

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
Meeting Minutes
451 South State Street, Room 326
July 7, 2016

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:29:13 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained in the Planning Office for an indefinite period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Thomas Brennan, Vice Chairperson Charles Shepherd; Commissioners Sheleigh Harding, Kenton Peters and Rachel Quist. Commissioners David Richardson and Heather Thuet were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Joel Paterson, Planning Administrator; Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager; Daniel Echeverria, Principal Planner; JP Goates, Principal Planner; Amy Thompson, Principal Planner and Kelsey Lindquist, Associate Planner; Michelle Moeller, Administrative Secretary and Paul Nielson, Senior City Attorney.

FIELD TRIP NOTES:

A field trip was held prior to the meeting. Historic Landmark Commissioners present were Charles Shepherd and Kenton Peters. Staff members in attendance were Michaela Oktay, Amy Thompson and Kelsey Lindquist.

The following site was visited:

- **Tracy Aviary** - Staff gave an overview of the proposal.
- **764 S. Park Street** - Staff gave an overview of the proposal

APPROVAL OF THE JUNE 2, 2016, MINUTES [5:30:48 PM](#)

MOTION [5:30:59 PM](#)

Commissioner Shepherd moved to approve the minutes from June 2, 2016 as amended. Commissioner Harding seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR OR VICE CHAIR [5:32:07 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Shepherd stated he had nothing to report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT [5:32:16 PM](#)

Ms. Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager, stated she had nothing to report.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD [5:32:27 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Comment Period, seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Comment Period.

PUBLIC HEARINGS [5:32:55 PM](#)

Tracy Aviary-New Construction and Major Alterations at approximately 589 E 1300 South - Angela Dean, the architect representing the tenant of the property (Friends of the Tracy Aviary), is requesting approval for New Construction and Major Alterations at Tracy Aviary. The request also includes amendments to Tracy Aviary's West Side Master Plan that was approved in 2009. Tracy Aviary is located in Liberty Park, a Landmark Site. The property is located in the OS (Open Space) zoning district, in City Council District 5, represented by Erin Mendenhall. (Staff contact: Amy Thompson at (801)535-7281 or amy.thompson@slcgov.com.)

- a. **New Construction - New Construction along the west side of the Tracy Aviary that will include a new entrance ticketing area, snack bar and plaza. Case Number: PLNHLC2016-00306**
- b. **New Construction & Major Alterations - New construction of an indoor/outdoor venue in the central portion of the aviary. The proposed structure is approximately 3,250 square feet and includes a gathering space, kitchen, restrooms, event storage and bird program back stage area. The request includes removal of an addition to a contributing structure known as the office house/aquarium building to accommodate space for the new indoor/outdoor venue. Case Number: PLNHLC2016-00307**

Ms. Amy Thompson, Principal Planner, gave an overview of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff was recommending that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the petition as presented.

Ms. Angela Dean, Architect, reviewed the proposal and the need for the facility updates.

Mr. Tim Brown thanked Staff for their work on the proposal and for working with Tracy Aviary to improve the facility. He reviewed how the aviary previously preserved historic buildings and the projects completed over the years. Mr. Brown reviewed the use of the subject home over the years and explained they did not want the building; they would like the least amount of it to remain as possible or have it moved. He reviewed the three to one tree replacement policy to build up the urban forest on the property.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- The use of the building over the last ten years and the maintenance of the building.
- If efforts had been made to move the building in the past.
- The issues that prohibit the building from being salvaged.
- The options for keeping the building and how to ensure its retention.
- If there was another location on the grounds where the building could be relocated.
- The need for a reception center and onsite food options.

- The options for keeping the building and other options for a reception area.
- The entrances to the park.

PUBLIC HEARING [6:07:23 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Hearing.

The following individuals spoke to the petition: Ms. Heather Dove and Ms. Cindy Cromer.

The following comments were made:

- The Aviary needed a new reception area and place to purchase food.
- The building looked like it was past its expiration date.
- The building had no historic value.
- The building, although in the original location, had lost its historic context.
- It was important to keep the building but not in the current location.
- More information was needed on the condition of the building before a decision to demolish it was made.
- Should be made into a demonstration building regarding net zero solar energy.

Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission and Applicants discussed the following:

- If part of the building was approved for demolition would the Aviary be asking to demolish the remaining portion of the structure in the near future.
- What part of the building should remain and the best use of the building.

ADMINISTRATIVE SESSION [6:16:31 PM](#)

The Commission discussed and stated the following:

- The conditions of approval.
- The motions required for the proposal.

MOTION [6:18:14 PM](#)

Commissioner Harding stated regarding PLNHL2016-00306/307 – Tracy Aviary New Construction and Major Alterations, based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, she moved that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the proposed amendments to Tracy Aviary’s Master Plan with the following conditions of approval:

- 1. Applicant will update Tracy Aviary’s Master Plan to reflect proposed amendments as well as any new proposals that are approved with this petition. Revised Master Plan will be submitted to Planning Staff.**

Commissioner Peters seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

MOTION [6:19:18 PM](#)

Commissioner Quist stated regarding PLNHLC2016-00306 – Tracy Aviary New Construction and Major Alterations, based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, she moved that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction of the Entrance/Ticketing, Snack Bar and Plaza. Commissioner Peters seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

The Commission discussed and stated the following:

- The building was important, although it may not fit the aviary.
- The building was historic in nature.
- Relocation of the structure within the aviary should be studied as agreed previously.
- The Commission could not approve relocation at the current meeting.
- The lack of significant structures in the park should be considered.
- The way the proposed enclosure would be attached to the building.

MOTION [6:30:42 PM](#)

Commissioner Shepherd stated regarding Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction of the Entrance/Ticketing, Snack Bar and Plaza based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, he moved that the Historic Landmark Commission approve petition PLNHLC2016-00307 in part, and deny a portion of the request in part. With respect to a Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction of the indoor outdoor event venue, petition PLNHLC2016-00307, he moved that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

1. Satisfy the Historic Landmark Commissions Condition of Approval that was applied to petition PLNHLC2008-00684 in 2009 that states: Office house be retained and interpreted.
2. Modify the design of the storage area related to New Construction of the event venue to retain the historic office house/aquarium building. Final design details are delegated to Planning Staff. and;
3. Work with Salt Lake City's Urban Forester on removal of any trees, and any proposed new tree plantings. And;
4. To deny the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Alterations to remove the west portion of the office house/aquarium building.

Commissioner Quist seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

[6:32:22 PM](#)

Minor Alterations Tracy Aviary Dabbling Duck Pond Minor Alterations to Tracy

Aviary's Dabbling Duck Pond at approximately 589 E 1300 South - Jennifer Hale, the consultant representing the tenant of the property (Friends of the Tracy Aviary), is requesting approval for renovations to the Dabbling Duck exhibit. Request includes new entry and exit vestibules, modifications to the exhibit pathway, reconfiguration of the existing water channel, a beaver dam feature and the addition of a new "duck blind" structure. Tracy Aviary is located in Liberty Park, a Landmark Site. The property is located in the OS (Open Space) zoning district, in City Council District 5, represented by Erin Mendenhall. (Staff contact: Amy Thompson at (801) 535-7281 or amy.thompson@slcgov.com.) Case Number: PLNHLC2016-00409

Ms. Amy Thompson, Principal Planner, gave an overview of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff was recommending that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the petition as presented.

Ms. Jennifer Hale, Landmark Design Architect, reviewed the proposal and the need for the updates. She reviewed the benefits of the updates to the exhibits for the birds and visitors.

PUBLIC HEARING [6:38:40 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Hearing.

ADMINISTRATIVE SESSION [6:39:02 PM](#)

The Commission discussed and stated the following:

- The historic value to the current exhibit.

MOTION [6:40:22 PM](#)

Commissioner Harding stated based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, she moved that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed renovations to the Dabbling Duck Exhibit at Tracy Aviary, petition PLNHLC2016-00409, with the following conditions of approval:

1. Work with Salt Lake City's Urban Forester on removal of any trees, and any proposed new tree plantings.

Commissioner Peters seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously

[6:41:18 PM](#)

Liberty Square Apartments at approximately 461 S. 600 E., 457 S. 600 E., 459 S. 600 E., 637 E. 500 S. - Douglas Thimm, architect, representing Cowboy Partners, is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new construction of a four story apartment structure, major alterations to a contributing building and the demolition of seven noncontributing buildings. The proposal is located at the above listed address. The site is zoned TSA-UN-C and is located within the

Central City Local Historic District. The subject properties are located within Council district 4, represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff contact is Kelsey Lindquist (801) 535-7930 or Kelsey.lindquist@slcgov.com.) Case Number: PLNHLC2015-00237, PLNHLC2015-00238

Ms. Kelsey Lindquist, Associate Planner, gave an overview of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated staff was recommending that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request as presented.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- The appropriate depth for the balconies.
- The north façade of the structure.

Mr. Ricky Parkinson, architect, reviewed the proposal and how they would address Staff's concerns. Mr. Parkinson reviewed the materials, details of the building and how it would fit with the neighborhood.

Mr. Dan Lofgren, Cowboy Partners, stated they were comfortable with the proposed recommendations and would work with Staff on the windows and balconies. He stated most people did not complain about the size of the balcony and asked the Commission to approve the proposal with the conditions as outlined by Staff.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- The site plan for the proposal.
- What constituted open space.
- Maintaining and encouraging walkability in the neighborhood.
- Access to the proposal from Green Street.
- The tree location on Green Street.

PUBLIC HEARING [7:26:56 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Hearing.

Mr. Michael Iverson, Central City Neighborhood Council, stated they supported the proposal, how it fit with the neighborhood and reviewed the presentation given to the neighborhood council. He asked the Commission to support the proposal as presented.

The following individuals spoke to the petition: Ms. Cindy Cromer

The following comments were made:

- It was important to protect the Ensign Floral building.
- More points needed to be given for midblock walkways in the TSA zoning.
- The parking structure was in the ideal location.

Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Hearing.

The Applicants thanked the audience for their comments and reviewed what would be seen of the parking structure.

ADMINISTRATIVE SESSION

The Commission discussed and stated the following:

- The design and depth objectives for balconies.
- Deeper balconies would increase activity with the street.
- The architect should be allowed to design the building to what they see fit.
- The sense of human scale should be considered and not detracted from.
- The options for the balconies to make them seem bigger.
- Seeing through activity space to open space from the street.
- The Commission needed to define the balconies and not allow Staff to make the determination.
- The window depth and detailing.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following

- If they felt comfortable with the direction on the balconies.

MOTION [8:00:00 PM](#)

Commissioner Quist stated regarding PLNHLC2015-00237 and PLNHLC2015-00238 – Liberty Square Apartments, based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, she moved that the Commission approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a major alteration at 461 South 600 East, demolition of the noncontributing structures and the new construction of a four story apartment building, the Liberty Square Apartments, with the following conditions:

- 1. A separate Certificate of Appropriateness for the signage would be required at a later time.**
- 2. Issues regarding the balconies be delegated to Staff.**
- 3. Issues relating to window detailing be delegated to Staff.**
- 4. Air conditioning units will not be allowed on the balconies or windows or primary or secondary facades.**
- 5. That the lot consolidation be recorded with the Salt Lake County Recorder's Office; and**
- 6. Final plan details be delegated to Staff.**

Commissioner Peters seconded the motion.

The Commissioners discussed if they would like to add conditions about the entrance.

Commissioner Shepherd asked to amend the motion to address the prominence and visibility of the primary entrance/corner entrance to be delegated to Staff.

Commissioner Quist accepted the amendment. Commissioner Peters seconded the amendment.

The Commission discussed the following

- The wording in the motion addressing the prominence of the entrance.
- The issues of the window detailing.
- Increasing the interior and exterior square footage connection in regards to the balconies.
- Clarification on condition 2, issues on the balconies, such as increased useable balcony depth, increased usable connectivity between the interior and exterior spaces through sliding doors/French doors and specifically utilizing guidelines 12.4-3, 12.1-4 and 12.1-5, 12.7 and 12.6-4.
- The language in the motion.

Motion [8:22:37 PM](#)

Commissioner Quist stated regarding PLNHLC2015-00237 and PLNHLC2015-00238 – Liberty Square Apartments, based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, she moved that the Commission approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a major alteration at 461 South 600 East, demolition of the noncontributing structures and the new construction of a four story apartment building, the Liberty Square Apartments, with the following conditions:

1. **A separate Certificate of Appropriateness for the signage would be required at a later time.**
2. **Issues regarding the balconies be delegated to Staff. Specifically to comply with design guidelines 12.6-4, 12.4-3,12.1-4,12.1-5 and 12.17.**
3. **Air conditioning units will not be allowed on the balconies or windows or primary or secondary facades.**
4. **That the lot consolidation be recorded with the Salt Lake County Recorder’s Office; and**
5. **Final plan details be delegated to Staff.**
6. **To emphasize the main entrance as the prominent primary entrance with the details to be delegated to Staff.**

Condition relating to the windows was removed as it was the opinion of the Historic Landmark Commission that mid-century style buildings that window recessed was not a concern.

Commissioner Peters seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously

[8:25:50 PM](#)

Window Replacement at approximately 764 S. Park Street - Daniel Teed is requesting approval for the replacement of the windows on the subject property. The home is located at approximately 764 S. Park Street, in the Central City Historic District. The property is currently under enforcement, as the windows have already been replaced. The subject property is zoned SR-3 (Special

Development Pattern Residential). The property is located within Council District 4 represented by Derek Kitchen. (Staff contact is Kelsey Lindquist at (801)535-7930 or kelsey.lindquist@slcgov.com.) Case Number: PLNHLC2016-00250

Ms. Kelsey Lindquist, Associate Planner, gave an overview of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated staff was recommending that the Historic Landmark Commission deny and approve a portion of the proposal as presented.

Mr. Daniel Teed stated he cared about his house, the neighborhood and the historic nature of the home. He reviewed the repairs he made to the home, the window treatment and other homes in the area with vinyl windows. Mr. Teed reviewed the window openings, stated the windows fit with the style of the home, the neighborhood and the character of the area.

[8:37:28 PM](#)

The computer shut down and the meeting was paused for a moment.

[8:39:37 PM](#)

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- When the home was purchased.
- When the citation for the windows was issued.
- The time period for the original windows and the new windows.
- If the applicant knew the home was in a Historic District.
- If the cabinets were new in the kitchen.

PUBLIC HEARING [8:53:53 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Hearing.

The following individuals spoke to the petition: Ms. Cindy Cromer, Mr. Kai Fernandez, Ms. Victoria Felt, Mr. Adam Stone and Mr. Eleanor Lewis.

The following comments were made:

- Lowell and Park were extremely intact historic streets.
- The disconnect between the Enforcement, Planning and Permitting processes could have caused some of the issues with the project.
- Historical preservation was important for the neighborhood.
- The character defining elements on the home were still in tact.
- Great care was taken to preserve the home.
- The home was in such poor condition and should have been demolished but Mr. Teed took the time to renovate it in an appropriate way.
- The area was a mess prior to Mr. Teed purchasing the property and he had improved it greatly.

Chairperson Brennan read the following comments:

- Brandon Goo – in support
- Tanner Ruber – in Support- the energy efficiency that we can add by new windows and doors can help with the city's air without affecting the historic look and character of the area.
- Joseph Felt – in support – If laws in place prohibit replacing broken/ otherwise hazardous windows, I support revising the law.
- Vincent Johnson – in support – I feel Dan Teed is doing an amazing job keeping in the style of the neighborhood. All except for one small detail...he is doing a fantastic job in making our amazing little park neighborhood a little less ghetto.

Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission, Applicant and Staff discussed and stated the following:

- The classification status of the neighboring home that was given permission to install vinyl windows and the classification of the subject home.
- If the transoms were original.
- If building permits were issued for the window replacement.
- The discrepancies with city departments regarding the approval process.

ADMINISTRATIVE SESSION [9:10:46 PM](#)

The Commission discussed and stated the following:

- The need to address the lack of communication between the city departments.
- The side windows were expectable and less of an issue than the front windows.
- The front windows were incompatible with the home.
- Applications where vinyl windows were approved and if vinyl was appropriate for this home.
- The language in the motion.

MOTION [9:18:17 PM](#)

Commissioner Shepherd stated regarding PLNHLC2016-00250 – Park Street Window and Door Replacement, based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, he moved that the Commission deny the request for a certificate of appropriateness for the replacement of two windows on the east and approve the request for a certificate of appropriateness for the replacement of window on the north, south and west elevations and the installation of the new front door based on the limited visibility of side elevation windows and the reasonable profiling of the installed windows. Commissioner Quist seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously

[9:20:40 PM](#)

East Bench Master Plan - A City initiated petition to update the East Bench Master Plan and to develop a specific corridor plan for Parley's Way. The project area is bounded by South Temple and the University of Utah northern property lines to the north, University Street and 1300 East to the west, 1700 South to 2300 East to

Parley's Way to the South, and the City boundary to the east. The plans will establish goals and policies related to the future growth and development of the East Bench Community. The project area is located in Council Districts 5 represented by Erin Mendenhall, 6 represented by Charlie Luke, and 7 represented by Lisa Adams. The draft plans can be reviewed at www.slcgov.com/opencityhall. (Staff contact: Wayne Mills at (801) 535-7282 or wayne.mills@slcgov.com). Case number PLNPCM2014-00139

Mr. Daniel Echeverria and Jonathan Goates, Principal Planners gave an overview of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). They stated Staff was recommending that the Historic Landmark Commission forward a favorable recommendation to the Planning Commission regarding the plan.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- The email from John Dewy.
- If recognition was given to the National Historic District.
- If there was information on the difficulty in creating new Historic Districts was included.
- The impacts of traffic and how the Parley's Way Corridor plan addressed the area.
- If a similar plan would be created for Foothill Drive.

PUBLIC HEARING [9:28:24 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [9:28:31 PM](#)

Commissioner Harding stated regarding East Bench Master Plan and Parley's Way Corridor Plan, she moved that the Historic Landmark Commission forward a positive recommendation to the Planning Commission in support of the draft East Bench Master Plan and draft Parley's Way Corridor Plan as it relates to historic and community preservation. Commissioner Peters seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

WORK SESSION

[9:29:04 PM](#)

Rules of Procedure - Review the Historic Landmark Commission Rules of Procedures document dated June 17, 2010, and discuss whether revisions to the document are needed.

The Commission and Staff reviewed the current Rules of procedure discussed the following:

- The items that needed to be changed or updated.
- How to address changes to applications.
- Holding more issues only hearings or work sessions.
- Having a second monthly meeting.

- The Commissioners will review the document and send any comments or concerns to Staff.

[9:45:31 PM](#)

Petition to study and make recommendations regarding the Historic Landmark Commission and the land use ordinances pertaining to the H Historic Preservation Overlay - Mayor Biskupski has initiated a petition requesting that Planning Staff study and make recommendations for potential changes to the City's zoning ordinance for the following issues:

- a. Review the role and responsibilities of the Commission under the current code in the creation of local historic districts/sites as well as the standards and decision making processes for granting or denying approval of development proposals within the H Historic Preservation Overlay.**
- b. Study and assess how other communities within and outside Utah structure their local regulations, standards and decision making functions. Assemble a possible range of options for the City to consider and to identify best practices to provide greater clarity, consistency, transparency and accountability, and**
- c. Make recommendations to the Mayor and the City Council for any changes to the City's ordinance for the role and responsibilities of the Historic Landmark Commission, the standards, and the decision making process for historic districts and landmark sites.**

Planning Staff will brief the Commission on the petition, scope, projected timeline and take input on the study. (Staff contact is Michaela Oktay at (801)535-6003 or michaela.oktay@slcgov.com.) (Case number PLNPCM2016-00330

Ms. Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager, gave an overview of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Historic Landmark Commission was not asked to take action but to comment and participate in the briefing and to ask questions and to provide any comment or information to help inform the study as it progresses this year. Staff may also ask members to consider being part of a small work group as part of this study.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Enforcement issues.
- Standards, guideline clarity.
- Local historic district notification.
- Maps and contributing status data base.
- Streamlining where feasible.
- Consistency.

The meeting adjourned at [9:48:53 PM](#)