

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

Brandon House

Major Alterations to a Structure Petition 470-07-33
located at approximately 113 West Clinton Avenue in
the Capitol Hill Historic District

November 7, 2007



Planning and Zoning
Division
Department of Community
Development

Applicant: Jason Guinn

Staff: Janice Lew
(801) 535-7625
janice.lew@slcgov.com

Tax ID: 08-36-229-002

Current Zone: SR-1A (Special
Development Pattern Residential
District)

Council District: Three,
Council Member Jergensen

Acreage: .29 acres

Current Use: Single-family

**Applicable City Code Land
Use Regulations:**

- Section 21A.34.020

Attachments:

- A. Application
- B. Staff Report
- C. Documentation
- D. Photographs

REQUEST

The Commission first reviewed a request for approval to install vinyl siding to replace existing aluminum siding, replace the existing horizontal slider windows with similar vinyl window and replace a door on the home located at 113 West Clinton Avenue at the October 3, 2007 meeting. Discussion during the meeting centered on the use of appropriate replacement materials that would be compatible with the architectural character of the building and consistent with City standards. The Commission referred the case to the Architectural Committee, with direction to specifically review the siding material and window design and placement. The proposal was then to return to the Commission for final approval. The replacement door was removed from consideration by the Commission as it would not be visible from the street.

The Architectural Committee met with the applicant on October 11, 2007. The Committee which included Commissioners Paula Carl and Warren Lloyd, discussed potential solutions to the issues identified above. The applicant submitted a revised replacement window plan in response to the Architectural Committee's comments. Replacement siding materials are under consideration by the property owner.

PUBLIC NOTICE

Notice of the proposed major alteration was mailed on September 19, 2007 and October 23, 2007 to all property owners within eighty-five feet (85') of the subject property. Community Council review is not required by the City Code.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Based upon the input of the Architectural Committee, comments, analysis and findings included in the staff reports, Planning Staff recommends the Historic Landmark Commission approve the window replacement request for 113 West Clinton Avenue, subject to the following conditions:

1. That the Commission allows the replacement of the existing horizontal slider window on the north elevation with a vinyl window of the same style, as this portion of the home is a later addition constructed in 1980 and not of an age to have achieved historic significance in its own right.
2. That the Commission approves the use of vinyl replacement windows that match the existing window configuration. They are located on secondary and tertiary elevations where no decorative or character-defining architectural features will be removed as the original windows were replaced and the openings have been altered.
3. Should the applicant present a replacement siding material that matches the original material in detailing or is a compatible substitute material, such as a fiber cement material, staff requests that the Commission direct staff to administratively approve the alterations. Such building materials would enhance the appearance of the building and bring its design closer to that historically found on a bungalow type house.

VICINITY MAP



BACKGROUND, ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS:

BACKGROUND

The Architectural Committee met with the applicant on October 11, 2007. The subcommittee suggested the following:

- a three-panel window configuration for the enclosed porch,
- maintaining the picture window on the north elevation as this is original to the home,
- replacing the two-panel slider on the north elevation with a similar vinyl window as this portion of the house was a later addition, and
- utilizing a compatible substitute siding material such as a fiber cement siding material.

At this time, the proposal includes new vinyl replacement windows of the same style. No changes are proposed to the enclosed porch windows or original picture window on the primary façade.

STAFF ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

In the previous staff report attached to this report as Exhibit B, staff made findings according to the provisions of Section 21A.34.020(G): *Standards for Certificate of Appropriateness for Alteration of a Landmark Site or Contributing Structure*, of the City Zoning Ordinance. The proposal was considered inconsistent with Standards 6, 8, 9, and 10. Staff is of the opinion that these issues have largely been addressed in the current

proposal. The house has experienced the typical alterations made to increase the size of smaller historic homes prior to historic district designation. The original windows were altered and no longer retain their original configuration, the front porch enclosed, an addition constructed, and metal siding installed. As such, the request for new replacement windows does not destroy significant cultural, historical or archaeological material. The Historic Landmark Commission has approved the use of vinyl replacement windows in cases where the windows are located on secondary and tertiary elevations and no historic fabric will be lost. In this case, the use of a vinyl slider on the front elevation in the context of an existing alteration is in keeping with the character of the property.

Exhibit A Application

Exhibit B
October 3, 2007 Staff Report

Exhibit C Documentation

Exhibit D Photographs

Published Date: November 1, 2007