

**SALT LAKE CITY HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION
REQUEST BY TROLLEY SQUARE ASSOCIATES LLC, REPRESENTED BY
MARK BLANCARTE FOR APPROVAL TO RELOCATE CONTRIBUTING
STRUCTURES ON A HISTORIC SITE 470-07-19
WEDNESDAY, June 6, 2007**

OVERVIEW

The Planning Division has received an application to relocate several structures located at Trolley Square. The structures include the water tower, the arched entry sign on 500 South, a trolley car that houses a restaurant, and the sand house which is currently occupied by a bank. The relocations are part of a Planned Development that would add approximately 90,000 square feet of retail space in multiple new buildings. In order to accommodate the new buildings the structures would have to be relocated or demolished.



BACKGROUND

Trolley Square is deeply rooted in the history of Salt Lake City. The site was originally designated as the 10th Ward by Brigham Young in the original plat of the City. It was used as the site of the Territorial and State Fair until 1908, when it was converted to a trolley Yard. The site was used by the Utah Light and Railway Company as the main trolley yard for the city until 1945, when trolley service in Salt Lake City stopped. The site was used as a garage for the Utah Transit Authority buses and Utah Power's maintenance vehicles. The site was littered with junk vehicles, old tires, etc (source:

Utah State Historical Society). In 1972, the site was redeveloped into a shopping center and the main buildings on the site were restored.

The sand house originally was used to store sand that was placed on the trolley tracks to provide additional traction in the winter months. The brick structure had very few openings. In the 1970's the structure was converted to commercial purposes. Multiple alterations were made to the structure and most of the original openings in the building were filled in. New openings were cut for doorways and service windows.

The water tower was an original feature of the site. It is 97 feet in height. The original purpose of the tower was to provide an emergency water supply to the trolley barns in case of fire. When the site was converted into a shopping center in the 1970's, a spiral staircase, decorative lighting, and signage were added to the tower. Similar changes have occurred over the years as tenants changed.

The trolley car is representative of the types of vehicle that ran on the trolley lines in Salt Lake City. The trolley car was added to the site as a permanent feature when the barns were converted to a shopping center. The trolley car has been the home to a variety of uses over the years, and is currently occupied by a restaurant.

The entry sign on 500 South was originally located in front of the Orpheum Theater, (which became the Capitol Theater in 1927) where it spanned 200 South in Salt Lake City. It was relocated to Trolley Square after the trolley barns were rehabilitated into a shopping center. The petitioner is requesting to relocate the structure to accommodate a relocated access point on 500 South.

Central Community Master Plan

The subject property is located in the area covered by the Central Community Master Plan. The future land use map in the plan designates the property as Community Commercial. The Master Plan lists several goals and objectives, some specific to Trolley Square. The Plan lists minimizing the negative impacts of Trolley Square as a main issue in the plan. The Plan also discusses historic preservation. One of the goals is to give high priority to the preservation of historic structures and development patterns. Policy HP 1.4 reads "encourage new development, redevelopment, and subdivision of lots that are compatible with the character of existing development of historic districts or individual landmarks".

Zoning Considerations

The property is currently zoned CS Community Shopping. The proposed location of the sand house places it on the west side of the block along the 600 East frontage. It will be approximately 13 feet from the 600 East property line. The zoning ordinance would require a minimum 30 foot setback. However, the development is being processed as a Planned Development and the Planning Commission will be asked to reduce the 30 foot setback as it relates to this structure.

The proposed locations of the water tower and trolley car meet the zoning requirements in terms of setbacks.

The entry sign on 500 South is located on the property line. The applicants are proposing to keep the sign on the property line, but relocate it to the west. It requires a setback modification as part of the Planned Development.

PROPOSAL

The applicants are proposing to construct multiple new buildings on Trolley Square. The proposal includes the construction of a new retail building with a footprint of approximately 52,000 square feet. Constructing the new building would require the relocation of multiple structures, including the sand house which is currently occupied by a bank, the water tower, a trolley car used as a restaurant and an entry sign located along 500 South. The sand house and the trolley car would be relocated to the west side of the main trolley barn. The water tower would be relocated approximately 20 feet south of its current location and the entry sign would be relocated approximately 30 feet to the south of its current location.

STAFF ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

The standards for relocating contributing structures in an Historic District are outlined in Section 21A.34.020(I) – Standards for Certificate of Appropriateness For Relocation of Landmark Site or Contributing Structure – of the Salt Lake City Zoning Ordinance.

1. The proposed relocation will abate demolition of the structure;

Analysis: The Sand House is currently located where the applicants are proposing to build a large retail pad (Building C). The site plan will be reviewed by the Planning Commission through the planned development process. The Sand House would have to be demolished if the site is to be developed as proposed. Relocating the structure would preserve the building in a different location on the block. The water tower and trolley car relocations are being proposed to accommodate the same building as the sand house. The water tower is proposed to be relocated about 20 feet to the south and the prominence of the tower will not be altered. The proposed location also will not block any portion of the main trolley barn. The entry sign on 500 South is proposed to be relocated slightly to the west to accommodate a new driveway location. The existing driveway will be reclaimed as landscaping and is also tied to the proposed Building C.

Finding: Relocating the structures will result in preserving the contributing structure while still accommodating the proposed development.

2. The proposed relocation will not diminish the overall physical integrity of the district or diminish the historical associations used to define the boundaries of the district;

Analysis: Relocating historic structures generally changes the historic fabric of an historic district or site. The sand house was used as a storage facility and is the only remaining out building on Trolley Square. The structure could have been located anywhere on the site where it was accessible to the vehicles that delivered the sand. The 600 East frontage originally had a view of the trolley barns. The parking garage that was erected within the last 30 years changed the 600 East streetscape away from its historical pattern of development. Placing the Sand House along 600 East will improve the streetscape by adding the presence of a contributing structure.. Relocating the sand house to the west side would not diminish the physical integrity of the site or the district.

The water tower was located where it was because it was relatively close to the main structures and could deliver water quickly in case of an emergency. Moving the water tower to the south approximately 20 feet will not negatively impact the historic nature of the site. The water tower has become a visual icon in Salt Lake City. It adds to the 700 East streetscape. Relocating the tower 20 feet to the south would not change the historic importance of the structure.

Most of the original trolley lines were located along the west side of the trolley barns. Locating the trolley car to this area would place it in a location trolley cars would have traveled historically. The trolley car was placed in its current location when the site was rehabilitated into a shopping center in the 1970's.

The entry sign along 500 South is being relocated slightly to the west. The sign is not original to the site. Relocating the sign to the west will not have a negative impact on the historical nature of the site. The entry sign creates an interesting element to the 500 South streetscape. The sign itself has strong historical significance since the early 1900's when it spanned 200 South in front of the Orpheum Capitol Theater. When the sign was relocated to Trolley Square, it added to the character of the development and has become a desirable addition. Keeping it along the 500 South frontage maintains the character of the sign and its relationship to Trolley Square.

Standards:

11.1 Respect historic settlement patterns. Site new buildings such that they are arranged on their sites in ways similar to historic buildings in the area. This includes consideration of building setbacks, orientation and open space, all of which are addressed in more detail in the individual district standards.

11.3 Orient the front of a primary structure to the street. The building should be oriented parallel to the lot lines, maintaining the traditional grid pattern of the

block. An exception is where early developments have introduced curvilinear streets, like Capitol Hill.

Finding: Relocating the sand house, water tower, trolley car or entry sign will not diminish the overall physical integrity of the district or the historic associations used to define the boundaries of the district because the structures will remain on site. The Trolley car and the entry sign were added to the Trolley Barns after the site was rehabilitated to a shopping center.

3. The proposed relocation will not diminish the historical or architectural significance of the structure;

Analysis: The original purpose of the sand house was to provide a protected location for the storage of sand that was put on the trolley tracks to help provide traction. It is likely that the sand house was located where it was because it was out of the way of the trolley lines that accessed the trolley barns but accessible to service vehicles. When the block was no longer used for transportation purposes, the potential conflicts with trolleys and buses were eliminated. Due to the adaptive reuse of the building, the historic use of the site was changed. Currently the structure is located in the middle of the block and is surrounded by a surface parking lot.

The sand house has been sand blasted and the overall quality and appearance of the brick was altered. The structure has had numerous exterior alterations over the years, including filling in doors and window, cutting out new doors and windows, the addition of an atrium on the east side of the structure and a covered service area for the current use on the west side and the addition of signage. Despite the changes, the building maintains some of its original value, including the roof form which is unique to the structures at Trolley Square and the architectural detailing on the north and south elevations.

Depending on the method used to move the building, it is possible that some of the historic fabric of the structure may be lost. If it is only possible to move the structure “brick by brick”, the original mortar of the structure must be removed and replaced, destroying some of the original craftsmanship of the structure. If this is the process that is used, the mortar should be similar in make up, installation method and width to the original. The structure should be well catalogued, including written descriptions, photographs, and mapped with an appropriate map key to the photographs. This should be done in accordance with Historic American Buildings Survey standards.

During the relocation process, it is possible that the structure may experience a failure regardless of the process used to relocate it. Every effort should be made to protect the structure during the moving process. Because the structure will be relocated on top of an existing parking structure, the phasing of the project should be considered. A foundation for the new location should be constructed prior to disassembling the structure from its current location and all major work around the proposed site should be complete prior to reconstructing the building.

The proposed relocation will make the structure visible from 600 East and help define the 600 South frontage. This would make the structure more visibly significant and could enhance the streetscape along 600 East.

Due to the type of construction, it will likely be much easier to relocate the water tower, entry sign, and trolley car. In order to insure that the structures are reassembled to their historic condition, the structures should be documented according to the Historic American Building Survey standards.

Standards

2.1 Preserve the historic appearance of original materials. Preservation includes proper maintenance of the material to prevent deterioration.

2.5 Repair deteriorated primary building materials. Isolated areas of damage may be stabilized or fixed, using consolidants. Epoxies and resins may be considered for wood repair and special masonry repair components also may be used.

2.6 When repointing masonry, preserve original mortar characteristics, including its composition, profile, and color. In some cases, matching the composition of the historic mortar mix may be essential to the preservation of the brick itself.

2.8 Match the original material in composition, scale and finish when replacing materials on primary surfaces. If the original material was wood clapboard, for example, then the replacement material should be wood. It should match the original in size, the amount of materials exposed, and in finish, traditionally a smooth finish, which was then painted. The amount of exposed lap should match. Replace only the amount required. If a few boards are damaged beyond repair, then only they should be replaced, not the entire wall.

2.10 Match the size, proportions, finish, and color of the original masonry unit, if a portion of a historic masonry wall must be replaced.

6.2 If replacement is necessary, design the new element using accurate information about original features. The design should be substantiated by physical or pictorial evidence. One of the best sources for historic photographs is Salt Lake County Records Management, which maintains early tax photographs for thousands of buildings. In historic districts, intact structures of similar age may offer clues about the appearance of specific architectural details or features. Speculative reconstruction is not appropriate for individual landmarks, as these structures have achieved significance because of their historical and architectural integrity. This integrity may be jeopardized by speculative reconstruction. Replacement details should match the original in scale, proportion, finish and appearance

Finding: The proposed relocations may diminish the historical or architectural significance of the structure if the original craftsmanship is lost during the disassembling process or the structure suffers a catastrophic event during the moving process. Therefore prior to disassembling the sand house, major work near the proposed relocation site should be complete and the structures should be documented according HABS standards.

4. The proposed relocation will not have a detrimental effect on the structural soundness of the building or structure;

Analysis: Depending on the method use to move the sand house, it is possible that some of the historic fabric of the structure may be lost. If it is only possible to move the structure “brick by brick”, the original mortar of the structure must be removed and replaced, destroying some of the original craftsmanship of the structure. If this is the process that is used, the mortar should be similar in make up, installation method and width to the original. The structure should be well catalogued, including written descriptions, photographs, and mapped with an appropriate map key to the photographs. This should be done in accordance with Historic American Buildings Survey standards.

During the relocation process, it is possible that the structures may experience a failure regardless of the process used to relocate it. Every effort should be made to protect the structure during the moving process. Because the sand house will be relocated on top of an existing parking structure, the phasing of the project should be considered. A foundation for the new location should be constructed prior to disassembling the structure from its current location and all major work around the proposed site should be complete prior to reconstructing the building.

A structural engineer with experience in relocating masonry structures should evaluate the structure to ensure that it can be relocated and identify the most suitable moving method. Furthermore, the structures that are proposed to be relocated should be documented according to the Historic American Building Survey standards prior to any relocation work being initiated. The purpose of documenting the structures is to provide a guide on material colors, dimensions, etc. and to provide historical evidence if portions of the building cannot be rebuilt.

Standards

2.1 Preserve the historic appearance of original materials. Preservation includes proper maintenance of the material to prevent deterioration.

2.5 Repair deteriorated primary building materials. Isolated areas of damage may be stabilized or fixed, using consolidants. Epoxies and resins may be considered for wood repair and special masonry repair components also may be used.

6.2 If replacement is necessary, design the new element using accurate information about original features. The design should be substantiated by physical or pictorial evidence. One of the best sources for historic photographs is Salt Lake County Records Management, which maintains early tax photographs for thousands of buildings. In historic districts, intact structures of similar age may offer clues about the appearance of specific architectural details or features. Speculative reconstruction is not appropriate for individual landmarks, as these structures have achieved significance because of their historical and architectural integrity. This integrity may be jeopardized by speculative reconstruction. Replacement details should match the original in scale, proportion, finish and appearance

Finding: Relocating the structures will not have a detrimental effect on the structural integrity of the building if a professional engineer can determine that the structures can be moved and relocated, the current condition of the structures is documented according to the Historic American Building Survey standards, and a plan is in place to reestablish those elements of the structures that cannot be reused.

5. A professional building mover will move the building and protect it while being stored; and

Analysis: The applicant will be required to hire a professional building mover with experience in relocating masonry structures. The other structures do not present the same challenges as a masonry building does.

The entity hired to do the relocations should be evaluated by staff if the Historic Landmark Commission determines that the standards to relocate historic structures are satisfied.

Finding: A professional building mover shall be hired by the applicant to relocate the structure and protect it until it is properly placed in the new location.

6. A financial guarantee to ensure the rehabilitation of the structure once the relocation has occurred is provided to the city. The financial guarantee shall be in a form approved by the city attorney, in an amount determined by the planning director sufficient to cover the estimated cost to rehabilitate the structure as approved by the historic landmark commission and restore the grade and landscape the property from which the structure was removed in the event the land is to be left vacant once the relocation of the structure occurs.

Analysis: If the relocations are approved, the applicant will be required to submit a financial guarantee to ensure the structures are rehabilitated. The guarantee will be approved by the City Attorney. The relocations should be conditioned on the site plan being approved through the Planned Development process.

Finding: The applicant must submit, in a form approved by the City Attorney, a financial guarantee to ensure the rehabilitation of the structure at the proposed location and provide a copy to the Planning Director of the estimated cost in relocating the building. The estimated cost should reflect the bids that the applicant has received to move the building.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff finds that the proposed development meets the standards specified in the ordinance, and recommends approval of this project, with the following conditions:

- 1) This approval is for the relocations only; all other City requirements must be met prior to obtaining a building permit.
- 2) That the applicant provides staff with information on the contractor who has been hired to do the work. The information shall include the preferred method for relocating the structures and a plan to reestablish any elements that are damaged as part of the relocation process.
- 3) That the petitioner submit a bond, pursuant to City requirements, prior to the issuance of a permit for moving the structures.
- 4) That the proposed locations are subject to Planning Commission approval for the Planned Development.

If the Historic Landmarks Commission determines that other design features are required, staff recommends that the Commission include those features as conditions of approval.

Nick Norris, AICP
Principal Planner
May 29, 2007

Attachments: Exhibit A: Proposed site plan
Exhibit B: Photos of structures that are to be relocated.

Exhibit A
Proposed Site Plan

Exhibit B
Photographs structures that
are proposed to be relocated