

Motion Sheet

PLNHLC2017-00777 Demolition

PLNHLC2017-00778 New Construction

PLNHLC2017-00788 Special Exception Approvals

Motion to approve with conditions listed in the staff report:

(Consistent with Staff Recommendation)

Based on the information in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve PLNHLC2017-00777 Demolition of Rear Garage Structure at approximately 508 South Temple, approve PLNHLC2017-00778 New Construction and approve PLNHLC2017-00788 Special Exception, with the conditions listed in the staff report.

1. That design details are delegated to Staff for approval.
2. That alterations to the existing Medical Office building are the subject of review under a separate Certificate of Appropriateness for Minor Alterations.

Motion to approve with conditions modified by the Commission:

Based on the information in the staff report, the information presented, and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission approve PLNHLC2017-00777 Demolition of Rear Garage Structure at approximately 508 South Temple, approve PLNHLC2017-00778 New Construction and approve PLNHLC2017-00788 Special Exception, with the conditions listed in the staff report, with the following modifications:

1. List the conditions that are to be modified, added, or removed.

Motion to deny:

Based on the information presented and the input received during the public hearing, I move that the Commission deny PLNHLC2017-00777 Demolition of Rear Garage Structure at approximately 508 South Temple, deny PLNHLC2017-00778 New Construction and deny PLNHLC2017-00788 Special Exception, because evidence has not been presented that demonstrates the proposal complies with the following standards:

Alteration of a Contributing Structure in an H Historic Preservation Overlay District (21A.34.020.G) (Demolition of Garage Structure)

Specifically, the commission should make findings related to which standards are not substantially complied with, based on the following standards:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be used for a purpose that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment;
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided;
3. All sites, structures and objects shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create a false sense of history or architecture are not allowed;
4. Alterations or additions that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved;
5. Distinctive features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved;
6. Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced wherever feasible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in

composition, design, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other structures or objects;

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible;
8. Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant cultural, historical, architectural or archaeological material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment;
9. Additions or alterations to structures and objects shall be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible in massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment;
10. Certain building materials are prohibited including the following:
 - a. Aluminum, asbestos, or vinyl cladding when applied directly to an original or historic material.
11. Any new sign and any change in the appearance of any existing sign located on a landmark site or within the H historic preservation overlay district, which is visible from any public way or open space shall be consistent with the historic character of the landmark site or H historic preservation overlay district and shall comply with the standards outlined in chapter 21A.46 of this title.

New Construction Standards (21A.23.020.H)

Specifically, the commission should make findings related to which standards are not complied with, based on the following standards:

1. Scale and Form:
 - a. Height and Width: The proposed height and width shall be visually compatible with surrounding structures and streetscape;
 - b. Proportion of Principal Facades: The relationship of the width to the height of the principal elevations shall be in scale with surrounding structures and streetscape; and,
 - c. Roof Shape: The roof shape of a structure shall be visually compatible with the surrounding structures and streetscape; and
 - d. Scale of a Structure: The size and mass of the structure shall be visually compatible with the size and mass of surrounding structures and streetscape.
2. Composition of Principal Facades:
 - a. Proportion of Openings: The relationship of the width to the height of windows and doors of the structure shall be visually compatible with surrounding structures and streetscape;
 - b. Rhythm of Solids To Voids In Facades: The relationship of solids to voids in the facade of the structure shall be visually compatible with surrounding structures and streetscape;
 - c. Rhythm of Entrance Porch And Other Projections: The relationship of entrances and other projections to sidewalks shall be visually compatible with surrounding structures and streetscape; and
 - d. Relationship of Materials: The relationship of the color and texture of materials (other than paint color) of the facade shall be visually compatible with the predominant materials used in surrounding structures and streetscape.
3. Relationship to Street:
 - a. Walls of Continuity: Facades and site structures, such as walls, fences and landscape masses, shall, when it is characteristic of the area, form continuity along a street to ensure visual compatibility with the structures, public ways and places to which such elements are visually related;

- b. Rhythm of Spacing And Structures On Streets: The relationship of a structure or object to the open space between it and adjoining structures or objects shall be visually compatible with the structures, objects, public ways and places to which it is visually related;
- c. Directional Expression of Principal Elevation: A structure shall be visually compatible with the structures, public ways and places to which it is visually related in its orientation toward the street; and
- d. Streetscape; Pedestrian Improvements: Streetscape and pedestrian improvements and any change in its appearance shall be compatible to the historic character of the landmark site or H historic preservation overlay district.

4. Subdivision of Lots:

The planning director shall review subdivision plats proposed for property within an H historic preservation overlay district or of a landmark site and may require changes to ensure the proposed subdivision will be compatible with the historic character of the district and/or site(s).

Special Exception Standards

Specifically, the Commission finds that the proposed project does/does not comply with the review standards based on the following findings (Commissioner then states findings based on the Special Exception Standards to support the motion):

- A. Compliance with Zoning Ordinance and District Purposes: The proposed use and development will be in harmony with the general and specific purposes for which this title was enacted and for which the regulations of the district were established.
- B. No Substantial Impairment of Property Value: The proposed use and development will not substantially diminish or impair the value of the property within the neighborhood in which it is located.
- C. No Undue Adverse Impact: The proposed use and development will not have a material adverse effect upon the character of the area or the public health, safety and general welfare.
- D. Compatible with Surrounding Development: The proposed special exception will be constructed, arranged and operated so as to be compatible with the use and development of neighboring property in accordance with the applicable district regulations.
- E. No Destruction of Significant Features: The proposed use and development will not result in the destruction, loss or damage of natural, scenic or historic features of significant importance.
- F. No Material Pollution of Environment: The proposed use and development will not cause material air, water, soil or noise pollution or other types of pollution.
- G. Compliance with Standards: The proposed use and development complies with all additional standards imposed on it pursuant to this chapter.