SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION Meeting Minutes 451 South State Street, Room 326 November 5, 2015

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at <u>5:32:25 PM</u>. Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained in the Planning Office for an indefinite period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Chairperson Thomas Brennan, Vice Chairperson Charles Shepherd; Commissioners Sheleigh Harding, Kenton Peters and Rachel Quist. Commissioners David Richardson and Heather Thuet were excused.

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Nora Shepard, Planning Director; Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager; Michelle Moeller, Administrative Secretary and Paul Nielson, Senior City Attorney.

APPROVAL OF THE OCTOBER 1, 2015, MINUTES <u>5:33:09 PM</u> **MOTION** <u>5:33:24 PM</u>

Commissioner Harding moved to approve the minutes from October 1, 2015. Commissioner Peters seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR OR VICE CHAIR 5:33:38 PM

Chairperson Brennan stated he had nothing to report.

Vice Chairperson Shepherd encouraged the Commissioners to review the Historic Apartment tour along with the guidelines.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT 5:34:27 PM

Ms. Nora Shepard, Planning Director, reviewed the items that would be reviewed at the December Historic Landmark Commission meeting, such as the Local Historic District petition requirements. She reviewed the City Council meeting schedule and the Historic Landmark Commission items that may be reviewed.

Ms. Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager, reviewed the Historic Landmark Commission petitions that were reviewed or approved by the City Council.

PUBLIC COMMENT <u>5:38:06 PM</u>

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Comment Period.

Ms. Cindy Cromer reviewed the money the City Council appropriated to address changes at Pioneer Park. She expressed concern over the changes as the Historic Landmark Commission had not discussed them and the park is listed as a National and Local registered district. Ms. Cromer reviewed the proposed changes such as removal of trees and changing the topography of the park. She asked the Commission to get involved in the process, help protect the park and keep the historic nature.

Ms. Shepard stated she attended the same meeting and explained the proposal for Pioneer Park and that the City Council would have to consider a plan before changes were actually made. She agreed the Historic Landmark Commission should be involved in the process and thanked Ms. Cromer for bringing it to the Commission's attention.

Chairperson Brennan explained other historic parks were going through the same process and reviewed the park plan in North Carolina that could be used as a reference or model for planning Salt Lake City parks.

The Commission discussed the importance of the process to improve the parks.

Commissioner Quist expressed the concern over digging in Pioneer Park and the archeological components that could be under the surface.

Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Comment Period.

PUBLIC HEARINGS 5:46:39 PM

<u>Chimney Removal at approximately 1342 E 300 South</u> – Kathleen Kristensen is requesting a certificate of appropriateness from the City to remove two original brick chimneys at the above listed address. Currently the land is used for a singlefamily dwelling and the property is zoned R-2 Single- and Two-Family Residential District. This type of project must be reviewed as a Minor Alteration. The subject property is within Council District 4, represented by Luke Garrott. (Staff contact: Michael Maloy at (801)535-7118 or <u>michael.maloy@slcgov.com</u>) Case number PLNHLC2015-00583.

Ms. Michaela Oktay, Planning Manager, gave an overview of the proposal as outlined in the Staff Report (located in the case file). She stated Staff was recommending that the Planning Commission deny the petition as presented.

The Commission and Staff discussed the following:

• If the original proposal was for one or more chimneys to be removed.

Ms. Kathleen Kristensen reviewed the reasoning for removing the chimneys and that it was not cost effective to repair them. She asked the Commission to approve the removal of the east chimney as it was non-functioning. Ms. Kristensen stated passersby do not notice the chimneys and asked why she should have to repair and non-functioning chimney that had no use.

The Commission, Staff and Applicant discussed the following:

- If the repairman was from the list of suggested resources for masonry repair.
 - No it was just a business out of the phonebook.

- Why it was important to repair and keep the chimney even though it was not usable.
- The repairs and tax credits for the home.
- The condition of the chimneys and how to address them.

PUBLIC HEARING 5:59:31 PM

Chairperson Brennan opened the Public Hearing.

Ms. Cindy Cromer stated the house was on one of Salt Lake's great streets, marked the eastern terminus of the street, was on the edge of the University Historic District and was a corner property that was highly visible. She stated the home was beautiful in the 80's and it was sad to see that the home fell in disrepair. Ms. Cromer stated the argument that the chimneys were non-functioning was irrelevant because they were character defining elements of the architecture. She stated the chimneys were not in that bad of shape and explained the repairs she had made to her buildings. Ms. Cromer stated masonry restoration was expensive but repairs could be made to restore and save the chimneys.

Chairperson Brennan closed the Public Hearing.

The Commission made the following comments:

• Removing loose brick and a temporary capping with sheet metal would be appropriate until the chimneys could be repaired.

The Commission discussed the following:

• The different pictures of the chimneys.

MOTION <u>6:08:18 PM</u>

Commissioner Harding stated in the case of PLNHLC2015-00583, Chimney Removal, based on the analysis and findings listed in the Staff Report, testimony received, and the proposal presented, she moved that the Historic Landmark Commission deny the request for Certificate of Appropriateness to remove two chimneys at 1342 E 300 South. Specifically, the Commission finds that the proposed project does not comply with the review standards. Commissioner Quist seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at <u>6:09:19 PM</u>