

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
Meeting Minutes
451 South State Street, Room 326
May 5, 2016

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:35:28 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained in the Planning Office for an indefinite period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Thomas Brennan, Vice Chairperson Charles Shepherd; Commissioners Sheleigh Harding and Rachel Quist. Commissioners David Richardson, Kenton Peters and Heather Thuet were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Nora Shepard, Planning Director; Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager; Anthony Riederer, Principal Planner; Michelle Moeller, Administrative Secretary and Paul Nielson, Senior City Attorney.

FIELD TRIP NOTES:

A field trip was held prior to the meeting. Historic Landmark Commissioner present was Rachel Quist. Staff members in attendance were Michaela Oktay and Anthony Riederer.

The following site was visited:

- **279 North J Street** - Staff gave an overview of the proposal.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR OR VICE CHAIR [5:36:02 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Shepherd stated he had nothing to report.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT [5:36:13 PM](#)

Ms. Nora Shepard, Planning Director, reported on the Mayor's petition request regarding reviewing the Historic Landmark Commission Historic Districts and Landmark Sites. She reviewed the purpose, timeline and what would be reviewed under the petition. Ms. Shepard reviewed the ballot results for the Harvard Heights proposed Local Historic District and stated the petition was transmitted to the City Council. She reviewed the status of other Local Historic District petitions. Ms. Shepard reviewed the upcoming and postponed applications that would be brought to the Commission in the future.

The Commission and Ms. Shepard reviewed the following:

- The Commission's role in the Mayor's petition.
- The last time the Historic Landmark Commission procedures were reviewed and amended.

APPROVAL OF THE APRIL 7, 2016, MINUTES [5:43:43 PM](#)

MOTION [5:43:53 PM](#)

Commissioner Harding moved to approve the minutes from April 7, 2016. Commissioner Quist seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD [5:44:36 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Comment Period, seeing no one wished to speak; Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Comment Period.

PUBLIC HEARINGS [5:45:03 PM](#)

Dosch/Clary Single-Family New Construction at approximately 279 North J Street – Campbell Dosch and Jeseca Clary, as owners of the subject property, are requesting approval from the City to develop a new single-family house at the above stated address in the Avenues Historic District. Currently, the site is vacant and has previously served as a subject parcel to an adjacent property. At its maximum height, the proposed building will be 31 feet 6 inches above existing grade. This project requires a Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction in a Historic District, a Special Exception for additional pitched roof height, a Special Exception for additional flat roof height and a Special Exception for additional exterior wall height. The property is in the SR-1A (Special Development Pattern) zoning district located in City Council District 3, represented by Stan Penfold. This project must be reviewed by the Historic Landmark Commission because it is for new construction in a local historic district. (Staff contact: Anthony Riederer, 801-535-7625 or anthony.riederer@slcgov.com)

- a. **New Construction in a Historic District** - In order to build the project noted above, a Certificate of Appropriateness for New Construction in a Historic District is required. The project is a new single-family house of contemporary design on a site which is currently vacant. (Case Number PLNHLC2015-00845)
- b. **Special Exceptions for Additional Height** - In order to build the project noted above, three different Special Exceptions for Additional Height are required as outlined below: (Case Number PLNHLC2016-00276)
 - i. **Special Exception for Additional Pitched Roof Height of 31 feet 6 inches.** The maximum pitched roof height for the SR-1A zone is 23 feet or 27.61 feet via block face average.
 - ii. **Special Exception for Additional Flat Roof Height of 29 feet 3 inches.** The maximum flat roof height for the SR-1A zone is 16 feet.
 - iii. **Special Exception for Additional Exterior Wall Height of 31 feet 6 inches.** The maximum exterior wall height in the SR-1A is 16 feet.

Mr. Anthony Riederer, Principal Planner, gave an overview of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated staff was recommending that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the petition as presented.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- The backing distance/radius on the property.
- The roof line of the proposed structure.
- The visibility of the structures north face to the surrounding properties.
- The setbacks for the property.
- How chimneys and feature walls were addressed in the plan.

Mr. Campbell Dosch and Ms. Jeseca Clary, applicants, reviewed the proposal and how it differed from the previous request.

Mr. Lyle Beecher, Architect, reviewed why the Special Exceptions were necessary to develop the property, the form of the roof and how the design fit with the neighborhood. He reviewed the use of materials to tie the structure into the neighborhood.

The Commission, Applicant and Staff discussed the following:

- When a Special Exception should be granted for a petition.
- Why the Special Exceptions were being requested.
- If the brick was visible from the interior of the home.
- The ceiling heights of the structure.
- The window openings and fenestrations.
- The amount of glazing on the structure.
- The current proposed height, the recommended height and what the ordinance allowed.

PUBLIC HEARING

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Hearing.

The following individuals spoke to the petition: Mr. Jim Gardner and Mr. Kirk Henrichsen.

The following comments were made:

- Project was a beautiful building but in twenty years would it fit in.
- The building should be made to better fit the neighborhood.
- Structure would stand out like a McMansion on the street face.
- The mass and elongation were too much for the lot.
- The best use of the property would to purchase the adjoining lot and maintain the current status.
- Traffic, snow removal, construction would cause issues for the neighborhood.

Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Hearing.

The Applicants stated they met the setbacks and the overall lot coverage was within the allowable regulations. They stated the lot was a buildable lot and construction

would not impede on the sidewalk or street. The Applicants stated the massing tied in with the neighborhood and would not look out of place.

ADMINISTRATIVE SESSION

The Commission discussed and stated the following:

- Modern homes were difficult to analyze in historic areas.
- The height of the structure was an issue.
- The garage placement worked for the proposal.
- The materials, massing and glazing were questionable.
- Agreed with the Staff Report recommendations.
- The roof slope.
- Structure height and the slope of the street.
- How the structure would be seen from the different elevations.
- The proposal was great and a number of concerns were addressed.
- Elevation study shows the building was not out of scale from the neighbors.
- Floor height could be scaled down to help with the overall building height.
- Eaves could be addressed to make the structure less monumental.
- To table, deny or approve the petition.

MOTION [6:34:50 PM](#)

Commissioner Harding stated regarding PLNHLC2015-00845 – New Construction in a Historic District PLNHLC2016-00276 – Special Exceptions for Additional Wall and Roof Height, based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, she moved that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request for New Construction at approximately 279 North J Street with the following conditions:

- 1. Inverse-pitched roof segments are modified to be flat, with a maximum height of 23.25 feet above finished first floor height.**
- 2. Elimination of the exterior decorative/feature wall that that extends above the revised roofline.**
- 3. The fenestration pattern is revised on the north façade to allow more transparency at the front of the house.**
- 4. Specific information and specifications as to selected materials are provided and approved.**
- 5. The design complies with all applicable building and development codes.**
- 6. Approval of final design details are delegated to staff for approval.**

Commissioner Quist seconded the motion.

The Commission discussed the following:

- Carrying the brick wall through the structure would be a strong feature element and help connect the transparency.

- If the brick wall would be visible.
- The monumentality of the roof overhangs were an issue.
- The fenestration on the south was a concern.
- The front of the home was very commercial.
- If condition two should be included in the motion.
- If Staff should review the eaves.

Commission Harding amended her motion to remove condition number two and have Staff review how to minimize the eaves. Commissioner Quist seconded the amendment. Commissioners Harding and Quist voted “aye”. Commissioners Shepherd and Brennan voted “nay”. The motion failed due to a tie vote.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- A possible motion and the language to include in that motion.
- How the height of the structure could be reduced.
- Staff’s recommendation on the roof that would affect the structure height.
- Review of the windows in order to scale them back on the stairwell atrium along the southeast fenestration and elevation.

MOTION [6:47:40 PM](#)

Commissioner Harding stated regarding PLNHLC2015-00845 – New Construction in a Historic District based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, she moved that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the request for New Construction at approximately 279 North J Street with conditions one, three, four, five and six as listed in the Staff Report and add that staff review fenestration on the south and the southeast portions of the home and lighten the eaves. Commissioner Quist seconded the motion. Commissioners Harding, Brennan and Quist voted “aye”. Commissioner Shepherd voted “nay”. The motion passed 3-1.

MOTION [6:51:10 PM](#)

Commissioner Harding stated regarding PLNHLC2016-00276 – Special Exceptions for Additional Wall and Roof Height, based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, she moved that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the following Special Exceptions at approximately 279 North J Street which support the design modifications identified as Staff recommended conditions for new construction

- 1. To exceed the maximum height of a flat roof by some amount approximately thirteen feet three inches 13’3”.**
- 2. To exceed the maximum exterior wall height as required by the previous motion.**
- 3. To deny the following Special Exception to exceed the maximum height of a pitch roof by eight feet six inches 8’6”.**

Commissioners Quist seconded the motion. Commissioners Harding, Brennan and Quist voted “aye”. Commissioner Shepherd voted “nay”. The motion passed 3-1.

The meeting adjourned at [6:53:26 PM](#)