

**SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
MINUTES OF THE MEETING
Room 315, 451 South State Street
August 5, 2009 at 5:45 p.m.**

This document along with the digital recording constitute the official minutes of the Historic Landmark Commission regular session meeting held on August 5, 2009.

If you are viewing a hard copy of the minutes and would like to view the attached materials and listen to audio excerpts of the record, please go to:

www.slcgov.com/boards/HLC/hlc-agen.htm

To download the FTR player and listen to audio excerpts from the record if you are already viewing this document on the worldwide web, click [here](#).

The regular meeting of the Historic Landmark Commission was held on August 5, 2009, at [5:46:53 PM](#) in Room 315 of the City and County Building, located at 451 South State Street, Salt Lake City, Utah, 84111. Commissioners present for the meeting included: David Fitzsimmons (Chairperson), Warren Lloyd (Vice Chair), Anne Oliver, Polly Hart, Bill Davis, Sheleigh Harding, and Creed Haymond. Planning staff present for the meeting were: Robin Zeigler, Senior Preservation Planner; Janice Lew, Principal Planner; and Angela Brusatto, Historic Landmark Commission Secretary.

A field trip was held prior to the meeting at 4:00 p.m. The field trip was attended by David Fitzsimmons (Chairperson), Bill Davis, Warren Lloyd, Creed Haymond and Robin Zeigler attended for the Planning Division.

FIELD TRIP 4:00 p.m.

On the field trip, the Commission visited one location, 1014 3rd Avenue. Staff pointed out the rear additions and carport that would be removed, the location of the garage, and the location of other alterations proposed. The Commission asked questions about the height, repetition of the corbels and their materials, and if the foundation would remain painted.

DINNER [5:03:01 PM](#)

Robin Zeigler introduced Terry Beaver, a consultant for Utah Solar Energy Association, to give a presentation on alternative energy, photovoltaic energy and other types of solar technology. Mr. Beaver presented many different types of panels; thin film, flat plate PV systems, and other array systems, along with the advantages and disadvantages of converting to solar power, and the credits allowed by the power company and federal government that was available for conversion to solar energy. Mr. Beaver concluded his presentation by inviting the Commission to attend the Utah Solar Tour on Saturday September 12, 2009 touring solar powered homes. Additional information may be found at www.utsolar.org.

Robin Zeigler introduced the new Historic Landmark Commission secretary Angi Brusatto and acknowledged former Historic Landmark Commissioners attending the dinner meeting that would be honored for their service during the meeting.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER [5:50:55 PM](#)

PRESENTATION [5:53:09 PM](#)

Chairperson David Fitzsimmons recognized the service of the former commissioners of the Historic Landmark Commission; Jessica Norie, Pete Ashdown, Esther Hunter, and Noreen Hammond-Heid and presented them with plaques.

AMENDED MEETING CALLED TO ORDER [6:02:15 PM](#)

Chairperson Fitzsimmons stated that the comments to the Commission would be moved to the beginning of the agenda instead of at end of the session. Chairperson Fitzsimmons reminded the Commission of the cancellation of **PLNHLC2009-00453-1130 East 300 South Minor Alteration**.

COMMENTS TO THE COMMISSION [6:03:37 PM](#)

Chairperson Fitzsimmons invited Cindy Cromer to address the Commission. Ms. Cromer addressed the issue of preserving the historic glass in replacement windows and asked the Commission to be diligent in fighting for retainment of the original glass in the original windows.

PLNHLC2009-00706 – 1014 3rd Avenue Major Alterations [6:06:25 PM](#) – A request by Sandra Secrest Hatch, architect representing owner John Conboy, for a major alteration including a new garage, removal and construction of rear additions and minor alterations to the building located at approximately 1014 3rd Avenue. The project will require review of additional height for the new addition. The site is zoned SR-1A and is located in City Commission District 3, represented by Commission Member Eric Jergensen. [View staff report.](#)

PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION [6:06:35 PM](#)

Robin Zeigler presented the proposed plans for the Anderson-Lymon house. Ms. Zeigler explained the proposed demolition, the planned additions, and the materials to be used, which were brick, new and existing, 8 inch colonial smooth, 4 inch trim Hardie board, stone foundation painted to match existing foundation, and the roofing would be asphalt shingles to match the existing roof. The windows would be two-over-two aluminum clad and designed to reflect the design of existing windows. Ms. Zeigler stated that the proposed additional height requires approval, that additional height would be 38 feet, and the ordinance allowed for 23 feet for the average in the block. Staff recommended approval for this addition.

Commissioner Oliver inquired if the height ordinance was for the whole district and Ms. Zeigler corrected it to be for the block. Commissioner Oliver agreed with the proposed addition being consistent with the whole block.

Applicant Response [6:10:31 PM](#)

Ms. Hatch inquired if the Commission had any questions. She mentioned that she had designed a previous addition to the east of the proposed residence and on the other side of the residence.

Commissioner Lloyd inquired if the garage would be the same as the existing garage. Ms. Hatch responded that the garage will be a little bit deeper. Ms. Hatch also mentioned that there was an alley and an easement along that location.

Public Comments [6:12:12 PM](#)

No response.

MOTION [6:13:08 PM](#)

Commissioner Oliver moved in the case of PLNHLC2009-00706 – 1014 3rd Avenue Major Alterations, that the Commission approve the application as submitted as well as the additional height, based on the findings and facts of the staff report and because the application meets all applicable standards of section 21A.34.02G of the ordinance.

Commissioner Hart seconded the motion.

All voted in favor; the motion passed unanimously.

PLNHLC2008-00684 – Tracy Aviary, Major & Minor Alterations and New Construction [6:14:47](#)

[PM](#)– A request by Paul Svendsen, representing the Tracy Aviary, for major alterations to the Wilson Pavilion, new construction of exhibit space, the installation of temporary holding structures and review of a master plan for the Tracy Aviary located approximately 589 East 1300 South in Liberty Park. Tracy Aviary is located in the Landmark Site of Liberty Park. Tracy Aviary is zoned OS Open Space and is located in City Commission District 4, represented by Commission Member Luke Garrott. [View staff report](#)

PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION [6:14:58 PM](#)

Ms. Zeigler inquired of the Commission if the proposed project should be presented to the Commission as four components of the project or as four different applications.

Commissioner Hart requested that the project be treated as four different applications for presentation purpose. Ms. Zeigler agreed that they were very different projects and the Commission agreed along with Commissioner Lloyd expressing concern that there would be no additional burden to the applicant regarding fees. Ms. Zeigler confirmed that there would be no additional costs, it was still listed under one application number, but would require four separate votes from the Commission. Commissioner Oliver requested that the project be combined into three projects, rather than four.

Ms. Zeigler discussed the first of three parts of the Tracy Aviary reconstruction project, specifically the construction of the Southern Ground Horned Bills exhibit. Staff recommended approval because the building was in keeping with previous structures and materials that had been approved.

Applicant Response [6:17:52 PM](#)

Paul Svendson represents the Tracy Aviary, 589 East 1300 South, SLC. Mr. Svendson reiterated the background needs for the building from the previous session when the issue was originally presented.

Commissioner Warren asked questions regarding the design intent of the structure. Mr. Svendson confirmed that the structure is going to be built with concrete masonry unit block walls with cladding and Hardie board, which would allow for insulation for efficiency. Mr. Svendson introduced the architect, Kenton Peters, and Mr. Peters confirmed that the building would be identical to another structure, with exception to the mesh wiring.

Commissioner Oliver inquired of the Association of Zoos and Aquariums requirements regarding windows in the structure. Mr. Svendson described the lack of windows was due to the risk of birds flying into the windows and because the emu's beaks, being extremely strong, could be an injured.

Public Comments

No response.

Commission Comments

No response.

MOTION [6:25:20 PM](#)

Commissioner Harding moved in the case of PLNHL2008-00684 that the Commission approve the new construction of a Southern Ground Horned Bills exhibit based on the findings listed in the staff report.

Commissioner Haymond seconded the motion.

All voted in favor; the motion passed unanimously.

PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION [6:26:34 PM](#)

Ms. Zeigler presented the second of three parts regarding the Tracy Aviary reconstruction, the remodel of the Wilson Pavilion. Ms. Zeigler explained the location of the temporary trailer during the construction and that it was estimated to be needed for approximately nine months.

Applicant Response [6:30:24 PM](#)

Mr. Svendson discussed design changes from the previous session. Mr. Svendson noted the concern the Commission had with the sky lights, mainly the height, and Mr. Svendson stated that the architect was able to get the protrusion of the sky lights on the roof line down by six inches. He discussed the changes of the roof line, vestibule, and other elements planned. Mr. Svendson discussed the placement of a temporary structure during construction in two different potential locations. Commissioner Lloyd inquired of the changes that were being proposed to the, curved glulam beams, and asked for a clarification. Mr. Svendson noted that the original beams would be retained, but those originally planned for the entrance will be a Teflon fabric.

Public Hearing [6:38:17 PM](#)

Chairperson Fitzsimmons invited Cindy Cromer to address the Commission. Ms. Cromer commended the improvements on the sky lights as positive, but she stated some concerns with the location of the temporary structure. Ms. Cromer also gave a background on the murals presently seen at the back of the exterior exhibits of the Wilson Pavilion.

Executive Session [6:40:08 PM](#)

Chairperson Fitzsimmons noted that the design was acceptable and stated that the Commission agreed. He suggested dealing administratively for the placement of the structures for the birds.

Ms. Zeigler suggested the following language regarding the structure be considered, “the temporary structure may go anywhere in the aviary where it is not affecting or changing any existing features.” Chairperson Fitzsimmons agreed.

MOTION [6:41:13 PM](#)

Commissioner Oliver moved in the case of PLNHLC2008-00684 that the Commission approve the proposed renovation of the Wilson Pavilion as presented in the staff report and approve the installation of a temporary building with the location to be at the discretion of the aviary so long as it does not disrupt any existing buildings or landscape features because this project potentially meets the applicable standards and for the reasons presented in the staff report.

Commissioner Harding seconded the motion.

All voted in favor; the motion passed unanimously.

PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSION [6:42:36 PM](#)

Ms. Zeigler presented the third part of the Tracey Aviary Reconstruction, the review of the Master Plan. She presented a list of buildings and structures that staff recommended be determined as non-significant and could therefore be removed including the current entrance, the gift store, red-crowned crane exhibit, the pavilion structure, magpie-coo coo exhibit, condor exhibit, Conner exhibit, bird show building, CMU building, mobile structure, yellow bricked building, and a framed ticket booth. Staff recommended that the duck pond and the Southern Ground Horned Bills exhibit be documented if removed or filled in, the office and the feed

building be retained, the wood bridge be assessed for integrity, and the buildings discussed in the first half of the report be considered non-significant.

Applicant Presentation [6:51:23 PM](#)

Mr. Svendson discussed with the Commission the plans to adjust the Master Plan with the help of GSPS architects, a zoological architect, along with a bird show consultant and expert. He informed the Commission that there was no pertinent request to demolish any of the structures, but inquired of the options the aviary had with regards to the reconstruction plans. Mr. Svendson asked the Commission for guidance on the aquarium, building 16, in the inventory, and the wood bridge.

Chairperson Fitzsimmons asked Mr. Svendson if it would be an option to table the issue. Mr. Svendson responded that it was more helpful knowing which buildings are important for planning purposes.

Public Hearing [7:02:11 PM](#)

Chairperson Fitzsimmons invited Cindy Cromer to address the Commission. Ms. Cromer concurred that the original structures needed to be retained even if they were not viable for use.

Kenton Peters address the Commission regarding building 14 in the inventory. He encouraged the Commission to remove this structure as it was built after the original structures were built.

Executive Session [7:04:57 PM](#)

Commissioner Hart questioned the staff on buildings, 10, 12, and 30 of the inventory. Ms. Zeigler noted that the damage to structure 10 undermining its integrity. Structures 12 and 30 were not old enough to be considered significant. She confirmed that staff recommend keeping buildings 16 and 17, which were constructed in 1938.

MOTION [7:08:58 PM](#)

Commissioner Oliver moved in the case of PLNHLC2008-00684 that we concur with some of the findings with exceptions noted as follows; the duck pond be documented following the State Historic Preservation Offices requirements for intensive level surveys prior to removal and that it is not necessary to document the Southern Ground Hornbills because it does not appear on the 1968 detailed map of the aviary, that the office/aquarium and feed building be retained and interpreted, that it is not necessary to document the wood bridge as suggested by staff because it does not appear in its current location on the 1968 map either and thus is probably less than 50 years old and that all other buildings noted on the June 2009 inventory as planned to be remove are appropriate to remove if necessary.

Commissioner Harding seconded the motion.

All voted in favor; the motion passed unanimously.

THIS ITEM WAS CANCELLED

PLNHLC2009-00453 – 1130 East 300 South Minor Alteration - A request by Patrick Lawrence to build an oversized garage located at approximately 1130 East 300 South in the University Historic District. The property is zoned R-2 and is located in Commission District 4 represented by Luke Garrott.

ISSUES ONLY [:11:44 PM](#)

PLNPCM2009-00628 - Commercial Design Guidelines —The Salt Lake Planning Division has hired consultants Thomason & Associates to create a new chapter for the design guidelines used by the Historic Landmark Commission to make design review decisions for properties with local historic designation. Currently the design guidelines are for residential properties only. This supplemental information will provide guidance for commercial properties. The draft design guidelines are available on the City’s website at slcgov.com/boards/hlc/hlc-agen.htm [staff report](#)

Staff Presentation [7:15:21 PM](#)

Janice Lew presented the plans for revising the Commercial Design Guidelines; preservation, architectural style, rehabilitation standards, standards for new construction, general design guidelines, and then a section that discusses the various districts. Ms. Lew addressed the Commission asking for guidance and direction on revising the guidelines, with a strong emphasis on signage and photos.

Questions by the Commission [7:30:14 PM](#)

Chairperson Fitzsimmons voiced his concern of the global outlook of the preservation guidelines in regards to commercial historic buildings. Commissioner Lloyd suggested using language describing problem areas and usage for commercial buildings. Ms. Lew suggested breaking up the section into smaller sections for presentation and Commissioner Polly agreed with Ms. Lew. Commission would communicate with staff through email for suggestions and questions on revisions. Commissioner Oliver suggested having these discussions during the dinner hour prior to the meetings and all have agreed to discuss the specifics of revising the guidelines at the dinner meetings prior to the open Commission meetings.

Public Comment [7:51:01 PM](#)

Chairperson Fitzsimmons invited Cindy Cromer to address the Commission. Ms. Cromer suggested that the language “sustainability” be added into the revised guidelines.

OTHER BUSINESS: [7:52:25 PM](#)

Chairperson Fitzsimmons announced the election of new officers. Chairperson Fitzsimmons opened the floor for nominations for Chairperson.

MOTION [7:53:04 PM](#)

Commissioner Hart nominated Commissioner Warren Lloyd for Chairperson.

All voted in favor; the nomination passed unanimously.

OTHER BUSINESS: [7:53:40 PM](#)

Chairperson Fitzsimmons opened the floor for nominations for Vice Chairperson.

MOTION [7:54:02 PM](#)

Commissioner Hart nominated Commissioner Anne Oliver for Vice Chairperson.

All voted in favor; the nomination passed unanimously.

MOTION [7:54:34 PM](#)

Commissioner Hart motioned for the meeting to be adjourned.

Commissioner Lloyd seconded the motion.

All voted in favor; the motion passed unanimously, meeting adjourned.

Angela Brusatto, Historic Landmark Commission Secretary