SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING City & County Building 451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah Thursday, August 1, 2019

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at <u>5:32:39 PM</u>. Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Kenton Peters; Vice Chairperson Robert Hyde; Commissioners Stanley Adams, Sheleigh Harding, Rocio de Maria Torres Mora, David Richardson, Charles Shepherd, Esther Stowell, and Paul Svendsen. Commissioners Thomas Brennan, and Victoria Petro-Eschler were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director; John Anderson, Planning Manager; Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner; and Marlene Rankins, Administrative Secretary.

Field Trip

A field trip was held prior to the work session. Historic Landmark Commissioners present were: Kenton Peters, and Esther Stowell. Staff members in attendance were Michaela Oktay, John Anderson, and Ashley Scarff.

• 613 East 100 South – Staff gave an overview of the proposal.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR 5:33:23 PM

Chairperson Peters welcomed Rocio de Maria Torres Mora to the commission.

Vice Chairperson Hyde stated he had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR 5:33:39 PM

Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director, reminded the commission regarding the ipad return request.

APPROVAL OF THE JUNE 6, 2019, MEETING MINUTES. <u>5:34:27 PM</u> MOTION 5:34:42 PM

Commissioner Shepherd moved to approve the June 6, 2019, meeting minutes. Commissioner Stowell seconded the motion. All were in favor of approving the minutes. The motion passed.

Commissioner Svendsen requested information regarding a demolition of the Covey Apartments on the corner of 1st Avenue. Michaela Oktay provided clarification on the partial collapse that the occurred with the building and demolition information.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS

Cindy Cromer - Stated, she has been doing research in how materials to be used in Historic structures has changed over the years.

5:40:03 PM

Modifications to Row House Development at approximately 613 E. 100 South - Tate Siemer, developer and property owner, is requesting modifications to a new construction project for a 3-unit row house located within the Central City Local Historic District at the abovementioned address. The project was previously approved in December 2017 and is currently under construction. The requested modifications include changes to windows and doors that are partially constructed, and do not follow the initial Commission approval. The site is zoned RMF-45 (Moderate/High Density Multi-Family Residential), and is located in Council District 4, represented by Ana Valdemoros. (Staff contact: Lauren Parisi at (801)535-7226 or lauren.parisi@slcgov.com) Case number: PLNHLC2017-00722

Ashley Scarff represented Lauren Parisi in the absence of her presence. Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission deny all the proposed changes with three exceptions listed in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Profile of the windows that are installed versus the ones that were previously approved
- Whether the City did an inspection and noticed the construction and that there was not an official stop work order issued for the project

Tate Siemer, applicant, provided further design details regarding modifications to new construction. He also provided explanation regarding the changes made to original design approval.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Materials and color changes that were previously approved
- Clarification as to what it would entail to go back to original plan proposed
- What the impact on the masonry would be to change to original proposed design

Philip Pally, Matrix, provided possible design alternatives to be considered.

The Commission and Applicant further discussed the following:

- Clarification as to where the HVAC condensers located
- Whether the areas that are fenestrated are surrounded by metal siding
- Clarification as to what the intention is for detailing between the windows
- Whether there is satisfactory warranty on black vinyl windows that face the west
- Clarification on the window material

PUBLIC HEARING 6:24:20 PM

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Cindy Cromer – Raised concern that this is the second meeting in a row where the commission has had a development enforcement issue. She also stated that there is so much waste, and she's saddened by it.

The applicant addressed the public concerns.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission discussed the following during executive session:

- Concerns with change to vinyl window material
- Possibility on requiring upgrade in materials
- Waste issue in terms of wasting the construction materials that have already been used on the building
- Solid to void ratio
- Windows
- Protecting integrity; struggle with approving change
- Precedent; There's a reason for guidelines

MOTION 6:56:27 PM

Commissioner Harding stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve the requested modifications to the original Certificate of Appropriateness for the new construction project at 613 E 100 South regarding the change in garage door material, the front and back doorway detail on the ground floor of each unit and all modifications on the rear North façade of the building as proposed on the as built drawing for petition PLNHLC2017-00722 and all other aspects of the petition would be denied.

Clarification was made as to motion made.

Commissioner Richardson seconded the motion. Commissioners Richardson, Torres-Mora, Stowell, Hyde, Shepherd, Harding, Svendsen and Adams voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at <u>6:59:33 PM</u>