

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING
City & County Building
451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah
JANUARY 3, 2019

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:34:32 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Kenton Peters, Vice Chairperson Robert Hyde; Commissioners Thomas Brennan, Sheleigh Harding, David Richardson, Charles Shepherd, Esther Stowell and Paul Svendsen. Commissioner Victoria Petro-Eschler was excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director, Paul Nielson, Attorney; Amy Thompson, Senior Planner; Carl Leith, Senior Planner and Deborah Severson, Administrative Secretary.

Field Trip

The field trip was cancelled.

APPROVAL OF THE NOVEMBER 1, 2018, MEETING MINUTES. [5:35:32 PM](#)

MOTION [5:35:46 PM](#)

Commissioner Hyde moved to approve the November 1, 2018, meeting minutes. Commissioner Stowell seconded the motion. All Commissioners voted "Aye" with the exception of one abstained. The motion passed 6-1.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR [5:36:19 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Hyde stated he had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR [5:36:31 PM](#)

Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director, stated she had nothing to report.

[5:36:45 PM](#)

Request for Extension of Approval – New Construction at Approximately 563 E 600 S - Kristen Clifford, the consultant who represents the property owner, Ernesto Gutierrez, is requesting the Historic Landmark Commission grant a time extension on approval of New Construction of a Mixed-Use building at approximately 563 E. 600 S in the Central City Local Historic District. The Commission granted approval for this project on December 7, 2017. (Staff contact: Amy Thompson at (801) 535-7281 or amy.thompson@slcgoc.com) **Case number PLNHLC2017-00555**

Amy Thompson, Senior Planner, provided an overview of the petition and reasoning for the request of extension of time.

MOTION [5:38:44 PM](#)

Commissioner Brennan stated, I move to approve a twelve-month continuation of the request for PLNHLC2017-00555.

Commissioner Harding seconded. Commissioners Svendsen, Hyde, Shepherd, Brennan, Stowell, Richardson and Harding voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

[5:39:31 PM](#)

Request for Extension of Approval – New Construction and Special Exception at Approximately 1117 E South Temple – Tariq Mughal, property owner, is requesting the Historic Landmark Commission grant a time extension on approval of New Construction and associated Special Exceptions to develop a 12-unit multi-family building at approximately 1117 E South Temple in the South Temple Local Historic District. The Commission granted conditional approval for this project on December 7, 2017. (Staff contact: Amy Thompson at (801) 535- 7281 or amy.thompson@slcgov.com) **Case number PLNHLC2017-00560 and PLNHLC2017-00763**

Amy Thompson, Senior Planner, provided an overview of the petition and reasoning for the request of extension of time.

MOTION [5:41:03 PM](#)

Commissioner Harding stated, I grant a one-year extension.

Commissioner Hyde seconded. Commissioners Harding, Richardson, Stowell, Brennan, Shepherd, Hyde and Svendsen voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENTS [5:41:44 PM](#)

Cindy Cromer – Stated she commended the Commission for their work on important projects.

[5:43:39 PM](#)

Twin Home Development at approximately 578 and 610 N. West Capitol Street - Dustin Holt, DB Urban Communities, is requesting approval from the City for the construction of 12 twin homes, and associated Special Exception approvals, on a steeply sloping site which fronts Darwin Street to the east and West Capitol Street to the west. The development site consists of two distinct parcels. The development will require a subdivision of this site which will be the subject of a separate application.

- a. New Construction of 12 twin home dwellings. **Case number: PLNHLC2017-00696**
- b. Special Exceptions sought in SR-1A Zone District. **Case number: PLNHLC2018-00930**
 - i. Building Height – Several buildings exceed the maximum building height - ranging from 1 ft to 8 ft.
 - ii. Wall Height – Several buildings exceed the maximum wall height – ranging from 2 ft to 8 ft.
 - iii. Setbacks – A reduced side yard setback of 5 ft is sought for five lots.
 - iv. Grading – Several buildings would require grading in excess of 4 ft.

The site falls within the Capitol Hill District and is zoned SR-1A (Special Development Pattern Residential). The development site lies within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton (Staff contact: Carl Leith at (801)535-7758 or carl.leith@slcgov.com.)

Carl Leith, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the application for certificate of appropriateness and approve the special request associated with these proposals with the conditions listed in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Clarification on defining the existing grade and proposed grade, and the associated offset for proposed building height and special exception purposes
- City ordinance for measuring height above grade for a finished building
- Whether there is an easement agreement
- Clarification on where the streets, sidewalks and alley are located relative to the site

Dustin Holt, Applicant, provided further details regarding the proposed project. He also addressed questions and concerns raised by the Commission.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Whether there is currently illegal dumping on the site
- Site elevations
- Whether there were any studies on single car garage door openings on 2 car garages
- Compatibility with the neighborhood
- Side facade entry and access
- Clarification on the difference between the Alta Survey and final grade as defined by the application drawings

PUBLIC HEARING [6:53:24 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Joan Degiorgio – Stated she provided a letter regarding her concerns and touched on some key points regarding her concern regarding compatibility with the neighborhood.

Mark Milligan – Stated he had concerns regarding the wall height against his property and the lot width for buildings 11 and 12.

Bruce Shapiro – Stated he is in favor of the petition but is opposed to staff having authority over approvals and believes it should stay with the Commission.

Frank Pignanelli – Stated he's in favor of the petition.

Lewis Downey – Provided a comment card after the meeting adjourned stating that he is in support of the petition.

The Commission made the following comments:

- It would be helpful to have the existing context nailed down and the existing context of neighboring homes addressed more definitively. Dimensions for setbacks from the streets and the dimensions of the width of the lots perpendicular to the development would be useful to support the project. Information to understand better what the materials are for the details and traditional patterns of the buildings themselves would be valuable. Entrances, porches, wayfinding elements, etc.
- Concerned with the rhythm and scale of these buildings compared to the smaller surrounding homes.
- The comparative context to the adjacent historical structures, in particular on West Capitol, is really important to understand and address.

MOTION [7:27:01 PM](#)

Commissioner Harding stated, I move in the case of PLNHLC2017-00696 and PLNHLC2017-00930 that we table this to provide further detail as set forth in our discussion, to the next meeting or within the next six months.

Commissioner Richardson seconded the motion. Commissioners Svendsen, Hyde, Shepherd, Brennan, Stowell, Richardson, and Harding voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at [7:28:26 PM](#)