



Communication to the Historic Landmark Commission

DATE: October 2, 2014

TO: Historic Landmark Commission Members

FROM: Carl Leith
Senior Planner – Historic Preservation

RE: Acceptance of the Contributing/Non-Contributing Status of properties within the proposed Yalecrest—Princeton Park Local Historic District

Recommendation

Based upon a review of the 2005 Yalecrest Reconnaissance Level Survey, review of the existing history and integrity of the homes within the proposed Yalecrest—Princeton Park Local Historic District, and a review of new submitted information, the Planning staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission accept the proposed amendment to the contributing and non-contributing status of homes within the proposed Yalecrest—Princeton Park Local Historic District (see the proposed rating for one property in this memo).

Summary 2005 Yalecrest Reconnaissance Level Survey and the Proposed Yalecrest – Princeton Park Local Historic District Ratings

Rating	2005 RLS Status	Proposed Status
Contributing	25 (93%)	26 (96%)
Noncontributing	2 (7%)	1 (4%)
Total Number of Principal Structures	27	27

Background

On September 4, 2014, the Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing on the proposed designation of the Yalecrest—Princeton Park Local Historic District, located on Princeton Avenue between 1700 East and 1800 East. At the public hearing, the Planning Staff briefly reviewed the contributing status of the homes on this block of Princeton Avenue and recommended that the contributing and non-contributing status of structures on the block be discussed in detail at a later date.

Analysis

The homes in the proposed Yalecrest—Princeton Park Local Historic District are relatively intact and maintain a high level of integrity. According to the survey, the method used to evaluate the properties was based on age and architectural integrity as follows:

A – Eligible/significant: A contributing building built within the historic period and retains integrity; excellent example of a style; unaltered or only minor alterations or additions; individually eligible for National Register architectural significance; also, buildings of know historical significance.

B – Eligible/Contributing: A contributing building built within the historic period and retains integrity; good example of a style or type, but not as well-preserved or well-executed as “A” buildings, though overall integrity is retained eligible for National Register as part of a potential historic district primarily for historical, rather than architectural, reasons. The additions do not detract and may be reversible.

C – Ineligible/Non-Contributing: A non-contributing building built during the historic period but has had major alterations or additions; no longer retains integrity. The resource may still have local historical significance.

D – Out-of-period: A non-contributing building constructed outside the historic period.

This rating system is the standard used for all o f the historic surveys done in Salt Lake City. Under this rating system, properties rated “A” and “B” are considered to be contributing buildings. Buildings rated “C” and “D” are considered to be non-contributing.

Proposed Changes

1785 Princeton Avenue

The 2005 RLS rated this two story home as “C” – Ineligible (non-contributing) with an evaluation that the second story was a later addition to the building. Upon further analysis, and discussions with SHPO staff, it has been concluded that the second story is in fact original and that the home is a contributing structure. The house appears to be very similar today as when it was originally built. Staff recommends that this home be rated as a contributing building.

1785 Princeton Avenue historical and current photographs



Conclusion

Based on this re-evaluation, Staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission accepts the following amendment to the 2005 Yalecrest Reconnaissance Level Survey (see table below). With the proposed amendments, the Yalecrest—Princeton Park Local Historic District would have 26 contributing buildings (96%) and one non-contributing building. If the proposed local historic district is designated by City Council, Planning Staff will use these rating to determine how the properties will be evaluated in using the; 1) standards for the alteration of a contributing building (21A.34.020G), or 2) the standards for the alteration of a noncontributing building (21A.34.020H).

COMPARISON: 2005 YALECREST ARCHITECTURAL SURVEY AND PROPOSED PRINCETON PARK CONTRIBUTING STATUS RATINGS

Address	Yalecrest RLS Rating 2005	Princeton Proposed Rating 2014	Comments
1785 E Princeton Avenue	C	B	After analysis and discussions with SHPO staff, it has been determined that the home is a contributing structure.