

MEMORANDUM

451 South State Street, Room 406
Salt Lake City, Utah 84111
(801) 535-7757



Planning and Zoning Division
Department of Community Development

TO: Historic Landmark Commission

FROM: Nick Norris, Principal Planner

DATE: August 30, 2007

SUBJECT: Trolley Square Development

On August 1, 2007 the Historic Landmark Commission (HLC) remanded the proposed new construction at Trolley Square back to the established Trolley Square subcommittee. The subcommittee met on August 15. Esther Hunter, Warren Lloyd, Noreen Heid (original members of the joint subcommittee) and Creed Hammond, who requested to be on the subcommittee at the August 1st meeting, were in attendance. The motion to remand the item listed the following topics for further discussion and analysis:

1. That the applicant investigate options to reduce the mass of Building C by either reducing the size of the building or redesigning the roof structure to allow the south elevation to be terraced to improve sight lines into the site;
2. Investigate redesigning of Building P Central to increase sight lines to Building B from 600 East;
3. Provide updated drawings;
4. Provide some sort of commitment to an outdoor historical walking tour (working with the State Historical Preservation Office and the Utah Heritage Foundation) to tell the history of Trolley Square;
5. Provide a three dimensional model or perspective drawings of the proposed plan that reflect changes requested by the HLC; and
6. Provide a list of issues raised at the Issues Only Hearing.

The motion also stated that the item was to be placed on the September 5, 2007 Historic Landmark Commission agenda. It was the desire of the Commission at that time to have the applicant address the above list prior to coming back to the full HLC.

The applicants provided a three dimensional digital model of the development and provided specific perspectives into the site. The subcommittee addressed each of the above items. In terms of Building C, the subcommittee recommended pushing back the south elevation of Building C “just a bit” or cutting back the southeast corner of the building to widen the view from 700 East.

The subcommittee discussed options for Building P Central. The general idea was to improve the site lines to Building B. The model provided by the applicants showed how much of Building B would be visible from Trolley Lane. Further decreasing the height of Building P Central was mentioned as a potential solution to increasing the views.

The applicants did submit updated elevations of Building C prior to the subcommittee meeting. The elevations were distributed to the members of the subcommittee. A complete set of updated drawings has been attached to this memo.

The applicant met with staff and a representative from the Utah Heritage Foundation to discuss the walking tour. At that meeting, a dozen or so potential sites for historical markers, pictures and a description of the picture were discussed. One of the concepts discussed was to bring some of the history of the historical structures back to the public realm by placing markers at the main pedestrian entrances. The markers would contain a picture taken from a similar location and a brief description that explains the history of the original use of the site and how it has evolved over time. The walking tour is being used to help offset the impacts of the new construction on the historical nature of the site.

Staff has created a table that lists the core issues raised since the first open house on the proposed changes to Trolley Square and what has been done to date to address those issues. Some of the issues have been addressed by the Planning Commission's approval of the Planned Development. The list contains categories of issues and some issues that have not had a lot of discussion are included in the categories. The table of issues is attached to the memo.

On Wednesday August 29, staff received word from the Urban Forestry Department that the Urban Forester performed an analysis on the health of the two Fremont Poplars on 600 East. The report indicated that the trees are not healthy and are recommended for removal. An additional analysis was done by an arborist hired by the applicant that made the same recommendation. I have attached a copy of both reports. It may be possible to transplant the two plane trees that are between the Fremont Poplars to a location near where the poplars are currently planted. The plane trees would be consistent with the existing planting pattern in terms of species and spacing and be of a large enough size to make an immediate impact.

For a complete analysis of the proposal and the specific findings, please refer to the August 1, 2007 staff report for petition 410-07-21. A review of the updated drawings did not result in substantive changes to staff's original analysis findings, but staff has made modifications to the conditions of approval.

Condition number 1 has been altered based on the revised drawings. The original condition required the windows on the east elevation of Building C to be lowered so that they were similar to the store fronts on the historic buildings. Due to a grade change, an elevated planter has been added in front of one panel of the wall. Windows will be above the planter.

Condition 2 has been changed based on discussions at the subcommittee meeting. The second level openings shown on the elevations are similar in dimensions to the Utah Light and Railway logos that are found on the east and west facades of the historic buildings. The condition was modified because this is an acceptable form to base the openings off of.

Staff added a condition requiring the historical walking tour be added to the site. The walking tour will consist of a plaque with a picture and a brief description of the picture. Staff will work with the applicant and representatives from the State Historical Preservation Office and the Utah Heritage Foundation in developing the final details of the walking tour.

Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Historic Landmark Commission approves petition 470-07-21 including the revised drawings based on the analysis and findings in the August 1, 2007 staff report and information presented during the August 1, 2007 public hearing with the following conditions:

1. That the ground level windows on the east elevation of Building C be extended closer to the ground or closer to the top of the elevated planter to create a knee wall that is consistent with the store fronts of the existing buildings at Trolley Square.
2. That the parking level of Building C have cutouts that are similar in dimension to the Utah Light and Rail emblem found on the east and west elevations of the historic buildings at Trolley Square;
3. That the section of wall on the west elevation of Building C includes some design feature or artwork that creates a visually interesting terminus to Trolley Lane.
4. That the applicant includes a historical walking tour that explains the history of the site with final details of that tour delegated to the Planning Director based on input from the State Historic Preservation Office and the Utah Heritage Foundation.
5. That any damage that was done to the west façade of Building A by the 1970's addition be repaired.
6. That all deteriorating design features on the existing structures be repaired based on historical photographs, existing features, etc.

Attachments:

- A. Summary of Issues
- B. Minutes from the August 15 subcommittee meeting
- C. August 1 HLC Staff Report
- D. July 11, 2007 Planning Commission minutes
- E. Tree Analysis
- F. Site plans and building elevations

Attachment A
Summary of Issues

Attachment B
August 15 Subcommittee minutes

Attachment C
August 1 HLC staff report

Attachment D
July 11, 2007
Planning Commission
Meeting Minutes

Attachment E
Tree Analysis

Attachment F
Site Plan and Building Elevations