

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING
City & County Building
451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah
March 7, 2019

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:33:27 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Vice Chairperson, Robert Hyde; Commissioners Stanley Adams, Thomas Brennan, Sheleigh Harding, David Richardson, Charles Shepherd, Esther Stowell and Paul Svendsen. Chairperson Peters and Commissioner Victoria Petro-Eschler were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were Nick Norris, Planning Director; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Lex Traughber, Senior Planner; Amy Thompson, Senior Planner; Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner and Marlene Rankins, Administrative Secretary.

Field Trip

A field trip was cancelled.

APPROVAL OF THE FEBRUARY 7, 2019, MEETING MINUTES.

MOTION [5:33:58 PM](#)

Commissioner Adams moved to approve the February 7, 2019, meeting minutes. Commissioner Brennan seconded the motion. Commissioners Brennan, Stowell, Shepherd, Richardson, Adams and Svendsen were in favor. Commissioner Harding abstained as she was not present for the February 7, 2019 meeting. The motion passed 6-1.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR [5:34:18 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters was not present.

Vice Chairperson Hyde stated he had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR [5:34:24 PM](#)

Nick Norris, Planning Director, informed the Commission on the fire in the contributing apartment buildings in the Central City Historic District, 521 South 500 East. He stated that the full extent of the fire damage is currently unknown.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

[5:36:27 PM](#)

Relocation of 665 E. Ely Place - A request by Trolley Square Ventures, LLC, to relocate the structure located at 665 E. Ely Place to 636 E. Sego Avenue in the Central City Historic District. The property where the structure is currently located is zoned FB-UN2 (Form Based Urban Neighborhood District). The property where the structure is proposed to be relocated is zoned SR-3 (Special Development Pattern Residential District) and is located within City Council District 4. (Staff contact: Lex Traughber at (801) 535-6184 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com). **Case number PLNHLC2018-00966**

[5:36:33 PM](#) Commissioners Sheleigh Harding and Stanley Adams presented a conflict of interested and stepped away from the table for this item.

Lex Traugher, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification regarding the term relocation

Doug White, applicant, provided further details regarding the proposed petition and was available for questions.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Subdivision status
- Clarification of reason for 3 lots versus 2
- Whether relocation was separate from exterior additions
- Clarification with the standard regarding a professional building mover
- Whether the previous approval was similar to this request

PUBLIC HEARING [5:51:53 PM](#)

Vice Chairperson Hyde opened the Public Hearing;

Cindy Cromer – Stated she is in support of the relocation and would like to see the house maintain its historical value and look.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Vice Chairperson Hyde closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission and Staff further discussed the following:

- The definition of relocation
- Time frame of reconstruction
- Clarification with standards that were previously approved

MOTION [6:07:30 PM](#)

Commissioner Svendsen stated, based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for relocation have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Commission approve the request for relocation of the structure located at approximately 665 E. Ely Place. Specifically, the Commission finds that the proposed project substantially complies with Standards for Certificate of Appropriateness for Relocation of a Landmark Site or Contributing Structure: In considering an application for a certificate of appropriateness for relocation of a landmark site or a contributing structure, the historic landmark commission shall find that the project substantially complies with the following standards:

- 1. The proposed relocation will abate demolition of the structure;**
- 2. The proposed relocation will not diminish the overall physical integrity of the district or diminish the historical associations used to define the boundaries of the district;**
- 3. The proposed relocation will not diminish the historical or architectural significance of the structure;**
- 4. The proposed relocation will not have a detrimental effect on the structural soundness of the building or structure;**
- 5. A financial guarantee to ensure the rehabilitation of the structure once the relocation has occurred is provided to the city**

And a professional building mover and/ or contractor will move the components of the building and protect them while being stored.

Discussion was made with clarification regarding the professional mover standard.

Commissioner Stowell seconded the motion. Commissioners Brennan, Stowell, Shepherd, Richardson and Svendsen voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

[6:11:14 PM](#) Commissioners Harding and Adams rejoined the meeting.

[6:11:26 PM](#)

New Construction at 170 West 600 North – Wayne Gordon with AMD Architecture, representing Rhama Rentals, LLC, property owner, is requesting design approval to construct a new single-family home at 170 West 600 North, which is located in the Capitol Hill Local Historic District. The proposal also includes a detached two-car garage at the rear of the lot, which would have an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU) located on the second level. The project requires review and approval of the following petitions:

- a. A Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for New Construction is required to allow for the construction of the new home and detached accessory structure. (Case number PLNHLC2018-00942).
- b. The applicant has requested two (2) Special Exceptions (Case number PLNHLC2019- 00111):
 - i. The placement of window wells in the side yard of the principal structure that exceed the maximum permitted width of six feet (6’),
 - ii. To permit the proposed accessory structure with ADU to have a footprint that exceeds fifty percent (50%) of the footprint of the principal structure.

The site is located Council District 3 represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contacts: Ashley Scarff - (801) 535-7660 or ashley.scarff@slcgov.com / Amy Thompson - (801) 535-7281 or amy.thompson@slcgov.com).

Amy Thompson, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the petition with the conditions listed in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification with the two special exceptions being requested
- Zoning allowance and accessory dwelling units

Angela Dean, AMD Architecture; Jack Reinhard, applicant and Wayne Gordon, AMD Architecture. Wayne provided a sample of the slate material to be used and provided design details.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Discussion was made whether the private ally issue mentioned in the staff report was resolved
- Whether the proposed easement condition would affect the applicant

PUBLIC HEARING [6:26:25 PM](#)

Vice Chairperson Hyde opened the public hearing;

Scott Christensen – Raised his concerns regarding the proposed project.

Brian Hutchinson – Provided pictures of neighboring historic homes and stated his concerns regarding the project.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Vice Chairperson Hyde closed the public hearing.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification on the existing structure and accessory buildings
- Elevations of the street scape

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Use of the current standing garage

The applicant addressed the comments questions and concerns.

FAILED MOTION: [6:51:16 PM](#)

Commissioner Svendsen stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve petition PLNHLC2018-00942, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the New Construction of a single-family home and accessory structure that contains an ADU, and petition PLNHLC2019- 00111, which is a request for two (2) Special Exceptions: one for the placement of window wells in the side yard of the principal structure that exceed the maximum permitted width, and another to permit the proposed accessory structure with ADU to have a footprint that exceeds fifty percent (50%) of the footprint of the principal structure, with the following direction:

- 1. Approval of all final design details, including specific direction expressed by the Commission, shall be delegated to Planning Staff.**
- 2. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall complete the Lot Line Adjustment process (through to recordation) so the parcel's lot lines reflect what is shown on the submitted site plan. The following must be met:**
 - a. Adjustments made to 170 West 600 North (subject parcel) shall result in a minimum lot size of at least 5,000 sf and a lot width that is not less than 42.4 feet (measured at the front yard setback line of 15 feet, 8 inches (15', 8")).**
 - b. Adjustments made to 172 West 600 North shall result in lot area and width that are no less than what is currently existing on site.**

Commissioner Adams seconded the motion. Commissioners Svendsen, Adams, and Richardson voted "Aye". Commissioners Harding, Shepherd, Stowell and Brennan voted "Nay". The motion failed 4-3.

Executive discussion was made regarding the conditions of the motion and whether additional information should be provided for future review.

MOTION [7:02:34 PM](#)

Commissioner Harding stated, in the case of PLNHLC2018-00942 and petition PLNHLC2019-00111, I move that we table these until the applicant is ready to return.

Commissioner Richardson seconded the motion. All commissioners were in favor. The motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Svendsen excused himself from the remaining part of the meeting.

WORK SESSION

[7:03:26 PM](#)

4th Avenue Pump House –The Historic Landmark Commission will hold a second work session on a proposal by Salt Lake City Public Utilities for the new construction and special exceptions associated with a pump house located at 4th Avenue and North Canyon Road (official address 300 N. Canyon Road). The purpose of the pump house is to provide drinking water to the community and to ensure the well, located on the site, is safe and secure. The pump house will contain equipment necessary to operate the well and the required chemicals to treat the water. This will be a work session review, no formal public hearing will be held and a decision will not be made at this meeting. The subject property lies within the Avenues Historic District (H Historic Preservation Overlay), is zoned OS (Open Space) and is located within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Kelsey Lindquist, (801) 535-7930 or kelsey.lindquist@slcgov.com) **Case numbers PLNHLC2018-00557 & PLNHLC2018-00558**

Kelsey Lindquist, Senior Planner, briefed the Commission regarding the proposed petition and provided a presentation.

Jesse Stewart, Public Utilities Deputy Director; Kirk Bagley, Bowen Collins and Associates; John Ewanowski, CRSA – provided a further design details regarding the proposed project.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- The height of the building
- Length of pipe meters
- Suggestion of drinking water fountain
- Decorative fencing around electrical box
- Possibility of pitched roof and articulated façade
- General designs and dimensional concerns

The meeting adjourned at [7:53:31 PM](#)