petro–Eschler moved to approve the December 5, 2019 meeting minutes. Commissioner Adams seconded the motion. All Commissioners voted “aye”.

The motion passed unanimously. [5:31:55 PM](#)

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR [5:32:04 PM](#)

Both the Chair and Vice Chair did not attend; no report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR [5:32:12 PM](#)

Planning Manager Mills gave an update on the Salt Lake Regional Medical Center signs.

Planning Manager Mills also discussed the following extension request:

Extension Request for New Construction at approximately 563 E. 600 S. - Kristen Clifford, the consultant who represents the property owner, is requesting that the Historic Landmark Commission grant a one-year time extension on approval of New Construction of a Mixed-Use building in the Central City Local Historic District. The Commission originally granted approval for this project on December 7, 2017. The subject property is located within Council District 4 which is represented by Ana Valdemoros. Staff contact is Amy Thompson at (801) 535-7281 or amy.thompson@slcgov.com. Case number **PLNHLC2017-00555**.

Commission declined to hear from staff and/or the applicant.

Commissioner Petro–Eschler moved to grant the one-year extension. Commissioner Mora second the motion. All Commissioners voted “aye”.

The motion passed unanimously [5:36:01 PM](#)

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS [5:36:05 PM](#)

Cindy Cromer commented on the previous extension request. She commented on the main issues have been with loans, fire, and Rocky Mountain Power. Cindy expressed the need to address the issues in a timelier manner.

PUBLIC HEARING for agenda items [5:37:56 PM](#)

1. **Masonic Temple Apartments at approximately 33 S. 600 E.** - DB Urban Communities, representing the property owner, the Masonic Temple Association, is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of a multi-family residential development of approximately 125 dwelling. New construction is required to go the Historic Landmark Commission. Currently, the site is occupied by a surface parking lot and is zoned RO - Residential Office. The subject property is located within Council District 4, represented by Ana Valdemoros. Staff contact is Lex Traughber at (801) 535-6184 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com. Case number **PLNHLC2019-00860**.

[5:38:17 PM](#) Commissioner Petro–Eschler disclosed a potential conflict of interest: she knows one of the architects on the project. The architect’s spouse works for Commissioner Petro-Eschler. Commissioner Petro-Eschler disclosed that she will receive no benefit from this project, and she believes she can be impartial. Senior City Attorney Paul Nielson discussed that he has no concerns about Commissioner Petro-Eschler’s relation to the architect.

[5:39:48 PM](#) Senior Planner Lex Traughber discussed the Masonic Temple Apartments at approximately 33 South 600 East PLNHLC2019-00860. Traughber discussed that several public comments were received for this project. He addressed the public process that was required on this project, and what notifications were sent out. Traughber also discussed that a traffic study is not required for this project.

The Commission and Staff Discussion [5:45:00 PM](#):

Commission did not have any questions for staff.

Applicant Presentation [5:46:03 PM](#):

Dustin Holt of dbURBAN Communities introduced Jason Woodland, president of the Masonic Temple Association, Meghnad Aubry and David Abraham with Nexus Architects.

Woodland discussed the association's background and forecasted future.

Holt discussed the overall project and their public engagement process on this project and how the design was influenced by public input.

Aubry discussed the historical nods in the design and 600 E street façade.

The Commission and Applicant Discussion [6:12:00 PM](#):

Commissioner Petro–Eschler asked the applicant about the shadows this project will cast upon the neighboring mansion.

Aubry discussed the height of the project and the setbacks mitigating the casting of shadows.

Commissioner Maw asked about the location of the project and how that was chosen.

Woodland discussed the need to maintain the parking lot on the east side of their property.

Commissioner Maw asked about access to the project from 700 East.

Holt discussed how the project's parking stalls will be accessed.

Commissioner Svendsen asked how the height of the project was chosen.

Holt discussed their height choice process.

PUBLIC COMMENTS for Case number PLNHLC2019-00860 [6:19:42 PM](#)

Philip McCarthy, neighbor to applicant property, expressed that he is opposed to the project. He is concerned about the height of the project, the trees, and the sightlines. He would be okay with the project if it moved to the 700 East side of the Masonic Temple property and if they created green space on the 600 East side of the property.

Joseph Sanders, a local historian, supports the project and supports the need for funding to maintain the historic Masonic Temple.

Cindy Cromer spoke of neighboring properties to the project, expressed support of new development, more housing, and relocating the carriage house.

Todd Brashear opposes project and finds an issue with the requirements for new construction in historic districts. He also finds an issue with the height of the project, movement of sun light to neighboring projects, traffic, and the lot line adjustment.

Max Smith, local architect, spoke of the historical importance of South Temple. He expressed concerns with the north elevation and how it will not compliment the Walker McCarthy Mansion.

Orlando Luna, called upon to speak, but did not come up to speak.

Monique Carlson spoke of historic preservation and expressed concern about the height of the north side of the project.

Michael Shawn Fletcher, General Manager of the Walker McCarthy Mansion, opposes the project and spoke of the height, neighboring properties, and the desire to maintain the sightlines.

Rob Carlson expressed his support of preserving South Temple and supports the Masonic Temple finding a way to fund their preservation but is concerned about the north elevation of the project.

Michelle Turpin finds the City to be hypocritical if they approve this project when she has had smaller projects denied because she is also in a historic district.

Commissioner Paul Svendsen, temporary chair, read the following comments:

Ken Rozema expressed his concern about the community having a voice and believes the project will stick out like a sore thumb and look out of place.

Sandra McCarthy expressed she would rather see the project directly behind the Masonic Temple.

Patrick Egbert is concerned about traffic and safety. He feels that traffic would flow better if the project were built on the 700 East side of the property.

Molly Spain expressed concern about another high-rise ruining the historic character of South Temple.

Seth Spain expressed concern about high-rise buildings ruining the historic buildings on South Temple.

Gary Evershed would like a traffic study to be done and is concerned about the lot consolidation and keeping the historic nature of the area.

M.C. Rivetji expressed his support for the project and spoke about how buildings have been going up that disrupt views for all of history and we cannot halt development for that purpose. He expressed the need for more housing and maintained that this project will not harm the surrounding historic structures. This project helps preserve the historic district; economically and socially.

Patrick Egbert, representing the Cumming family, owner of the Keith Brown Mansion and local block. Patrick discussed the need for a traffic study; would like to see the project on 700 East.

Ray Hulse opposes the project, namely the alley way, and is concerned about crime and sanitation maintenance in the area.

The Commission and Applicant Discussion [6:58:06 PM](#):

Applicant was called back up to address the public's concerns.

PUBLIC COMMENTS closed for Case number PLNHLC2019-00860 [7:03:42 PM](#)

Executive Session [7:03:56 PM](#)

Commission discussed that they can only consider the historic district new construction guidelines, and that other concerns raised by the public do not fall under their purview.

Senior City Attorney Paul Nielson clarified that the commission can only consider the standards of the ordinance.

Commissioner Adams discussed the ordinance and the rights of a property owner.

Planning Manger Mills discussed access to light and the design objective that considers access to light and privacy to adjacent buildings.

Commissioner Petro–Eschler also discussed the ordinance and the HLC purview.

Planning Manger Mills discussed the HLC's responsibilities.

Commissioner Svendsen asked about noticing procedures.

Commissioner Stowell discussed the need to work out their relationships with adjacent property owners and neighbors.

MOTION to Approve made [7:11:30 PM](#)

Commissioner Stowell: based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness involving new construction in a local historic district have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Commission approve the request for new construction located at approximately 33 S. 600 East.

Commissioner Adams seconded the motion.

Commissioner Maw, Adams, Petro-Eschler, Stowell, and Torres Mora voted aye.

The motion to approve passed unanimously [7:12:22 PM](#)

Senior City Attorney Paul Nielson discussed the appeal process.

Meeting adjourned [7:13:15 PM](#)