

SALT LAKE CITY
HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
Minutes of the Meeting
Room 326, 451 South State Street
May 2, 2013

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Historic Landmark Commission Meeting. The meeting was called to order at [5:46:41 PM](#). Audio recordings of the Historic Landmark Commission meetings are retained in the Planning Office for an indefinite period of time.

Present for the Historic Landmark Commission meeting were: Vice Chair Polly, Hart, Earle Bevins III, Arla Funk, Robert McClintic, Charles Shepherd and Heather Thuet. Chairperson Sheleigh Harding; Commissioners, Stephen James and Thomas Brennan were excused

Planning Staff members present at the meeting were: Cheri Coffey, Assistant Planning Director; Joel Paterson, Planning Manager; Carl Leith, Senior Planner; Janice Lew; Senior Planner and Michelle Moeller, Senior Secretary.

FIELD TRIP NOTES:

No field trip was scheduled for this meeting.

DINNER [5:47:01 PM](#)

Dinner was served to the Commission and Staff at 5:00 p.m. a briefing on the Design Guidelines for Apartments and Multi-Family Buildings in Salt Lake City was given by Carl Leith, Senior Planner.

Design Guidelines for Apartments and Multi-Family Buildings in Salt Lake City - New Construction Section. Draft 2 - This is an introduction to the second draft of the section addressing the Construction of New Multi-Family Buildings in the city's historic districts. This draft includes revisions and additions to text and illustrations following previous Sub-Committee and full Commission review and discussion on the range of design criteria important to the sensitive and compatible design of a new multi-family building in a historic setting. (Staff contact: Carl Leith at 801-535-7758, or carl.leith@slcgov.com) Case number: PLNPCM2012-00870

Mr. Carl Leith, Senior Planner, reviewed the proposal as presented (available in the Planning Office). He stated the proposal would be presented to the Commission at a future meeting for approval.

The Commission stated they would email comments and corrections to Staff. They commend Mr. Leith on a job well done.

REPORT OF THE CHAIR OR VICE CHAIR [5:47:24 PM](#)

Vice Chair Hart stated she had nothing to report at this time

REPORT OF THE DIRECTOR [5:47:33 PM](#)

Mr. Joel Paterson, Planning Manager, stated he had nothing to report at this time.

APPROVAL OF THE April 4, 2013 MINUTES [5:47:38 PM](#)

MOTION

Commissioner Bevins moved to approve the minutes of April 4, 2013. Commissioner Funk seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

PUBLIC COMMENTS [5:48:14 PM](#)

No one wished to speak at this time.

PUBLIC HEARINGS [5:48:31 PM](#)

Avenues National Register Historic District - Utah's State Historic Preservation Office is soliciting comments from the Historic Landmark Commission regarding amendments to the National Register of Historic Places Registration Form for the Avenues Historic District. The historic district is bounded roughly by 'A' Street, Virginia Street, Sixth Avenue and South Temple Street. The subject property is within Council District 3, represented by Stan Penfold. (Staff contact: Janice Lew at (801) 535-7625 or janice.lew@slcgov.com).

Ms. Janice Lew, Senior Planner reviewed the petition as presented in the Staff Report (located in the Case File). She stated Staff was recommending the Commission forward a favorable recommendation to the Board of State History.

Ms. Korral Broschinsky gave a presentation of the National Register of Historic Places. She gave the history of the area and reviewed the proposed amendments as out lined in the Staff Report.

The Commission asked if there were building construction prior to 1857 in the Avenues. Ms. Broschinsky stated not that had been documented a study on adobe structures is currently underway.

The Commission and Ms. Broschinsky discussed what areas of the Avenues had been surveyed and those that need to be updated. They discussed what adding the upper avenues would do to the percentage of non-contributing structures. The Commission and

Ms. Broschinsky discussed what the census data would reflect for different housing in the area.

PUBLIC HEARING [6:06:48 PM](#)

Vice Chairperson Hart opened the Public Hearing. Seeing no one was present to speak for or against the petition, Vice Chairperson Hart closed the Public Hearing.

MOTION [6:07:23 PM](#)

Commissioner Funk stated in regards to the Avenues National Register Historic District amendments she moved that the Historic Landmark Commission forward a favorable recommendation to the Utah State Historic Preservation. Commissioner Shepherd seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

WORK SESSION [6:08:29 PM](#)

Demolition of Historic Buildings – Salt Lake City Mayor Ralph Becker requesting that the City adopt new regulations that will clarify how proposed demolitions of landmark sites and contributing buildings will be evaluated and the process for approving or denying a demolition request. This proposal will generally affect section 21A.34.020 of the Zoning Ordinance. Related provisions of Title 21A-Zoning may also be amended as part of this petition. If adopted, the proposed changes would apply to all City designated Landmark Sites and contributing buildings in local historic districts. (Staff contact: Janice Lew at 801-535-7625 or janice.lew@slcgov.com). File number: PLNPCM2009-00014

Ms. Janice Lew, Senior Planner reviewed the petition as presented in the Staff Report (located in the Case File). She stated Staff would bring the petition to the Commission for approval at a later date.

The Commission and Staff discussed why there was a two step process and what was being addressed to ensure the proposal was appropriate for the area.

The Commissioners discussed the steps of the proposed process and if the Historic Landmark Commission was the appropriate decision body. They discussed who should be making the final decision on demolitions and the conflicts of having other City Commissions review historic demolitions.

The Commission and Staff discussed the criteria Staff used to evaluate proposals for demolition. They discussed the Historic Landmark Commissions duties and roles in protecting historic buildings. The Commissioners discussed what other negotiations needed to be addressed such as relocating structures that would protect the structures and

still allow applicants to develop their properties. The Commissioners discussed the Special Merit Exception and if it should remain part of the ordinance. They stated the economic hardship section allowed people to prove viability of the property. The Commission discussed if the Special Merit Exception could be removed from the ordinance.

Staff stated what they were trying to do was implement the Preservation Plan where the process weighs the interests of the City.

The Commission reviewed the conversation from the April 4, Historic Landmark Commission meeting and how the new proposal addressed those concerns. They discussed options for proposals such as requiring applicants to incorporate existing structures into new construction.

Vice Chairperson Polly Hart stated the special merit exception was not necessary because there were currently options for people to demolish buildings; the City was not leaving people without options. She stated legitimate options exist and the financial hardship clause isn't really an obstacle so much as a hoop to be jumped through.

The Commissioners and Staff discussed the legality of the Special Merit Exception and why it was necessary to have a provision for demolition. They discussed what was meant by "determination of significant public benefit" and who should determine if it existed. The Commission discussed what changes had been made to the proposal giving the Historic Landmark Commission final approval. The Commission and Staff discussed the demolition process and the length of time allowed to approve or deny a demolition. They asked Staff to provide examples from other City that have similar ordinances and how they are used.

Ms. Coffey read from the Preservation Plan and reviewed the options the Commission could take regarding the proposal.

The Commission agreed to table the issue for further discussion.

Ms. Cheri Coffey stated the Mayor reappointed Sheleigh Harding to the Historic Landmark Commission; her term will be for four years. She reviewed the preservation conference and reported on Mr. Paterson's visit to Tucson, Arizona to discuss the Preservation Plan.

The meeting stood adjourned at [7:13:41 PM](#)