

**SALT LAKE CITY  
HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION  
Minutes of the Meeting  
Held at 451 South State Street, Room 126  
November 7, 2007**

A field trip preceded the meeting and was attended by Commission Members Dave Fitzsimmons and Paula Carl. Planning Staff present were Joel Paterson, and Nick Norris. A quorum was not present; therefore, minutes were not taken of the field trip.

#### MINUTES OF THE MEETING

The Historic Landmark Commission and staff assembled for the meeting. Present from the Historic Landmark Commission were Chairperson Fitzsimmons, Commissioner Carl, Commissioner Haymond, Commissioner Hunter, Commissioner Norie, and Commissioner Oliver.

Present from the Planning Staff were George Shaw, Planning Director; Joel Paterson, Planning Programs Supervisor, Janice Lew, Principal Planner; and Nick Norris, Principal Planner. Lynn Pace, Deputy City Attorney was also present.

Chairperson Fitzsimmons called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m.

An agenda was mailed and posted in accordance with zoning ordinance regulations for public hearing noticing and was posted in the appropriate locations within the building, in accordance with the open meeting law. Members of the Public were asked to sign a roll, which is being kept with the minutes of the Historic Landmark Commission meeting. Due to a technical malfunction, no recording exists for this meeting. These minutes were compiled from notes of the meeting and constitute the official record.

Chairperson Fitzsimmons inquired if all Commissioners had the opportunity to visit sites that would be the subject of discussion at this meeting. The Commissioners indicated they had visited the sites.

#### WORK SESSION

The Hearing items were moved forward on the agenda to ensure a full quorum would be present to hear the cases.

#### UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Case No. 470-07-33 Brandon Home (major alterations) – a request by Minta and Bob Brandon, represented by Jason Guinn for approval to install vinyl siding to replace existing aluminum siding; replace the existing horizontal slider windows with similar vinyl windows; and replace the front door on the home located at approximately 113 West Clinton Avenue. The property is located in the Capitol Hill Historic District. This case was tabled by the Historic Landmark Commission during the October 3, 2007 meeting.

At this meeting, the Historic Landmark Commission will consider only the proposed window replacements.

No comments from the general public were made.

**Motion**

**In regards to Case No. 470-07-33, Commissioner Hunter made a motion to approve the proposed window replacement with the conditions outlined in the staff report.**

**Commissioner Carl seconded the motion.**

**The motion carried unanimously.**

**PUBLIC HEARING**

Case No. 470-07-34 Legalization of vinyl fence. A request by Louise Alexander, represented by Adrian Alexander, to legalize a vinyl fence in the front yard of the home located at 626 East 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue in the Avenues Historic District. The property is located in the SR1-A Special Development Pattern Zoning District. The vinyl fence was installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The owner's representative, Pam Alexander explained that the vinyl fence was installed six years ago without a certificate of appropriateness. As the new fence replaced an existing fence, the owner did not believe she was violating the zoning ordinance and was not aware of the need for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

No comments from the general public were made.

The Commission stated that they were concerned that allowing a vinyl fence in a historic district would set precedence.

**Motion**

**In regards to Case No. 470-07-34, Commissioner Norie made a motion to deny the petition to legalize the fence.**

**Commissioner Haymond seconded the motion.**

**The Commission voted 3-1, Commissioner Carl voted, "Nay.", the motion carried by majority vote.**

**Case No. 470-07-37 Major Alteration/Minor Construction.** A request by Jane Beatty for major alterations to a contributing structure located at 23 North Virginia Street in the Avenues Historic District. The property is located in the SR1-A Special Development Pattern Zoning District. The proposal includes an addition to the rear of the home that is approximately 25.5 feet in height which exceeds the height limit in the SR1-A Zoning District but is lower than the height of the existing roof line (Approximately 29 feet.)

Mr. Norris stated that the structure was originally a duplex, but had been converted to a single family residence. The classification of the subject property was a Class B contributing structure.

The applicant stated that the front door of the structure had sustained damage it was not protected by an awning.

Annie Vernon, architect, supplied additional historic photos of the structure to the Commission which demonstrated that the door was covered in the past. She also stated that the existing pediment is not the original illustrated in the tax photo. The applicant is proposing to replace the aluminum windows with high quality wood windows.

The Commission discussed the landscaping, which did not contribute to the historic nature of the home. They also noted that the tax photos demonstrated that aluminum awning was used in the past to protect the front door.

No comments from the general public were made.

#### **Motion**

**Commissioner Norie made a motion in regards to Case No. 470-07-37, to accept staff recommendations as written. Final approval of the overhang protecting the front door to be based upon design guidelines was delegated to staff with the provision that the overhang shall not cover character defining fixtures such as the pediment.**

**Commissioner Carl seconded the motion.**

**Vote 3-1; Commissioner Haymond voted,"Nay." The motion carried by majority vote.**

BREAK

The Chair called a short break at 4:58 p.m.

The meeting resumed at 5:00 p.m.

Case No. 470-07-15 Huntington Park Condominiums. A request by Derrick Whetton to build a new 43 unit residential condominium building located at approximately 540 East 500 South in the Central City Historic District. The proposed development is located on four parcels and contains approximately 0.79 acres. The property is located in an R-O Residential Office Zoning District and an RMF-35 Moderate Density Multi-Family Residential Zoning District.

Mr. Norris gave a PowerPoint presentation of the proposal.

The Commission voiced concerns regarding the mass, and height of the proposed structure, and particularly on the side facades which are visible. They also discussed the location of the parking lot.

Cindy Cromer, a member of the public addressed the Commission. She stated that bigger apartments are typically at the corners of the block. The proposal needs a prominent entry and porches. The building height is in conflict with the district overlay. Referring to page 13 of the master plan, she stated that the project needs open space.

She went on to say that she welcomes housing on the site and noted that the developer had used smart design when he reduced the lateral hallways and excavated closer to the property lines. She also stated that the parking should be kept at the street and that the proposal needs better pedestrian amenities with a focus on people and car entrances. The building height and footprint are not consistent.

Finally she stated that Emigration Court was a bad example and should not be used to illustrate what the Commission would approve.

The Commission generally agreed that the project did not meet the standards as stated in the Design Guidelines and that the applicant would benefit from meeting with an Architectural Subcommittee. The subcommittee would address the following:

- Height
- Massing
- Pedestrian and automobile entry orientation

### **Motion**

**Commissioner Norie put forward the motion to table the case until after the applicant met with an Architectural Subcommittee. After meeting with the subcommittee, the applicant would present modified plans to the Commission.**

**The motion passed unanimously.**

Chairperson Fitzsimmons, Commissioner Carl and Commissioner Hunter agreed to serve on the subcommittee. Commissioner Carl and Commissioner Hunter suggested that Commissioner Lloyd might also be willing to serve on the subcommittee.

### **REPORT OF THE PLANNING DIRECTOR**

### **PRESERVATION PLAN**

### **COMMENTS TO THE COMMISSION**

### **CONSIDERATION OF THE MINUTES**

The Commission approved the minutes of October 3, 2007 with minor corrections.

## UNFINISHED BUSINESS

The Commission asked staff to consider setting aside a dedicated meal time for future meetings.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned.

---

David Fitzsimmons, Chairperson

---

Kathryn Weiler, Historic Landmark Commission Secretary