



Communication to the Historic Landmark Commission

DATE: October 2, 2014

TO: Historic Landmark Commission Members

FROM: Maryann Pickering, AICP
Principal Planner

RE: Acceptance of the Contributing/Non-Contributing Status of properties within the proposed Yalecrest—Upper Yale Local Historic District

Recommendation

Based upon a review of the 2005 Yalecrest Reconnaissance Level Survey, review of the existing condition of the homes within the proposed Yalecrest—Upper Yale Local Historic District, and a review of new submitted information, the Planning staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission accept the proposed amendments to the contributing and non-contributing status of homes within the proposed Yalecrest—Upper Yale Local Historic District (see proposed ratings for each property in this memo).

Summary 2005 Yalecrest Reconnaissance Level Survey and the Proposed Yalecrest – Upper Yale Local Historic District Ratings

Rating	2005 RLS Status	Proposed Status
Contributing	23 (82%)	21 (75%)
Noncontributing	5 (18%)	7 (25%)
Total Number of Principal Structures	28	28

Background

On September 4, 2014, the Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing on the proposed designation of the Yalecrest—Upper Yale Local Historic District, located on Yale Avenue between 1700 East and 1800 East. At the public hearing, the Planning Staff briefly reviewed the contributing status of the homes on this block of Yale Avenue and recommended that the contributing and non-contributing status of structures on the block be discussed in detail at a later date.

Analysis

The homes in the proposed Yalecrest—Upper Yale Local Historic District are relatively intact and maintain a high level of integrity. According to the survey, the method used to evaluate the properties was based on age and architectural integrity as follows:

A – Eligible/significant: A contributing building built within the historic period and retains integrity; excellent example of a style; unaltered or only minor alterations or additions; individually eligible for National Register architectural significance; also, buildings of know historical significance.

B – Eligible/Contributing: A contributing building built within the historic period and retains integrity; good example of a style or type, but not as well-preserved or well-executed as “A” buildings, though overall integrity is retained eligible for National Register as part of a potential historic district primarily for historical, rather than architectural, reasons. The additions do not detract and may be reversible.

C – Ineligible/Non-Contributing: A non-contributing building built during the historic period but has had major alterations or additions; no longer retains integrity. The resource may still have local historical significance.

D – Out-of-period: A non-contributing building constructed outside the historic period.

This rating system is the standard used for all o f the historic surveys done in Salt Lake City. Under this rating system, properties rated “A” and “B” are considered to be contributing buildings. Buildings rated “C” and “D” are considered to be non-contributing.

Proposed Changes

1703 Yale Avenue

The 2005 RLS rated this two story home as “C” – Ineligible (non-contributing) with no indication as to why it was rated as a “C”. After further analysis and discussions with SHPO staff, it has been determined that the home is a contributing structure. In fact, this home was one of the display homes for the Upper Yale subdivision and appears to be very similar today as when it was originally built. Staff recommends that this home be rated “B” as a contributing building.



1703 Yale Avenue historical and current photographs

1713 Yale Avenue

The 2005 RLS rated this home as an “A”. Unfortunately, the home that was there previously was destroyed by a fire sometime since the survey was completed. A new home was built on the lot in 2011 and has no historic value. Staff recommends that this home be rated as a “D – Out-of-period” because it was not built during the historic period and is less than 50 years old. It would be rated non-contributing.



1713 Yale Avenue historical and current photographs

1732 Yale Avenue

This home is rated as an “A” on the 2005 RLS survey. Planning staff and SHPO staff determined that this property should be changed to a “C – Ineligible” due to the many modifications done to the structure. Some changes made include: a large two-story addition at the rear, a new dormer window on the front and the enclosure of the porch. The building would be changed from a contributing to non-contributing structure.



1732 Yale Avenue historical and current photographs

1780 Yale Avenue

The 2005 RLS survey categorizes this residence at an “A”. Staff recommends that this property be changed to a “C – Ineligible” due to the out of period and context front porch addition. The status of the structure would be changed from contributing to non-contributing.



1780 Yale Avenue historical and current photographs

Summary of Proposed Changes:

Three contributing properties will be changed to non-contributing.
One non-contributing property will be changed to contributing.

Conclusion

Based on this re-evaluation, Staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission accepts the following amendments to the 2005 Yalecrest Reconnaissance Level Survey (see table on the following page 5). With the proposed amendments, the Yalecrest—Upper Yale Local Historic District would have 21 contributing buildings (75%) and seven non-contributing buildings. If the proposed local historic district is designated by City Council, Planning Staff will use these rating to determine how the properties will be evaluated in using the; 1) standards for the alteration of a contributing building (21A.34.020G), or 2) the standards for the alteration of a noncontributing building (21A.34.020H).

**COMPARISON: 2005 YALECREST ARCHITECTURAL SURVEY AND
PROPOSED UPPER YALE CONTRIBUTING STATUS RATINGS**

Address	Yalecrest RLS Rating 2005	Upper Yale Proposed Rating 2014	Comments
1703 E. Yale Avenue	C	B	After analysis and discussions with SHPO staff, it has been determined that the home is a contributing structure.
1713 E. Yale Avenue	A	D	New home – out of period.
1732 E. Yale Avenue	A	C	Remodel out of character and changed several historic features.
1780 E. Yale Avenue	A	C	Porch addition.