## GEORGE G. SHAW, AICP PLANNING DIRECTOR

## <u>Salti Lake; Ghiy Corporation</u>

DEPARTMENT OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT PLANNING AND ZONING DIVISION

ROSS C. "ROCKY" ANDERSON MAYOR

COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

A. LOUIS ZUNGUZE

DOUGLAS L. WHEELWRIGHT, AICP DEPUTY PLANNING DIRECTOR

CHERL COFFEY, AICH DEPUTY PLANNING DIRECTOR

## **MEMORANDUM**

DATE:

September 14, 2007

TO:

Mayor

City Council

FROM:

Cheri Coffey, Deputy Planning Director

RE:

SUMMARY OF ACTIONS TAKEN BY THE HISTORIC LANDMARK

COMMISSION AT THE SEPTEMBER 5, 2007 MEETING.

The following summary of actions by the Historic Landmark Commission is being provided to you for information purposes only. No action by the Administration or Council is required at this time.

Case No. 470-07-27 Pioneer Park Phase I Stage I (minor alteration) — a request by Salt Lake City Public Services Department, represented by Dell Cook, is located at Pioneer Park approximately 350 South 300 West. The Historic Landmark Commission approved Stage 1, Phase 1 improvements with the exception of the tree plan on August 1, 2007. Pioneer Park is designated as a Landmark Site on the Salt Lake City Register of Cultural Resources and the property is zoned Open Space (OS).

Council District: 4

Council Member: Nancy Saxton

Decision: The Historic Landmark Commission made two motions.

- 1) To approve the proposed plan with conditions.
- 2) To draft a letter to the Public Services Director that future Phased improvements for Pioneer Park include a long term maintenance and treatment plan for the trees in Pioneer Park with an estimated budget for maintaining the trees.

Case No. 470-07-21 Trolley Square (new construction and major alterations) — a request by Trolley Square Associates, LLC, to build multiple new structures at Trolley Square, located at approximately 602 East 500 South. The new structures include a 10,372 square foot addition to an existing structure, a new 52,293 square foot building and a 23,500 square foot building. Trolley Square is designated as a Historic Landmark Site on the Salt Lake City Register of Cultural Resources and is located within the Central City Historic District. The property is zoned Community Shopping (CS). (This item was tabled at the August 1, 2007 meeting.)

Council District: 4

Council Member: Nancy Saxton **Decision: Approved with conditions** 

Case No. 470-07-25 Kevin Bott Garage (minor construction) - a request by Kevin Bott, represented by Max Smith, Architect, for approval to construct a detached garage, located at approximately 576 East South Temple Street in the South Temple Historic District.

Council District: 4

Council Member: Nancy Saxton **Decision: Approved with conditions** 

> 451 SOUTH STATE STREET, ROOM 406, SALT LAKE CITY, UTAH 84111 TELEPHONE: 801-535-7902 FAX: 801-535-6174 TDD: 801-535-6021



Case No. 470-07- 31 Salt Lake City Library/ O.C. Tanner (major alteration) — a request by OC Tanner, represented by Kent Murdock for approval to renovate the Landmark Site located at approximately 15 South State Street. The structure is the old Salt Lake Library/Hansen Planetarium and is listed on the City's Register of Cultural. The property is located in the Central Business District D-1 Zoning District.

Council District: 4

Council Member: Nancy Saxton Decision: Approved with conditions

Case No. 470-07- 32 Yalecrest Historic District — solicit comments for listing "The Yalecrest Historic District" on the National Register of Historic Places. The proposed Yalecrest Historic District is located between Sunnyside Avenue and 1300 South between 1300 East and 1900 East.

Council District: 5

Council Member: Jill Remington Love

Decision: The Historic Landmark Commission forwarded a positive recommendation to

the State Board of History.

Case No. 470-06-57 Everest Builders (demolition) — a request by Everest Builders, represented by Eric Saxey. This case was remanded back to the Historic Landmark Commission by the Land Use Appeals Board on August 13, 2007. The Land Use Appeals Board remanded the case back to the Historic Landmark Commission decision to reconsider the April 4, 2007, findings of the Historic Landmark Commission regarding the proposed demolition of contributory structures located at approximately 256 South 700 East, 262-264 South 700 East, and 268 South 700 East, in the Central City Historic District.

Council District: 4

**Council Member: Nancy Saxton** 

Decision: The Historic Landmark Commission reversed the Economic Review Panel's decision by a 3/4 vote finding that the Economic Review Panel made an erroneous finding of material fact. For additional information, see the Attachment 1.

cc:

Louis Zunguze. Community Development Director George Shaw, Planning Director Doug Wheelwright, Deputy Planning Director Cheri Coffey, Deputy Planning Director Lyn Creswell, Chief Administrative Officer Cindy Gust-Jenson, City Council Executive Director Janice Jardine, City Council Office Orion Goff, Building Services and Licensing Director DJ Baxter, Redevelopment Agency Director John Naser, Engineering Director Kevin Young, Transportation Planning Engineer Lynn Pace, Deputy City Attorney John Spencer, Property Management City Council Liaisons Frank Algarin, Planning Commission Tim Chambless, Planning Commission Babs De Lay, Planning Commission Robert Forbis, Planning Commission Peggy McDonough, Planning Commission Susie McHugh, Planning Commission Prescott Muir, Planning Commission Kathy Scott, Planning Commission

Matthew Wirthlin, Planning Commission Mary J. Woodhead, Planning Commission Tom Berggren, Board of Adjustment Catherine Dunn, Board of Adjustment Gary M. Jones, Board of Adjustment Michael F. Jones, Board of Adjustment Rex Olsen, Board of Adjustment Historic Landmark Commission File

## Attachment 1

The Historic Landmark Commission passed a motion to deny the request of Economic Hardship based on the determination that the Economic Review Panel's decision was based on an erroneous finding of a material fact which was that the applicant did not explore all options for alternative scenarios (criteria d of the Economic Hardship Criteria) and that after review of the evidence submitted, public testimony, discussion of each criteria for Economic Hardship and the Staff Recommendation found in the September 5, 2007 staff report, that denial of the demolition would not result in an Economic Hardship based on the following:

- 1. The applicant failed to provide an adequate analysis of alternative scenarios which may produce a reasonable economic return on the property while preserving one or more of the contributing structures (Standard 21A.34.020.K.d) and
- 2. If the applicant had adequately analyzed alternative scenarios, he may have determined that an economic return on the property could occur with the preservation of one or more of the contributing structures which may have led to the availability of tax credits to offset some of the cost of rehabilitation of the contributing structures, making the project more economically viable.

Commissioners Hunter, Norie, and Oliver voted "aye"; Commissioner Carl voted "nay". Acting Chairperson Heid abstained. As three quarters of the Quorum supported the motion; the motion carried by majority vote.