

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING
City & County Building
451 South State Street, Room 326, Salt Lake City, Utah
November 1, 2018

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:32:40 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained for a period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Kenton Peters, Vice Chairperson Robert Hyde; Commissioners Thomas Brennan, Sheleigh Harding, Victoria Petro – Eschler, David Richardson, Charles Shepherd, Esther Stowell and Paul Svendsen. Commissioner Stanley Adams was excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were Michaela Oktay, Planning Deputy Director; Carl Leith, Senior Planner; Lex Traughber, Senior Planner; Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner, and Deborah Severson, Administrative Secretary.

Field Trip

A field trip was held prior to the work session. Historic Landmark Commissioners present were: Robert Hyde, Kenton Peters, Charles Shepherd, Esther Stowell, and Paul Svendsen. Staff members in attendance were Michaela Oktay, Lex Traughber, Carl Leith, Mayara Lima, Ashley Scarff and Molly Robinson.

- **2 South 400 West** - Staff gave an overview of the proposal.
- **1017 E 1st Ave** – Staff gave an overview of the proposal.

APPROVAL OF THE SEPTEMBER 6, 2018, MEETING MINUTES. [5:34:31 PM](#)

MOTION [5:35:17 PM](#)

Commissioner Stowell moved to approve the September 6, 2018, meeting minutes. Commissioner Hyde seconded the motion. All voted in favor. The motion passed unanimously.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR [5:34:21 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Hyde stated he had nothing to report.

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR [5:33:35 PM](#)

Michaela Oktay, Deputy Director, gave the Commission an update with the Mayor's decision on the Economic Hardship review panel findings for Bishop Place.

[5:35:40 PM](#)

New Construction at approximately 690 N. West Capitol Street - Jacob Ballstaedt, Garbett Homes, is requesting approval for new construction of 10 single-family dwellings (twin homes) on their own individual lots at approximately 690 N. West Capitol Street in the Capitol Hill Historic District. The property is currently vacant. The subject parcel is zoned SR-1A (Special Development Pattern Residential District). The project requires review and approval of the following petitions:

a. New Construction - This project request requires approval by the Historic Landmark Commission for new construction of principal buildings in an historic district. **Case number PLNHLC2017-00941**

b. Two Special Exceptions: **Case number PLNHLC2018-00096**

i. The applicant requests that the building height be flexible and modified by up to one foot (1') from the average building height on the block face of twenty-six feet one inch (26'1") to allow for building accommodation of cases where extreme cross slopes exist.

ii. The applicant requests modifications of interior side yard wall height (maximum 16' in the SR-1A Zone) of up to five feet (5') for a maximum of twenty-one feet (21'), to allow for building accommodation of extreme cross slope conditions, particularly those affected by the area of the natural swale on the property. The subject property is within Council District 3 represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Lex Traughber at (801)535-6184 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com).

[5:36:57 PM](#)

All Commissioners were in favor to reopening the Public Hearing.

Lex Traughber, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request as modified from the original plans.

Jacob Ballstaedt, Applicant; Tyler Kirk, Architect; and Scott Howell, with Garbett Homes provided the Commission with an updated review of the petition. They provided a presentation along with details of proposed changes to the petition.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Whether the homes will be sold individually
- Façade landscaping
- Whether landscaping will be provided in the backyards
- Retaining walls between units
- Whether there will be a new sewer line in place

PUBLIC HEARING [5:48:47 PM](#)

Chairperson Peters opened the Public Hearing;

Randal McNair – Provided a comment card but did not wish to speak.

Minta Brandon – Raised concern with the compatibility of the neighborhood.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Peters closed the public hearing.

The applicant addressed the concerns raised during the public hearing.

The Commission and Applicant further discussed the following:

- Fire truck turnaround

The Commission made the following comments:

- I appreciate the developer for engaging with the neighborhood
- It was helpful to see that the applicant has taken the time to take the public comments into account and the details of addressing issues
- I like it, it's a good use of a difficult piece of property
- I think this is a really responsible way to honor the ethos of the neighborhood and the topography that they're working with

MOTION [6:01:56 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson stated, based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for approval for the proposed special exceptions have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Commission approve the request for two (2) special exceptions located at approximately 690 N. West Capitol Street. Also, based on the analysis and findings in the staff report that the standards for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness involving new construction in a local historic district have been substantially met, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Commission approve the request for new construction located at approximately 690 N. West Capitol Street subject to the conditions listed in the staff report.

Commissioner Stowell second. Commissioners Svendsen, Hyde, Shepherd, Richardson, Petro-Eschler, and Stowell voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

[6:04:07 PM](#)

Construction of Hotel Building, Major Addition to Salt Lake Union Pacific Railroad Station and Demolition of Non-Contributing Structures at approximately 2 South 400 West - Emir Tursic, HKS Architects, on behalf of Vestar Gateway, LLC and Athens Hotel Development, LLC, is requesting approval from the City to construct a new hotel linked with, and as a major addition to, the Union Pacific Depot, and to demolish the single story additions to the rear of the station building. The new hotel will include approximately 225 rooms, retail and conference facilities, and will adapt the interior of much of the Union Pacific building including the Grand Hall of the Station into public hotel reception, restaurant, café and bar amenities, with hotel suites above the south wing on two floors. The new hotel building will link directly with the Union Pacific Railroad Station building at ground level and via bridge links at either end at higher level. The Salt Lake Union Pacific Railroad Station is a Salt Lake City Landmark Site and is listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The proposed development will also be reviewed by the Planning Commission for approval as a Planned Development and for Conditional Building and Site Design Review for a proposal in excess of the maximum height for the zone. The subject property is zoned Gateway-Mixed Use, is subject to the H Historic Preservation Overlay as a Salt Lake City Landmark Site, and is located in City Council District 4, represented by Derek Kitchen. This application must be reviewed by the Historic Landmark Commission because it is new construction on a City Landmark Site and a Major Addition to that Landmark Building. (Staff contact: Carl Leith, (801) 535-7758 or carl.leith@slcgov.com.) **Case Number PLNHLC2018-00616**

Carl Leith, Senior Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff recommended that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the petition with conditions as listed in the staff report.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- The two different parts of the easements
- Clarification on the visibility on the West elevation of the building
- Public access of the easements

- Canopy concept design options and signage

Jeff Mongan, Mark Stanford and Emir Tursic, Applicants, further reviewed details of the proposed project. They provided a presentation as long addressed concerns regarding easements.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- Discussion was made regarding the ramps/ bridge connectors on the outside of the building
- Whether there is a wall or barrier on the ground floor courtyard
- Type of changes that will take place within the Grand Hall
- Possible traffic congestion in the entrance area
- Security within the hotel and the enclosed courtyard
- Canopy concepts were discussed

PUBLIC HEARING [7:12:55 PM](#)

Cindy Cromer – Raised concern regarding easements and signage.

Tina Straley – Stated she is in support of the project and addressed her concerns.

Roger Borgenicht - Stated his concerns with the easements.

The Applicant addressed concerns raised during the public hearing.

Seeing no one else wished to speak; Chairperson Peters closed the public hearing.

The Commission made the following comments:

- I think this is a superb solution
- I like the design, I think it's beautiful
- I think they've done a nice job of planning and this will be a nice amenity
- I think this is remarkable

The Commission discussed with Staff whether or not the City has authority to regulate interior remodeling for National Historic structures.

MOTION [7:44:42 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson stated, based on the analysis and findings listed in this staff report, testimony and the proposal presented, I move that the Commission approve the application PLNHLC2018-00616 Construction of Hotel Building, Major Addition to Salt Lake Union Pacific Railroad Station and Demolition of Non-Contributing Structures at approximately 2 South 400 West with the following conditions:

1. That approval of details of alterations other than those mentioned in condition 4 to the Union Pacific Station building is delegated to Staff.
2. That approval of details of the design of the new hotel and associated landscaping is delegated to Staff with exceptions of number 4
3. That all issues related to the public use easements be addressed by staff and addressed by the Planning Commission
4. That final canopy designs, exterior signage, West entry and details of the Great Hall restoration be submitted for approval separate from this motion.

Discussion was made regarding condition number 3.

Commissioner Richardson stated, I would like to Amend my motion condition number 3 to state that; All issues related to public use easements be addressed by staff.

Commissioner Shepherd second.

Further discussion was made regarding the motion for clarification.

[7:47:58 PM](#)

SUBSTITUTE MOTION FAILED

Commissioner Svendsen stated, I have a substitute motion. Exactly, David's motion minus condition number 4.

Further discussion was made regarding the motion.

Commissioner Stowell second the substituted motion. Commissioners Stowell and Svendsen voted "Aye". Commissioners Richardson, Shepherd and Hyde voted "Nay". The Substitute motion failed 3-2.

Chairperson Peters requested the motion to be restated for clarity.

[7:53:45 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson stated, as written by staff adding:

3. That all issues related to public use easements be addressed to staff,
4. That final canopy designs, exterior signage, West entries, and details of the Great Hall restoration be submitted for approval separate from this motion.

Chairperson Peters stated, we previously had a motion and a second.

Commissioners Svendsen, Hyde, Shepherd, Richardson, and Stowell voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

[7:55:39 PM](#) The Commission took a break.

[8:02:13 PM](#)

Attic Additions at approximately 1017 E 1st Ave - Dennis Webb, property owner, is requesting approval for a new dormer and rooftop addition constructed on an existing single-family home at 1017 E 1st Avenue. The home is considered contributing to the character and integrity of the Avenues Local Historic District. This case is being forwarded to the Commission because the work was completed without prior approvals and does not meet the standards of review to be approved administratively. The subject property is zoned SR-1A (Special Development Pattern Residential District).

The project requires review and approval of the following petitions:

- a. Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for a Minor Alteration to a contributing structure is required prior to obtaining permit to legalize the construction of the attic additions. **Case number PLNHLC2018-00517;**
- b. The applicant has requested two Special Exceptions because the attic additions do not comply with wall and building height. **Case number PLNHLC2018-00676**

The subject property is located in Council District 3 represented by Chris Wharton. (Staff contact: Mayara Lima (801) 535-7118 or mayara.lima@slcgov.com)

Mayara Lima, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated the Staff recommend the Historic Landmark Commission deny the proposed project.

Dennis Webb, Applicant, further reviewed the proposed project.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

PUBLIC HEARING [8:16:37 PM](#)

Kim Bell – Provided a comment card but did not wish to speak

Joseph Bell – Stated he is in support of the project and design.

Amanda Orm – Stated she is in support of the project and believes it adds to the neighborhood.

Charles Stormont – Stated he is opposed of the project.

Richard Goers – Stated he is in favor of the project.

The applicant addressed the public comments.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Peters closed the public hearing.

The Commission made the following comments:

- The entire thing was imminently avoidable, and I support the staff's conclusion
- There's laws that need to be followed in the Historic District and they weren't followed
- I concur with the other commissioners, I think this is largely well precedence
- I concur with the other commissioners

MOTION [8:30:37 PM](#)

Commissioner Stowell stated, based on the information listed in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission deny the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the attic additions at 1017 E 1st Avenue, as presented in petition PLNHLC2018- 00517, and deny the request for additional building and wall height Special Exceptions, as presented in petition PLNHLC2018-00676.

Commissioner Hyde second. Commissioners Shepherd, Richardson, Stowell, Hyde and Svendsen voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

[8:32:30 PM](#)

Nomination for National Register Boulevard Gardens Historic District - The State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) has received a nomination to create the Boulevard Gardens National Historic District and list it on the National Register of Historic Places. The proposed Boulevard Gardens District encompasses one development the spans approximately three acres of the Ballpark Neighborhood, and is roughly bounded by Main Street, Quayle Avenue, West Temple Street, and a private alley to the south. The area includes 23 single family homes with Tudor Revival and/or Arts and Crafts elements, which all

face into a large landscaped court, the development's most distinguishing feature. SHPO will consider this request at a board meeting on October 25, 2018, and requests review and input by Salt Lake City as the City is the Certified Local Government (CLG) in this matter. The proposed District area is zoned R-1/5,000 Single Family Residential and is located within Council District 5, represented by Erin Mendenhall (Staff contact: Ashley Scarff (801) 535-7660 or ashley.scarff@slcgov.com).

Ashley Scarff, Principal Planner, reviewed the petition as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated that Staff recommends the Historic Landmark Commission provides a positive recommendation to the State Historic Preservation Office and the National Park Service.

PUBLIC HEARING [8:37:36 PM](#)

Bill Davis, Community Council – Provided history information with the neighborhood.

Ann Jimenez – Stated she is against the petition.

Jeramiah Miller – Provided a comment but was not present to speak.

Miguel Gonzalez – Stated he is in support of the petition and thinks it's a neighborhood worth preserving.

Adriana Castello – Stated she is in support of the petition.

Jake Strickland – Stated he is in support of the petition.

Joe Nelson – Stated he is in support.

Jefferey Curry – Stated he is in support.

Deborah Waford – Stated she is in support.

Julie Homstad – Provided a comment card but did not wish to speak.

Tim Williams – Stated he believes these homes should be preserved.

Seeing no one else wished to speak, Chairperson Peters closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Shephard provided clarification on the National Register and addressed the public's concerns.

MOTION [8:54:13 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson stated, I move to forward a positive recommendation to the SHPO and the Keepers National Register.

Commissioner Svendsen second. Commissioners Hyde, Svendsen, Stowell, Richardson and Shepherd voted "Aye". The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at [8:54:43 PM](#)