

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING
City & County Building
451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah
December 5, 2019

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:36:30 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting: Chairperson Kenton Peters and Vice Chairperson Robert Hyde. Commissioners Victoria Petro–Eschler, David Richardson, Paul Svendsen, Stanley Adams, Rocío de María Torres Mora, and Jessica Maw were also present.

Excused from the Historic Landmark Commission meeting: Commissioners Esther Stowell and Michael Vela.

Planning staff present at the meeting were Planning Manager Molly Robinson, Senior Planner Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner Lex Traughber, Principal Planner Lauren Parisi, and Administrative Secretary Merili Carter.

Senior City Attorney Paul Nielson was also in attendance.

Field Trip

A field trip was held prior to the work session. Present for the field trip were Chairperson Kenton Peters, Commissioners Rocío de María Torres Mora and Jessica Maw; City Staff: Planning Manager Molly Robinson, Senior Planner Kelsey Lindquist, and Senior Planner Lex Traughber.

- **613 E. 100 South** – Staff reviewed petitioner’s request.
- **Masonic Temple Apartments** – Staff reviewed project and observed the 600 East streetscape.
 - **Q:** Is the carriage house historically significant?
 - **A:** Yes, but it was originally a garage for a home that no longer exists. Staff is pleased that applicant wants to preserve the carriage house.
- **675 & 679 E. 2nd Avenue** – Staff reviewed project.
 - **Q:** Do additions normally go to the side of an original structure?
 - **A:** It is preferred that they are in the back, but this property cannot accommodate a back addition.
 - **Q:** How many units?
 - **A:** Maintain a total of eight.

Dinner

No public business was discussed. Senior City Attorney Paul Nielson conducted a training on the Open and Public Meeting Act for the commission and staff.

Commission Meeting Begins [5:36:30 PM](#)

Discussion to approve the November 7, 2019, MEETING MINUTES [5:37:28 PM](#)

MOTION to approve [5:37:44 PM](#)

Vice Chairperson Hyde moved to approve the November 7, 2019, meeting minutes. Commissioner Adams seconded the motion. All Commissioners voted “aye”.

The motion passed unanimously. [5:38:42 PM](#)

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR [5:38:45 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters and Vice Chairperson Hyde had nothing new to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR [5:39:00 PM](#)

Planning Manager Robinson discussed the building at 171 W 300 N, the painted masonry façade, **Case number PLNHLC2019-00132**, an appeal has been filed and is still waiting to be heard.

REVISIT TO THE REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR [5:39:28 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters discussed a study being conducted by the City for a proposed project on 100 South between 900 East and the University of Utah; the proposed work does not include accommodations for bicycles. The proposed work is a contradiction to the City's current streets ordinance. Chairperson Peters invited the commissioners and the public to talk to the City's Transportation Division and/or Bike Utah if they are interested in this project.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS [5:40:14 PM](#)

No public comment.

PUBLIC HEARING for agenda items [5:40:32 PM](#)

1. Addition to 675 & 679 E. 2nd Avenue Petition - Mitch McAllister, the property owner, is requesting approval for a Major Alteration to the principal structure located at 679 2nd Avenue. The applicant is proposing to construct an addition oriented to the west of the existing principal structure. The addition is approximately 1,336 square feet in size and 22'6" in height. The subject property is located in the SR-1A zoning district and the Avenues Local Historic District and within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. Staff contact is Kelsey Lindquist and can be reached at (801)535-7930 or kelsey.linquist@slcgov.com. **Case Number is PLNHLC2019-00831.**

Senior Planner Kelsey Lindquist discussed the addition to 675 & 679 E. 2nd Avenue petition (Case numbers: PLNHLC2019-00831).

- Located on the North side of 2nd Ave between J and K Street
- Surrounding context:
 - East: multi family structure
 - West: single family
 - South: religious institution
- Property consists of two lots that are not consolidated.
- Senior Planner discussed the demolition of a rear addition, the new addition, grading, and a lot consolidation.
- Staff received one public comment- concerns about the location of a neighboring wall.
- Staff is recommending approval with the conditions outlined in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff Discussion [5:45:44 PM](#):

Commission did not have any questions for staff.

Applicant Presentation [5:45:52 PM](#):

Mitch McCallister, property owner, discussed the two properties and the addition he is requesting approval for.

The Commission and Applicant Discussion [5:52:03 PM](#):

- Commissioner Maw asked about the use of materials.
 - Senior Planner Kelsey Lindquist discussed the design guidelines
 - Applicant further discussed his choice of materials and the materials currently on the building.

PUBLIC COMMENTS for Case number PLNHLC2019-00831 [5:53:42 PM](#)

No public comment.

Executive Session [5:53:58 PM](#)

Chairperson Kenton Peters discussed the design of the requested addition and wondered if it is trying too hard to emulate a historic design.

Commissioner Richardson is okay with the design and the use of materials; however, he discussed his concerns with the East elevation and how far back it is set back.

Commissioner Maw asked the applicant to discuss the set back.

Applicant McCallister had to set the addition back so far due to the design guidelines. The addition needs to be subordinate to the primary structure. The lot is also very large.

Commissioner Petro–Eschler further discussed the set back of the addition and how it compares to the structure to the West, she also discussed her appreciation for the use of materials and how they match the original structure.

Commissioner Svendsen expressed that he wishes the applicant could have been able to build a single-family home instead of the addition; however, given all the constraints the applicant is under that this project is just fine.

Commissioner Adams discussed his appreciation for the look of the project.

Commissioners discussed the need to combine the lots.

MOTION to Approve made [5:59:10 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson moved: Based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2019-00831, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Major Alteration of a contributing structure at 675 & 679 E. 2nd Avenue, with the following direction:

1. Approval of all final design details, including specific direction expressed by the Commission, shall be delegated to Planning Staff.

2. The applicant submit and finalize a lot consolidation with Salt Lake City.

Vice Chairperson Hyde seconded the motion.

Commissioner Petro–Eschler, Svendsen, Hyde, Adams, Richardson, Torres Mora, and Maw voted “Aye”.

The motion to approve passed unanimously [6:00:19 PM](#)

2. Modifications to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a Row House Development at approximately 613 E. 100 South - Carl York, property owner, is requesting modifications to the Certificate of Appropriateness for a new construction project located within the Central City Local Historic District at the abovementioned address. The modifications involve changes to the windows on the west elevation of the building. The Historic Landmark Commission has previously approved other changes to this application. The site is zoned RMF-45 (Moderate/High Density Multi-Family Residential), and is located in Council District 4, represented by Ana Valdemoros. Staff contact is Lauren Parisi and can be reached at (801)535-7226 or lauren.parisi@slcgov.com. Case Number **PLNHLC2017-00722**.

Principal Planner Lauren Parisi discussed the modifications to a Certificate of Appropriateness for a Row House Development at approximately 613 E. 100 South (Case numbers: PLNHLC2017-00722).

- History of requests and denials / the new request
- Original COA
- New Construction standards
- Staff recommends approval

The Commission and Staff Discussion [6:04:10 PM](#):

Commissioners and Parisi discussed the previous requests and the new request and what work has already been done.

The Commission and Applicant Discussion [6:09:58 PM](#):

Carl York, applicant, talked about the project, the previous requests, the original COA, and the current request.

Commissioner Svendsen asked about the history of the project.

The Commission and Staff Discussion [6:14:03 PM](#):

Commissioner Svendsen asked Parisi for further clarification of the previous submission compared to this current request.

Commissioner Richardson asked for clarification on the approval of this request.

Chairperson Peters asked Parisi for clarification on the chronology of the requests.

PUBLIC COMMENTS for Case number PLNHLC2017-00722 [6:17:16 PM](#)

No public comment.

Executive Session [6:17:35 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson commented that this is a good comprise on the west façade, and if the south and east façade remain as the original COA this will be a win-win.

Commissioner Petro–Eschler expressed that this is a cautionary tale for development practices in Salt Lake City; for several months in a row now they have heard developers say they ‘did not know’ regarding mistakes made in historic districts.

Commissioner Richardson mentioned just learning of a house on 500 South and 600 East that started with a roofing permit but are not partially tearing down the building.

Commissioner Petro-Eschler spoke of a house in the Avenues that was lost recently due to a gable collapse.

Commissioner Svendsen expressed frustration with the history of this case coming to the commission, receive a denial, appeal that decision, receive a denial, and then to come back to the commission and ask for another approval.

Planning Manager Robinson spoke about the chronology of the project and clarified, again, how this current request is a new, yet “frankensteined”, version of the original request.

Commissioner Petro-Eschler asked if anything being considered was once denied.

Planning Manager Robinson discussed that windows are addressed by their composition and not by each individual window.

Commissioner Svendsen asked how it is different.

Planning Manager Robinson further discussed the composition, what is already built, and what is being asked to be approved.

Principal Planner Lauren Parisi also stepped back in to help clarify everything.

MOTION to Approve made [6:27:38 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson moved: Based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the requested modifications to the original Certificate of Appropriateness regarding changes on the west elevation of the building for the new construction project at 613 E. 100 South; Case Number: PLNHLC2017-00722.

Specifically:

- Modifications to the fenestration for the doors.
- Aluminum clad wood windows except for three openings in shower rooms.

Commissioner Maw seconded the motion.

Commissioner Maw, Torres Mora, Richardson, Adams, Hyde, Petro–Eschler voted “Aye”.

Commissioner Svendsen voted “no”.

The motion to approve passed [6:29:21 PM](#)

Work Session [6:29:35 PM](#)

3. Masonic Temple Apartments – DB Urban Communities, representing the property owner, the Masonic Temple Association, has submitted an application for new construction for a multi-family residential development located at approximately 650 E. South Temple Street. The proposed development fronts on 600 East. Currently, the site is occupied by a surface parking lot. The subject property is located in Council District 4 represented by Ana Valdemoros. Staff contact is Lex Traughber and can be reached at (801)535-6184 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com. **Case Number is PLNHLC2019-00860.**

Senior Planner Lex Traughber discussed the Masonic Temple Apartment project (case number PLNHLC2019-00860).

- Rezone Request has been approved to RO (residential office) by City Council previously.
- This is essentially a complex design review; staff and applicant have worked diligently to bring this design forward to the HLC.
 - Staff has not identified any issues with the proposal.
 - Focus is on the seven standards for new construction and the associated multifamily design guidelines.
 - Input is requested from the Historic Landmark Commission to the applicant.

The Commission and Staff Discussion [6:34:15 PM](#):

Commission had no questions for staff.

Applicant Presentation [6:30:02 PM](#)

Dustin Holt of Dusty Baker Communities introduced his colleagues, Meghnad Aubry and David Abraham with Nexus Architects, all here representing the Masonic Temple Association and their project. Holt discussed the history of the project and the current design. He asked that the commission provide guidance for any changes they see needed. Holt thanked previous commissioners and staff that are no longer serving, but thanked them for their time and guidance on this project. He discussed the economic viability of the Masonic Temple and how this project will provide a stream of income to maintain the historic Masonic Temple building, and how this project will serve Salt Lake City’s master plan by developing underutilized land. Holt discussed the project’s process and the plans to keep the historic carriage house, or parts of it.

The Commission and Applicant Discussion [6:51:05 PM](#)

Commissioner Torres Mora asked Holt for the name of the apartments. He indicated that the project was originally named the Masonic Temple Apartments; however, once built they will have the name of Regius Flats or Regius Square, and 33 South 600 is the address they are working on.

Commissioner Richardson asked for clarification on parking: the entrance will be on the back of the building with ingress/egress from 600 East. The garage face will not be visible from 600 East.

Chairperson Kenton Peters asked for more information about the design approach for the 600 East façade and the historical nods. Architect Meghnad Aubry discussed the project's human scale, the choice of materials, and how this project will work with the existing surrounding buildings.

Chairperson Kenton Peters and Commissioner Richardson discussed the set back.

Commissioner Richardson discussed the trees on the 600 East and asked for plans to protect them, a mitigation plan if needed, and asked for further explanation on the set back on 600 East and asked about how high the grading is. Architect Meghnad Aubry discussed the yards starting at grade and moving up to being about 5 feet tall, and there is about a 15-foot set back from the sidewalk.

Chairperson Kenton Peters asked for a street scape on the west elevation to show the commission how this project relates to neighboring properties.

Commissioner Maw asked about the relationship to the parking lot to the east. Holt verified that there is not a plan to have any kind of transition between the back of this project and the parking lot to the east that is actively used by the Masonic Temple. He indicated that there is the entrance off South Temple, a hammerhead turnaround for a fire truck, and in the long-run there are hopes that an alley way will be created and possibly a parking structure added to the east parking lot.

Commissioner Richardson spoke about the balconies and appreciates that this project has usable balconies and indicated that HVAC systems should not be placed on any balconies. Holt agreed.

Commissioner Svendsen asked if there was going to be a pool. Holt indicated that there will not be a pool and then further discussed the amenity spaces.

Commissioner Torres Mora asked Holt if there will be any affordable housing units in the project. Holt indicated that this is a market rate project and it will not include any affordable housing units, though they were explored.

Commissioner Maw said she likes the building and likes the design.

Commissioner Petro–Eschler enjoys the way the project will complement the entire block.

Chairperson Kenton Peters wrapped up the conversation by asking the applicant to proceed as planned and indicated that the commission likes the project thus far.

Meeting adjourned [7:16:22 PM](#)