



# Communication to the Historic Landmark Commission

**DATE:** December 5, 2014

**TO:** Historic Landmark Commission Members

**FROM:** Michael Maloy, AICP, Senior Planner

**RE:** Acceptance of the Contributing/Non-Contributing Status of properties within the proposed Yalecrest – Upper Harvard & Yale Park Plat A Local Historic District

---

## Recommendation

Based upon a review of; 1) the 2005 Yalecrest Reconnaissance Level Survey, 2) the history and integrity of the homes within the proposed Yalecrest - Upper Harvard & Yale Park Plat A Local Historic District, and 3) recently submitted information, the Planning staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission accept the proposed amendments to the contributing and non-contributing status of homes within the proposed Yalecrest - Upper Harvard & Yale Park Plat A Local Historic District (see the proposed ratings for two properties on page 3 of this memorandum).

### **SUMMARY: 2005 YALECREST RECONNAISSANCE LEVEL SURVEY (RLS) AND PROPOSED YALECREST - UPPER HARVARD & YALE PARK PLAT A LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICT RATINGS**

<b>Rating</b>	<b>2005 RLS Status</b>	<b>Proposed Status</b>
<b>Contributing</b>	57 (95%)	55 (91.7%)
<b>Non-contributing</b>	3 (5%)	5 (8.3%)
<b>Total Number of Principal Structures</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>60</b>

## Background

On September 4, 2014, the Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing on the proposed designation of the Yalecrest – Upper Harvard & Yale Park Plat A Local Historic District, located on Harvard Avenue between 1500 East and 1700 East. At the public hearing, the Planning Staff briefly reviewed the contributing status of the homes on this block of Harvard Avenue and recommended that the contributing and non-contributing status of structures on the block be discussed in detail at a later date.

## Analysis

The homes in the proposed Yalecrest - Upper Harvard & Yale Park Plat A Local Historic District are relatively intact and maintain a high level of integrity. According to the 2005 survey, the method used to evaluate the properties was based on age and architectural integrity as follows:

**A – Eligible/Significant:** A contributing building built within the historic period and retains integrity; excellent example of a style; unaltered or only minor alterations or additions; individually eligible for National Register architectural significance; also, buildings of know historical significance.

**B – Eligible/Contributing:** A contributing building built within the historic period and retains integrity; good example of a style or type, but not as well-preserved or well-executed as “A” buildings, though overall integrity is retained eligible for National Register as part of a potential historic district primarily for historical, rather than architectural, reasons. The additions do not detract and may be reversible.

**C – Ineligible/Non-Contributing:** A non-contributing building built during the historic period but has had major alterations or additions; no longer retains integrity. The resource may still have local historical significance.

**D – Out-of-period:** A non-contributing building constructed outside the historic period.

This rating system is the standard used for all historic surveys done in Salt Lake City. Under this rating system, a structure rated either “A” or “B” is considered to be a contributing building. A structure that is rated either “C” or “D” is considered to be a non-contributing building.

## Proposed Changes

### 1506 Harvard Avenue

The 2005 Yalecrest Reconnaissance Level Survey rated the original 1915 “prairie school four-square” styled structure as “A” - Eligible/Significant. On July 9, 2013, Salt Lake City issued Building Permit number BLD2013-04726 to construct a “small addition over existing foundations” within the rear yard. However, because the residence is located on a corner parcel the addition is prominently visible from 1500 East. Whereas the scale and details of the addition do not appear to be consistent with recommended design guidelines for historic structures, staff questions whether the 2005 Yalecrest Reconnaissance Level Survey rating of the residence should be changed from “A” to “C.”



*1506 Harvard Avenue historical photograph*



*1506 Harvard Avenue current photograph*

**1547 Harvard Avenue**

The 2005 Yalecrest Reconnaissance Level Survey rated the original 1924 bungalow styled structure as “A” - Eligible/Significant. However, following the issuance of Building Permit number BLD2013-07441 on October 10, 2013, the residence was demolished to facilitate construction of a new two-story home. Homes that are constructed outside the historic period are rated “D” – Out-of-Period.



*1547 Harvard Avenue historical photograph*



*1547 Harvard Avenue current photograph*

**Conclusion**

Based on this re-evaluation, Staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission accepts the following amendment to the 2005 Yalecrest Reconnaissance Level Survey (see table below). With the proposed amendments, the Yalecrest - Upper Harvard & Yale Park Plat A Local Historic District would have 55 contributing buildings (91.7%) and five non-contributing buildings (8.3%). If the proposed local historic district is designated by the City Council, Planning Staff will use these rating to determine how the properties will be evaluated in using; 1) the standards for alteration of a contributing building (21A.34.020.G), or 2) the standards for alteration of a non-contributing building (21A.34.020.H).

**COMPARISON: 2005 YALECREST RECONNAISSANCE LEVEL SURVEY (RLS) AND PROPOSED UPPER HARVARD & YALE PARK PLAT A CONTRIBUTING STATUS RATINGS**

<b>Address</b>	<b>Yalecrest RLS Rating 2005</b>	<b>Proposed Rating 2014</b>	<b>Comments</b>
1506 Harvard Ave	A	C	After analysis and discussions with SHPO staff, it has been determined that the home is a “non-contributing” structure.
1547 Harvard Ave	A	D	After analysis and discussions with SHPO staff, it has been determined that the home is an “out of period” structure.