

SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
Meeting Minutes
451 South State Street, Room 326
June 4, 2015

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:49:08 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained in the Planning Office for an indefinite period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Thomas Brennan, Vice Chairperson Sheleigh Harding; Commissioners David Richardson, Kenton Peters, and Charles Shepherd. Commissioners Rachel Quist and Heather Thuet were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Nora Shepard, Planning Director; Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager; Carl Leith, Senior Planner; Lex Traugher, Senior Planner; Michelle Moeller, Administrative Secretary and Paul Nielson, Senior City Attorney.

FIELD TRIP NOTES:

A field trip was held prior to the work session. Historic Landmark Commissioners present were Charles Shepherd and Kenton Peters. Staff members in attendance were Michaela Oktay, Carl Leith and Lex Traugher.

The following sites were visited:

- **780 E South Temple** - Staff gave an overview of the proposal.
- **275 N Vine Street** - Staff gave an overview of the proposal.

APPROVAL OF THE MAY 14, 2015, MINUTES [5:49:48 PM](#)

MOTION [5:50:00 PM](#)

Commissioner Peters moved to approve the minutes from May 14, 2015. Commissioner Shepherd seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT [5:50:30 PM](#)

Ms. Nora Shepard, Planning Director, reviewed the date for the July meeting and the request to schedule tours of new construction. She reported on the possible workshops for both staff and the public.

Ms. Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager, reported on the ballot results for the Uintah Heights and Yale Park proposed Local Historic Districts. She reviewed the next steps for the petitions.

The Commission and Staff discussed the time frame for the petitions and the percentage of property owners that responded to the ballots.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR OR VICE CHAIR [5:51:50 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan reviewed the need for the Commission to visit newer construction in the Historic Districts and asked the Public to send project addresses to Staff.

Vice Chairperson Harding stated she had nothing to report.

PUBLIC COMMENT [5:55:53 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Comment Period.

Mr., Kirk Huffaker, Utah Heritage Foundation, thanked the Commission for visiting the 780 S. Temple site, reviewed the importance of recognizing special buildings in the city and the need to preserve them for the future.

Ms. Cindy Cromer reviewed upcoming conference the Commission might want to attend. She presented the handout for window replacement, reviewed windows types and the cost to repair or replace those windows. Ms. Cromer asked the Commission to gather similar information from applicants wishing to replace windows to accurately reflect the cost for window replacement.

Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Comment Period.

PUBLIC HEARINGS [6:01:17 PM](#)

Western General Agency Building at approximately 780 E. South Temple - The State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) has received a request from Bim Oliver to add the Western General Agency Bldg to the National Register of Historic Places. This request will be considered by the State Board of History's meeting on July 16, 2015 and SHPO requests review by Salt Lake City before that time as the Certified Local Government (CLG) in this matter. This item is being brought before the Historic Landmark Commission to provide input. Staff contact: Lex Traughber at (801)535-6184 or lex.traughber@slcgov.com

Mr. Lex Traughber, Senior Planner, turned the time over to Steve Cornell for a presentation.

Mr. Steve Cornell, applicant, thanked the Commission for considering the application. He reviewed the history of the property, architecture of the building and the importance of protecting similar structures for the future.

Mr. John Leer, Building Owner, reviewed the history and restoration of the building.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- The recent renovations to the building.
- What aspects of a building could be restored or altered and still allow the building to keep its historic status.
 - It was important to maintain the balance of compatibility.
 - Keep with the nature of the building and the keep the character defining factors.

PUBLIC HEARING [6:15:17 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Hearing, seeing no one wished to speak to the petition; Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [6:20:22 PM](#)

Commissioner Richardson stated, based on the testimony and plans presented, he moved that the Historic Landmark Commission forward a positive recommendation to the State Historic Preservation Office and the National Park Service owing to the integrity of the site, building and its direct association with a locally-significant architecture. Commissioner Harding seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

[6:20:56 PM](#)

New Single Family Home at approximately 275 N. Vine Street – John Sparano, on behalf of owner Chad Spector, is requesting approval from the City to demolish an existing noncontributing structure and to build a new single family residence in the Capitol Hill Historic District. The subject property has been determined uninhabitable in its current condition, has been vacant for some time, is zoned RMF-75 (High Density Multi-Family Residential District) and is located in City Council District 3, represented by Stan Penfold. This application must be reviewed by the Historic Landmark Commission because it is new construction in a local historic district. (Staff contact: Carl Leith, (801)535-7758 or carl.leith@slcgov.com.)

- a. Demolition of a Noncontributing Structure – In order to build the new single family residence the applicant is requesting approval to demolish the existing noncontributing house on this lot. Case Number PLNHLC2015-00295**
- b. New Construction – In order to build the proposed single-family residence a New Construction application must be approved by the Historic Landmark Commission. Case Number PLNHLC2015-00296.**

Mr. Carl Leith, Senior Planner, gave an overview of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated Staff was recommending that the Historic Landmark Commission approve the petition as presented.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- Proposed building read as a commercial building rather than a single family residence.
- The setback, layout and design of the proposal.

Mr. John Sparano, applicant, reviewed the north elevation and why the design was chosen.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the following:

- The function of the room above the garage.
 - It will be used as a photography studio.

PUBLIC HEARING [6:38:51 PM](#)

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Hearing.

Mr. Kelly Badger stated he lived south of the proposal, felt the proposal would improve the area and his only concern was over the construction and demolition of the structure.

Staff stated they would work with him regarding his concerns about the demolition process, he should direct those questions to Staff for answers.

Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission made the following observations:

- The proposal responded appropriately to the street and would be a appropriate addition to a unique street.
- Other proposals, reviewed by the Commission, for modern infill have not been as appropriate as this proposal.
- The lot was larger and the design was not over developing the lot.
- Great to have a proposal that was not asking for Special Exceptions.

MOTION [6:43:09 PM](#)

Commissioner Peters stated regarding PLNHLC2015-00295, Demolition of Non Contributing structure, and PLNHLC2015-00296, New Construction, based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony and the proposal presented, he moved that the Commission approve the request for demolition of a noncontributing structure and for new construction located at 275 N. Vine Street, subject to confirmation of noncontributing status and confirmation of no substantive objections. Commissioner Richardson seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

[6:44:12 PM](#)

Design Guidelines for Westmoreland Place Historic District – Draft - Mayor Ralph Becker has initiated a petition to create Design Guidelines for the Westmoreland Place Historic District in Salt Lake City. Westmoreland Place was designated as a Local Historic District in 2010. These guidelines will amend the Design Guidelines for Historic Residential Properties and Districts (Preservation Handbook) to create an additional chapter for the district. The proposed Westmoreland chapter will supplement the general guidelines in the Handbook and address the specific characteristics of this historic district. For architects, designers, contractors and property owners, they provide guidance in planning and designing future projects. For city staff and the historic landmark commission, they provide guidance for the interpretation of the zoning ordinance standards. Design guidelines are officially adopted by city council. The Historic Landmark Commission will hold a Public Hearing, receive public comments, and review the draft design guidelines. (Staff contact: Carl Leith at (801)535 7758, or carl.leith@slcgov.com). Case number:

PLNPCM2015-00162

Mr. Carl Leith, Senior Planner, gave an overview of the draft guidelines as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). He stated the document was a first draft and Staff was looking for comments, questions and corrections from the Commission.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

- If the intent of the chapter was to apply to the national or local districts.
 - The local historic district.
- When the local and national districts were designated.
- If there was an interest in aligning the districts.
- Who owned the entry gateways.
 - It was a neighborhood effort in conjunction with the city.
- The significance of the porches and setbacks in the area.
- How to add on to a building without sacrificing the character of the structure or neighborhood.
- The need to acknowledge that second level additions were sometimes necessary because of lot size and having guidelines on how to best accomplish these additions.
- Adding the tree canopy as a key character defining factor.
- Clarification and using terms that consistent with other guidelines.
- Commissioners will send their comments and corrections to Staff.

The meeting adjourned at [7:08:39 PM](#)