SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING City & County Building 451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah November 7, 2019

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at <u>5:34:50 PM</u>. Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting: Chairperson Kenton Peters; Commissioners Victoria Petro–Eschler, David Richardson, Paul Svendsen, Stanley Adams, and Michael Vela.

Excused from the Historic Landmark Commission meeting: Vice Chairperson Robert Hyde and Commissioners Esther Stowell, Rocío de María Torres Mora, and Jessica Maw.

Planning staff present at the meeting were Deputy Director Michaela Oktay, Senior Planner Amy Thompson, Senior Planner Sara Javoronok, and Administrative Secretary Merili Carter. City Attorney Paul Nielson was also in attendance.

Field Trip

A field trip was not held prior to the work session. Chairperson Kenton Peters misspoke about a field trip being held prior to the meeting. The field trip was canceled same day and was not scheduled to attend and he did not know it was canceled.

Commission Meeting Begins 5:34:50 PM

Discussion to approve the October 3, 2019, MEETING MINUTES 5:35:22 PM

MOTION to approve 5:35:44 PM

Commissioner Richardson moved to approve the October 3, 2019, meeting minutes. Commissioner Adams seconded the motion. All Commissioners were in favor. The motion passed unanimously.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR 5:35:45 PM

Chairperson Peters had nothing new to report.

Vice Chairperson Hyde was excused.

Commissioner Svendsen asked about the status of the appeal for Case No. PLNHLC2017-00722 (613 East 100 South / Applicant Tate Siemer). Deputy Director Oktay informed the commission that their decision was upheld and offered to send the hearing officer's decision on the appeal to the commissioners.

Deputy Director Oktay informed the commission that an appeal has been filed on case PLNHLC2019-00132 (171 West 300 North/ Applicant Preserve Partners) and that the applicant requested the mayor to be the hearing officer; date to be announced.

Deputy Director Oktay informed the commission that Senior Planner Carl Leith left Salt Lake City Corporation on October 31, 2019, after 10 years of service. The commission expressed their appreciation of Carl's unique contributions to the City and the preservation community.

Commissioner Richardson discussed his thoughts on window replacement companies and the need to push preservation of old windows.

Deputy Director Oktay discussed the high level of preservation knowledge and passion that will be required to fill Carl's now vacant position.

Commissioner Svendsen discussed the city's current historical overlay ordinance and the need to make it clearer when it comes to painting a contributing structure in a historic overlay district. Director Oktay and the commission discussed the ordinance, noticing, title process, and what/if changes can be made.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR 5:45:45 PM

Deputy Director Oktay discussed:

Extension Request: New Construction and associated Special Exceptions at approximately 1117 E South Temple- A request by Tariq Mughal for time extension for the original Historic Landmark Commission approval issued on December 7, 2018 for a Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction of a multi-family residential building and associated Special Exceptions at approximately 1117 E South Temple. A one-year extension of the original approval was granted by the Commission on January 3, 2019, and the applicant is requesting the commission extend the approval for an additional year. The subject property is located within Council District 4, by Ana Valdemoros, Staff contact is Amy Thompson 535-7281 represented (801)or amy.thompson@slcgov.com. Case Numbers PLNHLC2017-00560 & PLNHLC2017-00763.

Senior Planner Amy Thompson briefly discussed her memorandum on case number PLNHLC2017-00560 & PLNHLC2017-00763 and that the special exception was for grade changes in the rear yard.

Commissioner Svendsen moved to approve the extension. Commissioner Adams seconded the approval of the extension. Motion unanimously passes: **Extension Granted** at 5:47:22 PM

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS 5:47:46 PM

Cindy Cromer discussed Senior Planner Carl Leith's legacy in the preservation community.

PUBLIC HEARING for agenda item 5:49:54 PM

Alterations to Cottage and Additions to Adjacent Building at approximately 287 G Street and 480 6th

Avenue- Rodrigo Schmeil of Smith Hyatt Architects, on behalf of owner Pamella Jones Bloland, is requesting approval from the City to rehabilitate and to extend the existing cottage by removing the existing rear walls and constructing a new basement area. Proposals would also construct new additions to the adjacent commercial building on the south and the west side of the cottage. Special Exception approvals will be required in association with these proposals. The cottage would be rehabilitated and extended as a commercial unit. The property is situated on the corner of G Street and 6th Avenue, lies within The Avenues Historic District (H Historic Preservation Overlay), is zoned SR-1A (Special Development Pattern Residential District) and is within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. Staff contact is Sara Javoronok at (801) 535-7625 or sara.javoronok@slcgov.com.

- a. Alterations to Cottage and Additions to Adjacent Building. Case number: PLNHLC2018-00454.
- b. Special Exceptions. Case number: PLNHLC2018-00880
 - i. Side Yard Setback Building within the side yard required 4 feet setback by 4 inches (inline addition).
 - Building Coverage Increase in Building Coverage from 62% to 67% in SR-1A Zone District.

Senior Planner Sara Javoronok discussed Alterations to Cottage and Additions to Adjacent Building at approximately 287 G Street and 480 6th Avenue (Case numbers: PLNHLC2018-00454 and PLNHLC2018-00880).

- Senior Planner Carl Leith's work on these cases.
- Contributing building dates to the 1870s.
- One of the oldest homes in the Avenues.
- 2016 it was reviewed for its "contributing" status.
- Summer 2019 these same proposals were discussed with the commission in less detail.

The Commission and staff discussed the following <u>5:57:33 PM</u>:

- Completion of the lot line adjustments previously approved.
- Regrading the yard away from the building.

Applicant presentation <u>5:58:41 PM</u>:

Rodrigo Schmeil of Smith Hyatt Architects, on behalf of owner Pamella Jones Bloland discussed his architectural process used to honor the legacy and the preservation/rehabilitation of the property. Schmeil also discussed the current condition of the property.

The Commission and applicant discussed the following 6:03:49 PM:

- Commissioner Svendsen asked why the applicant is asking to expand the footprint.
 - o Applicant would like to access the commercial building from the garage.
 - Applicant would like to have more commercial square footage to help pay for the preservation/renovation.
- Commissioner Richardson asked how the extension relates to the neighboring building to the south.
 - The new addition will be set approximately a foot behind the current front yard set back of the building to the south.

PUBLIC COMMENTS for Case number PLNHLC2018-00454 and PLNHLC2018-00880 6:08:10 PM

Kevin Mass, neighbor to subject property, expressed his support of the project and appreciates the architect's effort to honor the legacy and preservation of the historic building. Mr. Mass did express concern about the current commercial tenant of the subject property and their use of lights at night and the externalities to the neighborhood. He would like to discuss light pollution with the property owner. Mr. Mass overall supports the project.

Rodrigo Schmeil of Smith Hyatt Architects, on behalf of owner Pamella Jones Bloland discussed support in discussing the externalities of using excess light at night and supports finding a solution.

Executive Session 6:11:29 PM

Commissioner Vela and Adams discussed their support in the preservation/renovation of the property.

Commissioner Svendsen and Richardson discussed concerns over the current zoning of the property, but they supports the project otherwise. Commissioner Richardson discussed the Planning Commission addressing the zoning change and the importance of the grade changes around the historic building.

Commissioner Petro–Eschler discussed her support for the project; however, she is disappointed that the historic home is being wrapped in a commercial space, but sees the preservation perspective. She hopes others property owners will see the benefits of innovatively preserving historic buildings. Commissioner Richardson and Petro-

Eschler discussed the use of glazing on the front wall of the addition to allow for a "see through" to the historic building; respecting the original structure.

Chairperson Peters discussed the historical precedent of marrying commercial and residential buildings together and that it was not always graceful.

MOTION to Approve made <u>6:16:25 PM</u>

Commissioner Richardson moved: Based on the information in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve PLNHLC2018-00454 Alterations to Cottage and Additions to Adjacent Building at approximately 287 G Street & 480 6th Avenue and approve PLNHLC2018-00880 Special Exceptions, with the condition listed in the staff report, with the following modifications:

- 1. Delegate approval of details to staff.
- 2. Grade changes to the front and corner side yards.

Commissioner Vela seconded the motion.

Commissioner Adams, Svendsen, Petro-Eschler, Chairperson Peters voted "Aye"

The motion to approve passed unanimously 6:17:45 PM

Other Business 6:17:59 PM

Chairperson Peters discussed the Chair and Vice Chair elections.

- Commissioner Richardson moved to elect Vice Chairperson Robert Hyde as chair.
- Chairperson Peters questioned if they should do that while Commissioner Hyde is absent.
- Commissioner Svendsen moved to elect Chairperson Peters as chair and Commissioner Hyde as vice chair for another year to maintain current leadership.
- Commissioner Vela and Adams seconded the motion.
- Commissioner Richardson and Petro–Eschler voted "Aye".
- Motion passes unanimously. 6:19:49 PM

Deputy Director Oktay led a training session for the commission 6:19:59 PM

Meeting adjourned 6:42:40 PM