

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING
City & County Building
451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah
AUGUST 2, 2018

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:30:17 PM](#) . Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Charles Shepherd, Vice Chairperson Kenton Peters; Commissioners Sheleigh Harding, Robert Hyde, Victoria Petro – Eschler, David Richardson, Esther Stowell and Paul Svendsen. Commissioner Stanley Adams, Thomas Brennan and Rachel Quist were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were Nick Norris, Planning Director; Molly Robinson, Manager; Paul Nielson, Attorney; Carl Leith, Senior Planner; David Gellner, Principal Planner and Marlene Rankins, Administrative Secretary.

Field Trip

The field trip was cancelled.

APPROVAL OF THE JUNE 28, 2018, MEETING MINUTES. [5:30:57 PM](#)

The minutes for June 28, 2018 was unanimously approved.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR

Chairperson Shepherd stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Peters stated he had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR

Mr. Nick Norris, Planning Director, updated the Commission that the City Council is going to be discussing some changes to the sign ordinance as to what defines a vintage sign and allows it to be relocated, reuse, etc. when it meets those qualifications for vintage signs. It's a way for us to help preserve the more historic signs that may be outside of historic districts.

GENERAL PUBLIC HEARING [5:33:24 PM](#)

Chairperson Shepherd opened the Public Hearing;

Cindy Cromer – Expressed her liking of the turn out on the project known as 935 on 9th East.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Shepherd closed the General Public Hearing.

[5:36:00 PM](#)

Construction of Three Single Family Attached Dwellings and Demolition of Non-Contributing Structure at approximately 275 N Vine Street – Pierre Langue, Axis Architects, on behalf of owner Chad Spector, is requesting approval from the City to build three new single

family attached residences in the Capitol Hill Historic District. The subject property is zoned RMF-75 (High Density Multi-Family Residential District) and is located in City Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. This application must be reviewed by the Historic Landmark Commission because it is new construction in a local historic district. (Staff contact: Carl Leith 801-535-7758 or carl.lieth@slcgov.com) **Case Number PLNHLC2018-00219**

Commissioner Svendsen stepped out for the item due to conflict of interest.

Mr. Carl Leith, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the application with the condition that design details are delegated to Staff for approval.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- The street scape and whether it's a mismatch or match
- Front porches

Pierre Langue, Axis Architects, addressed several points the Commission had previously requested, which include:

- The design guidelines
- Entrance and front porch
- Concerns that were emailed by the public regarding the project.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Property line and the 2 foot elevation difference

PUBLIC HEARING [6:00:01 PM](#)

Chairperson Shepherd opened the Public Hearing;

Kelly Badger – provided clarification with the boundary wall limit that goes between the two properties. He also raised concern regarding cars sliding with the snow into his home.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Shepherd closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [6:03:15 PM](#)

Commissioner Peters stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony received and the revised proposal presented, I move that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the application PLNHLC2018-00219. New construction of three attached single family dwellings with the following condition: that approval of details is delegated to Staff.

Motion was Second. Commissioners Hyde, Harding, Peters, Eschler, Richardson and Stowell voted “Aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

Commissioner Svendsen rejoined the group for the remainder of the items.

[6:04:25 PM](#)

Rear Addition to Dwelling at approximately 774 E Third Avenue – A request by Hannah Vaughn, Vaughn Yribar Architecture, on behalf of owners Sara Baldwin-Auck and Nate Auck, for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a two-story addition to the rear of the existing single-story house. The proposed addition is being referred to the Historic Landmark Commission because the rear addition would exceed the height of the principal structure. The proposed addition would require special exception approvals for an in-line addition and roof height exceeding the zoning standard. The subject property is located in the SR-1A zone, The Avenues Historic District and is within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Carl Leith 801-535-7758 or carl.leith@slcgov.com)

a. Rear Addition to Single Family Residence. Case Number PLNHLC2018-00247

b. Special Exceptions: Request to construct an in-line addition to the existing house and request to construct a rear addition which would exceed the maximum roof height by approximately 3 feet 4 inches and maximum wall height by approximately 2 feet 7 inches.
Case Number PLNHLC2018-00248

Mr. Carl Leith, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the application for certificate for appropriateness for the new addition, construction of the accessory building and replacement of the windows and approve the special exceptions requests associated with these proposals with the condition that approval of details is delegated to Staff.

Hannah Vaughn, Architect, was open to address any questions or concerns.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- Large expanses of glazing and lack of shading on the housing
- Height of the root cellar and its entrance

PUBLIC HEARING [6:26:17 PM](#)

Chairperson Shepherd opened the Public Hearing; seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Shepherd closed the Public Hearing.

Commissioners moved into executive session [6:26:24 PM](#)

The Commission expressed concerns and thoughts.

MOTION [6:32:38 PM](#)

Commissioner Peters stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, the Staff recommends that the Commission approve the application for a Certificate of

appropriateness for the new addition, the construction of the accessory building, replacement of the windows and approve the special exception requests associated with these proposals with the following condition: That approval of details is delegated to Staff.

Commissioner Harding stated to clarify that he read that Staff recommends but he's actually moving the approval.

Commissioner Peters confirmed that it is his motion to move the approval.

Motion was second. Commissioners Stowell, Richardson, Eschler, Peters, Svendsen and Hyde voted "Aye". Commissioner Harding voted "Nay". The motion passed 6-1.

[6:34:05 PM](#)

WORK SESSION

Rehabilitation of Cottage and New Additions at approximately 287 N G Street and 480 E Sixth Avenue – The Historic Landmark Commission will hold a work session to provide preliminary review of a proposal and application by Rodrigo Schmeil, Smith Hyatt Architects, on behalf of owner Pamela Jones Boland, to retain, rehabilitate and/or reconstruct the existing cottage with new basement area, linking this to new rear additions alongside the adjacent commercial building. The property is situated on the corner of G Street and 6th Avenue. This will be a work session review; no formal public hearing will be held and a decision will not be made at this meeting. The subject property lies within The Avenues Historic District (H Historic Preservation Overlay), is zoned SR-1A (Special Development Pattern Residential District) within Council District 3, represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact Carl Leith 801-535-7758 or carl.leith@slcgov.com) **Case Number PLNHLC2018-00454**

Mr. Carl Leith, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Memorandum.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Preference of Staff between options
- Elimination of the roof
- Structural issues

Pamella Boland, Rodrigo Schmeil, and Max Angle, Applicants, reviewed the history and lack of maintenance on the property. They stated the proposal would meet current size and energy codes and help to preserve the historical building.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- How other cities handled historic buildings
- Practicalities of how to accomplish the rebuilding of the house
- Whether the building is a contributing building if it's disassembled and reassembled
- What is the National Park Service's view
- How the structural integrity will be maintained

- The dismantling of the building
- The possibility of augmenting the structure
- The size of the property
- The views of the south elevation
- Materials being used and preservation of historical materials
- The difference between a remodel and new construction using old materials
- Whether there was or wasn't a porch
- Whether the project will require a rezone or not

The Commission recommended the Applicants do some research as to what the National Park Service has done in the past with similar situations and remodels.

[7:47:03 PM](#)

Adaptive Reuse Ordinance - Planning staff will update the Commission on efforts to develop an adaptive reuse ordinance to help achieve adopted city goals related to historic preservation, housing, sustainability, and economic development. The purpose of an adaptive reuse ordinance is to promote the reuse of existing buildings to achieve city goals versus demolishing buildings when the building is no longer economically viable for the original or current use. (Staff contact: David J. Gellner at (801-535-6107 or david.gellner@slcgov.com))

Mr. Nick Norris, Planning Director, stated the City currently has Adaptive Reuse Ordinance that only applies to Landmark sites and one of the things that we have been exploring is the role of an adaptive reuse ordinance based on results that have been seen in other cities in various scales from small to large and the benefits as a result of using the Adaptive Reuse Ordinance. We are currently exploring the idea of adopting a similar ordinance and the work session is to provide an overview of the ordinance and how it's used to help preserve some of the more historic building that may not be locally designated or in a historic district.

Mr. David Gellner, Principal Planner, provided further details and benefits of the use of Adaptive Reuse Ordinance to achieve the preservation of historical buildings.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- The possibility of becoming a great tool to incentivize preservation
- Scales of arbitrary age of buildings to be preserved
- Flexibility of building codes with the ordinance
- Houses being turned into apartments and what the benefits are with the ordinance
- Will the ordinance allow to circumvent the underlining existing zoning

OTHER BUSINESS

Chair and Vice Chair Elections were postponed until September 6, 2018.

The meeting adjourned at [8:11:27 PM](#)