

**SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION**  
**Meeting Minutes**  
**451 South State Street, Room 326**  
**April 5, 2018**

A roll is kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:33:28 PM](#) . Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained in the Planning Office for an indefinite period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Charles Shepherd; Commissioners Thomas Brennan, Sheleigh Harding, David Richardson, Esther Stowell, Rachel Quist and Paul Svendsen. Commissioners, Stanley Adams, Robert Hyde, Victoria Petro-Eschler and Vice Chairperson Kenton Peters were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager; Carl Leith, Senior Planner; Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner; Deborah Severson, Administrative Secretary and Paul Nielson, Senior City Attorney.

**FIELD TRIP NOTES:**

- No field trip was held for this meeting.

[5:34:11 PM](#)

**APPROVAL OF THE MARCH 1, 2018, MINUTES.**

**MOTION**

**Commissioner Richardson moved to approve the minutes from the March 1, 2018. Commissioner Harding seconded the motion. Commissioners Brennan, Harding, Richardson, Stowell and Svendsen voted “aye”. Commissioners Quist abstained from voting as she was not present at the subject meeting. The motion passed unanimously.**

[5:34:48 PM](#)

**REPORT OF THE CHAIR OR VICE CHAIR**

Chairperson Shepherd stated that Commissioner Brennan and he participated in the Rose Center Public Policy Institute workshop. Chairperson Shepherd and Commissioner Brennan gave an overview of the workshop.

Ms. Michaela Oktay, Deputy Planning Director, added that the Planning Division has compiled a list of action items that resulted from the workshop, and will focus on implementing some of the recommendations by May 2018.

[5:39:10 PM](#)

**DEPUTY DIRECTOR’S REPORT**

Ms. Oktay stated that the City Council adopted the New Construction and Demolition/Economic Hardship text amendments.

Ms. Oktay announced that the Economic Hardship Review Panel will hold a public

hearing for Bishop Place on April 11, 2018 at 2:00 p.m. in the City & County Building in Room 118. The Review Panel Members are Claudia O'Grady (Mayor's choice), Lewis Frances (Historic Landmark Commission's choice) and Merlyn Taylor (Applicant's choice).

[5:43:30 PM](#)

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

Chairperson Shepherd opened the Public Comment Period, seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Shepherd closed the Public Comment Period.

[5:43:48 PM](#)

**The Rose New Construction & Special Exception at approximately 525, 527 & 537 South 500 East - Jake Williams and Jon Galbraith with CW Urban, LLC, property owner and developer, are requesting approval of the design of a multi-family structure containing four (4) dwelling units at the above listed address in the Central City Local Historic District. The subject parcels are zoned RMF-35 (Moderate Density Multi-Family Residential). The project requires approval for New Construction within a Historic District, as well as Special Exception approval to allow for the placement of refuse and recycling dumpsters within an interior side yard setback area. The site is in Council District 4 represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff contact: Ashley Scarff at (801)535-7660 or [ashley.scarff@slcgov.com](mailto:ashley.scarff@slcgov.com).) Case numbers PLNHLC2017-00658 & PLNHLC2018-00141). (Administrative matter)**

Ms. Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner, gave an overview of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request with conditions.

[5:55:19 PM](#)

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Open space and maximum building coverage.

[5:56:49 PM](#)

Mr. Jon Galbraith (Architect) and Mr. Jake Williams, representing CW Urban, LLC, reviewed the design, materials and layout of the proposal.

[6:02:30 PM](#)

The Commission and Applicants discussed the following:

- Building placement and design options addressing integration and separation of greenspace for private and common spaces, and access to refuse and recycling dumpsters.
- Side yard access to the back three units.
- Massing of the exterior wall on the south façade.

- Rhythm and spacing of the door and windows on the front (west) façade.
- Front canopy, porch and entrance features.
- Visual compatibility with surrounding structures.
- Interior design, square footage and integration of patio space above garages.
- Rhythm and spacing of doors and windows, and exterior finish on the north façade. (Entrances for the back three units.)
- Foundation expression.

[6:33:53 PM](#)

### **PUBLIC HEARING**

Chairperson Shepherd opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wishing to speak; Chairperson Shepherd closed the Public Hearing.

[6:33:53 PM](#)

The Commission discussed and stated the following:

- Rework the fenestration to address the rhythm and spacing discord on the south elevation.
- Provide additional fenestration to the north elevation.
- A diminished prominence of the first level resulting from the projection of the second and third levels, and a lack of foundation expression.
- Justification for applying multi-family standards to single-family attached units.

[6:40:50 PM](#)

### **MOTION**

**Commissioner Svendsen stated that his analysis was almost consistent with the Staff recommendation, and so based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing; Commissioner Svendsen moved that the Commission approve Petition PLNHLC2017-00658, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction of a multi-family structure at 525, 527 and 537 S 500 East; and Petition PLNHLC2018-00141, a request for a Special Exception for the proposed placement of refuse and recycling containers within an interior side yard, with the following conditions:**

- 1. Approval of all final design details, including specific direction expressed by the Commission, shall be delegated to Planning Staff. The specific direction is the fenestration pattern on the north and south walls.**
- 2. Streetscape and pedestrian improvements and any change in its appearance shall be compatible to the historic character of the landmark site or H historic preservation overlay district. The Applicants shall submit a site plan with detail that is sufficient to facilitate final approval from Staff.**

Commissioner Richardson seconded the motion. Commissioners Quist, Stowell, Richardson and Svendsen voted “aye”. Commissioners Brennan and Harding voted “nay”. The motion passed with a 4-2 vote.

[6:43:49 PM](#)

The Commission recessed.

[6:49:01 PM](#)

**New Single Family Dwelling at approximately 717 South 500 East** - Eve Knott, representing owner Tyson Andrus, is requesting approval from the City to construct a single family residence at the above listed address. The lot is currently vacant, is zoned RMF-30 (Low Density Multi-Family Residential) and is in the Central City Historic District protected by the H Historic Preservation Overlay. The proposed development requires approval from the Historic Landmark Commission for New Construction in an historic district and several associated Special Exceptions. The subject property is within Council District 4 represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff contact: Carl Leith at (801)535 7758 or [carl.leith@slcgov.com](mailto:carl.leith@slcgov.com)). (Administrative matter)

- a. New construction of single family dwelling. Case number: PLNHLC2018-00007
- b. Special Exceptions. Case number: PLNHLC2018-00107
  - I. Request to construct the building with external access stair to basement level extending 4 feet 8 inches into the inner side yard setback area along south side of the building.
  - II. Request to construct the building with a southern central section which projects approximately 2 feet into the inner side yard setback area.
  - III. Request to construct the building where the front facade, roof canopies and eaves which would project into the front yard and inner side yard setback areas for the building to a maximum of 5 feet 6 inches.

Mr. Carl Leith, Senior Planner, gave an overview of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request as presented.

[7:00:45 PM](#)

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Adjacent and surrounding development.
- The proposed setback which meets the average setback along the block face.

[7:02:38 PM](#)

Mr. Josh Parkin (Harris Architecture) and Mr. Ed Axley (Davies Design Build) reviewed the purpose of the design.

[7:04:10 PM](#)

The Commission and Applicants discussed the following:

- Relocating the window well on the west (front) elevation to the north (side) elevation.
- Proposed landscaping.

[7:07:30 PM](#)

### **PUBLIC HEARING**

Chairperson Shepherd opened the Public Hearing.

The following individual spoke to the petition:

- Cindy Cromer

The following comments were made:

- Concerns relating to the visual impact of the streetscape and pedestrian view, and “up staging” the historic character of existing structures as a whole.
- Lack of information in applications to make sound judgement on visual impacts.

Chairperson Shepherd closed the Public Hearing.

[7:12:01 PM](#)

The Commission discussed and stated the following:

- The front façade creates an interesting transition from the rhythm of the neighborhood to the large scale structure to the north.
- The proposal has design improvements compared to previous designs reviewed by the Commission.
- The proposal has design elements that interact with surrounding development.
- Notable definition of foundation.
- Consider removing the window well on the front elevation, and capturing natural light from south or west elevations.
- The front balcony on the second level has an urban design impression seemingly intended for storage rather than a front porch common to historic design intended to invite neighborhood interaction.
- Reconsider the scale and design of the two front floor-to-ceiling windows.

[7:16:19 PM](#)

**MOTION**

Commissioner Harding stated that based on the analysis and findings listed in the staff report and testimony presented, Commissioner Harding moved that the Commission approve the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction and approve the special exceptions subject to the following condition:

1. The detailed design approval is delegated to Staff.

Commissioner Svendsen seconded the motion. Commissioners Quist, Brennan, Stowell, Richardson, Harding and Svendsen voted “aye”. The motion passed unanimously.

[7:17:33 PM](#)

**Training Session**

The training session will be rescheduled at a later date.

The meeting adjourned at [7:18:09 PM](#)