


# Memorandum

Planning Division  
Community & Economic Development Department

---

To: Historic Landmark Commission

From: Lex Traugher – Principal Planner 

Date: May 19, 2010

CC: Ruth Ann Trudell & Joan Thompson – Property Owners/Applicants

Re: Petition PLNHLC2010-00057, Trudell/Thompson –  
Window Replacement

---

On May 5, 2010, the Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing and considered the above referenced petition, making a motion to consider the subject structure noncontributory and requested that the application be sent back to Planning Staff for further review of the proposed window replacement project.

Section 21A.34.020(B)(2) of the Zoning Ordinance defines "Contributing Structure" and reads, "A contributing structure is a structure or site within an H historic preservation overlay district that meets the criteria outlined in subsection C2 of this section and is of moderate importance to the city, state, region or nation because it imparts artistic, historic or cultural values. A contributing structure has its major character defining features intact and although minor alterations may have occurred they are generally reversible. Historic materials may have been covered but evidence indicates they are intact."

On the other hand, Section 21A.34.020(B)(3) of the Zoning Ordinance defines "Noncontributing Structure" stating, "A noncontributing structure is a structure within an H historic preservation overlay district that does not meet the criteria listed in subsection C2 of this section. The major character defining features have been so altered as to make the original and/or historic form, materials and details indistinguishable and alterations are irreversible. Noncontributing structures also include those which are less than fifty (50) years old."

Section 21A.34.020(C)(2) of the Zoning Ordinance, referenced in the above definitions, outlines the criteria used to evaluate the contributory or noncontributory status of an individual property within an historic district. Specifically, and most relevant in this instance, Section 21A.34.020(C)(2)(b) references the necessity to evaluate the physical integrity of a structure in terms of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association as defined by the National Park Service for the National Register of Historic Places.

It is under the authority of these Zoning Ordinance Sections that the Historic Landmark Commission makes the following findings in terms of Petition PLNHLC2010-00057, located at 249 South 1100 East:

Findings:

The subject home is a noncontributory structure in the University Historic District based on the criteria in Section 21A.34.020(C)(2)(b) of the Zoning Ordinance. The home has undergone extensive and irreversible alterations over the years and has lost the ability to meet the definition a contributing structure in the District. Exterior alterations to said structure shall be reviewed in accordance with Zoning Ordinance Section 21A.34.020(H) which addresses the "Standards for a Certificate of Appropriateness Involving New Construction or Alteration of a Non-Contributing Structure."